



**Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe**

**Office of the Special Representative and Co-ordinator  
for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings**

---

**9<sup>th</sup> Alliance against Trafficking in Persons Conference**

**Prevention of Modern Slavery:  
‘An Ounce of Prevention is Worth  
a Pound of Cure’**

**14-15 September 2009**

**Conference Report**

---

## Foreword

This is the conference report of the Alliance against Trafficking in Persons Conference, organized in Vienna on 14-15 September 2009, entitled “*Prevention of Modern Slavery: “An Ounce of Prevention is Worth a Pound of Cure”*”. It contains highlights from each of the presentations given at the conference. The conference was a great success and again brought together more than 300 experts from governments, international organizations and civil society, as well as investigative journalists, documentary filmmakers, photographers and students. The presentations and subsequent discussions ranged from how the global financial crisis is contributing to modern-day slavery to emphasizing the role of the media in combating human trafficking. The creation of the Alliance against Trafficking in Persons in 2004 and its maintenance over the years is, in my view, a major achievement in terms of co-operation throughout the international community. The Special Representative and the OSCE are proud to host this platform for co-operation and dialogue between OSCE participating States, international organizations and civil society.

I would like to thank my Office for all their hard work in conceptualizing and organizing this conference; in particular, my thanks go to Ms Vera Gracheva for taking the lead on organisation and to Ms Claire Jessel for the logistical arrangements.



**Eva Biaudet**  
**OSCE Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings**

## Table of Contents

<b>1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>2. Opening.....</b>	<b>5</b>
2.1 Welcome - <i>Mara Marinaki, Ambassador, Permanent Mission of Greece to the OSCE, Chairperson of the Permanent Council</i> .....	5
2.2 Welcome - <i>Marc Perrin de Brichambaut, OSCE Secretary General</i> .....	5
2.3 Opening Remarks - <i>Hillary Rodham Clinton, US Secretary of State</i> .....	6
2.4 Welcome and Opening Remarks - <i>Eva Biaudet, OSCE Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings</i> .....	7
<b>3. Special Panel: Global Overview – Showcasing Efforts to Decrease and Prevent Human Trafficking by Pursuing the Human Rights Approach.....</b>	<b>7</b>
3.1 Introduction - <i>Eva Biaudet, OSCE Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings</i> .....	8
3.2 Human Trafficking: Towards a Victim-centred Approach using the Special Procedures Mandate - <i>Joy Ngozi Ezeilo, UN Special Rapporteur on Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children</i> .....	8
3.3 Modern-day Slavery: Better Prevented than Fought - <i>Najat M’jid Maalla, UN Special Rapporteur on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography</i> .....	9
3.4 Human Trafficking: a Contemporary Form of Trafficking - <i>Gulnara Shahinian, UN Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Slavery, its Causes and Consequences</i> .....	9
<b>4. Prevention by Undermining the Trafficking Business Model, Going after the Money Trails and Decreasing Vulnerability .....</b>	<b>10</b>
4.1 Introduction. <i>Anthony Steen, Member of Parliament for Totnes, Chairman of All Party Parliamentary Group for Trafficking of Women and Children, United Kingdom</i> .....	10
4.2 The Involvement of Criminal Organizations and Prevention Measures - <i>Alexis Aronowitz, International Consultant on Human Trafficking, The Netherlands</i> .....	10
4.3 Going after the Money Trail - <i>Riikka Puttonen, Officer in Charge, Anti-Human Trafficking and Migrant Smuggling Unit, UNODC</i> .....	11
4.4 Analyzing the Business and Socio-economic Causes of Trafficking in Human Beings in Order to Decrease Vulnerabilities to Trafficking and to Better Prevent the Crime - <i>Gerda Theuermann, Independent Expert on Trafficking in Human Beings and Migration, Researcher/Consultant of the OSCE/EGI Project under UN.GIFT</i> .....	12
4.5 Croydon Community against Trafficking: Ending Slavery and Trafficking in Croydon - <i>Duncan Parker, Founder, Croydon Community against Trafficking</i> .....	13
<b>5. The Impact of the Global Financial Crisis on Trafficking in Human Beings and the Prevention of its Consequences.....</b>	<b>14</b>
5.1 Introduction - <i>Goran Svilanovic, OSCE Co-ordinator of Economic and Environmental Issues</i> .....	14

5.2 The Global Crisis and Human Trafficking: Addressing the Real Challenges - <i>Roger Plant, Head of Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour, International Labour Organization (ILO)</i> .....	14
5.3 Financial Crisis Impact on Remittances on Migrant Workers and Anti-Money Laundering Measures against Trafficking in Human Beings - <i>Isaku Endo, Research Analyst, Financial Market Integrity Unit, World Bank</i> .....	15
5.4 Global Crisis Effects on the Prevention of Human Trafficking in Developed Countries - <i>Jean Geran, Senior Fellow at the Legatum Institute</i> .....	16
5.5 The Global Financial Crisis and Prevention of Trafficking in Persons - <i>Jonathan Martens, Programme Specialist in Counter-trafficking at the International Organization for Migration (IOM)</i> .....	17
<b>6. Best Practices in Prevention of Trafficking in Human Beings</b> .....	18
6.1 Introduction – <i>Stephen Warnath, Director, Nexus Institute</i> .....	18
6.2 Best Practices for the Prevention of Human Trafficking - <i>Ruth Rosenberg, Independent Advisor and Consultant on Human Trafficking</i> .....	18
6.3 Facilitating Safe Labour Migration and Assisting Returning Migrants and their Families: a Case Study of Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan - <i>Azalia Dairbekova, Director, Eurasia Foundation, Tajikistan</i> .....	19
6.4 From Counter-Trafficking to the Creation of a Protective Environment for Children - <i>Vincent Tournecuillert, Regional Child Protection Officer for Central and South-Eastern Europe, Terre des Hommes – Child Relief</i> .....	20
6.5 Women’s Empowerment and Reduction of Vulnerability: the Experience of Donetsk Regional League of Business and Professional Women, Ukraine - <i>Lyudmila Gorova, Chairperson Donetsk Regional League of Business and Professional Women, Ukraine</i> .....	21
<b>7. The Media’s Role in the Prevention of Trafficking in Human Beings</b> .....	21
7.1 Introduction – <i>Ruth Pojman, Deputy Co-ordinator, OSCE Office of the Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings</i> .....	21
7.2 Human Trafficking in the Mirror of Post-Soviet Media - <i>Nadezhda Azhgikhina, Founder of the Association of Russian Women Journalists, Secretary of the Union of Journalists of Russia</i> .....	22
7.3 Media Reporting about the Trafficking of Women in South-Eastern Europe: the Hunt for Victims - <i>Saša Leković, Investigative Journalist Centre, Zagreb</i> .....	22
7.4 The Making of ‘Not Natasha’ - <i>Dana Popa, photojournalist</i> .....	23
7.5 Presentation of the Film ‘Sex Slaves’ - <i>Ric Esther Bienstock, Emmy Award- winning film Director/Producer of ‘Sex Slaves’ documentary, Canada</i> .....	24
<b>8. Closing Remarks</b> .....	24
8.1 Eva Biaudet, OSCE Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings .....	24
8.2 Madina Jarbussynova, Ambassador-at-Large, Kazakhstan .....	25
<b>Annex 1: Conference Agenda</b> .....	26

## 1. Introduction

On 14 and 15 September 2009, the OSCE Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings, **Eva Biaudet**, convened the 9<sup>th</sup> Alliance against Trafficking in Persons Conference, entitled '*Prevention of Modern Slavery: an Ounce of Prevention is worth a Pound of Cure*'. This large scale event, which attracted more than 300 representatives of international organizations, national governments and NGOs, focused on the important role of prevention initiatives and programmes in tackling the crime of human trafficking.

The topics covered during the conference included the impact of the global financial crisis on trafficking in human beings, the business model of trafficking, and the role of the media in preventing the crime. All three UN Special Rapporteurs with responsibility for tackling human trafficking featured as keynote speakers at the event, and Hillary Rodham Clinton, US Secretary of State, delivered a video address to participants. The event was accompanied by a photo exhibition and documentary film which sensitively showed the plight of victims of trafficking.

## 2. Opening

**2.1 Welcome** - *Mara Marinaki, Ambassador, Permanent Mission of Greece to the OSCE, Chairperson of the Permanent Council*

The OSCE Special Representative for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings is a constructive partner and point of reference, supporting national governments in streamlining their National Action Plans and in learning from international best practices in combating trafficking in human beings.

The struggle to prevent modern slavery is an ethical and political issue that echoes the wisdom of history. In order to alleviate human suffering and combat organized crime at the OSCE level, governments first need to co-operate, learn more about one another and to communicate. Traffickers have proven very successful in cross-border co-operation; their lucrative criminal networks have thrived, while governments have sadly often failed to strengthen international co-operation.

