

# ► Initial review of community-based vocational training (CBVT) in G20 countries

Paper prepared for the 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the G20 Employment Working Group under Indonesia's Presidency

ILO

February 2022

## ▶ Table of contents

---

▶ Table of contents	2
▶ Executive Summary	3
▶ 1. Community-based vocational training – concepts and definitions	4
1.1 Definition of terms	4
1.2 Spotlight on the history of community-based vocational training	5
1.3 Methodology of the review	6
▶ 2. Governance of Community-Based Vocational Training	7
2.1 Community-Based Vocational Training as a sector	7
2.2 Community outreach and delivery by VET providers	8
2.3 Community-based organizations as service providers	10
▶ 3. Outreach, admission and targeting in community-based vocational training	11
3.1 Outreach institutions and recruitment	11
3.2 Admission criteria to training	13
▶ 4. Training design and delivery	17
4.1 Community involvement in needs identification and training design	17
4.2 Types of training delivery	17
4.3 Training and recruitment of trainers	20
▶ 5. Assessment, Certification, and Post-Training Support	21
5.1 Assessment and certification	21
5.2 Post training support	23
5.2.1 Facilitating access to wage employment	23
5.2.2 Facilitating small and micro-enterprises development	24
▶ 6. Conclusions	25
▶ 7. References	27
Additional resources	34

## ► Executive Summary<sup>1</sup>

---

This review provides an overview of Community-Based Vocational Training (CBVT) schemes and approaches in G20 countries with a focus on rural areas. It aims at informing policy debate and knowledge sharing among members of the G20 Employment Working Group.

The decentralized element in community-based vocational training opens opportunities for more demand-driven skills development through bottom-up approaches, more participatory planning and has the potential to activate disadvantaged groups, including rural women and youth and people with disabilities.

The review describes how CBVT is organized, governed, financed, and implemented in different countries, building on community structures and decentralized forms of management. It clusters countries into different types of schemes, provides examples of the role CBVT has played during the COVID-19 pandemic and the role information technology and ICTs play in skills design and delivery of CBVT.

The review points to a number of lessons learned in making CBVT realize its potential. They include:

1. **Link skills systems and governance to local demand:** importance of balancing centralised impulses within skills systems, designed to ensure national policy concerns are met, with the need for local autonomy in order to be responsive to the needs and aspirations of communities and local skills ecosystems. Regardless of the overall statutory distribution of governance responsibilities and powers, there needs to be a focus on making skills systems work across levels to serve local needs.
2. **Create networks between local actors:** it is essential to ensure that skills providers interact with local institutional environment and community to respond to local needs and economic potential and integrate socio-cultural and environmental concerns, rights and post-training support.
3. **Improve access and quality of CBVT:** CBVT often reaches populations who are not easily able to access decent formal work. This should not lead to systems that are “second best” and limit possibilities of progression within formal education and transition to formal employment. It is imperative to look at mechanisms for access, including stipends, flexible delivery, etc. Qualification systems that allow for progression and recognition of prior learning can play an important role but have often excluded the most marginalised in practice. Learning technologies can also play a role, but the existing inequalities of access to ICTs has to be addressed to avoid that online and distance learning does not further exclude the marginalised.
4. **Fully incorporate climate and environmental concerns:** As an approach that focuses on reaching those left behind by development, CBVT needs to be designed in ways that address the existential crises faced by many of its target populations regarding access to resources such as potable water. At the same time, there is an opportunity for CBVT to focus on skills that advance green jobs and greener economies.
5. **Build on partnership, participation and (local) social dialogue:** Workers and employers and their organizations are critical in ensuring that dialogue and collaboration with government and civil society partners is effective in addressing community concerns. CBVT as crucial element of lifelong learning strategies for all needs a framework for shared responsibility and commitment to facilitate local economic empowerment.

The COVID-19 pandemic has aggravated existing inequalities in access and participation in skills and lifelong learning for disadvantaged people living and working in rural and informal economies. It is therefore important that the G20 takes action to scale-up and strengthen CBVT to expand training opportunities for disadvantaged groups, particularly those in the rural sector, and include CBVT within national recovery strategies.

---

<sup>1</sup> The undertaking of this report has been made possible with the financial support of the EU funded project “Building partnerships on the future of work” which aims at promoting a global approach to the changing world of work, by protecting citizens and by finding workable and sustainable solutions to key challenges related to the changing nature of work. For more information, please see the [website](#).

## ► 1. Community-based vocational training – concepts and definitions

---

The Covid-19 pandemic has heavily affected global employment conditions and labour markets. In 2021, global labour productivity growth slowed down significantly, with negative growth in low- and lower-middle-income countries. As a result, the “productivity gap” between developing and advanced economies has grown. At the global level, people living in rural areas are twice as likely to be in informal employment as those in urban areas (80 per cent versus 44 per cent). Women and young people were more severely affected through job losses, higher exposure to occupational and health hazards, and increased unpaid care work (ILO 2021a, ILO 2021b).

Community-based vocational training (CBVT) – as an integral part of skills and lifelong learning systems – can strengthen the access and quality of training particularly for people in disadvantaged situations in rural communities. Skills development and lifelong learning are fundamental enablers of decent work, productivity and sustainability that can raise the value and output of labour, empower the lives of workers and enrich societies (ILO 2021c). They are integral components of strategies for sustainable growth and development. The ILO’s G20 Training Strategy (ILO 2010) had already highlighted the need to ensure broad access to training opportunities, for women and men, and particularly for those groups facing greater difficulties, in particular youth, lower skilled workers, workers with disabilities, and rural communities. The COVID-19 pandemic has put renewed emphasis on the need for approaches to skills and lifelong learning that target the most vulnerable and marginalized (ILO 2021d).

This paper provides an overview of Community-Based Vocational Training schemes and approaches in G20 countries with a focus on rural areas, including farm and off-farm activities. After a clarification of terms, a spotlight on its history, and the methodology applied for the review, chapter 2 will describe different governance arrangements of CBVT. Chapter 3 will discuss different outreach and recruitment strategies, chapter 4 delivery modalities, and chapter 5 assessment, certification and post-training support. Chapter 6 will provide conclusions and pointers for the policy debate.

### 1.1 Definition of terms

**Community-based vocational training** is understood as decentralized training for work, taking a particular focus on community-participation, self-advancement and empowerment, and on the inclusion of disadvantaged groups. It can be particularly relevant in rural areas, where there is little access to formal institutions. Typically, community-based vocational training covers the identification of local economic opportunities, training and post-training support (definition adapted from ILO 2011). The ILO’s Training for Rural Economic Empowerment is one of the well-proven methodologies for community-based training that has been implemented in over 20 countries.<sup>2</sup>

The term **TVET (Technical and Vocational Education and Training)** refers to education, training and skills development for a wide range of occupational fields, production sectors, services and livelihoods. TVET, as part of lifelong learning, can take place at secondary, post-secondary and tertiary levels and includes Work-Based Learning (WBL) and continuing training and professional development that may lead to qualifications. TVET also includes a wide range of skills development opportunities in national and local contexts. Learning to learn, the development of literacy and numeracy skills, transversal skills and citizenship skills are integral components of TVET. (UNESCO-UNEVOC n.d.)

**Skills**, formerly defined as “the ability to apply knowledge and use know-how to complete tasks and solve problems” (UNESCO-UNEVOC n.d.) has recently evolved into a more overarching term that refers to the ability to perform a task or a job, including the knowledge, competence and experience needed.

The term **qualification**, refers to the formal expression of vocational or professional abilities, recognized at international, national or sectoral levels. (ILO Human Resources Development Recommendation, 2004 (No. 195)).

**Skills development** refers to the full range of formal and non-formal vocational, technical and skills-based education and training for employment or self-employment, including pre-employment and livelihood education and training; TVET and apprenticeships in both secondary and tertiary education; training for employed workers, including in the workplace; and employment-oriented and labour market-oriented short courses for those seeking employment. (ILO 2010).

---

<sup>2</sup> [Training for Rural Economic Empowerment \(TREE\) \(ilo.org\)](https://www.ilo.org/training-for-rural-economic-empowerment)

In many countries, the terms “skills development”, “VET” and “TVET” are used interchangeably. However, for the purposes of this report, the term “skills development” is a broader term that refers to all formal, non-formal and informal learning that has some labour market or broader societal utility. In this report, the terms “VET” and “TVET” are retained when referred to in case studies and examples or cited from national or international sources (for definitions, see also ILO 2021c).

**Active Labour Market Policies (ALMPs)** are labour market policies that focus on stimulating employment and job creation through, for example, public works schemes, hiring subsidies, vocational training and retraining, and the promotion of small and medium enterprises and self-employment (ILO 2015a). The OECD defines ALMPs as: “all social expenditure (other than education) which is aimed at the improvement of the beneficiaries’ prospect of finding gainful employment or to otherwise increase their earnings capacity. This category includes spending on public employment services and administration, labour market training, special programmes for youth when in transition from school to work, labour market programmes to provide or promote employment for unemployed and other persons (excluding young and disabled persons) and special programmes for the disabled.” (OECD 2002). This means that skills-related ALMPs delivered in rural areas are included in CBVT, yet not all CBVT would be considered an ALMP, in particular if applying OECD’s definition.

The term **lifelong learning** has also evolved greatly since its emergence more than 100 years ago. During the second half of the twentieth century, it was mostly known for recognizing the role of adult learning or continuing education in addition to school education, TVET and higher education. The term began to assume a central role as a principle to prepare individuals to learn continuously over their life span during the policy debates in the 1990s after the release of the Delors report in 1996, which proposed the concept of “learning throughout life”. It gave equal weight to the concepts of “learning to know”, “learning to be”, “learning to live together” and finally “learning to do”, which recognized the value of learning and skills development for employment. (ILO 2021c; ILO 2019).

## 1.2 Spotlight on the history of community-based vocational training

Historically, rural skills development has often been prioritised in response to external pressures such as environmental challenges or concerns about rural-urban migration. Famous historical examples here include the land grant colleges of the USA from the 1860s. In the global South, rural skills development was relatively neglected in the period after the Second World War, a period coinciding with large scale decolonisation in Africa and Asia. Industrial take-off dominated the skills agenda, with major expansions of urban skills programmes and university level programmes for professions. However, by the late 1960s, there were growing policy concerns that the growth of formal urban employment had been less than expected, with related concerns about the size of the urban informal economy and of rural-urban migration. Alongside a focus on training for the informal sector, led by the ILO (reviewed in Fluitman 1989), the late 1960s saw a range of national initiatives to build rural skills in new institutions such as the Kenyan village polytechnics (National Christian Council of Kenya 1967) and the Botswanan brigades (van Rensburg 1974). This was part of a broader movement to address rural poverty (Coombs and Ahmed 1974).

The ILO’s portfolio around community-based vocational training designed to promote and support income and employment-generating activities for poor rural people expanded in the 1980s, became known as a training methodology under the term Training for Rural Gainful Activities (TRUGA) in the 1990s and evolved into the Training for Rural Economic Empowerment (TREE) methodology in the early 2000s, still used today (ILO 1993; ILO 2017).

Although the ILO has continued to support CBVT, the overall skills development field saw a turn towards a governance focus from the 1990s, resulting in a “VET toolkit” (McGrath and Lugg 2012) that concentrated attention on such policy instruments as qualifications frameworks, sectoral skills bodies and outcomes-based funding. Within some agencies, such as DFID or AFD, a focus on sustainable livelihoods did emerge in the late 1990s that might have revitalised the rural skills agenda. However, this coincided with a decline in donor support to skills development as lying outside the key policy priorities of the Millennium Development Goals. As a result, livelihoods and skills were not strongly articulated in many agencies. Moreover, as urbanisation has continued, there is a strong sense that cities are the priority both of growth and poverty reduction strategies (McGrath et al. 2020).

### **1.3 Methodology of the review**

The methodology used for this rapid review included a review of literature on community-based, rural skills training, research articles, including grey literature such as internet websites and reports of national or international organizations. G20 countries were scanned for relevant case studies.

## ► 2. Governance of Community-Based Vocational Training

---

There are a number of different approaches to community based vocational training, and each approach has a number of possible approaches to governance.

Some of the main distinctions are:

- Whether funding and direction are at the national level, devolved to subnational authorities or a mix of the two.
- The extent to which vocational training is considered part of the education system or part of labour/human resources development. This may be reflected in the Ministries responsible, whether Education, Labour, or others (such as agriculture or rural development), or a mix.
- The role of formal educational institutions, who may be direct providers of CBVT or work in different ways to support community-based providers
- The role of stakeholders from community, employers, workers and the education community in shaping policy and operations.

A key difference from a governance perspective is the way in which “community based” is understood. From the current review, three possible streams arise:

1. Community based adult education including vocational training is seen as a distinct sector within the broader public sector and is regulated and articulated within the education/training system.
2. Formal and regulated non formal training providers seek to improve the quality of their service to rural, isolated and disadvantaged groups through outreach, partnerships and tailored services.
3. Vocational training services are delivered by community organizations not part of formal education or training or a dedicated CBVT sector, in some contexts selected through a competitive, contracted approach.

The main characteristics of each and the governance strategies associated with them are described in the following sections. As a preliminary review, this is not to be considered either comprehensive or definitive but offers a possible framework for further research. It should also be acknowledged that each country noted may have elements of more than one approach in addition to that noted here as an example.