In order to confront the new threats posed by organized crime, we are in dire need of ground-breaking changes in how states treat vulnerable sections of their populations, how they protect individuals and how they co-operate with civil society. Effective prevention requires a clear national and international framework; the OSCE perspective demonstrates that only a consistent human rights-based approach and an inter-agency, multidisciplinary co-operative strategy can really succeed in combating trafficking.

**2.2 Welcome** - *Marc Perrin de Brichambaut, OSCE Secretary General*

OSCE participating States have made considerable efforts at the national level to curb the trafficking of human beings. They have been supported in this fight by the OSCE Secretariat, the Special Representative for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings, the Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) and the OSCE field operations. The

Alliance against Trafficking in Persons also plays a key role in combating human trafficking in the OSCE region and globally. The Alliance is a unique, informal and efficient forum, which acts as an excellent platform for common advocacy, dialogue, and sharing of experiences and best practices in the OSCE region and amongst its participating States. Prevention of trafficking can only be addressed together, with each of the international organizations sharing their experience and vision.

Prevention is a broad issue which is so closely related to the other two so-called ‘3 Ps’ (Protection and Prosecution) that often it is hard to differentiate between prevention in its pure form and the preventive effect of adequate prosecution or the prevention of re-trafficking by providing adequate protection to the victim.

Prevention of trafficking is a cross-dimensional issue for the OSCE. Prevention requires better economic opportunities for employment and the enhancement of both good governance and the fight against corruption. Trafficking is a transnational security threat that requires co-operation between participating States, as well as zero tolerance of exploitation and discrimination. It requires gender mainstreaming, the provision of educational opportunities and the consideration of the best interests of children and young people. It is also related to conflict prevention, as trafficking is often a consequence of conflict and displacement. Each of these areas, when addressed in a comprehensive way, has a strong impact on the prevention of modern slavery. Each has to be dealt with, with a view to ensuring equality and non-discrimination, ethnic peace and cultural diversity.

### ***2.3 Opening Remarks - Hillary Rodham Clinton, US Secretary of State<sup>1</sup>***

Human trafficking flourishes in the shadows and demands attention, commitment and passion from each and every individual. Today, millions of people are living in bondage around the world. Under threat of violence they are forced to work in fields and factories, to work as domestic servants in homes that might as well be their prisons, and to walk the streets as prostitutes and beggars. Trafficking weakens legitimate economies, it breaks up families, it fuels violence, it threatens public health and safety and it shreds the social fabric. It also undermines our efforts to promote peace, prosperity, and human rights worldwide.

Thanks in part to efforts of activists and national leaders, there has been progress; more than half of all countries have enacted laws prohibiting all forms of human trafficking. New partnerships between law enforcement and non-governmental organizations including women’s shelters and immigrants’ rights groups have led to thousands of prosecutions as well as assistance for many survivors. However, despite this progress, today at least 12 million people worldwide are victims of trafficking, and that estimate is certainly too low. New economic pressures are likely to aggravate the problem further.

Along with prosecution and protection, prevention is one of the ‘3 Ps’ of the fight against trafficking. In the United States of America, the National Trafficking Report has proved to be an effective tool in guiding efforts, and such experiences need to be shared between countries. Each OSCE participating State is encouraged to consider preparing its own National Report on Human Trafficking, including recommendations for further actions.

---

<sup>1</sup> Video address introduced by Ms Carol S. Fuller, Chargé d’Affaires, US Mission to the OSCE.

Together we must implement a comprehensive approach that both confronts criminals and cares for survivors.

## ***2.4 Welcome and Opening Remarks - Eva Biaudet, OSCE Special Representative and Coordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings***

In combating trafficking, as with any other human rights violation or crime, it is essential for us to focus on prevention. The conference title quotes the old British adage “*an ounce of prevention is worth a pound of cure*”. While everybody agrees on the importance of preventative efforts, they have arguably been the most challenging of the three P’s of Protection, Prosecution and Prevention to implement.

The global financial crisis has exacerbated the underlying economic and social conditions in which human trafficking flourishes. Efforts should be focused upon preventing exploitation, rather than on efforts to control migration. Obtaining accurate numbers and data on this complex and hidden crime is very difficult, but improved knowledge is possible as long as adequate resources and structures are applied. For this reason, all participating States should consider establishing a National Rapporteur or equivalent mechanism and further developing their functions, also by sharing experiences and using lessons learnt from other OSCE participating States. It is also necessary to engage in the prevention of the root causes of trafficking at each stage of the process: at the point of transit, at the exploitation phase and finally, to prevent re-trafficking.

Child protection is an obligation of all governments, both national and local, and it is their responsibility to build safer environments, which empower rather than exclude populations. Increased efforts are needed at the local level to protect the best interests of children and ensure sufficient capacity.

Legislation has a normative role, but also helps to form public opinion, and thus has a clearly preventative dimension. Women’s commodification through trafficking is facilitated by local customs and laws that treat women as property, and also by the global sex industry, which normalizes the exploitation of people, mostly women and children.

It is important to prevent this modern-day slavery, to end the trauma, including the abuse, indignity, degradation, sexual and other violence, humiliation, stigmatization, and captivity. Even if it is tempting in times of serious economic difficulties to only focus on the short-term, we cannot give up. The economic downturn does not mean that our obligation to protect the freedom and human dignity of victims of trafficking is any less urgent. Two hundred years ago our forbearers built a political public commitment that abolished the transnational slave trade, even though this was clearly against the economic interests of many people in power. Why should it not be possible to do the same today?

## **3. Special Panel: Global Overview – Showcasing Efforts to Decrease and Prevent Human Trafficking by Pursuing the Human Rights Approach**

This Special Panel, chaired by Eva Biaudet, provided a broad picture of UN activities in promoting the human-rights and victim-centred approach in the fight against trafficking in human beings, child prostitution and child pornography, and new forms of slavery. The UN Special Rapporteur on Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, **Joy Ngozi Ezeilo**, looked at the significance and effectiveness of the Special Procedures under the UN

Human Rights Council in the prevention of human trafficking. **Najat M'jid Maalla**, UN Special Rapporteur on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography, examined the issue of child trafficking. Finally, **Gulnara Shahinian** - UN Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Slavery, its Causes and Consequences – looked at trafficking within the context of other forms of modern-day slavery.

### ***3.1 Introduction - Eva Biaudet, OSCE Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings***

Some of the basic issues underlying the discussion on the prevention of human trafficking are ‘*what is human value and what is a human being worth?*’ and ‘*how much can we do to protect human beings against power and control, such as economic powers?*’ The prominent people attending the Alliance conference have voices that can be heard outside of their own constituencies. However, very few of us can be heard globally; it is therefore good to join voices, with national and international actors and with local voices in order to have a greater impact at the global level.

### ***3.2 Human Trafficking: Towards a Victim-centred Approach using the Special Procedures Mandate - Joy Ngozi Ezeilo, UN Special Rapporteur on Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children***

The UN Special Rapporteur on Trafficking in Persons has a mandate that covers all forms of trafficking in human beings. The key areas of focus for the Special Rapporteur have been identified as: trafficking of women and children in areas which have been neglected, trafficking in men and boys for labour and other forms of exploitation, addressing the root causes of trafficking (e.g., gender inequalities) and promoting a human rights-centred approach. The Special Rapporteur also intends to look at linkages to the Millennium Development Goals, gender-based violence and the provision of integrated services. There is a lack of reliable statistics and data regarding victims of trafficking, and the Special Rapporteur intends to address this by facilitating a framework for creating a data-collection mechanism for all forms of trafficking.

The Special Rapporteur is advocating at national levels for the adoption of national legislation that is victim-centred and for the improvement of international co-operation to end human trafficking. It is important to ensure that trafficked persons are given proper legal protection and not treated as illegal migrants and that human rights are placed at the core of any intervention.

International, regional and national strategies for combating trafficking should rest on the following ‘5 Ps’ and ‘3 Rs’: protection, prosecution, punishment, prevention, promotion (of international co-operation), redress, rehabilitation and reintegration of victims to assume a constructive role in the society.

Finally, all work on combating human trafficking must be people-centred; all people have the right to live free from fear and want. We must recognize the dignity of victims and their right to survival and development.



### ***3.3 Modern-day Slavery: Better Prevented than Fought - Najat M'jid Maalla, UN Special Rapporteur on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography***

The UN Special Rapporteur on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography plays a role in addressing both supply and demand in child trafficking, using an approach linked to the UN Declaration on the Rights of the Child, and the obligation of others to protect those rights. There is a multitude of factors that have led to an increase in child trafficking including the economic crisis, poverty, the increased use of the Internet, increased mobility, organized crime, impunity and corruption. The key areas in which work to combat child trafficking is urgently needed include: treating the causes, ratification of conventions, publicising the rights of the child, capacity building, identifying the risk factors and reviewing legislation.

We need to adopt a co-ordinated and concerted approach to addressing child trafficking in the global context, working with the treaty-based bodies, the agencies of the UN (e.g., UNICEF) and other international organizations. This approach should also involve the many different actors at local, regional and national levels, whose work should be mutually reinforcing.

### ***3.4 Human Trafficking: a Contemporary Form of Trafficking - Gulnara Shahinian, UN Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Slavery, its Causes and Consequences***

In the last two decades, there has been significant research undertaken and achievements made in combating trafficking in human beings, but much work remains to be done. The trafficking of human beings is just one form of slavery; others include caste and descent-based slavery, forced labour and bonded labour. Slavery has never completely ceased to exist during recorded history, but the forms that it takes have changed. More than 300 laws have been written to combat slavery but none of them have been totally effective. 27 million people are still affected by bonded-labour and 179 million children are victims of child labour. We must recognize that such modern-day slavery is not limited to Asia or Latin America, but also occurs throughout the OSCE region.

There is a real gap between the rights proclaimed in international human rights treaties and the reality on the ground in terms of modern-day slavery. Closing this gap is crucial for all human rights work today. It requires a systematic approach, including the effective collection of relevant data and comprehensive planning through a participatory process. An important element in this endeavour is to define meaningful indicators which can be used to assess progress. The development of better indicators would allow us to better hold governments accountable for the protection of human rights and to highlight success through accurate criteria. Moreover, indicators have huge potential for clarifying and communicating the practical content of human rights in concrete situations.

We need to enhance and mainstream the human rights-based approach in addressing all forms of slavery. Much more needs to be done in terms of promoting and protecting the rights of children and in strengthening human rights standards. We also need to mainstream an anti-slavery approach to development programmes in the field and to search for effective and long-term sustainable co-operation, both between UN Special Rapporteurs and with other international organizations. Useful mechanisms could include the development of common approaches to information collection and sharing - for instance in regard to the spectrum of NGOs dealing with trafficking or the ratification of international instruments - and the

organization of joint country visits. International organizations could also issue joint statements on human rights violations.

#### **4. Prevention by Undermining the Trafficking Business Model, Going after the Money Trails and Decreasing Vulnerability**

This panel, moderated by Anthony Steen MP, focused upon the environment that causes vulnerabilities to human trafficking at the national and international levels, and showed how globalizing forces (both informal and formal), market participants, economic conditions and the political environment combine to facilitate, enhance and generate demand. **Alexis Aronowitz**, International Consultant on Human Trafficking, examined the business models of trafficking, demonstrating the sophisticated modus operandi of criminal groups and their activities. **Riikka Puttonen**, Officer in Charge, Anti-Human Trafficking and Migrant Smuggling Unit, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), set out the important role that financial investigations play in catching traffickers and preventing further trafficking. **Gerda Theuermann**, independent expert on trafficking in human beings and migration presented the outline of the research on THB as a criminal business model, which forms an OSCE/EGI project under the UN.GIFT. Finally, **Duncan Parker**, founder of the Croydon Community Against Trafficking, presented the work of a community-based group in London in identifying victims trafficked for sexual exploitation, closing down brothels and persuading local media not to carry advertisements for ‘personal services’, potentially provided by victims of trafficking.

##### **4.1 Introduction** - *Anthony Steen, Member of Parliament for Totnes, Chairman of All Party Parliamentary Group for Trafficking of Women and Children, United Kingdom*

There are no votes for human trafficking, it is not an issue upon which people elect politicians, and constituents are not interested in it; for this reason, it is difficult to get parliamentarians interested in the topic. We need to find a way to push trafficking higher up the international agenda, and encourage participating State representatives to bring Members of Parliament to future events to ensure that the issue moves up the political agenda. We have to make it uncomfortable for the traffickers; we need the police to find them, the immigration services to spot them, the politicians to pass the laws and the NGOs to pick up the victims. There is a circus of people – the ‘upper’ sphere - going around the world talking about anti-trafficking and then the ‘lower’ sphere doing the hard work with the victims, and there is a lack of co-operation between the two groups.

Groups of Parliamentarians interested in trafficking issues have been set up in Denmark, Holland, Poland, Lithuania and Romania, with France, Spain, Italy and Germany currently setting up groups. Other participating States should be encouraged to follow suit.

##### **4.2 The Involvement of Criminal Organizations and Prevention Measures** - *Alexis Aronowitz, International Consultant on Human Trafficking, The Netherlands*

There are a number of different models through which the crime of human trafficking is carried out. These range from the single one man/woman business to isolated criminal groups and criminal networks, in which members are associated via one or more intermediaries. Investigations from the Netherlands show that 69% of suspects arrested form part of a

network and virtually all (97%) are involved in cross-border trafficking. Large trafficking units tend to have several sub-units that specialize in particular parts of the operation (for example providing recruitment services and fake passports) as well as a management unit which controls the sub-units. Individuals within the networks also play different roles, with some acting as investors, others as recruiters, and still more as transporters. Corrupt public officials or protectors may assist in obtaining travel documents, while other individuals in the networks act as informers, guides, debt collectors, money launderers and enforcers. Recruiters are often trusted individuals, such as friends or family members.

The critical examination of trafficking organizations as business models, developed by Louise Shelly, looks at how trafficking 'businesses' maximize their profits; this may include rotating victims between countries, renting women out rather than selling them, or using one passport for a number of different women.

Intelligence sources at Interpol reveal that trafficking in human beings tends to supplement more traditional criminal activities such as human smuggling, drug trafficking, arms trafficking, vehicle theft and money laundering. Each act of trafficking a human being is a process rather than a single crime, which may well cross a number of countries.

It is important not to overlook the issue of internal trafficking. The highest number of victims of trafficking in the Netherlands and Germany are Dutch and German respectively.

The Barrier Model has been developed in the Netherlands to show how numerous stakeholders can be involved in constructing barriers to trafficking. It identifies five stages at which key stakeholders can construct barriers which hinder trafficking in human beings. These are entrance (smuggling and border crossing), housing (prostitution circuit and illegal housing), identity (false documents, false social security numbers), work (pimps, exploiters, violence, exploitation) and financial (money laundering). The barrier model further identifies illegal service providers and illegal activities at each of the five stages. More importantly, strategic partners have been identified which may come into contact with victims or traffickers at each stage and which are in a position to erect barriers to hinder or prevent trafficking in human beings. Barriers can be erected at any of the five stages, but an integrated approach involves taking action at all five stages.

#### ***4.3 Going after the Money Trail - Riikka Puttonen, Officer in Charge, Anti-Human Trafficking and Migrant Smuggling Unit, UNODC***

Financial investigations form an important tool in the prevention of trafficking, going after the money trail created by the traffickers. The ultimate aim is conviction and confiscation of the assets of the crime. Trafficking is a lifestyle crime; it is clear that the motivation of the criminals involved in trafficking is quite simply money. They need to be able to launder the proceeds of the crime in order to mask their illegal activities and make them seem legitimate. This may involve investing in cars, houses, or equipment, for example. Financial investigations involve the collection, collation and analysis of all available financial information. Trafficking creates a financial footprint, including money transfers for recruitment infrastructure and obtaining documents; it is not possible to completely conceal the financial operation. Techniques for investigating such operations include surveillance, wiretapping, going through bank accounts, investigating families and suppliers and examining taxation records. Financial investigations are sometimes used to support the trafficking charge, or can be used instead of a trafficking charge where one cannot be

successfully brought. It is often very difficult for defence lawyers to challenge the facts gained from financial investigations.

There is a clear link between financial investigations and prevention: if the proceeds of crime are confiscated, the traffickers are less able to recruit new victims and their ability to continue their criminal activities is diminished. Financial investigations can also contribute to preventing corruption, by depriving criminal gangs of the resources to bribe officials. Article 12 of the UN Convention on Transnational Organized Crime sets out a framework for what can be confiscated. In some jurisdictions, confiscation only applies to the proceeds of crimes, whilst in others it also includes vehicles, shelters, factories and other items intended for use in crime, as well as any other income derived from proceeds of crime.

Good practices have been developed in some countries concerning the disposal of criminal assets, and how the confiscated assets are utilized. For example, they might be given back to law enforcement agencies to continue their investigations into trafficking, or perhaps used to compensate victims of trafficking. True compensation should economically empower victims, to help diminish the likelihood of re-trafficking; this is one of the key reasons why the international community needs to pay more attention to the role of financial investigations in preventing human trafficking.