### 2.1 Community-Based Vocational Training as a sector

Australia, Italy, the UK, the Republic of Korea and South Africa all have, to a greater or lesser degree, a formal approach to establishing and regulating a community-based education sector that includes VET. This is characterized by some form of legislative authority (for example the Australian Ministerial Declaration, the South African Constitution and related legislation, the UK’s Adult Education Budget), an established budget and/or revenue source (such as South Africa’s skills levy). (Claphams and Vickers 2017; OECD 2020a)

Italy, the USA and Canada all have sub-national (state and provincial) formal learning institutions (community colleges in the USA and Canada, CPIA’s in Italy) that are established as part of the overall education system by relevant government authorities (Ministries of education/higher education) but operate as autonomous institutions with their own premises, staff and governing bodies, who may include members of the local community, employers and other stakeholders. These institutions provide employment-oriented training for adults, usually drawn from the local area and often emphasizing access for the disadvantaged. (Fletcher and Friedel 2017; EU Eurydice: Italy 2022; Cedefop 2017)

Australia has a federally established and regulated community education sector, although state and territorial governments establish detailed policies for their operation. Adult Community Education (ACE) is a recognized part of the overall TVET system with some providers being Registered Training Organizations (RTO) able to offer fully recognized training and credentials, others providing training in association with RTO’s to better serve specialized populations (Adult Learning Australia 2020). The UK has historically had a formally recognized Adult Community Education sector (Local Government Association 2020), with local authorities having a statutory responsibility to provide adult learning services. Recent budget and policy changes have consolidated adult learning budgets into a single fund, with spending authority devolved to sub-national governments and large municipalities.

The Republic of Korea recognized the importance of lifelong access to education, including employment related vocational education in its 1999 “Lifelong Education Law”, under which cities and regions provide access to learning of two types: “life enrichment” and “employability”. Lifelong employability training is developed by state and local governments under the direction of the Ministry of Employment and Labour. While the majority of employment training may be delivered by formal providers such as polytechnic universities, by situating this stream in the context of lifelong adult learning the approach has some similarities to those countries where community-based learning has the characteristics of a sector. Funding is through the National Employment Insurance Fund, which specifies that training must be delivered at a registered institution. Individuals have a lifelong learning voucher (“Tomorrow Learning Card”) which they can use to pay costs of training they select (OECD 2020a; Lee 2017).

South Africa positions community education within an overall post school education and training landscape. The National Department of Higher Education and Training has system oversight. The TVET system was previously under separate Departments of Education and Labour and this legacy is reflected in current funding arrangements. Public TVET colleges are financed through the education budget, whilst a series of occupational programmes are funded through a national skills levy on payroll, with 80% of the funds administered by Skills and Education Training Authorities (SETAs): 21 organizations representing different economic sectors. These SETAs have tripartite governance and are responsible for identifying skills needs and funding training. The remaining 20% of the levy goes to the National Skills Fund which supports a range of activities, including the Community Education and Training Colleges. There is one college per province, and they operate more than 2,500 Community Learning Centres and satellites where vocational and other skills are taught (OECD 2019; Powell and McGrath 2019; Helen Suzman Foundation n.d.).

This general approach to governance of community-based VET includes a number of common features:

#### Key points: Community-Based Vocational Training as a sector

- ▶ Formal legislative recognition of the sector (whether direct or indirectly as a budget item)
- ▶ Devolved formal government authorities
- ▶ Explicit governance role for communities (for institutions or for community-based providers)
- ▶ Articulation of the training provided within a national training system.

## 2.2 Community outreach and delivery by VET providers

The challenge of enabling access to quality VET training for rural, remote and other populations with special needs (such as indigenous and tribal peoples, or persons with disabilities) has been met in a number of countries through outreach by existing institutions or the development of specific training strategies for specific populations. Mexico and Argentina have each explored ways of making their institution-based training accessible and relevant to a wider range of students.

In Mexico, over 80% of higher education institutions operate outreach programming supporting community-based training and development. This is within the broader framework of governance where the Ministry of Public Education (SEP) has overall responsibility, and the national system of competency standards and certification is governed by a tripartite board. Each Mexican state has responsibility for education within the national framework, and some states and locations have implemented the dual system of TVET (Baronnet and Bermúdez Urbina 2019; UNESCO-UNEVOC 2018a).

Argentina has a similar approach to national/provincial governance of TVET, with the Ministry of Education and National Institute of Technological Education responsible for major policy direction, with stakeholder participation on a Commission with representation from provinces and region; and a tripartite National Council of Education, complemented by sectoral skills councils. Based on needs determined by provincial governments, the Ministry provides “mobile classrooms”: transportable, fully equipped learning facilities to areas where access to formal VET is limited. These mobile classrooms provide training specific to employment opportunities identified locally (INET 2021).

Japan does not include VET within its approach to community-based adult education. However, the formal TVET system does make provision for local governance, involvement of local structures and individuals in governance, and creating access for specific groups through locally developed solutions. The national level of government provides overall financial support and advice, but implementation is the responsibility of the 47 prefectures, each of whom works with local public



and private training institutions, the employment service, employers and social welfare offices to develop training for unemployed and employed workers and new labour market entrants (NIER 2011).

Brazil's comprehensive approach to TVET includes one element specifically dedicated to rural / agricultural skills training coupled with technical assistance to agricultural producers. The SENAR system is a network of rural training centres working in partnership with local business owners to provide vocational skills to the local population. As part of the overall VET system, it is under tripartite governance (World Bank 2007; CNA n.d.; ILO 2020a).

Indonesia's national "Training for Work" system establishes vocational training centres (BLK) that deliver short term, employment-oriented training. These centres are regulated by the national Ministry of Manpower but operational responsibility rests with regional or district governments. BLK Komunitas (over 2100) are established from the "bottom up" by community organizations (which may include religious organizations, local schools, and labour unions) (Fitriani 2021). They deliver training defined by the national competency standards system. Initial funding for BLK Komunitas is from government but they are expected to become self-sustaining over time. This approach reflects a formally grounded (in the national skills system and manpower development strategies) approach to developing a community-based infrastructure of vocational training provision (Wicaksono et al. 2022).

Germany's dual system is another example of linking local or community-based provision within a formal system. National level vocational training regulations are implemented through state MoEs (that run vocational schools) and industry chambers that include employers and in some cases worker organizations. Vocational schools collaborate with employers to deliver company-level training plans for apprentices, monitored by chambers. Continuing education and training in Germany is very heterogenous, highly complex and diverse in its governance, with very little national direction. The first National Skills Strategy on CET/adult education was launched in 2019 (Cedefop 2019b; Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy of German 2021).

Turkey has a comprehensive approach to VET provision under the Ministry of National Education, with significant participation by employers' associations at the national and provincial levels. The provincial level National Education Directorates in each of the 81 provinces have responsibility for school management and evaluation, while the administrative boards for VET schools include a range of local stakeholders including municipal government, professional and sectoral organizations (ETF 2021b).

France defines lifelong learning, including VET, as a right and provides for VET training and qualification through a number of mechanisms. At the national level responsibility for different elements is distributed across a number of Ministries (initial TVET in Education, continuing VET in Labour, for example), while regions are responsible for organizing and delivering VET as part of labour force services. Social partners are involved in advice on regulation, qualifications and collection of skills levy funds. Overall coordination is through "France Compétence" which oversees funding (ILO/UNESCO 2018). Russia also views lifelong learning as an important element of VET provision, which is delivered primarily by formal institutions, and through employers under the overall direction of the Ministry of Education and Science which establishes the national legislative, policy and funding frameworks, with advice from sectoral boards and commissions including social partners. Delivery is at the regional level through networks of training centres, bolstered by the introduction of 7 inter regional centres of competence (UNESCO-UNEVOC 2021a; ETF 2020c).

China sees community-based education and VET as key to rural development, but to date most development in this area has been strongly 'top down', with district community education centres overseeing township schools and village schools. These have little involvement by community stakeholders (Du and Wang 2015; Zhou 2019). Similarly, Saudi Arabia's drive to dramatically increase the skills and employability of Saudi citizens (The Kingdom of Saudi Arabia 2021) has prompted the development of a range of locally available options including community colleges along the US model, but without the corresponding elements of local control and governance. Overall TVET in Saudi Arabia is driven by the Technical and Vocational Training Corporation under the Ministry of Labour (UNESCO-UNEVOC 2022; Almannie 2015; International Trade Administration 2019).

Common issues in governance for this general approach include:

#### Key points: Community outreach and delivery by VET providers

- ▶ Overall responsibility from a national Ministry of Education, Labour or workforce development, with operational or detail responsibility devolved to lower-level governments.
- ▶ Linkage to sectoral education/workforce development bodies with tripartite membership
- ▶ Defined role for formal VET institutions including skills qualification frameworks and defined curricula, teacher training, quality assurance and remote delivery.

## 2.3 Community-based organizations as service providers

In many countries, including those that may also have other approaches to community-based VET, community-based organizations are seen as contracted providers of specific VET services within either education or workforce development programmes.

India, Canada and the USA all have national skills development policies or strategies that are delivered through a competitive bid process, which may favour for-profit or not-for-profit entities, locally based or large-scale providers, etc., depending on the orientation of the commissioning agency and government (Wood 2018; US Department of Education 2020).

India's national policy on skills development established a National Skills Development Corporation with the explicit aim of leveraging private sector investment and involvement in VET. Service providers may be private companies, NGOs and public or private formal training institutions, all regulated by the National Council for Vocational Education and Training (Ministry of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship of India 2015; Chandrasekar and Murugesan 2019).

In Canada and the USA, national level funding for training for adults is distributed to States and Provinces, who are responsible for developing plans for delivery. In the US, state level workforce development boards will advise of this, in Canada, some Provinces have sector-based skills advisory bodies. There is no formally required tripartite structure for these in either country. Funds are normally distributed by state or provincial government departments to qualified providers based on criteria which may include meeting educational or other standards. In some jurisdictions this process has been fully privatized, with funds allocated by for-profit organizations. In these circumstances, community-based organizations may be successful as providers but there is no broader regulatory or financial support for their existence as a sector (US Department of Labour 2022; Government of Canada 2020a). The challenges community based organizations face in connecting effectively with employers to ensure that the training they provide is relevant and leads to employment is discussed in a report by the US Urban Institute, with observations that relate to all community based providers. (Spaulding and Blount 2018)

Some common themes in governance from these examples are:

#### Key points: Community-based organizations as service providers

- ▶ Lack of any defining or overarching regulatory framework for community-based VET
- ▶ In some contexts, a competitive approach to selection of service providers
- ▶ Limited role in governance of community-based organizations for sectoral or tripartite organizations.

## ► 3. Outreach, admission and targeting in community-based vocational training

---

Community-based vocational training aims to reach people who face additional barriers to access skills and lifelong learning. Barriers may exist due to lack of formal training infrastructure and offers in rural or remote areas, or because personal or socio-economic characteristics of some groups hinder their access to training.

Among G20 countries, some have dedicated strategies, approaches or systems that address the lack of training infrastructure in rural areas, such as Argentina, Brazil, Indonesia, or South Africa. Argentina uses mobile training workshops set up in remote areas for two to four months, Brazil has a dedicated training agency for rural areas (SENAR), Indonesia runs Centers for Community Learning Activities (PKBM) and community-based vocational training centres (BLK Komunitas), and South Africa a network of 2500 Community Learning Centres and Satellite Learning Centres, in addition to its rural public TVET colleges and campuses, public and private agricultural colleges.

Other countries use community-based approaches to help overcome access barriers for specific groups as part of overall skills development systems. Countries including Argentina, Australia, Brazil, Canada, Mexico, and the US have prioritized CBVT approaches to take account of indigenous and tribal peoples' cultural identity and values, traditional knowledge and associated skills and environment. Other countries apply community-based approaches to better serve poor people, as in the Indian National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM), or community-based rehabilitation approaches for persons with disabilities in India and the US.

A third group of countries does not appear to have specific strategies for community-based vocational training. In these countries skills provision is organized in a very decentralized way, leaving room for local initiative and management as part of the system design. The German dual apprenticeship system, based on partnership between vocational schools, local employers, and business chambers, with the involvement of workers' organizations, is a well-known example (BIBB, n.d.).

### 3.1 Outreach institutions and recruitment

In order to reach target communities and beneficiaries, countries use a wide range of **outreach institutions and approaches**. In Canada, for example, social workers inform people receiving social assistance about employment-related support or training they are eligible for. Displaced people learn about offers through their employment insurance benefits. Others would be referred from specialized services, such as those who cater to immigrants, or professional bodies that offer trades training (Griffin-Cohen 2004). In Indonesia, village heads in remote areas facilitate outreach and recruitment of beneficiaries. In India, service providers of the NSDC or NRLM use existing government infrastructure or premises of employers to promote training services, apprenticeships and RPL. NGOs and private vocational training institutions also organize "melas", where training or job opportunities are offered and candidates are enrolled. (Ministry of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship, 2020) In the United Kingdom, Adult Community Education (ACE) services are often based at centres in the heart of disadvantaged communities. They are important hubs not only for learning but also for information-sharing in the community and collaboration among different services (Local Government Association 2020; UK Parliament 2020). Community information campaigns are common practice in Canada, too, where services on offer are advertised through different channels, like local radio, newspapers, posters, and leaflets, in addition to the internet (Griffin-Cohen 2004). In Turkey, school and community events and family meetings help raise awareness about vocational education and training available, with special attention for girls (Ministry of Labour and Social Security 2018). In Saudi Arabia, outreach to communities is delivered through television, the internet, newspaper advertisements and publications, and advertisements at mosques and health centres, under the 'Learning Neighbourhood' program that offers educational and vocational training for less-privileged women (Hanemann et al. 2017).