***4.4 Analyzing the Business of Trafficking in Human Beings in Order to Decrease Vulnerabilities to Trafficking and to Better Prevent the Crime - Gerda Theuermann, Independent Expert on Trafficking in Human Beings and Migration, Researcher/Consultant of the OSCE/EGI Project under UN.GIFT, Austria***

The OSCE is preparing an exploratory study, under the auspices of the UN.GIFT Expert Group Initiative, designed to analyse the business of human trafficking. Preventive approaches to human trafficking have, to date, mainly focused upon potential victims, and there has been a lack of comprehensive analysis of the business model of trafficking and the socio-economic environment which allows this crime to prosper. There is a lack of integrated, holistic prevention approaches that combine anti-trafficking, good governance, an analysis of social and economic factors, anti-corruption measures, development policies and security policies. There are also very few prevention programmes aimed specifically at traffickers or potential traffickers.

In order to address these issues, an international expert team has been compiled to prepare the study, with backgrounds in anti-trafficking work, criminology, sociology, international relations, and the fight against corruption and money laundering. The objectives of the study are to enhance understanding of the environment which makes trafficking possible, to understand the business model of trafficking, to formulate comprehensive prevention policies based upon this understanding, and to identify concrete policy recommendations, knowledge gaps and further research needs. The study, based on cases and data collection from a number of the OSCE participating States, makes use of theoretical methodologies, including anomie, rational choice theory and neutralization theory. Anomie refers to the low commitment of societies to laws and social norms, owing to sudden social, political and economic change; human trafficking flourishes in anomic societies. According to rational choice theory, people operate as rational actors, making decisions based upon weighing the risks, costs and benefits of committing a crime; to reduce trafficking, we need to increase the costs and the likelihood of being caught and reduce the profits. Neutralization theory deals with the techniques that people use to neutralize the concept of committing a crime (e.g., through denial of

responsibility, denial of injury or denial of the victim-status of the person against whom the crime was committed). Using these theoretical approaches, together with research into the crime of trafficking, the researchers hope to come to a better understanding of the crime, and of those who perpetrate it, in order to enhance future prevention efforts.

#### ***4.5 Croydon Community against Trafficking: Ending Slavery and Trafficking in Croydon - Duncan Parker, Founder, Croydon Community against Trafficking, United Kingdom***

The Croydon Community against Trafficking (CCAT) is a coalition of concerned citizens, faith and community groups who aim to stop the injustice of human trafficking for sexual exploitation within the London Borough of Croydon, UK. The organization focuses upon off-street prostitution, as this is how trafficking manifests itself in Croydon. The Borough is one of the main areas for trafficking in the UK, with the third largest off-street sex-industry in London.

CCAT was formed by small group of individuals who realized what was happening within Croydon, and has now almost comprehensive support within the local community. The objectives of CCAT are to raise awareness of trafficking in the local community, to work with other agencies to liberate, protect and support trafficked people in Croydon, to stop the activities of the traffickers, and to reduce the use of commercial sexual services provided by trafficked victims.

The founders of CCAT undertook their own research to establish the scale of the problem in Croydon. Although the police had only identified four brothels in the Borough, by following up personal services advertisements in local newspapers, CCAT members were able to identify at least 60 brothels. 84% of the women in these brothels were from overseas and were identified by CCAT as likely to have been trafficked; this assessment was based on the price of sex, the nationalities of the women and the risky types of sex offered.

CCAT shared their findings with the local newspapers. The newspapers ran the stories, but at the same time continued to carry advertisements for sexual services from the same brothels. CCAT challenged the local press, and as a result, one newspaper agreed to remove the advertisements and persuaded their owners Newsquest, a national group of 240 newspapers, to do the same. The owner of Newsquest, Gannett (who also own USA Today), is now considering whether to apply this policy to its other publications worldwide. Reports show that personal services advertisements are worth an estimated €49.5 million to the newspaper industry in the UK alone.

Since its foundation in 2005, CCAT has been involved in the rescue and care of nine women. The number of brothels in Croydon has been reduced by half and advertising of personal services has reduced dramatically in all Croydon newspapers. The organization sits in key decision-making bodies with the Police and Council. The CCAT model has now been adopted by the NGO Stop the Traffik and used as the basis for setting up anti-trafficking community groups, known as Active Communities against Trafficking (ACT), throughout the UK.

## 5. The Impact of the Global Financial Crisis on Trafficking in Human Beings and the Prevention of its Consequences

This panel, moderated by Goran Svilanovic, provided an insight into the actual and potential implications of the global financial crisis on vulnerabilities of populations to human trafficking in participating States. These include a considerable decrease in job opportunities for both nationals and migrant workers in the countries of origin and destination. **Roger Plant**, Head of Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour at the ILO, set out a series of key recommendations on addressing trafficking for forced labour in the current climate. **Isaku Endo**, Research Analyst, Financial Market Integrity Unit at the World Bank explored how the current decline in global remittances to developing countries may have an impact upon trafficking. **Jean Geran**, Senior Fellow at the Legatum Institute, examined the effects of the global crisis on efforts to prevent trafficking in industrialized countries. Finally, **Jonathan Martens**, Programme Specialist in Counter Trafficking at the IOM, looked at the impact of the global financial crisis on migration, its effects on trafficking in persons and the implications for prevention efforts.

### *5.1 Introduction - Goran Svilanovic, OSCE Co-ordinator of Economic and Environmental Issues*

Migration is an important area of work for the OSCE, and formed the topic of the Economic and Environmental Forum held under the under Greek Chairmanship in 2009. Weak co-ordination between government agencies and limited co-operation between countries create loopholes that can be exploited by criminals. The OSCE worked together with the UN Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) and the government of the Republic of Cyprus to organise a regional event on trafficking in human beings and money laundering in the Mediterranean region in 2008.

The financial crisis has had a devastating effect with a sharp rise in unemployment and has impacted upon migration trends with many migrants losing their jobs and having to return home. At the same time we are experiencing a growing intolerance towards migrants. All these developments have consequences for trafficking in human beings, and call for enhanced co-operation between all stakeholders.

### *5.2 The Global Crisis and Human Trafficking: Addressing the Real Challenges - Roger Plant, Head of Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour, International Labour Organization (ILO)*

It is important not to be simplistic about the challenges that the global financial crisis poses in terms of human trafficking, or to assume that it will automatically result in an increase in labour trafficking. So far there has been no evidence of increased exploitation during the current crisis. There has, however, been a very sharp decline in remittances from migrant workers, for example, to Mexico. Huge numbers of Chinese workers from the Southern provinces are reported to have returned home. The Chinese authorities have been active in warning their nationals of the risks of exploitation and non-payment for Chinese migrants going to Eastern European countries.

While trafficking in human beings for forced labour has been criminalized in many countries, to date there have been practically no effective prosecutions or convictions for this crime. An integrated approach to the prevention of trafficking is needed involving labour inspection

agencies, law enforcement bodies, civil society actors, trade unions, government and businesses. The role of business must go beyond the prevention and eradication of forced labour and trafficking within their own company activities and supply chains. They also need to address the legal and policy gaps which permit new forms of exploitation to emerge in a range of different industries. Recruiters do not necessarily act illegally, but rather exploit existing loopholes in legislation to exploit workers; this is one of the consequences of the tremendous deregulation of labour markets in many countries. There is a need for consensus on the permissible practices on charging migrant workers; they often face enormous transaction costs in accessing jobs, which they are unable to pay.

There is a need for better operational indicators for forced labour and trafficking. The ILO Delphi methodology was used to produce consensus amongst a large group of experts on the indicators of human trafficking. These include factors such as confiscation of papers, deception about the nature of the work during the recruitment process and overcharging for food and accommodation. The indicators can be used beyond data collection purposes, for practical action by law enforcement agencies and for training purposes.

In trying to prevent forced labour, it is important to identify and then address the root causes of the problem. Governments should apply the same logic they applied to the financial crisis to the labour market. In response to the financial crisis, there has been a stronger approach to the regulation of financial practices. However, there has been a weaker approach to regulation and monitoring in response to a simmering crisis of equal importance on the world's labour markets. The ILO's third Global Report on forced labour over the past decade, *The Cost of Coercion*, shows that the money taken from vulnerable migrants by being in a forced labour situation, rather than a free employment relationship, is considerably higher than previously estimated. With a carefully thought-out approach, the present crisis provides an opportunity for forward thinking, with all partners agreeing on the minimum regulations, monitoring and labour market governance, which will be essential if vulnerable women, men and children are not to be placed at greater risk of forced labour and trafficking.

***5.3 Financial Crisis Impact on Remittances on Migrant Workers and Anti-Money Laundering Measures against Trafficking in Human Beings - Isaku Endo, Research Analyst, Financial Market Integrity Unit, World Bank***

Global remittance flows to developing countries reached \$328 billion in 2008, an increase of 15% from \$285 billion in 2007. Remittance flows to developing countries are expected to shrink by 7.3% in 2009, according to the World Bank. The degree to which the financial crisis impacts upon remittances varies from region to region. However, these flows are expected to experience positive growth in 2010 and 2011.

The World Bank has carried out Bilateral Remittance Corridor Analysis Studies, which included interviews with documented and undocumented migrants, through which they have gathered information about the impact of the financial crisis on migrants' decision-making processes. Migrant workers are left with a number of choices when faced with job losses as a result of the financial crisis. They may have the opportunity to change employment within the same country, to return home and perhaps officially migrate to another country, to work informally, or to move to another country informally. Some of these options may lead to unwanted opportunities for smuggling and trafficking businesses and greater opportunities for informal channels to be abused for money laundering. Anti-money laundering measures should be used to detect and trace money generated from human trafficking and the

smuggling of migrants. Adequate legal frameworks and memoranda of understanding are necessary for the protection of migrants, as is information sharing between authorities and organizations working on human trafficking. It is also important to improve knowledge gathering and the exchange of experience on human trafficking and money laundering.

Financial intelligence Units can play an important role in analysing remittance flows and detecting possible crimes. Financial reports can be used to disseminate intelligence to prosecutors or other authorities that work on detecting money laundering. However, trust between NGOs and Financial Intelligence Units needs to be strengthened, as some NGOs may be reluctant to co-operate with what they perceive as police agencies.

The global financial crisis, through reduced remittance flows, may have a negative impact upon developing economies. There is a need to develop a protection mechanism for migrant workers, and to improve knowledge and understanding of trafficking in human beings, money laundering and smuggling.

#### ***5.4 Global Crisis Effects on the Prevention of Human Trafficking in Developed Countries*** *- Jean Geran, Senior Fellow at the Legatum Institute*

The current financial crisis is a global phenomenon which has a varying impact upon different regions, countries and localities. Its full effect on human trafficking is unknown and also varies by location; however, evidence seems to indicate that the trafficking problem is exacerbated by the increased vulnerability of victims and potential victims along with declining incomes. The crisis also has had a profound effect on our ability as individuals, organizations and governments to prevent and combat trafficking in human beings. In highly industrialized or 'demand' countries, the crisis has led to major increases in public spending for economic stimulus activities, creating pressure for budget cuts in other areas. Budget resources, both public and private, are scarcer than ever. Just as awareness and the desire to address the problem is growing in some countries, including the United States of America, the United Kingdom and Japan, governments and NGOs are struggling to find the resources to combat the problem and help victims restore their lives. Low-cost, co-operative responses must be identified that can adjust quickly to changing circumstances.

As we think about new trafficking trends in the context of a global crisis, we need to consider the links between demand/destination countries (mostly developed) and source/transit countries (mostly developing) as these linkages have implications both for the nature of the challenge before us and the most effective responses. Pornography, sex tourism, mail-order brides, new technology and consumer demand for global products are all issues related to human trafficking that we must monitor for changing dynamics. Child trafficking for the pornography industry is growing in industrialized countries, which is not helped by the fact that the viewing of child pornography and animated child pornography, is not criminalized in all countries. In Japan, where there has been a clamp-down on entertainment visas that were being used as a mechanism for trafficking, marriage visas have increased, signifying that these may now be being used for trafficking through 'mail-order bride' schemes. Public-private partnerships already exist to address many of these issues and should be more widely utilized alongside codes of conduct. Prevention and protection networks need to be strengthened, wider audiences engaged and funding gaps supplemented.

There is a need to monitor changing patterns of trafficking and to create low-cost, adaptable co-ordination mechanisms that can improve targeting and increase the speed of joint



responses. Partnership opportunities should be identified to increase impact without the need for substantial new resources. New technology can be used to improve responses and mobilize young people to prevent and combat human trafficking, for example through the use of social networking sites. The use of new technologies to recruit people into situations of exploitation must also be carefully monitored; this is an area in which new partnerships can be forged with the private sector. Multi-stakeholder taskforces can be established in major cities or local areas to share information, respond to specific cases, develop joint protocols, conduct community outreach, train law enforcement and share intelligence. Finally, domestic policies and anti-trafficking efforts need to be reconciled with foreign policy and development assistance.

### ***5.5 The Global Financial Crisis and Prevention of Trafficking in Persons - Jonathan Martens, Programme Specialist in Counter-trafficking at the International Organization for Migration (IOM)***

The global financial crisis has resulted in a reduction in regular labour migration flows to some countries, reversals of rural to urban internal migration and a reduction in the flow of irregular migrants to some destination countries. The overall impact on global migration patterns and on the conditions of migrants remains, however, unclear.

Migrants are facing new challenges, including job losses, reduced or unpaid wages, ineligibility for social benefits and higher levels of xenophobia and discrimination. Past crises suggest that, even though unemployment did not disproportionately affect migrant workers, their conditions of work deteriorated more rapidly.

There has been an increase in the return of unemployed migrants to countries of origin, but not all migrants will or can return; many adopt a 'wait and see' approach, and may find work in the informal economy and overstay their visas.

The reactions of governments to these issues have been varied. In some countries, including South Korea, Malaysia, Thailand and Kazakhstan, there has been a complete freeze on the entry of foreign workers in some sectors. Other countries, such as the UK and Italy, have introduced more restrictive immigration policies, while others have adopted policies to encourage employers to retrench migrant workers. The Czech Republic and Spain have provided financial incentives to encourage unemployed migrants to return home, whilst the Philippines has provided assistance packages to returning migrants to some countries of origin.

In times of financial austerity, cash-strapped consumers will prioritize the cheapest goods and services, whilst cash-strapped businesses will try to cut costs. A larger pool of people suffering from financial insecurity is likely to lead to a larger pool of people wanting to migrate; greater pressure to work abroad will increase risks and worsen the conditions that people are willing to accept, with migrants willing to take more risks.

In the light of these developments, there is a need to raise awareness of businesses and consumers of labour trafficking, promote information on the rights of migrants, discourage xenophobia and form partnerships between countries of origin and destination. Finally, if as a result of the financial crisis, donors limit their financial support for counter-trafficking programmes, implementing partners will find it difficult to continue their efforts to combat trafficking in human beings.

## 6. Best Practices in Prevention of Trafficking in Human Beings

This panel, moderated by Stephen Warnath, provided participating States with an overview of existing best practices aimed at preventing trafficking in human beings. **Ruth Rosenberg**, Independent Advisor and Consultant on Human Trafficking, looked at how we can improve our ability to assess the impact of such programmes. **Azalia Dairbekova**, Director of the Eurasia Foundation in Tajikistan, spoke about trafficking for labour purposes of nationals from Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan. **Vincent Tournecueillert**, Regional Child Protection Officer for Central and South-Eastern Europe for Terre des Hommes – Child Relief, presented the TACT model of action for assisting child victims of trafficking in South-Eastern Europe. Finally, **Lyudmila Gorova**, Chairperson of the Donetsk Counter-trafficking NGO Donetsk Regional League of Business and Professional Women, gave an overview of the work of her organization in assisting victims of trafficking and empowering women in the Donetsk region of Ukraine.

### *6.1 Introduction – Stephen Warnath, Director, NEXUS Institute*

There are two themes that can help to frame a study of the prevention of trafficking in human beings: (i) understanding the relationship between the root causes and the prevention of trafficking. Many of the underlying assumptions about our prevention efforts are untested and may not help us to go in new directions and develop new prevention activities. (ii) achieving effective prevention impact and results is extremely hard – it is difficult to put in place an integrated, holistic prevention programme.

### *6.2 Best Practices for the Prevention of Human Trafficking - Ruth Rosenberg, Independent Advisor and Consultant on Human Trafficking, Bosnia and Herzegovina*

There are a number of difficulties in measuring and assessing the impact of programmes aimed at preventing trafficking in human beings. We know that there are a range of factors which lead to the creation of an environment in which human trafficking can flourish. Societal factors include the lack of economic opportunities and restrictions on migration, while individual factors include social isolation, domestic violence, and even a desire to explore the world. We cannot address the societal root causes just through anti-trafficking programmes, as they denote a far wider problem.

In designing trafficking prevention programmes, we tend to follow a process of identifying the target groups, assessing what makes people vulnerable, and for what purposes. The assumptions we make in this process can create a vicious circle, in which we only find what we are looking for. For example, if we find young women trafficked for prostitution, we focus our efforts on this and identify more young women trafficked for prostitution. However, in doing so, we may miss other types of victims, or victims trafficked for other purposes. Studies show, for example, that male victims of trafficking often exit trafficking alone and do not come into contact with officials or NGOs when doing so; this means that we are less likely to come across them in our programmes.