**Agricultural extension services** can also deliver community-based vocational training. In addition to government-provided centralized services, usually under Ministries of Agriculture, some countries have implemented community-based extension services, e.g., the Indian agricultural technology management agency (ATMA) model. Run by a multi-stakeholder board, the agency reaches out to farmer groups. This model has been assessed along with the farmer field schools approach, promoted by the FAO in many countries, including in Indonesia (Feder et al. 2004; Feder et al. 2010). Community-based approaches have the advantage of being more flexible and better reach resource-poor farmers in

marginalised areas (Lotz et al 2016). However, elite capture, low capacity of service providers, deep-seated cultural attitudes that prevent an effective empowerment of farmers, and difficulties in implementing farmers' control of service providers' contracts, were some of the challenges identified (Feder et al. 2010; Warburton and Coupe 2012). In some G20 countries, such as South Africa, this has led to attempts to reform agricultural extension officer education to focus more closely on the needs of the communities that extension is supposed to serve. In India, this has been supported by the inception of the Agricultural Skills Council of India (Brown and Majumdar 2020).

**Workers and Employers' organizations** also engage in promoting training offers at local and community-levels. In Germany, local business chambers not only promote dual apprenticeship among local employers, but also register apprenticeship contracts, monitor the training and organize final assessments (Federal Ministry of Economic Affairs 2017). In the UK, the program Unionlearn supports workers in acquiring skills and qualifications to improve their employability. Union Learning Representatives (ULRs) within enterprises encourage learning in the workplace, help workers identify their training needs and arrange learning opportunities within their companies. Unionlearn provides learning opportunities to about 250 000 workers per year, particularly benefitting workers with no or low qualification levels (Global Deal/ILO/OECD 2020).

**Employment services** in most G20 countries provide information on skills training programs available, guidance and counselling to individuals and groups to select the most suitable program on offer. In many countries employment services implement or sub-contract training programmes and provide supports such as stipends, subsidies, assistance with transport or child care costs, and other measures to enable access. They also play important roles in local networking, partnerships, and helped greatly cushion the effects of the COVID pandemic (ILO 2020b). In order to increase outreach to rural and remote areas, contracted services and partnerships with other providers have become more widespread in recent years (Powers 2017). Argentina, Mexico, Russia and Turkey, for example, provide services through NGOs, PrEAs and partner local governments to extend service reach (OECD 2015). In Denmark, a career guidance café in Vapnagaard was established to reach disadvantaged youth and provide career guidance through group and individual counselling, (ETF 2020b, p. 47). In France, where local public employment offices of Pole Emploi have autonomy to contract providers locally, a special service has been set up for young people, the "missions locales", see Box 1.

► **Box 1: "Missions locales" in France to improve outreach to young people**

At the local level, the "missions locales" are responsible for identifying, welcoming, providing information, vocational guidance and support for young people aged 16 to 25 to help them build professional and life projects. They are overseen by the Ministry of Labour and have a privileged partnership with the Public Employment Service. "Missions locales" have an NGO status but sign a multi-year agreement with the State. This allows the negotiation of objectives, means and results, based on a shared diagnosis of the needs of the territory to promote access of young people to employment. They don't directly offer training activities but rely on existing governmental and local training structures, encourage local partnerships to build actions adapted to the needs of young people and local realities, and follow the young people's progress until set objectives are achieved.

Source: <https://www.mission-locale.fr/>

Digital outreach and guidance services increased in prominence during the COVID-19 pandemic when face-to-face services were halted in most G20 countries (Cedefop et al. 2020). While most ICT-based services have national outreach, they can also promote local service delivery and community-based vocational training, depending on how they are set up (Cedefop 2018a). Khetha in South Africa, a multi-channel career development platform under the Department of Higher Education and Training, provides free access to career information, advice and guidance through telephone, SMS, face-to-face, print, a website, a mobile site or social media, and outreach to schools among others. The Khetha radio programme is broadcast weekly in 10 official languages as has wide coverage in rural areas (ILO forthcoming; Khetha 2017).

Another interesting example are "**Cités de Métier**", which are places for career education and guidance open to everyone irrespective of age or labour market status. They offer information and resources to help people take appropriate career choices, find training, skill recognition, employment or self-employment services. They bring together professionals from the fields of counselling and professional life, offer free access documentation on employment, careers and vocational training, IT resources and multimedia areas, one-day information sessions, symposia and meetings organised by the Cité's partners or through external partners. Providers can obtain the "Cité de Métier" label. Among G20 countries, France, Germany, Italy and Canada, as well as 3 other EU countries form part of this network of career guidance providers (OECD 2019).

## 3.2 Admission criteria to training

Community-based vocational training programmes often have more flexible admission criteria than formal education and training programmes, in particular if they include non-formal training and target disadvantaged learners. Providers, however, also need to ensure that learners have a sufficient level of literacy or basic numeracy to be able to follow the course. For this reason, remedial courses can be offered in functional literacy or other basic skills.

Formal vocational training options in India either with Industrial Training Institutes (ITIs) or the numerous training programmes offered through the NSDC usually need a minimum of 10<sup>th</sup> Standard high school education. Some trades require only up to 8<sup>th</sup> Standard high school entry level to ensure the required level of literacy and numeracy of an applicant (Sharma and King 2019). Training under the National Rural Livelihoods project, by contrast, was not restricted to schooling levels (3iE 2020).

Community colleges in the US are generally 'open admission' meaning that there are few or no entrance requirements other than age (generally age 18), and many do not require completion of secondary education. Students are normally drawn from the local community. Course fees are very low, particularly compared with four-year universities, and for some students, fees are waived (Fletcher and Friedel 2017). In Saudi Arabia, admission to Community Colleges is free (Almannie 2015).

Another mechanism to allow for admission of people that do not possess the formal requirements to access a learning program is the validation and recognition of prior learning (RPL). RPL systems (see also chapter 5) facilitate access either to education and training, or to the labour market by providing qualifications to people who have the skills but not the formal credentials to prove their competence. Many European countries have introduced systems for the validation and recognition of non-formal and informal learning. Cedefop maintains and updates an inventory, guidelines, case studies and a database of country systems (Cedefop/European Commission/ICF 2019). Many regions and trade sectors in India have developed assessments for "Recognition of Prior Learning" based certification for informal economy workers who have gained experience on the job and can now be certified as crafts people from the respective trades. The objective of RPL in India, called "Pradhan Mantri Kaushal Vikas Yojana" (PMKVY) is to align the competencies of the unregulated workforce of the country to the standardized National Skills Qualification Framework (NSQF) and thereby provide an opportunity for informal sector workers to access formal training and upskilling opportunities (PMKVY 2021). A tracer study showed that wages of successful candidates had increased on average by four per cent six months after recognition and that 60 percent of respondents expressed interest in pursuing further skill training (Rothboeck et al. 2018).

Countries may implement community-based vocational training programs for specific target groups with distinct needs. Programs often have national reach but promote training at the community level, since this is where barriers to participation in training are best overcome. People face additional disadvantage if multiple factors for vulnerabilities intersect, such as for a disabled woman living in a rural remote area. Additionally, COVID-19 has disproportionately affected those who were already facing disadvantages (Avis et al. 2021).

### ► Box 2: Making VET accessible to disadvantaged populations in Australia

A 2018 study by the Australian National Centre for Vocational Education Research found that some regions had succeeded in achieving high levels of participation and completion for disadvantaged learners, meaning indigenous learners, learners with a disability, learners from a culturally and linguistically diverse (CALD) background, people who are unemployed, or have low levels of prior educational attainment. These regions had focused on institution-wide initiatives to support learners, built strong community partnerships with employers and service agencies, and developed mechanisms of individualized support for learners. The paper's authors noted that "Community-owned providers had a particularly good understanding of local labour market needs, often through long-term association with the community or locality. They also had reputations for trustworthiness and success in engaging high-need learners."

Source: NCVET 2018.

**Poor people in rural areas** in India receive services through the National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM). The program promotes the creation of women's 'Self-help group' (SHG) interventions that inspire a cohesive community effort to problem solving with a focus on creating community institutions of the poor. Self-Help-Groups are linked to village organizations and these to cluster-level federations to improve local networking and mutual learning. Links to financial institutions, social protection and other government departments were also fostered. An impact evaluation by 3iE (2020) between 2012 and 19 showed that the scheme was successful in supporting financial inclusion and access to credit for

members; however, only a small number of group enterprises were operational. Also in India, Deen Dayal Upadhyaya Grameen Kaushalya Yojana has placed more than half a million rural youth in employment since 2014 (Ministry of Rural Development 2020). In Mexico, it is the Public Employment Service, Servicio Nacional de Empleo, that runs a self-employment promotion programme intended to reach low-income workers in mainly rural communities affected by poverty and lack of opportunities to sustain a stable livelihood (ILO 2018c). In China, the Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security has launched a campaign to expand vocational education in particular in rural areas by 2025 and waives tuition fees for vocational schools and provides financial support for students from low-income households in rural areas. The national polytechnic, DUOC, also provides complementary feeding, transport and materials programmes for poor and marginalised learners (UNESCO-UNEVOC 2021b).

**Women** are often beneficiaries of community-based programs given on the one hand their lower participation in lifelong learning and the labour force due to care responsibilities and socio-cultural norms and barriers; on the other hand, their stronger involvement in community activities that go beyond a purely economic role. In South Africa, 71 percent of learners at the over 2500 Community Learning Centres and Satellite Learning Centres are women. Moreover, women form the majority of staff at these locations (OECD 2019). In the Republic of Korea, the Occupational Centre for Women (OCW) in Ansan City, Republic of Korea, has offered training and employment services to women on behalf of the Ministry of Gender, Equality and Family since 2009. Women who have been out of the active labour force for a long time find it difficult to approach the centre, lacking either information or self-confidence. Therefore, the OCW works with community centres to organize weekly visits to the centres, markets and other public places where women gather, as well as to industrial parks and neighbourhoods that are difficult to reach. This strategy proved successful: one-to-one support combining counselling from social workers with career guidance, training and job-search support from employment counsellors is effective in helping women access training and to find jobs (ILO 2018a).

**Indigenous and tribal people** may also face discriminatory attitudes in school and training environments, language barriers and the non-adaptation of learning materials to their needs, which can lead to early dropout. According to the UN, in Latin America and the Caribbean only 40 per cent of indigenous children completed secondary education out of the 85 per cent who initially enrolled (UN 2016). Community-based education and training can be successful in improving outreach and adapting learning offers to the needs of indigenous and tribal people. In Canada, there is a separate program stream for Canada's Indigenous people, The Indigenous Skills and Employment Training (ISET) Program, see Box 3.

### ► Box 3: The Indigenous Skills and Employment Training Program (ISET) in Canada

In 2016 and 17, extensive consultations with indigenous partners and organizations led to the revision of the Aboriginal Skills and Employment Training Strategy (ASETS) into the new Indigenous Skill and Employment Training Program (ISET). The program is co-developed with Indigenous partners; provides increased funding and greater flexibility for organizations to design programming and recognizes, respects and reflects differences between indigenous peoples, specifically the First Nations, Métis and Inuit. The program funds indigenous service delivery organizations that design and deliver job training. For outreach purposes, indigenous organizations use success stories of indigenous men and women who succeeded in their career to attract others.

Source: Government of Canada 2020b; OECD 2018.

In Australia, Waltja Tjutangku Palyapayi, an Aboriginal NGO, partners with accredited training providers to deliver training to indigenous communities living in rural areas (UNESCO-UNEVOC 2021b).

**Migrant workers and refugees** are another significant group of people requiring specific assistance, including language instruction, help with education or professional certification recognition, and work permits to facilitate their labour market inclusion (Wedekind et al. 2019). In Canada, there are professional bodies, such as the College of Midwives or the Chartered Professional Accountants of Canada that deliver training and certification in their fields of specialization. Canada brings in many highly trained and professionally certified immigrants who need to either qualify or retrain to Canadian standards. In other countries, such as France, Germany and South Africa, systems of national qualifications and / or recognition of prior learning have been used to integrate migrant and refugees into national skills systems (Wedekind et al. 2019). Turkey hosts large numbers of refugees (around 3.6 Mio) who have in principle access to the local labour market under temporary protection schemes. However, many are confined to work in the informal economy due to lack of relevant skills or available job opportunities in the formal labour market. Box 4 describes how local authorities engage in skills development to enhance outreach and provide more targeted services to refugees and host communities.

► **Box 4: Labour market integration of refugees in Turkey through skills development, work-based learning and apprenticeship facilitated by municipalities**

While the Government of Turkey has responded to the needs of refugees at the national level through a comprehensive legal framework, local authorities have also taken on additional responsibilities and extended their services to cover education, employment services, shelter provision and other services. The Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality (IBB) for example works with women cooperatives and regional employment offices (accredited private employment agencies) to deliver rights-based employment services (job placement, vocational and job counselling). Skills development, in particular if combined with work-based learning, is a promising avenue for socio-economic inclusion for refugees. The Turkish apprenticeship system is a part of the formal education and based on local partnerships between vocational training schools and employers. It has hosted around 3000 Syrian refugee until 2021, including with the support of the ILO. Measures included promoting apprenticeship opportunities in refugee communities and building the capacity of TVET and company trainers to create inclusive learning environments. In addition, a new 6-month work-based learning programme in collaboration with employers' organizations in Adana, Ankara, Bursa, Denizli, Gaziantep is being implemented for refugees and host community members. Participation is encouraged through financial incentives, child care provision, and training support.

Sources: Özer 2021; OECD/ILO 2017; ILO/MLSS/KfW/BMZ. 2022; ILO n.d.; ILO Ankara Office.

**Informal economy workers** have been particularly hard hit during the COVID-19 pandemic. Indonesia, for example, doubled its funding for the Kartu Pra-Kerja (Pre-employment Card Programme) from 10 trillion Indonesian rupiah (IDR) to IDR20 trillion (US\$1.3 billion), which funds skills training of unemployed workers. The programme targets about 5.6 million informal workers and SMEs affected by the pandemic (ILO/WB/UNESCO 2021).

**Persons with disabilities** benefit from community-based rehabilitation, a multi-sectoral approach to meet the health, education, vocational skills and livelihood needs of children, youth and adults with disabilities. The WHO introduced CBR in the late 1970s primarily as a service delivery method aimed at bringing primary health care and rehabilitation services closer to people with disabilities in low- and middle-income countries. It evolved to a multisectoral approach, supported by many international organizations including the ILO, aimed at equalization of opportunities and social inclusion of people with disabilities (WHO 2010; ILO 2008). In the Republic of Korea, disability-inclusive CBVT approaches are implemented through so-called integrated job-centered schools that operate within select general schools and provide vocational education and training for students with disabilities and offer an array of services including business or industry field trips, community based work experiences within vocational rehabilitation facilities and local businesses, supported employment, follow-up support, and family support (Chun et al. 2016; Song et al, 2012; Yoon, 2012).

**Disadvantaged youth**, often referred to as NEET, not in education, training or employment, have been high on the development agenda, including in the EU (Eurofound 2021), reinforced through the COVID crisis (ILO 2020c; ILO 2021e), with CBVT in many countries also prioritizing disadvantaged young people. In the EU, the European Youth Goals (2019-27) include a dedicated goal on "Moving rural youth forward" (Youth3Europe n.d.). Japan faces a unique societal problem called "hikikomori" that describes a state of acute social withdrawal that concerns an estimated 320,000 young people below the age of 30. Hikikomori and their families can receive help at one of the 67 Community Hikikomori Support Centres run by the prefectural governments. The centres provide counselling and referral to mental health services or other specialised providers including the Regional Youth Support Stations (RYSS). The public employment service "Hello Work" (HW) collaborates and provides intensive job placement services (OECD, 2017). In Latin America, including Argentina, several programmes referred to as "Programas Jovenes" have been implemented and evaluated (Almeida et al 2012; ILO 2015b).

**People in conflict with the law** might also benefit from special programs, such as the Hacemos Futuro (We make the future) program in Argentina, where people under 35 years charged with misdemeanors are offered either completion of studies, or vocational training courses. The objective is to increase the access of the holders to formal education, comprehensive professional training and trades, tertiary or university careers, encourage participation in socio-community practices, promote the development of social and emotional skills, vocational skills, improve their socio-economic environment and prevent further violence (ECLAC 2020).

► **Box 5: Financial incentives for retraining and upskilling of displaced workers in Wales**

In the United Kingdom, Career Wales, the employment services of the Welsh Government, has introduced the ReAct Scheme. The scheme provides funds for skills upgrading or retraining of people who have been made redundant or are unemployed. It includes financial incentives for employers to recruit staff and cover training costs, and subsidizes training through vocational training grants and extra support grants (which are awarded on a discretionary basis). People who participate in ReAct can also apply to Careers Wales for financial support to cover training, travel, childcare or accommodation costs that might otherwise prevent their re-entry into the labour force.

Source: British Council n.d. Career Change Wales 2022.

Some countries also implement special community-based training programs for **victims of violence and abuse, older workers, or other groups** who often face additional layers of discrimination. The program “Cozinha & Voz” (Kitchen and Voice) in Brazil, a partnership between the Federal Labour Prosecutor’s Office (MPT), local municipalities, a renowned Brazilian chef, local restaurants, members of the Casa Poema institute to build participants’ self-esteem, and supported by the ILO, has demonstrated how skills training can support social inclusion and equality of opportunity for all. The project is part of a broader initiative to promote decent work for vulnerable populations, jointly developed by the ILO and Brazil’s Federal Labour Prosecutor’s Office (MPT) (ILO 2020d). Another example of a program targeting youth at risk, victims of violence and abuse, and older workers is the Work BC’s (British Columbia) Skills Training and Employment Program (STE). Outreach is ensured through the network of Work BC centres and affiliated training providers (WorkBC 2022). In the Russian Federation, following a decision to increase retirement age, the government promotes vocational training (continuing training and retraining) to citizens of pre-retirement age (60–65 for men and 55–60 for women) through public employment services (ETF 2021a; ETF 2020c).

In addition, a number of countries have policies for addressing **sexual and gender-based violence in** their skills systems. A review of European practice points to six key principles here:

- Stakeholder involvement in the development of teachers’ codes;
- Integration of dissemination activities with teachers’ education, training and professional review;
- Practical workshops and seminars are held for teachers with the involvement of professional bodies responsible for the code of conduct;
- Adequate disciplinary procedures;
- Regular reviews of the code;
- Professional bodies provide consultation and guidance on the application of the code (Golubeva and Kaniņš 2017).



## ► 4. Training design and delivery

---

Training delivery is the set of processes that are put in place to achieve specific learning objectives. In the case of CBVT programs, because of the greater emphasis put on community involvement, this section will also discuss skill needs identification, along with types of training delivery - classroom/centre-based, work based, through mobile units, or online/distance learning, and the training and recruitment of trainers. This section will examine how CBVT programs are delivered in G20 country, and how and why they vary in terms of skills development and employment opportunities for the participants taking part in the CBVT programs.

### 4.1 Community involvement in needs identification and training design

Community based-vocational training programs often aim at income generating activities and local development at the community level targeting marginalised communities or rural or remote areas. Such programs are thus often preceded by socio-economic context analysis which involves multiple community actors. Due to the lack of formal employment and economic opportunities in such contexts, a thorough survey of potential economic opportunities within the community and in the neighbouring environment is often required before designing any programme. Based on this analysis training needs and corresponding training objectives can be determined including whether the most realistic outcome for trainees will be wage employment, micro- or group enterprise creation (WGICSD 2005; ILO 2009).

For instance, the Indonesian community education centres (PKBM) are autonomous structures whose tasks include: identifying community needs; offering a variety of educational courses, including basic skills and multimedia courses; mobilizing resources in the community; building partnerships with local organizations; and monitoring the progress and results of their activities. They are complemented by Balai Latihan Kerja (BLK) Komunitas that provide vocational training at the community level. The vocational training curricula of BLK Komunitas are based on the Indonesia national competency standard (SKKNI) and instructors are formally trained. After an initial period of guidance and financing by the government, the BLK Komunitas are expected to operate independently and create a partnership with companies to establish links between the communities and the local labour market (Wicaksono et al. 2022).

Depending on the capacity of local organizations, needs assessments can be done by jobs centres, local research centres or directly in coordination with employers. In Italy, the Provincial Centres for School Education for Adults (Centri provinciali per l'istruzione degli adulti - CPIAs) deliver education and training for people aged 16 and above and cover a wide variety of occupations. They served 236,000 people in 2019/20 and are mandated to engage with their community and work with research and development centres in each region among others, to provide demand-led training adapted to local socio-economic and cultural characteristics (EU Eurydice 2022; OECD 2021b; Ministry of Education, University and Research 2018). In Germany, enterprises offer apprenticeship places based on local demand. While training regulations for each occupation are agreed at national level, enterprise trainers devise company-level training plans to adapt the programme to local conditions and business processes (Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy, Germany 2021).

For the upskilling of workers, training providers usually work closely with companies or social partners. For instance, in Korea, large companies and small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) that are part of the supply chain as suppliers and contractors jointly develop and provide training through the CHAMP programme. Financed by the Ministry of Employment and Labour, CHAMP is a leading vocational education and training programme in Korea, with 161 training centres in 2015 (OECD, 2020a). It has been recognised as one of the key policy measures that address skills mismatches in the local labour market (OECD/ILO, 2017).

### 4.2 Types of training delivery

Four main approaches to training delivery exist and often co-exist in G20 countries:

- a) Classroom/Centre-based delivery, within TVET providers, community training providers, or ad hoc training facilities;
- b) Mobile Training Units used in remote communities;
- c) Work based learning;
- d) Online and distance learning.

Programmes can follow one or a mix of several approaches. Programmes with a work-based learning component are generally seen as more effective in delivering demand-led skills. Online and distance learning has increased throughout all countries due to distancing measures and training provider closures resulting from the COVID-19 crisis. However, lack of access to the internet and to IT devices in rural areas has posed significant challenges to learning continuity particularly for disadvantaged people (ILO 2020e, ILO 2021c).

Providers of CBVT can include formal and non-formal government or non-government non-profit or for-profit education and training providers, or community-based organizations.

► **Box 6. Adult Community Education (ACE) providers as part of skills system in Australia**

Adult Community Education (ACE) is a recognized element of Australia's education and skills training system. The latest Ministerial Declaration 2008 called for ACE to provide a "value-adding role in VET by bringing in its distinctive qualities; particularly to assist adults disadvantaged in learning into and through the VET system as well as serving a generic role of offering VET to all adults". ACE is delivered by local organizations who may or may not be Registered Training Organizations (RTO's) within Australia's skills system. Providers who offer VET training must be either RTO's or operate in partnership with an RTO. ACE providers are community owned and managed, not for profit organisations that have adult education as a primary focus.

Of the 3.9 million Australian vocational education and training (VET) students enrolled in 2020, 386,400 (9.8% of the total) studied with one of around 400 not-for-profit ACE provider. While VET can be undertaken in the school system in Australia, the majority of VET takes place post school by people over 19 years of age. Indeed, only 16% are aged 19 years or younger. ACE providers can deliver formal and non-formal TVET courses. TVET is offered by multiple types of public, private, community and industry sector providers. It can be offered by RTOs who deliver formal TVET qualifications, or industry sector providers who deliver vendor training, in community-based settings, the workplace and through the activities of civil society organizations or staff training and development programmes for enterprises, government agencies and training providers.

Delivery modes can include full-time, part-time, through online, self-paced or distance learning, through apprenticeships and through the Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL). Specifically, individuals can make applications to RTOs to have the skills, knowledge and experiences developed through informal and non-formal learning formally assessed and recognized for nationally accredited qualifications.

[Source: Adult Learning Australia 2020; Community Colleges Australia 2020; UNESCO 2018a.

**Classroom/centre-based training** remains the most common type of training delivery. It predominates in Russia, the USA, Saudi Arabia and Mexico within formal TVET provision, and in Italy or South Africa in community-based adult education and training. In Brazil, SENAR, offers free training to agricultural producers and workers through a decentralized network of training centres and schools across the country. Since its inception in 1991 SENAR has trained more than 70 million rural producers and workers. SENAR's 6,000 instructors conduct vocational courses and provide technical assistance across all 26 states of Brazil in 300 occupations. SENAR offers 2.5 years technical training courses leading to technician qualifications, vocational training courses of shorter durations, social promotion activities (short courses in development of personal and social skills, handicrafts, rural development, food and nutrition, health, culture, community organization, etc.), technical and managerial assistance, distance education and higher education through the CAN College (CNA n.d.). One of SENAR's most successful features is the integration of occupational training and social promotion in the same organization. The learning process is related to rural work and living conditions and rural women are given preference for social promotion programs, including training in protection against toxic products used in agriculture (World Bank 2007).

**Mobile training units** have been developed in countries like Brazil, India (Akshay 2012), and Argentina to provide training to people living in areas where access to formal VET is limited. They are usually small and transportable units embedded in cars, car trailers, trucks or boats with essential technology, equipment and material for selected vocational trades, laboratory services, technical and technological assistance, information, certification or processes and products, for trainees and companies of all sizes. In Brazil, for example, SENAI operates a mobile unit for processing oil from restaurants to manufacture bio diesel (SENAI 2012).

► **Box 7: The National Network of Mobile Classroom Workshops in Argentina**

In 2012, Argentina has created the National Network of Mobile Classroom Workshops under the supervision of the National Institute of Technological Education (INET). Under this framework, the Ministry of Education provides transportable, fully equipped learning facilities to provide training for employment opportunities identified locally by the provinces. Through an internal rotation system, the classrooms are moved to different locations in the provinces, functioning as a network. The time spent in each location depends on demand and the type of courses offered. Each unit has a satellite internet connection, generator, electrical installation, accessibility for people with reduced mobility, multimedia equipment, thermal and acoustic insulation, air conditioning, drinking water, among other services and facilities. In addition, each classroom has been equipped with tools, instruments and supplies, depending on the speciality.

Source: INET 2021.