Our use of indicators in measuring the impact of trafficking programmes may also be misjudged. For example, the indicators set for awareness raising programmes tend to measure knowledge of trafficking within the target group. However, most studies show that increased knowledge of trafficking does not actually lead to changes in behaviour or prevent individuals from becoming victims. Indicators used in empowerment programmes may

measure the number of people calling hotlines or seeking services. However, if someone is empowered and better understands trafficking and how to protect themselves, they may be more likely to take a job abroad, paradoxically increasing their exposure to the risk of trafficking. Thus, again this indicator will not necessarily effectively measure the impact of the programme. USAID-funded studies show that there is simply not enough impact data available at present to draw any conclusions about the impact and success of prevention programmes.

We need to improve knowledge of trafficking gleaned from identified and assisted victims and share this more widely amongst other groups of potential victims that we have previously overlooked. We should also conduct trafficking studies which collect information and data beyond that obtained from assisted victims. We often do not share national statistics, which leads to countries of origin and destination having completely different figures about bilateral flows of victims. There is also a need to conduct long-term longitudinal studies to assess the impact of interventions, which include comparisons to similar individuals who did not participate in prevention programmes. This has to go beyond individual programming and incorporate nationwide impact assessments, which are not dependent upon year-by-year programmatic funding. Donors need to move beyond annual programming. Finally, we need to encourage states to measure rates of trafficking and not give up on this just because it is perceived as being too difficult.

***6.3 Facilitating Safe Labour Migration and Assisting Returning Migrants and their Families: a Case Study of Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan*** - Azalia Dairbekova, Director, Eurasia Foundation, Tajikistan

Labour migration – both legal and illegal – plays a crucial role in the development of both the Kyrgyz and Tajik economies, the two facing quite serious challenges in the OSCE region. Migrant remittances amount to almost 50% of GDP in both of these countries, with many households being completely dependent on these remittances. The average migrant's monthly income before migration is \$30, compared to \$475 during migration.

In both Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan, only those agencies accredited by the government are allowed to recruit potential migrants; however, there is limited access to these agencies, particularly outside the large towns. As a result, those people who cannot easily access the legal routes tend to take illegal risky paths to migration, making them susceptible to trafficking. A March 2009 survey of 3,000 returning migrants in Kyrgyzstan showed that over 70% had found their jobs abroad through word of mouth or relatives, whilst 9.3% were completely uninformed. Only just over 5% had used the official employment agents and resource centres.

The major factors that are likely to make someone vulnerable to trafficking for forced labour purposes in these countries are poverty, low education levels, poor language and communication skills and illegal status. Risk groups include adult labour migrants, migrants' children (both in destination and home countries) and migrants' wives remaining in the home country (especially in Tajikistan).

The Eurasia Foundation provides a range of services to migrants before departure, in destination countries and on return. The Foundation has established resource centres and also works at the policy level, lobbying for change and informing policy development. The

organization addresses the root causes of trafficking through income-generation programmes, programmes to return girls to school and work with the media.

**6.4 From Counter-Trafficking to the Creation of a Protective Environment for Children -**  
*Vincent Tournecuillert, Regional Child Protection Officer for Central and South-Eastern Europe, Terre des Hommes – Child Relief*

Transnational Action against Child Trafficking (TACT) is a co-ordinated project implemented by Terre des Hommes, designed to prevent the trafficking of children in South-Eastern Europe. Created in 2001, this programme includes a series of co-ordinated activities and combines direct intervention with capacity building. TACT provides assistance to hundreds of trafficked children and former child trafficking victims, as well as to a wider pool of vulnerable children and their families. The TACT model of action has four phases: (i) immediate intervention/substitution; (ii) building transnational and national networks; (iii) carrying out evidence-based advocacy initiatives and concrete work on new laws and regulations; and (iv) reinforcement of local child protection mechanisms, which value local service providers and empower communities. This final phase includes the creation of child protection safety nets at the community level.

There are a number of factors that increase the vulnerability of children to trafficking for begging and street crime. These include ethnic origin (with the vast majority of victims in the Terre des Hommes programme coming from the Egyptian and Roma communities), poverty and family unemployment.

The TACT model places the child at the centre of the programme and aims to help the child to become independent and resist the trafficking process. The views and wishes of the child are essential in the decision-making process and in the design of the intervention. Building trust is central to approaching both the children and parents, and relations are based upon sincerity, complicity, proximity and reciprocity. Central to the programme is the idea of countering the logic of the traffickers, with each phase of the project corresponding to phases of the traffickers' operations.

The TACT programme operates along four transnational axes, namely Albania-Greece, Moldova-Russia-Ukraine, Romania-France-Italy-Spain, and Kosovo-Albania-Macedonia. In the Albania-Greece programme alone, over 40,000 children have been reached, and training on child protection has been provided to over 1,500 teachers, school directors, school psychologists and child protection units. Over the past six years, nearly 200 children have been integrated in Greece and over 800 re-integrated in Albania.

The challenges for prevention programmes include the fact that trafficking is a rapidly changing phenomenon, which means that NGOs have to constantly adapt their programmes, and authorities have to adapt their services. There is a need to develop local child protection structures through a decentralised process. Finally, there needs to be genuine political will, with proper social inclusion policies developed for minorities and genuine transnational co-operation at all levels.

**6.5 Women's Empowerment and Reduction of Vulnerability: the Experience of Donetsk Regional League of Business and Professional Women, Ukraine - Lyudmila Gorova, Chairperson Donetsk Counter-Trafficking NGO – Donetsk Regional League of Business and Professional Women, Ukraine**

The Donetsk Regional League of Business and Professional Women aims to empower women in the Donetsk region of Ukraine and to reduce their vulnerability. The organization contributes to strengthening the influence of women on social and political life and to combating discrimination. It provides help to women in crisis and assists in the economic empowerment of women. The organization runs a hotline, a regional crisis prevention centre and a women's business support centre and implements a programme to assist victims of trafficking.

Trafficking victims and their families can receive assistance in search and repatriation, victim identification, identification of victims' needs, provision of assistance and monitoring of the reintegration process. The service provides individual consultations, help with finding lost documents, medical check-ups, assistance in training and business set-up, and support if the victim decides to prosecute her traffickers. Re-trafficking cases are very few amongst women participating in the reintegration work of the centre.

All services guarantee anonymity, confidentiality and professionalism. Around 170 women call the hotline per day and 130,000 women have used the 'Women for Women' centre, where they can have individual consultations with psychologists, lawyers and social workers, as well as take part in professional skills courses and training. The women's business support centre has been used by 35,000 women, and provides business courses, ongoing support, exhibitions and conferences. 43% of women graduating from the centre's courses have started their own businesses. Moreover, the organization's Women's Information Centre provides support to more than 200 NGOs for women and supports a coalition of 23 NGOs which hold annual media campaigns against gender violence, and produce TV and radio shows on the topic.

## **7. The Media's Role in the Prevention of Trafficking in Human Beings**

This panel, moderated by Ruth Pojman, addressed the critical role of the media in the prevention of trafficking in human beings. **Nadezhda Azhgikhina**, founder of the Association of Russian Women Journalists, Secretary of the Union of Journalists of Russia and expert on human trafficking and gender issues, looked at human trafficking in the mirror of post-Soviet media. **Saša Leković**, from the Investigative Journalism Centre in Zagreb, Croatia, explored media reporting about trafficking of women in South-Eastern Europe. **Dana Popa**, photojournalist, talked about the photo exhibition depicting trafficking victims, which was displayed during the conference and is based on her book 'Not Natasha'. Finally, **Ric Esther Bienstock**, Emmy Award-winning film director/producer, presented her 'Sex Slaves' documentary, which was also shown during the event.

### **7.1 Introduction – Ruth Pojman, Deputy Co-ordinator, Office of the OSCE Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings**

One cannot underestimate the power of the media in combating trafficking. A good journalist can vividly portray the reality, change attitudes and behaviour, investigate and expose the chain of THB, and provide support for trafficking victims. Media can help form political will

and pressure governments to take further actions and to fight related corrupt practices. It can also galvanise people into action by educating consumers on the origin of the products and services that they buy, and persuade them not to buy products produced with slave labour. However, the media can also have unintended negative effects on the fight against trafficking. One foreign news network covered the story of Albanian trafficking victims found in a European country; even though the network did not provide the victims' details or show their faces, there was enough information for the traffickers to find them and murder them upon their return home. Investigative journalism may not only be dangerous for the victims but also for the journalists themselves, as many have been threatened and some covering organized crime and human trafficking have been killed. The power of the media can be used for both good and bad. The media can influence whether victims are blamed or embraced and whether exploitation is tolerated or action is taken. A strong documentary film or a great journalist can bring home the realities of trafficking through their stories to a large audience in a way that few of us can.