**Work-based learning** plays an important role in community-based vocational training. It is a strong feature of skills systems in many G20 countries such as Australia, Germany, Japan or Turkey (Australian National Government 2020). In Turkey, work-based learning includes holiday-period internships, in-company training periods lasting three days per week, to full-time training in the company. This included over 1.1 million learners (45 per cent female) in work-based learning in 2019/20 (ETF 2021b, ETF 2020a). Japanese vocational high schools often have strong ties with industry, universities and professional training colleges, leading to curriculum innovations. As well as gaining practical experience in industry, students participate in inter-school competitions in a wide range of subjects. These competitions are usually held and sponsored by the association of vocational high school principals and local companies. To prepare for these competitions, students develop critical thinking, collaboration and communication skills and present the results of their work to their class, collaborating on team projects (OECD 2021c).

► **Box 8: Promoting CBVT and community development through an integrated university programme in Mexico**

The Center for Rural Development (CESDER) has developed a 4-year degree in Rural Development Planning aimed primarily at farmers and/or indigenous people of limited economic resources who are committed to contributing to the improvement of living conditions in their local area. Students enrolled in the course need to have the moral and economic support of a Civil Society Organisation (CSO) to which they are linked during their studies.

From the time they enter the first year of their degree, students are asked to work closely with a group in their community, including their own family. There they practice what they have learnt in the degree sessions, such as the maintenance of family gardens, composting, care for the environment, as well as various agroecological practices. Community- and work-based activities are monitored and supported during the second and third years through field visits by teachers (at least two per year), to encourage mutual learning between students, improve agroecological practices further, and encourage community ownership of the process.

Source: Baronnet and Bermudez 2019; <https://cdr.or.cr>

The COVID-19 pandemic has increased the reliance on **online and distance learning** for community-based vocational training programs with institutions offering blended or full-time distance learning courses. In Italy's Provincial Centres for School Education for Adults (CPIAs) all courses provided have a flexible organisation, allowing for personalised study paths, and the recognition of prior learning. Students can take up to 20% of the total required tuition time through distance learning. At Brazil's SENAR, the EaD portal<sup>3</sup> offers distance programmes as mini-courses of a few hours up to blended long-term trainings. In Canada, since the onset of COVID-19, the majority of community-based employment and training programmes that provide literacy and basic skills training and/or upgrading have been delivered online and/or virtually. In Turkey, the online social and education platform EBA<sup>4</sup> with free learning content was considerably expanded. To facilitate access, the Ministry agreed with GSM operators to provide cellular subscribers with free access to online education platforms (ETF 2021b, OECD 2020b).

<sup>3</sup> [Portal Senar FIC - Portal Senar FIC](https://portal.senar.fic)

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.eba.gov.tr/eicerik>

### 4.3 Training and recruitment of trainers

Identifying and selecting trainers/instructors is key to the success of any training programme. Trainers need to adapt to different contexts and play a variety of roles depending on the situation (trainers, tutor, coach). In Canada, in order to meet the challenges of change and strengthen the community-based training system, the Canadian Coalition of Community Based Education and Training (CCCBET) initiated a human resource study to develop a job classification system and a description of roles, responsibilities and activities to facilitate human resource planning and development (Canadian Coalition of Community based Training 2000). In Community-Based Vocational training programs in remote areas, the availability of experts and professional trainers is often limited, and when delivered outside of formal TVET, training programs might rely on expert craftspeople and trainers directly from the community. The Indian Kudumbashree program in Kerala works through neighbourhood groups of women who use facilitators and trainers from their community (State Poverty Eradication Mission Kerala. 2022). In the Russian Federation, regions have been developing networks for VET teachers' continuing training, which is coordinated by local education development and CVET institutions. They offer programmes in educational psychology and pedagogy, methodology, and ICT in education, and arrange internships (ETF 2020c). However, research by UNESCO-UNEVOC suggests that many trainers feel under-equipped to work with disadvantaged learners, and most initial and continuing training for them is seen as inadequate (UNESCO-UNEVOC 2021b).

## ► 5. Assessment, Certification, and Post-Training Support

---

Community-Based Vocational Training aims to bridge the gap between skills and local employment opportunities, therefore making it vital to implement effective assessment, certification, and post-training support measures. Well-designed CBVT programmes enable individuals not only to acquire skills that are relevant to the local communities (see Section 4), but also to signal the acquired skills to potential employers or to start their own businesses when there is lack of wage employment in local communities. The inclusion of local institutions and social partners in the various stages of skills assessment and certification enhances the local community's acceptance and trust in the quality of skills delivered by CBVT. The provision of post-training support, that involves local actors, also helps individuals and groups to face the local realities of running a business or working in an enterprise.

CBVT supports household income through wage and self-employment, generates aggregate demand, and has the potential to improve competitiveness of local enterprises. Given the potential of CBVT to bring about long-term and wider societal and economic benefits beyond the immediate community that it serves, the need for alignment between community-based and national approach emerges. Skills assessment and certification that are locally relevant benefit from being aligned with national qualification systems, for quality assurance and skills recognition beyond the local level. Recognized certificates also enable accumulation of skills towards formal qualifications, which can support transition to higher value-added employment in the formal economy.

Positioning of CBVT in G20 countries' strategies varies from one country to another. Depending on such positioning, the assessment, certification and post-training practices also vary. This section presents various models adopted by G20 countries. The discussion first sheds light on the issues of assessment and certification, and then on post-training support.

### 5.1 Assessment and certification

CBVT programmes in G20 countries take various approaches to the assessment and certification of skills. Countries with strong and comprehensive qualification systems can either strongly emphasize the utility of formal certifications or provide flexibility allowing for the issuance of both formal and non-formal certifications. On the other hand, countries with less developed, or less comprehensive qualification systems, might put less emphasis on skills assessment or certification, but rather focus on support for self-employment. The validation and recognition of prior learning (RPL) is gaining ground in many G20 countries to provide access to formal skills training and qualifications, encourage lifelong learning, or facilitate the recognition of foreign qualifications (Cedefop/EC/ICF, 2019; 2018b).

Australia, France, Italy and South Africa all place focus on formal certification within their CBVT systems and delivery. In Australia, Adult Community Education (ACE) is delivered by local organizations who may or may not be Registered Training Organizations (RTO's) within Australia's skills system. If ACE organizations aim to deliver formal VET qualifications they must obtain the status as RTOs. Some ACE programmes may enter into formal partnerships with RTOs who are responsible for assessment and issuing qualifications to learners (Perlgut, 2020). In France, the State is the only body that develops qualifications for initial education and training. For continuous vocational training, however, both public and private institutions can develop qualifications that are registered in the National Register of Vocational Qualifications (RNCP). Social partners may create new qualifications through either the joint employment and vocational training committees or the observatories of qualifications. Monitoring of the certification processes for the qualifications listed in RNCP falls under the responsibility of France Compétences (Cedefop 2019a).

At the end of Apartheid in 1994, South Africa saw the development of formal qualifications as a key tool in overcoming the legacy of the past and including previously marginalised populations in the formal economy. A large system has developed of qualifications, sectoral education and training authorities and a nested structure of qualifications councils under an overarching South African Qualifications Authority. There was an initial emphasis on whole qualifications but this was followed by a realisation that shorter modules were more appropriate for the needs of those working in the rural subsistence and urban informal sectors (Powell and McGrath, 2019). In Italy, the Ministry of Education, Universities and Research (MIUR) oversees the VET system and is also responsible for adult learning. The 2015/2016 reform of the adult education system refined the concept of adult learning and replaced it with 'school education for adults' (*istruzione degli adulti - IDA*), with greater regulation and emphasis on quality assurance (EU Eurydice, 2022). The main idea of this reform was that courses on offer now lead to qualifications, including technical and vocational, following the unified national qualifications repertory created in 2013. The repertory contains the national occupational profiles and the corresponding

qualifications and programmes or learning pathways, as well as minimum education and training standards which are valid at the national level (Cedefop 2018b).

Most countries deliver both formal and non-formal certificates through CBVT. In Germany, while most continuing training is non-formal, initial TVET, largely delivered through apprenticeship, is governed by training regulations that set out nation-wide standards for training content and examinations. Final exams (for dual apprenticeships) are organized through self-regulatory bodies (usually the local business chambers) and implemented through panels of professionals who are appointed on a voluntary basis. The same standards apply across the whole of Germany and qualifications are recognised throughout the country (Federal Ministry of Economic Affairs 2017). Mexico delivers formal and non-formal certifications through CBVT. Qualifications in Mexico according to the National System of Competency Standards (NSCS) are issued by CONOCER, and a system of recognition of prior learning (RPL) has been established. The Ministry of Education continually identifies new priority skills and occupations across different industries and regions. Employers and trade unions play a significant role in the design of training programmes and in the evaluation and certification of workers' competences according to the NSCS framework. RPL is offered in 69 labour competence standards and 306 accredited Assessment Centres (UNESCO/UNEVOC 2018a). In Indonesia, Professional Certification Agencies are accredited and authorized by the National Professional Certification Body (NPCB) to conduct competency tests for Indonesian National Work Competency Standards in their own facilities or at licensed assessment centres (Kadie and Backrul, 2016). In Turkey, by June 2018, over 350.000 RPL certificates have been issued in 16 sectors. Formal certification has become compulsory for 81 occupations (Cedefop 2018c). In the UK, the "Recognizing and Recording Progress and Achievement" (RARPA) scheme provides for recognition of skills attainment. Participation in the scheme is a requirement for organizations to receive funds from the Adult Education Budget. (OECD 2017b)

In Japan, continuing training mainly happens on-the-job at local companies. Formal certification is possible through the National Trade Skill Testing and Certification System. Since 2008, over 3 million workers have been assessed and recognized as "certified skilled workers" by the Minister of Health, Labour and Welfare as (Yang and Yorozu, 2015). In the Republic of Korea, a reform was undertaken to introduce national competency standards in key industries. Thanks to these competency standards and a system called "Academic Credit Bank System (ACBS)", learners can acquire academic credits by completing approved courses towards national qualifications. The system also allows the recognition of learning other than formal schooling and training (Lee, 2017).

► **Box 9: Partial qualifications for lower-skilled young adults in Germany**

Germany has a strong tradition of full qualifications, developed and implemented in tripartite partnership. However, in light of growing skill shortages, in particular in skilled manual trades, the country increasingly acknowledges the need for partial qualifications for low-skilled adults, to accumulate skills certificates towards a full qualification. As an initiative of the chambers of industry and commerce (IHKs), in cooperation with the Federal Ministry for Education and Research (BMBF), the introduction of partial qualifications towards recognised vocational qualification started in October 2017. The project includes the establishment of a coordination office for the control, quality assurance and monitoring of activities, the development of guidance and support structures, and for the development of the training modules. In 2018, more than half (or 55 per cent) of IHKs were active in the certifying of partial qualifications for the occupations such as specialists in metal technology and industrial electrician.

Source: Cedefop 2019b, DIHK n.d.

When CBVT programmes are administered outside formal TVET system and focus largely on non-formal settings, the emphasis on certification of skills is less pronounced. Participants in such CBVT programmes aim to gain immediate employment opportunities in the local economy. More emphasis is therefore put on post-training support for self-employment and entrepreneurship. The benefit of this model is that limited resources available for CBVT can be invested in an optimized manner to achieve short-term gains through self-employment. The disadvantage is, however, that people might not be able to upskill and transition to higher value-added employment opportunities, being trapped in low-skill informal work. To promote transitions to formality, access to further training and to recognition of prior learning are important elements within comprehensive formalization strategies.

In India, community-based vocational training such as Kudumbashree in Kerala and the National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM) do not deliver formal qualifications and instead strongly focus on promoting self-employment to alleviate poverty in the rural community. The focus on self-employment is a deliberate one, given that the country has a well-established system of the Sector Skills Councils (SSC), which determine competency standards in line with the National Skills

Qualification Framework (NSQF) (Sharma and King 2019). Assessment bodies accredited by the Sector Skills Councils are involved in the assessment and certification of formal vocational training and in Recognition of Prior Learning (See section 3). Similarly, in China, community education usually does not lead to a credential, and a system for accumulating certifications through CBVT to be recognized within skills systems is not yet in place. At tertiary level, there is an emerging form of community college, such as minban (privately run) colleges, some of which are permitted by the Ministry of Education to confer diplomas (Postiglione, 2001). Lastly, in the Russian Federation, the National Council for Occupational Qualifications and Sector Qualifications Councils with employer representation set the reference frameworks for occupational and qualification standards and curricula. There is currently no legislative framework to provide for the validation of non-formal and informal learning (ETF 2020c).

## 5.2 Post training support

A feature of effective CBVT in G20 countries is the provision of post training support to facilitate (1) access to wage employment or development of micro and small enterprises. Sometimes provided by education and training institutions themselves, post-training support is most often delivered through local partnerships, collaboration between institutions and referrals to other suitable service providers at the community level.

### 5.2.1 Facilitating access to wage employment

Many G20 countries including Canada, France, Germany, Japan, the Republic of Korea, Turkey, the United Kingdom, and the United States have Public Employment Services (PES) operating at the community level. The PES in those countries provide assistance with preparing resumes and job applications, assistance in preparing for interviews and recruitment processes, assistance with job search, linkages with employers for job placement and linkages with workers' organizations. Community-based career guidance engages a wide range of local actors, such as career guidance professionals, social workers and community workers. Guidance can take place in dedicated spaces established by the government, or make use of existing local infrastructures, such as libraries shelters, cafes, sports clubs or youth clubs (Thomsen et al. 2017; ILO, 2018a). Due to the COVID-19 crisis, some counties have shifted career guidance services online (Cedefop/EC/ETF/ICCDPP/ILO/OECD/UNESCO 2020).