***7.2 Human Trafficking in the Mirror of Post-Soviet Media - Nadezhda Azhgikhina, Founder of the Association of Russian Women Journalists, Secretary of the Union of Journalists of Russia and Expert on Trafficking in Human Beings and Gender Issues***

The media reporting of human trafficking in the Russian Federation must be seen in the light of the fact that, following the demise of the Soviet Union, a real media market and real media freedom have not yet emerged. Immediately after the fall of communism, human trafficking was not a major issue picked up by the press, although some media attention was given to prostitution. The few stories that did emerge regarding sexual slavery were presented and interpreted as stories of 'unlucky prostitutes'. The first wave of very modest media coverage of trafficking in the Russian Federation occurred in the early and mid 1990s, and was associated mainly with gender violence; it resulted from the active efforts of international organizations and western women's groups. However, it took more than ten years of combined efforts by Russian and international NGOs to explain that gender violence is a real threat to democracy. By the mid 1990s, some independent crisis centres had begun to work with victims of trafficking; however, this work was reflected only in human rights publications and not in mainstream media.

In the mid and late 1990s, as freedom of expression flourished, human trafficking still did not appear in the mainstream media agenda, as there was no clear political vision or public awareness of the issue. It was, however, covered much more by human rights and women's organizations. When articles did appear in the mainstream media, the sexual nature of the crime was emphasized, and the victims were often marginalized and stigmatized. Trafficking for purposes other than sexual exploitation was not covered.

By the beginning of the 21<sup>st</sup> century, human trafficking had started to be understood as part of the international organized crime agenda. In March 2004, the Russian Federation ratified the Palermo Convention, including the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons. As the issue entered the official agenda, the media became more interested in it. A study carried out in 2008 found that quality newspapers were now reporting on the trafficking of persons for organ transplants, forced labour and child labour, as well as sexual exploitation<sup>2</sup>. The tabloid newspapers are now reporting the issue, but focus mainly upon

---

<sup>2</sup> Josef Dzyalishinsky and Elena Tyuryukanova, *Trafficking in People: Media as a Resource of Public Resistance to Contemporary Slavery*, OSCE project, 2008.

sexual exploitation. Many publications also highlight the work of the international community and NGOs on combating trafficking. However, there is still little in-depth analysis of trafficking issues in the media. Today the issue of human trafficking is also a visible part of the pop-culture agenda in the Russian Federation, but not part of the serious social and public discourse. Media coverage of trafficking is still quite limited and full of stereotypes, and in most cases the journalists writing the articles have no expertise or training on the topic.

It is important to plan media campaigns, public events, exhibitions and open air talk shows to break the silence and make people think about the issue of trafficking and work on it in their communities. Co-operation between NGOs and media organizations plays an important role in raising the profile of human trafficking in the media. Joint efforts produce broader campaigns and push politicians and the public into action.

A training module and an education programme on human trafficking should be developed for mainstream journalists; academic journalism curricula should also include a module on the topic. Education programmes are needed on security issues to ensure that journalists do not endanger victims' safety. It is also necessary to have a wide discussion with the media in the Russian Federation and in other countries to promote ethical media responsibility and to develop a dialogue of trust on combating trafficking in human beings.

### ***7.3 Media Reporting about Trafficking of Women in South-Eastern Europe: the Hunt for Victims - Saša Leković, Investigative Journalist Centre, Zagreb, Croatia***

Serbia, Croatia and Bosnia and Herzegovina are at the intersection of numerous trafficking routes; yet, the media in these countries rarely include news items on human trafficking. Occasionally, the media picks up stories of individual victims being discovered, but this does not tend to lead to any in-depth coverage of the phenomenon of trafficking. Most stories are based upon police press briefings; some reporters also make use of information from NGOs, which sometimes contradicts the information supplied by the police. When reporting on individual cases, it is extremely important that the victim's identity is protected; the safety of the victim is paramount. When one journalist reports a victim's story, there is a danger that other journalists may try to track the victim down; the onus is on the original journalist to alert the victim and their family to this possibility and the potential danger that it poses to the victim's anonymity. Journalists should also remember that once the victim has returned home, the trauma of being trafficked is not necessarily over; the deeper trauma is usually long term and sometimes reintegration can be extremely difficult.

### ***7.4 The Making of 'Not Natasha' - Dana Popa, photojournalist and author of 'Not Natasha'***

'Not Natasha' is a photo exhibition prepared between 2006 and 2008, which tells the story of women from Moldova<sup>3</sup> who had been trafficked into sexual slavery. Natasha is a nickname given to prostitutes in some countries, and hated by the women in the photographs. All of the women photographed were former sex slaves who lived to tell their story. Some of the pictures were taken at the International Organization for Migration (IOM) Centre in Moldova, where women and girls recently rescued from traffickers are provided with shelter.

---

<sup>3</sup> This photo exhibition (as well as the documentary – see below) was not intended to draw attention to any particular country. On the contrary, the personal stories of the victims reflected in these photos (and the film) are typical of all countries of origin and destination in the OSCE region.

The traffickers lure women into exploitation by offering them jobs in wealthy foreign countries as retailers, nannies or bartenders. They offer to pay their travelling expenses, allowing the women to pay them back once they start working. However, once the women arrive in the country of destination, the traffickers immediately confiscate their passports, trap them in brothels and put them to work as prostitutes.

All of the women photographed were mothers. Some of them chose to leave Moldova to earn money for their families, but did not know that they would be exploited. Others became pregnant during their ordeal.

The project was completed with the help of IOM Moldova and Winrock International.

***7.5 Presentation of the Film ‘Sex Slaves’- Ric Esther Bienstock, Emmy Award-winning film Director/Producer of ‘Sex Slaves’ documentary, Canada***

Ric Bienstock presented the documentary film ‘Sex Slaves’, which she produced and directed. The idea for the documentary came about as a result of a visit she made to rural China, where she stayed in a hotel which was also used as a brothel. Two of the women working there were Russians who had been trafficked and were being moved from hotel to hotel to provide sexual services. The producer felt extremely frustrated about not being able to help the women and decided to try to do something else to help them and other victims through her film work.

The film was made for "Frontline", portraying a real life story as it unfolded using undercover camera work. The film included interviews with the various people who form the chain of human trafficking, from the recruiters and traffickers, the victims, and the service providers, to the family and the husband of a victim. In making such a film, it is of paramount importance to ensure that the victims are not exploited in order to get a story. There is a fine balance between producing something that is interesting to mainstream media and avoiding the use of hype. The producer found it challenging to gain the co-operation of NGOs, which she needed in order to interview a victim and make a strong film that would interest the general public. NGOs may fear that victims might feel beholden and agree to participate in filming even though they feel uncomfortable doing so. In filming victims, the producer was careful not to show anyone's face without their full understanding and consent, and engaged with lawyers and NGOs to ensure that everything was done responsibly and sensitively. It was the strength of the women themselves coming across in their stories that made the film so powerful. NGOs and international organizations may feel that the media is using them, but they also have to learn how to use the media. Some governments and organizations have received the rights to the film so they can use it in events that they sponsor worldwide to highlight the dangers of becoming a victim of trafficking.

## **8. Closing Remarks**

### ***8.1 Eva Biaudet, OSCE Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings***

It is clear that the financial crisis, worsening conditions for migrants, growing xenophobia and discrimination, job losses, reduced or non-payment of wages, and significantly reduced remittances affecting communities are all contributing to changing patterns of trafficking.



Restrictive immigration policies also create opportunities and incentives for human traffickers who prey on desperate people prepared to even accept exploitative conditions. The response to these challenges must include the creation of low-cost co-ordination mechanisms that can improve the targeting of anti-trafficking programmes and increase the speed of joint responses to these new threats, increasing knowledge and the sharing of experience on combating trafficking. There is also a need to find ways to collate reliable data on the real scope of human trafficking. If we analyse trafficking as a business model, it is clear that it is the enormous profits that drive the traffickers. Chasing the money trails and assets is an important activity in the fight against trafficking.

Respecting the dignity and rights of migrants is a critical part of the prevention of human trafficking. Authorities who protect the rights of migrants send a clear signal to the general public about compassion and humanity. We know that migrants, particularly those without language and other skills, are especially vulnerable to serious exploitation and enslavement. Prevention efforts have to be well-targeted to each vulnerable group and environment, and at their best are helpful and empowering for each individual. Furthermore, we must pursue a more gender-balanced and child-friendly approach to safe migration policies, also mobilizing young people to prevent trafficking. Every level of society can contribute to the prevention of modern-day slavery. The role of the local communities is especially important. Journalists, also, can create an environment in which exploitation, discrimination and impunity are no longer tolerated, and in which people are educated to understand the consequences of the demand for commercial sex and unprotected labour, and change their behaviour.

We must use a multi-stakeholder approach to curb trafficking and forced labour in the face of the global economic crisis. Strengthening co-operation between governments and businesses is vital, especially in introducing regulations and conducting monitoring to root out exploitative labour conditions. Codes of conduct are needed in businesses, international organizations and in the military in order to stop the production goods and services made with child and forced labour.

The UN Special Rapporteurs will develop methodologies and practical tools for collaboration with partners, a move which is most welcome. The OSCE will utilize the Alliance against Trafficking in Persons to contribute to joint country visits, joint reports and joint statements with other international organizations.

Together, we can ensure that each person who is free from exploitation means a rescued life.

## ***8.2 Madina Jarbussynova, Ambassador-at-Large, Kazakhstan***

Trafficking in human beings is modern-day slavery, which demands close attention from the international community, national governments and civil society. It is a crime that weakens economies, breaks up families and promotes violence. Trafficking has a multidimensional impact upon many, involving the most blatant of human rights violations. It is a transnational threat which requires co-operation between states and a comprehensive, cross-dimensional approach. The OSCE Action Plan to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings is one of the key documents that provides the framework for co-operation on this issue.

It is clear that we need to more effectively target the criminals responsible for trafficking and those benefiting from the exploitation of victims. The criminals responsible for trafficking improve their systems from year to year; this means that our counter-measures also have to

improve. Kazakhstan will continue to work on this issue during its Chairmanship of the OSCE in 2010.

Prevention of trafficking is paramount: as the title of the conference says, an ounce of prevention is worth a pound of cure.

*Annex I: Conference Agenda*

**AGENDA**  
**“ALLIANCE AGAINST TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS”**

**Prevention of Modern Slavery:  
“An Ounce of Prevention is Worth a Pound of Cure”**

Vienna, Hofburg, Neuer Saal  
14-15 September 2009

**Monday 14 September**

9.30-10.00                      Registration

10.00-10.20                      **Welcome and Opening Remarks**

*Ms. Mara Marinaki*, Ambassador, Permanent Mission of Greece to the OSCE

*Mr. Marc Perrin de Brichambaut*, OSCE Secretary General

10.20-10.45                      **Opening Addresses**

Secretary of State *Ms Hillary Rodham Clinton* (video address introduced by Ms. Carol S. Fuller, Chargé d'Affaires, a.i., U.S. Mission to the OSCE)

*Ms. Eva Biaudet*, OSCE Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings

10.45-11.30                      *Coffee break; Photo exhibition in Vorsaal*

11.30-13.00                      **Special Panel: Global Overview** – Showcasing efforts to decrease and prevent human trafficking by pursuing the human rights approach.

This Special Panel will provide a broad picture of UN activities in promoting the human rights and victim-centred approach in the fight against THB; child prostitution and child pornography; and new forms of slavery. The UN Special Rapporteurs will share their opinion on the significance and effectiveness of the Special Procedures under the UN Human Rights Council (regular reporting to the HRC) in mobilizing national efforts to prevent and combat all forms of THB, in better co-ordinating anti-trafficking activities, and ensuring reintegration of victims and the prevention of re-victimization. The session aims to give a new impetus for developing further co-operation between the OSCE SR and UN SRs.

Moderator: *Ms. Eva Biaudet*, OSCE Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings

*Ms. Joy Ngozi Ezeilo*, UN Special Rapporteur on Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children

*Ms. Najat M'jid Maalla*, UN Special Rapporteur on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography

*Ms. Gulnara Shahinian*, UN Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Slavery, its Causes and Consequences

Discussion

13.15-15.00      *Lunch – Hofburg, 2<sup>nd</sup> floor*

13.30-14.45      *Film Screening: Documentary “Sex Slaves” (Ric Esther Bienstock, Director)*

15.00-16.30      **Panel 2: Prevention by undermining the trafficking business model, going after the money trails, and decreasing vulnerability.**

This Panel will focus on the environment that causes vulnerabilities to human trafficking at the national and international levels, and will show how globalizing forces, informal and formal market participants, economic conditions and the political environment combine to facilitate, enhance or generate demand, making it profitable or playing a facilitative role. The participants will discuss multiple trafficking business models demonstrating sophisticated modus operandi of criminal groups, various features characterizing the activities of the perpetrators and ways to disrupt it preventing enslavement of victims and involvement of individuals into committing crime. This issue is in the centre of the research being undertaken under the UN Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking (UN.GIFT) Expert Group Initiative “Analyzing the business model and socio-economic causes of THB in order to decrease vulnerabilities to THB and to better prevent the crime”.

Moderator: *Mr. Anthony Steen*, Member of Parliament for Totnes, Chairman of All Party Parliamentary Group for Trafficking of Women and Children, United Kingdom

*Ms. Alexis Aronowitz*, International Consultant on Human Trafficking, the Netherlands

*Ms. Riikka Puttonen*, Office in Charge, Anti-Human Trafficking and Migrant Smuggling Unit, UNODC

*Ms. Gerda Theuermann*, independent expert on THB and migration, researcher/consultant of the OSCE/EGI Project under the UN.GIFT “Analyzing the business model and socio-economic causes of THB in order to decrease vulnerabilities to THB and to better prevent the crime,” Austria

*Mr. Duncan Parker*, Founder, Croydon Community Against Trafficking, the UK

Discussion

17.00      Closing

17.30- 18.45      *Film Screening: Documentary “Sex Slaves” (Ric Esther Bienstock, Director)*

## Tuesday 15 September

09.30-11.00

### **Panel 3: The impact of global financial crisis on THB and prevention of its consequences**

This Panel will provide a better understanding of actual and possible implications of the global financial crisis on vulnerabilities of populations in participating States, including the following: a considerable decrease in job opportunities for both nationals and migrant workers in the countries of origin and destination; high potential for discrimination at the job places; the impact on the level of living in countries of origin, as well as a possible increase in internal trafficking; the dynamics of labour migration in the situation of the crisis, its effect on economies of countries of origin (e.g. remittances) and return of migrants.

Moderator: *Mr. Goran Svilanovic*, OSCE Co-ordinator of Economic and Environmental Activities

*Mr. Roger Plant*, Head of Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour, ILO

*Mr. Isaku Endo*, Research Analyst, Financial Market Integrity Unit, the World Bank

*Ms. Jean Geran*, Senior Fellow, Legatum Institute in London, the UK

*Mr. Jonathan Martens*, Programme Specialist/Counter-Trafficking, IOM

Discussion

11.00-11.30

*Coffee break*

11.30-13.00

### **Panel 4: Best practices in prevention of THB**

This Panel will provide the OSCE participating States with an overview of best practices in existing approaches and programmes to prevent THB in the OSCE region including: awareness-raising and education; employment; empowerment / improved community life; crisis prevention; safe labour migration; job-vetting activities; demand reduction; prevention policies and legislation; and public-private partnerships. The session will be designed to address prevention of all forms of THB (THB for sexual exploitation, THB for labour exploitation, THB for organized begging, child trafficking, etc.)

Moderator: *Mr. Stephen Warnath*, Director, NEXUS Institute

*Ms. Ruth Rosenberg*, Independent Advisor and Consultant on Human Trafficking

*Ms. Azalia Dairbekova*, Director, Eurasia Foundation, Tajikistan

*Mr. Vincent Tournecueillert*, Regional Child Protection Officer For Central and South-Eastern Europe, Terre des hommes – Child Relief

*Ms. Ludmyla Gorova*, Chairperson Donetsk Counter-Trafficking NGO - Donetsk Regional League of Business and Professional Women, Ukraine

Discussion

13.15-15.00      *Lunch – Hofburg, 2<sup>nd</sup> floor*

13.45-14.45      *Presentation of recent publications (Room 201)*

15.00-17.00      **Panel 5: The Media’s role in the prevention of THB**

This Panel will address the critical role the media can play in the prevention of THB including through: raising awareness of the reality of THB, humanizing it, helping victims feel that they are not alone, providing access to reliable information on actual cases and on those complicit, to bring pressure to bear in the formation of government political will to combat TIP and monitor, and to report on the work of civil society and the government. The speakers will provide their vision of the responsibility of the media to cover TIP appropriately and accurately, not to sensationalize, stigmatize or blame the victim, or to further endanger or victimize the victim.

Moderator: *Ruth Pojman*, Deputy Co-ordinator, Office of the Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings, OSCE

*Ms. Nadezhda Azhgikhina*, founder of the Association of Russian Women Journalists, Secretary of the Union of Journalists of Russia and expert on THB and gender issues

*Mr. Sasa Lekovic*, investigative journalist, Croatia

*Ms. Dana Popa*, photojournalist (author of *Not Natasha*) along with 14 photos in exhibit, Romania

*Ms. Ric Esther Bienstock*, Emmy-Award-winning film Director/Producer of “Sex Slaves” documentary, Canada

Discussion

17.00      **Closing Remarks**

*Ms. Eva Biaudet*, OSCE Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings

*Ms. Madina Jarbussynova*, Ambassador-at-Large, Kazakhstan

17.30- 18.45      *Film Screening: Documentary “Sex Slaves” (Ric Esther Bienstock, Director)*