In Korea, the Ministry of Employment and Labour (MoEL) sets the guidelines for Public Employment Services. The Job Centres of the MoEL and employment centres of various other governmental departments (such as those of municipal and local governments) play a central role in administering the PES. These centres deliver locally customized services through networking, coordination and cooperation with local business associations, labour unions, vocational training agencies and local governments. 'Mini job fairs for local community', are set up between schools and local employment service centres to prepare students for the job market and facilitate meetings with local employers (Lee 2017).

In the United States, post-training support varies depending on the type of training and the provider. The Department of Labor related programs are aligned with the American Job Centers (AJC) network which provides extensive job search support. The AJCs are designed to provide a full range of assistance to job seekers under one roof. The centers offer training referrals, career counseling, job listings, and similar employment-related services. Customers can visit a center in person or connect to the center's information online or through kiosk remote access. There are nearly 2,400 AJCs. However, due to COVID-19, some of them were temporarily closed or shifted to virtual (online) services (U.S. Department of Labor n.d.; Careeronestop 2022)).

#### ► Box 10: Digital career guidance services in Finland

"TET-tori" in Finland is a platform for secondary school students to find information about local employers and work experiences in enterprises, supported by local guidance practitioners, teachers and parents. On the platform, employers advertise their work experience offers and cooperate to ensure that school programmes are relevant to the local industry needs. This online platform is structured according to geographical regions and supports young people's knowledge and appreciation of professions and working life.

Source: ILO (Forthcoming); Cedefop 2022<sup>5</sup>

<sup>5</sup> [TET-tori | CEDEFOP \(europa.eu\)](https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/tet-tori)

## 5.2.2 Facilitating small and micro-enterprises development

In rural communities, where wage employment is not always a viable option, CBVT supports graduate to start their own businesses. Raising awareness of the legal and regulatory requirements in setting up a business, advisory services, marketing and the use of technology, are some of the elements of such support. CBVT also supports the creation of sustainable community structures and if mainstreamed into local economic development programmes, it can support enterprise formalization. In this regard, registering or obtaining a trade license from the local municipality is important to ensure that businesses are recognized and given legitimacy. Graduates are made aware about the necessity of the trade license and the local CBTV helps them to obtain the trade license well ahead of starting a business.

Coupled with post-training support is an emphasis on harmonizing micro-finance schemes with training activities and creating clear expectations and understanding of how microfinance works. Mapping of financial services, financial education for beneficiaries and creating links with financial institutions to provide affordable loans are important ways in which CBTV's post-training phase can contribute to successful employment and income generation.

In Brazil, the National Rural Learning Services (SENAR) implements the Enterprising Entrepreneurial Program, in collaboration with the Brazilian Service of Support to Micro and Small Enterprises (SEBRAE). The Program aims to promote the competitiveness and sustainability of rural enterprises in the Brazilian semi-arid climate regions, through the promotion of innovation, entrepreneurship and the dissemination of social technologies, production, management and sustainable practices. The program aims to improve the quality of life of rural entrepreneurs, including those of their families and employees through environmentally sustainable technologies. In addition, the program aims to promote diversification of economic activities in the region, such as sheep goat farming, beekeeping, fruit growing, the manufacture of products and food from the forage palm, rural tourism and solar energy, among others (SENAR, 2022; SENAR/SEBRAE. n.d).

Turkey has implemented a successful community-based development project to revitalize the rural economy in Kuyucak Village, which produces 93 per cent of Turkey's lavender.. The project aimed to expand the range of lavender products and support women's entrepreneurship. The Lavender Scented Village Women Entrepreneurs Cooperative was established and provided with training on marketing, rural tourism, product design, guesthouse management, entrepreneurship, medical aromatic plants, hygiene and the cooperative system. The village has become a tourism hotspot and has gained recognition beyond local borders (Gelecek Turizmde 2019; Basaran 2017).

In the Russian Federation, the Federal Ministry of Economic Development, in cooperation with regional authorities, has set up local centres to train young entrepreneurs. These centres, hosted by VET providers specialising in key areas of small and medium-sized enterprise (SME) development, provide assistance to start-ups as well as methodological guidance to the trainers (ETF 2020c).



## ► 6. Conclusions

---

This brief review is intended to raise the profile of community-based vocational training as a potentially important policy tool amongst G20 member states. CBVT takes a particular focus on community-participation, self-advancement and empowerment, and on the inclusion of disadvantaged groups. It is highly relevant in rural areas, where there is little access to formal institutions. Moreover, it is a powerful approach and methodology, since it typically covers the identification of local economic opportunities, training and post-training support. CBVT is important from the perspective of skills for employability and productivity, providing local income and value addition, and the potential to link to national markets and beyond. Yet it also has important contributions to make to social mobility, socialisation (professional identity), civic participation and trust in institutions and communities, and to equity (ETF 2020a).

The review points to a number of lessons learned in making CBVT realize its potential. They include:

- 1. Link skills systems and governance to local demand:** The discussion above points to the importance of balancing centralised impulses within skills systems, designed to ensure national policy concerns are met, with the need for local autonomy in order to be responsive to the needs and aspirations of communities and local skills ecosystems. It is clear that governance systems vary considerably in this respect, reflecting deeper differences regarding constitutional settlements, for instance between unitary and federal states. Regardless of the overall statutory distribution of governance responsibilities and powers, however, it is clear that there needs to be a focus on making skills systems work across levels to serve local needs.
- 2. Create networks between local actors:** In a briefing paper for the Buenos Aires G20 summit, Spours and Grainger (2018) argued for thinking about ‘facilitating verticalities’ – policies and actors that support skills and communities, and ‘collaborative horizontalities’ – networks between local actors. They saw mediation between the two as a key task of skills systems. Their approach has focused on cities but recent work from South Africa applied this to rural contexts too (Wedekind et al. 2021). In so doing, it is essential to ensure that skills providers interact with local institutional environment and community to respond to local needs and economic potential, and integrate socio-cultural and environmental concerns, rights and post-training support.
- 3. Improve access and quality of CBVT:** CBVT also demonstrates a tension regarding levels of formalisation, often reaching populations who are not easily able to access decent work in the formal sector. However, it is vital that this does not lead to systems that are clearly second best and which close down possibilities of progression within formal education and transition to formal employment. There are sound reasons for providing practical training through short courses that reflect the limited time and money for study available to many potential CBVT learners, complemented with remedial courses in literacy and numeracy if needed. However, this needs to be balanced with an awareness of the skills and knowledge that is required to make a viable living in many occupations. Where there is a gap in this regard, it is imperative to look at mechanisms for access, including stipends, flexible delivery, etc. Qualification systems that allow for progression and recognition of prior learning can play important roles here but have often excluded the most marginalised in practice if not in intention. Learning technologies can play a role here but the existing inequalities of access to ICTs has to be addressed to avoid that online and distance learning does not further exclude the marginalised.
- 4. Fully incorporate climate and environmental concerns:** CBVT has often been rural focused and this has led to a degree of environmental awareness in its approaches. However, it is abundantly clear that the climate crisis must be addressed in such programmes. As an approach that focuses on reaching those left behind by development, it needs to be designed in ways that address the existential crises faced by many of its target populations regarding access to resources such as potable water. At the same time, there is an opportunity for CBVT to focus on skills that advance green jobs and greener economies.
- 5. Build on partnership, participation and (local) social dialogue:** A key feature of CBVT is its participatory and partnership approach building on trusting relationships between local institutions and actors. Workers and employers and their organizations are critical in ensuring that dialogue and collaboration with government and civil society partners is effective in addressing community concerns. CBVT as crucial element of lifelong learning strategies for all needs a framework for shared responsibility and commitment to facilitate local economic empowerment.

Covid-19 has made the need to address CBVT even more pressing. Many people conventionally targeted by CBVT have seen their marginalisation and disadvantage further exacerbated by the pandemic and the subsequent lockdowns and slow downs. In all countries, women have borne the major brunt of additional care work due to illness or education and training closures and were more affected by job losses than men (ILO 2021b; ILO 2021f). Many G20 countries have sought to respond through CBVT initiatives and there is an opportunity and imperative to learn from these initiatives.

In light of these, G20 needs to take action to scale-up and strengthen CBVT to expand training opportunities for disadvantaged groups, particularly those in the rural sector, and include CBVT within national recovery strategies.

## ► 7. References

---

- 3iE. 2020. Impact Evaluation of the National Rural Livelihoods Project. Impact Evaluation Report 128, October 2020. Available at: [Impact Evaluation of the National Rural Livelihoods Project | 3ie \(3ieimpact.org\)](#)
- Adult Learning Australia, 2020. ACE Environmental Scan. Available at: <https://ala.asn.au/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/Australian-ACE-Report-2020.pdf>
- Akshay, N.; Sreeram, K.; Anand, A.; Venkataraman, R.; Bhavani, R. 2012. MoVE: Mobile vocational education for rural India, in: 2012 IEEE International Conference on Technology Enhanced Education (ICTEE). Available at: [MoVE: Mobile vocational education for rural India | IEEE Conference Publication | IEEE Xplore](#)
- Almannie, M. 2015. Proposed Model for Innovation of Community colleges to Meet Labor Market Needs in Saudi Arabia, Journal of Education and Practice Vol6(20), Available at: <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ11079062.pdf>
- Almeida, Rita, Jere Behrman, and David Robalino. 2012. Right Skills for the Job?: Rethinking Training Policies for Workers. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Australian National Government. 2020. Strengthening Skills: Expert Review of Australia's Vocational Education and Training System ("Joyce Review"). Available at: [Strengthening Skills: Expert Review of Australia's Vocational Education and Training System \(pmc.gov.au\)](#)
- Avis, J. Atkins, L., Esmond, B. and McGrath, S. 2021 Re-conceptualising VET: responses to Covid-19. Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 73, 1, 1-23, Available at: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13636820.2020.1861068>
- Baronnet, B. and F. Bermúdez Urbina (Coordinadores). 2019. La vinculación comunitaria en la formación de profesionales indígenas en México, Asociación nacional de universidades e instituciones de educación superior. Available at: <https://siteal.iiep.unesco.org/investigacion/3566/vinculacion-comunitaria-formacion-profesionales-indigenas-mexico>
- Basaran, N. 2017. Bringing Lavander to Economy in Rural Development and Rural Tourism Scope, in: Research Journal of Agricultural Sciences Tarım Bilimleri Araştırma Dergisi E-ISSN: 1308-027X, 10 (1): 47-49, 2017. Available at: [View of Bringing Lavander to Economy in Rural Development and Rural Tourism Scope \(ijans.org\)](#)
- BIBB. n.d. The German VET System. Available at: [Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training \(BIBB\) - Germany.](#)
- British Council. n.d. The UK Technical and Vocational Education and Training Systems. Available at: [https://www.britishcouncil.org/sites/default/files/the\\_uk\\_technical\\_and\\_vocational\\_education\\_and\\_training\\_systems.pdf](https://www.britishcouncil.org/sites/default/files/the_uk_technical_and_vocational_education_and_training_systems.pdf)
- Brown, T., and Majumdar, S. 2020. Agricultural TVET in developing economies: Challenges and possibilities. UNEVOC Network Discussion Paper. Available at: [www.unevoc.unesco.org/II/687](http://www.unevoc.unesco.org/II/687)
- Career Change Wales. 2022. Redundancy training grant (REACT +). Available at: [ReAct Funding Wales | Career Change Wales Training Academy](#)
- Careeronestop. 2022. State Workforce Development Boards. Available at: <https://www.careeronestop.org/Developers/Data/state-workforce-development-boards.aspx>
- Cedefop; European Commission; ETF; ICCDPP; ILO; OECD; UNESCO. 2020. Career guidance policy and practice in the pandemic: results of a joint international survey – June to August 2020. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union. <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/publications/4193>
- Cedefop, European Commission, ICF. 2019. European inventory on validation of non-formal and informal learning 2018 update: Synthesis report. [http://libserver.cedefop.europa.eu/vetelib/2019/european\\_inventory\\_validation\\_2018\\_synthesis.pdf](http://libserver.cedefop.europa.eu/vetelib/2019/european_inventory_validation_2018_synthesis.pdf)
- Cedefop. 2022. Resources for guidance. TET-tori. Available at: [TET-tori | CEDEFOP \(europa.eu\)](#)
- . 2019a. Vocational education and training in Europe: France. Available at: <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/tools/vet-in-europe/systems/france-2019#:~:text=The%20State%20is%20the%20only,acquis%20de%20l'exp%C3%A9rience>

- 2019b. Developments in vocational education and training policy in 2015-19: Germany. National VET policy developments. Available at: [Developments in vocational education and training policy in 2015-19: Germany \(europa.eu\)](#)
- 2018a. Handbook of ICT practices for guidance and career development. Luxembourg: Publications Office. <http://data.europa.eu/doi/10.2801/368695>.
- 2018b. Italy: the national qualification repertory. Available at: <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/news/italy-national-qualification-repertory>
- 2018c. National Qualification Frameworks (NQFs) online tool. Turkey. Available at: [Turkey | CEDEFOP \(europa.eu\)](#)
- 2017. Spotlight on VET Italy. Available at: [https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/files/8123\\_en.pdf](https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/files/8123_en.pdf)
- Canadian Coalition of Community based Training. 2000. A Study to Investigate, Analyse and Organize Community-Based Training Roles in Canada. Available at: [CCBT report2 \(ccocde-ccbct.com\)](#)
- Chandrasekar, B. and R. Murugesan. 2019. Review of TVET System and Skill Development System: an analysis of institutional matters in India, Jul 31, 2019, Issue 13. Available at: <http://tvvet-online.asia/issue/13/chandrasekar-et-al/>
- Chun, J.; Connor, A.; Kosciulek, J.F.; Landon, T.; Park, J. 2016. Career development for youth with disabilities in South Korea: The intersection of culture, theory, and policy. *Global Education Review*, 3 (3). 57-74. Available at: <https://ger.mercy.edu/index.php/ger/article/view/213/215>
- Clapham, A. and R. Vickers. 2017. Policy, practice and innovative governance in the English further education and skills sector, in: *Research in post-compulsory education*, 07/2017, Volume 22, Issue 3.
- CNA. n.d. SENAR. Available at: <https://cnabrasil.org.br/senar>
- Community Colleges Australia. 2020. Community Education Australia. Available at: [Community Education in Australia | Community Colleges \(cca.edu.au\)](#)
- Coombs, P. and M. Ahmed. 1974. *Attacking Rural Poverty*. Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore.
- DIHK. n.d. Chancen nutzen! Available at: <https://teilqualifikation.dihk.de/de>
- Du, B.H. and X.J. Wang. 2015. A Research on the Strategy of Promoting Community-Based Rural Vocational Education, *Canadian Social Science*, 11 (11), 117-122. Available at: <http://www.cscanada.net/index.php/css/article/view/7801>
- ECLAC. 2020. We make future programme (Programa Hacemos Futuro) (2018- ). Available at: <https://dds.cepal.org/bpsnc/programme?id=157>
- EU Eurydice. 2022. Italy. Adult education and training: Available at: [https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/national-policies/eurydice/content/adult-education-and-training-39\\_en](https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/national-policies/eurydice/content/adult-education-and-training-39_en)
- Eurofound. 2021. NEETs. Available at: [NEETs | Eurofound \(europa.eu\)](#)
- European Training Foundation (ETF). 2021a. Russian Federation. Education, Training and Employment Developments. Available at: [RE: Edited country fiches in Sharepoint \(europa.eu\)](#)
- 2021b. Education, Training and Employment Developments. Turkey. Available at: [RE: Edited country fiches in Sharepoint \(europa.eu\)](#)
- 2020a. Unlocking Youth potential in South Eastern Europe and Turkey. Skills development for labour market and social inclusion. Available at: [ETF Regional paper Youth in SEET \(europa.eu\)](#)
- 2020b. International Trends and Innovation in Career Guidance. Volume II. Country case studies. Available at: [innovation in career guidance vol. 2 0.pdf \(europa.eu\)](#)
- 2020c. Torino process 2018-20 National summary report: Russia. Available at: [https://www.etf.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2020-06/trp\\_russia\\_summary\\_report\\_en\\_0.pdf](https://www.etf.europa.eu/sites/default/files/2020-06/trp_russia_summary_report_en_0.pdf)
- Feder G., Anderson J.R., Birner R., Deininger K. 2010. Promises and Realities of Community-Based Agricultural Extension. In: Otsuka K., Kalirajan K. (eds) *Community, Market and State in Development*. Palgrave Macmillan, London. <https://doi.org/10.1057/978023029501812>
- Feder, G., R. Murgai, and J. B. Quizon. 2004. Sending farmers back to school: The impact of farmer field schools in Indonesia. *Review of Agricultural Economics* 26 (1): 45–62.
- Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy of German. (2021). Dual vocational training – a recipe for success. Retrieved from ARTICLE - Vocational Training & Profession: <https://www.bmwi.de/Redaktion/EN/Dossier/vocational-training-and-work.html>

- Federal Ministry of Economic Affairs. 2017. Germany's dual vocational training system, Available at: [duales-ausbildungsprogram.pdf \(bmwi.de\)](https://www.bmwi.de/SharedDocs/DE/Presse/pm/2017/07/170713_dual_vocational_training_system.pdf?__blob=publicationFile)
- Fitriani, E. D. 2021, June 8. Jangkau Seluruh Indonesia, Kini Kemnaker Punya 2.127 BLK Komunitas. Retrieved from Detik Finance: <https://finance.detik.com/berita-ekonomi-bisnis/d-5597841/jangkau-seluruh-indonesia-kini-kemnaker-punya-2127-blk-komunitas>
- Fletcher, J. and J. Friedel. 2017. 'Typology of state-level community college governance structures', in: Community College Journal of Research and Practice, vol.41, no.4-5, pp.311–322.
- Fluitman, F. (Ed.), 1989. Training for Work in the Informal Sector. ILO, Geneva.
- Gelecek Turizmde. 2019. Lavender Scented Village. Available at: <https://www.gelecekturizmde.com/lavender-scented-village/>
- Global Deal/ILO/OECD. 2020. Social Dialogue, Skills and Covid-19. The Global Deal for Decent Work and Inclusive Growth Flagship Report. Available at: [wcms 758550.pdf \(ilo.org\)](https://www.wcms758550.pdf).
- Golubeva, M. and Kaniš, V. 2017. Codes of conduct for teachers in Europe: A background study. Council of Europe. Available at: <https://www.coe.int/en/web/campaign-free-to-speak-safe-to-learn/-/etined-volume-4-codes-of-conduct-for-teachers-in-europe-a-background-study-201-1>
- Government of Canada. 2020a. About the Workforce Development Agreements program. Available at: <https://www.canada.ca/en/employment-social-development/programs/training-agreements/workforce-development-agreements.html>
- Government of Canada. 2020b. About the Indigenous Skills and Employment Training Program. Available at: [Description of the Indigenous Skills and Employment Training \(ISET\) Program - Canada.ca](https://www.canada.ca/en/employment-social-development/programs/indigenous-skills-employment-training-program.html)
- Griffin-Cohen, M. (Ed). 2004. Training the Excluded for Work: Access and Equity for Women, Immigrants, First Nations, Youth, and People with Low Income, UBC Press.
- INET. 2021. Red National Aulas Talleres Moviles (Network of mobile classroom workshops). Available at: <http://www.inet.edu.ar/index.php/niveles-educativos/formacion-profesional/programa-federal-de-aulas-tecnicas-moviles/>
- Hanemann, U. et al. 2017. Learning Neighborhood, Saudi Arabia. UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning. Available at: <https://uil.unesco.org/case-study/effective-practices-database-litbase-0/learning-neighborhood-saudi-arabia>
- Helen Suzman Foundation. n.d. South Africa's community education and training colleges. Available at : <https://hsf.org.za/publications/hsf-briefs/south-africa2019s-community-education-and-training-colleges>
- International Labour Organization. 2021a. World Employment and Social Outlook. Report: World Employment and Social Outlook 2021: Trends 2021 (ilo.org)
- . 2021b. ILO Monitor: COVID-19 and the world of work. Eighth edition, Updated estimates and analysis, 27 October 2021. Available at: [ILO Monitor: COVID-19 and the world of work. Eighth edition](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---relconf/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_813696.pdf)
- . 2021c. Shaping skills and lifelong learning for the future of work. Report to the International Labour Conference 109th Session, 2021. Available at: [https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_norm/---relconf/documents/meetingdocument/wcms\\_813696.pdf](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---relconf/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_813696.pdf)
- . 2021d. Conclusions on Skills and Lifelong Learning, International Labour Conference, 109th Session, 2021 Date: 10 December 2021. Available at: [wcms 831531.pdf \(ilo.org\)](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---relconf/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_831531.pdf)
- . 2021e. An update on the youth labour market impact of the COVID-19 crisis. Statistical brief. [https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_emp/documents/briefingnote/wcms\\_795479.pdf](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/documents/briefingnote/wcms_795479.pdf)
- . 2021f. Inequalities and the world of work. Report IV, International Labour Conference, 109th Session, 2021. Available at: [Inequalities and the world of work \(ilo.org\)](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/documents/publication/wcms_753404.pdf)
- . 2022. Inventory of digital career guidance services, forthcoming.
- . 2020a. Skills Development and Lifelong Learning: Resource Guide for Workers' Organizations. Geneva: International Labour Organization. Available at: [https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_emp/documents/publication/wcms\\_761035.pdf](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/documents/publication/wcms_761035.pdf)
- . 2020b. COVID-19: Public employment services and labour market policy responses. Policy Brief. Available at: [https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_emp/documents/publication/wcms\\_753404.pdf](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/documents/publication/wcms_753404.pdf)
- . 2020c. Global Employment Trends for Youth 2020: Technology and the future of jobs. International Labour Office – Geneva: ILO, 2020. Available at: [ENG ILO Report GlobalYouthEmployment Layout InsidePages Final.indd](https://www.ilo.org/public/eng/mediacentre/GlobalYouthEmploymentLayoutInsidePagesFinal.indd)

- 2020d. From the classroom to the living room: online classes ensure ongoing professionalization for vulnerable groups amid the pandemic in Brazil. Available at: [COVID-19: Protecting vulnerable groups: From the classroom to the living room: online classes ensure ongoing professionalization for vulnerable groups amid the pandemic in Brazil \(ilo.org\)](#)
- 2020e. Distance and Online Learning during the time of COVID-19. Policy brief. Available at: [wcms 743485.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#)
- 2019. Lifelong Learning: Concepts, Issues and Actions. Available at: [https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_emp/---ifp\\_skills/documents/publication/wcms\\_711842.pdf](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---ifp_skills/documents/publication/wcms_711842.pdf)
- 2018a. Public employment services: Joined-up services for people facing labour market disadvantage. ILO briefs on Employment Services and ALMPs Issue No. 1. Available at: [ILO briefs on Employment Services and ALMPs.indd](#)
- 2018b. Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL): Learning Package. Available at: [wcms 626246.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#)
- 2018c. Public Employment Services in Latin America and the Caribbean. Mexico. ILO Notes. Available at: [wcms 618066.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#)
- 2017. Training for Rural Economic Empowerment (TREE). Information note. Available at: [Skills for Employment: Information Note: Training for Rural Economic Empowerment \(TREE\) \(ilo.org\)](#)
- 2015a. National employment policies: A guide for workers' organisations. Some key terms and what they mean: Available at: [https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed\\_emp/@emp\\_policy/documents/publication/wcms\\_334921.pdf](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed_emp/@emp_policy/documents/publication/wcms_334921.pdf)
- 2015b. Youth and Informality Promoting Formal Employment among Youth: Innovative Experiences in Latin America and The Caribbean, Programa FORLAC. Available at: [http://www2.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---americas/---ro-lima/documents/publication/wcms\\_361990.pdf](http://www2.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---americas/---ro-lima/documents/publication/wcms_361990.pdf)
- 2010. A Skilled Workforce for Strong, Sustainable and Balanced Growth: A G20 Training Strategy, Geneva. Available at: [wcms\\_151966.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#)
- 2009. Rural Skills Training - A Generic Manual on Training for Rural Economic Empowerment (TREE), Geneva. Available at: [Rural Skills Training - A Generic Manual on Training for Rural Economic Empowerment \(TREE\) \(ilo.org\)](#) Wica
- 2008. Skills development through community-based rehabilitation (CBR): a good practice guide. Available at: [https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_emp/---ifp\\_skills/documents/publication/wcms\\_132675.pdf](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---ifp_skills/documents/publication/wcms_132675.pdf)
- 1993. The Training For Rural Gainful Activities (TRUGA) Project: An Evaluation Of Women's Participation And Benefits. Available at: [UN Digital Library Nepal: View Document](#)
- Forthcoming. Inventory of digital career guidance services, Geneva.
- n.d. ILO's support to refugees and host communities in Turkey. Available at: [https://www.ilo.org/ankara/projects/WCMS\\_379375/lang--en/index.html](https://www.ilo.org/ankara/projects/WCMS_379375/lang--en/index.html)
- ILO/MLSS/KfW/BMZ. 2022. Work-based learning Programme. Brochure. Available at: [wcms\\_836439.pdf \(ilo.org\)](#)
- ILO/UNESCO.2018. Taking a whole of government approach to skills development. Available at : [https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_emp/---ifp\\_skills/documents/publication/wcms\\_647362.pdf](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---ifp_skills/documents/publication/wcms_647362.pdf)
- ILO/WB/UNESCO. 2021. Skills Development in the Time of COVID-19. Available at: <https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---edemp/---ifpskills/documents/publication/wcms766557.pdf>
- Khetha. 2017. Careerhelp South Africa. Available at: <https://www.careerhelp.org.za>
- Lee, S. 2017, Good practices in using partnerships for effective and efficient delivery of employment services in South Korea, Employment Policy Department Working Paper, No.234. Available at [https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_emp/documents/publication/wcms\\_614053.pdf](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/documents/publication/wcms_614053.pdf)
- Local Government Association. 2020. Learning for Life: the role of adult community education in developing thriving local communities - A handbook for councillors, 2020. Available at : <https://www.local.gov.uk/publications/learning-life-role-adult-community-education-developing-thriving-local-communities>
- Lotz-Sisitka, H., Pesanayi, T., Weaver, K., Lupele, C., Sisitka, L., O'Donoghue, R., Denison, J. and Phillips, K. 2016. Water use and food security: Knowledge dissemination and use in agricultural colleges and local learning networks for home food gardening and smallholder agriculture. Water Research Council Research Report No. 2277/1/16, Pretoria. Available at: [www.wrc.org.za/Knowledge Hub Documents/Research Reports/2277-1-16.pdf](http://www.wrc.org.za/Knowledge Hub Documents/Research Reports/2277-1-16.pdf)

- McGrath, S. and R. Lugg. 2012. Knowing and doing vocational education and training reform: Evidence, learning and the policy process. *International Journal of Educational Development* 32, 696–708. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2012.02.004>
- McGrath, S., Ramsarup, P., Zeelen, J., Wedekind, V., Allais, S., Lotz-Sisitka, H., Monk, D., Openjuru, G., Russon, J.-A., 2020. Vocational education and training for African development: a literature review. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training* 72, 465–487. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820.2019.1679969>
- Ministry of Education, University and Research (of Italy). 2018. Provincial Centers for Adult Education. What they offer. Available at: [What they offer - Miur](#)
- Ministry of Labour and Social Security (of Turkey). 2018. Increasing School Attendance Rates Especially for Girls (IAREFG-II). Available at: <http://www.ikg.gov.tr/increasing-enrolment-rates-especially-for-girls-ii/?lang=en>
- Ministry of Rural Development (of India). 2020. About us: Vision: Transform rural poor youth into an economically independent and globally relevant workforce. Available at: <http://ddugky.gov.in/content/about-us-0>
- Ministry of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship (of India). 2020. Rozgar-Mela Available at: <https://msde.gov.in/en/schemes-initiatives/schemes-initiatives-through-nsdc/rozgar-mela>
- . 2015. National Policy for Skill Development and Entrepreneurship 2015. Available at: <https://msde.gov.in/sites/default/files/2019-09/National%20Policy%20on%20Skill%20Development%20and%20Entrepreneurship%20Final.pdf>
- National Christian Council of Kenya. 1967. After School What? NCCK, Nairobi.
- NCVER. 2018. Improving participation and success in VET for disadvantaged learners. Available at: <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED581698.pdf>
- NIER, 2011, Social education system in Japan. Available at: <https://www.nier.go.jp/English/educationjapan/pdf/201109LLL.pdf>
- OECD. 2021b. Provincial Centres for Adult Education. What they are, how they function and who use them. Available at: [https://www.oecd.org/els/emp/skills-and-work/adult-learning/CPIA\\_What\\_how\\_who.pdf](https://www.oecd.org/els/emp/skills-and-work/adult-learning/CPIA_What_how_who.pdf)
- . 2021c. Teachers and Leaders in Vocational Education and Training, OECD Reviews of Vocational Education and Training, OECD Publishing, Paris, <https://doi.org/10.1787/59d4fbb1-en>
- . 2020a. Strengthening the Governance of Skills Systems: Lessons from Six OECD Countries, OECD Skills Studies. Paris: OECD Publishing. Available at: [3a4bb6ea-en.pdf \(oecd-ilibrary.org\)](#)
- . 2020b. Education policy outlook Turkey. Available at: [Turkey-country-profile-2020 \(oecd.org\)](#)
- . 2019. Community Education and Training in South Africa, Getting Skills Right, OECD Publishing, Paris. <https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264312302-en>
- . 2018. Indigenous Employment and Skills Strategies in Canada, OECD Reviews on Local Job Creation, OECD Publishing, Paris. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264300477-en>
- . 2017a. Investing in Youth: Japan. Available at: <https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/docserver/9789264275898-en.pdf?expires=1645542536&id=id&accname=ocid57015261&checksum=2211099E6EA30319B5B7608275C6E82E>
- . 2017b. Getting skills right: United Kingdom. Policies to address skills imbalances in the United Kingdom. Available at: [https://read.oecd-ilibrary.org/employment/getting-skills-right-united-kingdom/policies-to-address-skills-imbalances-in-the-united-kingdom\\_9789264280489-6-en#page20](https://read.oecd-ilibrary.org/employment/getting-skills-right-united-kingdom/policies-to-address-skills-imbalances-in-the-united-kingdom_9789264280489-6-en#page20)
- . 2015. Strengthening public employment services, paper prepared for the G20 Employment Working Group, Istanbul, 7–8 May.
- . 2002. Glossary of statistical terms. Available at: <https://stats.oecd.org/glossary/detail.asp?ID=28>
- OECD/ILO. 2017. Engaging Employers in Apprenticeship Opportunities. Making It Happen Locally. Available at: [wcms\\_565884.pdf \(ilo.ch\)](#)
- Özer, M. 2021. A Promising Opportunity for the Integration of Syrian Refugees in Turkey: New Targets in Accessing the Labor Market through Vocational Education and Training, in: *Bartın University Journal of Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences*, 2021, Volume 12, Issue 23. Available at: [1772672 \(dergipark.org.tr\)](1772672 (dergipark.org.tr))
- PMKVY. 2021. Pradhan Mantri Kaushal Vikas Yojana. Available at: <http://www.pmkvyofficial.org>
- Postiglione, G. 2001. Community college development in China. Available at: <https://ejournals.bc.edu/index.php/ihe/article/download/6586/5807/>
- Powell, L. and S. McGrath. 2019. *Skills for Human Development*. Routledge, Abingdon.

- Powers, T. 2017. Partnerships and contractors in the delivery of employment services and ALMPs: a literature review. ILO Employment Working Paper No. 226. Available at: [wcms\\_613479.pdf \(ilo.org\)](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/-/dmp/-/publications-and-worksheets/-/working-paper/working-paper-no-226.pdf)
- Perlgut, D. 2020. The role of adult and community education providers in sustaining Australian democracy: A Discussion paper. Available at: <https://cca.edu.au/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/Role-of-adult-and-community-education-in-sustaining-Australian-democracy-and-supporting-civil-society-Jan2020.pdf>
- Rothboeck, S., Comyn, P. and Banerjee, P.S., 2018, 'Role of recognition of prior learning for emerging economies: learning from a four sector pilot project in India.' Journal of Education and Work, 31:4, pg.394-408. DOI:10.1080/13639080.2018.1473560
- SENAI. 2012. SENAI – Actions for Sustainable Development. Available at: [20131003142242606647o.pdf \(portaldaindustria.com.br\)](https://portaldaindustria.com.br)
- SENAR. 2022. Sertao Empreendedor. Available at: [Sertão Entrepreneur | Confederation of Agriculture and Livestock of Brazil \(CNA\) \(cnabrasil.org.br\)](https://www.sertaoempreendedor.org.br)
- SENAR/SEBRAE. n.d. Sertao Empreendedor, Available at: [FOLDER - SERTAO EMPREENDEDOR.indd \(cnabrasil.org.br\)](https://www.sertaoempreendedor.org.br)
- Sharma, A. and K. King. 2019. 'Skill India: new skills development initiatives in India', in: S McGrath, M Mulder, J Papier & R Suart (eds), Handbook of vocational education and training: developments in the changing world of work: volume 1, Springer Nature Switzerland, Cham, pp.39–62. Available at: <https://link.springer.com/referenceworkentry/10.1007/978-3-319-49789-176-1>
- Song, S. H., Kim, S. M., Kim, S. H., Yu, A. R., Jung, M. H., & Hwang, Y. U. 2012. A study on effective implementation of special school-based enterprises and integrated job-centered schools. Asian: Korea National Institute for Special Education.
- Spaulding, S and Blount, D.C, Employer Engagement by Community Based Organizations. Urban Institute, Washington DC USA, 2018. Available at: [https://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/98480/employer\\_engagement\\_by\\_community-based\\_organizations\\_1.pdf](https://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/98480/employer_engagement_by_community-based_organizations_1.pdf)
- Spours, K. and Grainger, P. 2018. A Social Ecosystem Model: A New Paradigm for Skills Development? G20 Policy Brief. Available at: [https://www.g20-insights.org/policy\\_briefs/a-social-ecosystem-model-a-new-paradigm-for-skills-development/](https://www.g20-insights.org/policy_briefs/a-social-ecosystem-model-a-new-paradigm-for-skills-development/)
- State Poverty Eradication Mission Kerala. 2022. Kudumbashree. Available at: [Kudumbashree | What is Kudumbashree](https://www.kudumbashree.org/)
- The Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, 2021. Human Capability Development Programme 2021-2025. Available at: <https://www.vision2030.gov.sa/v2030/vrps/hcdp/>
- The United States International Trade Administration, 2019. Education and Training Services, Available at: <https://www.trade.gov/knowledge-product/saudi-arabia-education-and-training-services>
- Thompsen, R.; Skovhus, R.; Buhl, R. 2017. Collection of cases: Career guidance in communities, translation prepared by Euroguidance Denmark.
- UK Parliament. 2020. Adult Community Learning. Available at : <https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm5801/cmselect/cmeduc/278/27808.htm>
- UN. 2016. Indigenous Peoples' Right to Education. Available at: [Backgrounder Indigenous Day 2016.pdf](https://www.un.org/development/desa/pubs/indigenous-peoples-right-to-education/)
- UNESCO. n.d. Promoting Inclusive Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Policy in Indonesia. Policy kit. Available at: <http://www.unesco.or.id/publication/policy%20kit%20promoting%20inclusive%20TVET%20policy%20Indonesia.pdf>
- UNESCO-UNEVOC. 2022. TVET country profile: Saudi Arabia, Available at: <https://unevoc.unesco.org/home/Dynamic+TVET+Country+Profiles/country=SAU>
- . 2021a. TVET Country Profile. Russian Federation. Available at: <https://unevoc.unesco.org/home/Dynamic+TVET+Country+Profiles/country=RUS>
- . 2021b. Technical and vocational education and training for disadvantaged youth. Available at: <https://unevoc.unesco.org/pub/tvetfordisadvantagedyouth.pdf>
- . 2018a. TVET country profile Mexico. Available at: [worldtvetdatabase\\_mex\\_en.pdf \(unesco.org\)](https://www.unesco.org/education/tvet-database/mex-en.pdf)
- . n.d. TVETipedia Glossary. Available at: [TVETipedia Glossary \(unesco.org\)](https://www.unesco.org/education/tvet-database/glossary)
- Unionlearn. 2020. Unionlearn from the TUC. Our history. Available at: [Our history | Unionlearn](https://www.unionlearn.org/our-history/)



- US Department of Education. 2020. Office of Career, Technical, and Adult Education, Available at: <https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ovae/index.html>
- US Department of Labour. 2022. Employment and Labour Administration. Available at: [ETA | U.S. Department of Labor \(dol.gov\)](https://www.dol.gov)
- U.S. Department of Labor, n.d. American Job Centers. Available at: <https://www.dol.gov/general/topic/training/onestop>
- van Rensburg, P. 1974. Report from Swaneng Hill. Dag Hammarskjold Foundation, Uppsala.
- Warburton, H. and S. Coupe. 2012. Bridging the gap between resource-poor farmers and extension services. The role of community-based extension systems, Innovations in extension and advisory services. International Conference Proceedings. Available at: [Bridging the gap between resource-poor farmers and extension services: The role of community based extensions | Climate Technology Centre & Network | Fri, 08/11/2017 \(ctc-n.org\)](https://www.ctc-n.org)
- Wedekind, V., Russon, J.-A., Ramsarup, P., Monk, D., Metelerkamp, L., and McGrath, S. 2021. Conceptualising regional skills ecosystems: Reflections on four African cases. International Journal of Training and Development 25, 4, 347-362. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ijtd.12251>
- Wedekind, V., Fakoush, H., and Alla-Mensah, J. 2019. Human migration and TVET. UNEVOC Discussion Paper. Available at: <https://unevoc.unesco.org/pub/30002-eng.pdf>
- Wicaksono et al. 2022. Priority Issue: Human Capacity Development for Sustainable Growth and Productivity Improvement, Background Issue Note for G20 EWG Group Meeting March 2022.
- Wood, D. 2018. Federalism in Action: The Devolution of Canada's Public Employment Service, University of Toronto Press, 2018.
- WorkBC. 2022. Skills Training for Employment. Available at: <https://www.workbc.ca/Training-Education/Skills-Training-for-Employment.aspx>
- Working Group for International Co-operation in Skills Development (WGICSD). 2005. Skills Development for Rural People: A Renewed Challenge. Paper 10. Debates in Skills Development. Available at: [Paper10.pdf \(norrag.org\)](https://www.norrag.org)
- . 2007. World Development Report 2008: Agriculture for Development, available at: [World Development Report 2008 : Agriculture for Development \(worldbank.org\)](https://www.worldbank.org)
- WHO. 2010. CBR Guidelines. Livelihood component. Available at: [CBR cover 4 for press PDF.indd \(who.int\)](https://www.who.int)
- Yang, J.; Yorozu, R. 2015. Building a learning society in Japan, the Republic of Korea and Singapore, UIL Publication Series on Lifelong Learning Policies and Strategies: No. 2. Available at: <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000232547>
- Yoon, J. 2012. An effect of vocational rehabilitation program of integrated school of vocational education on occupational preparation of the mentally handicapped students (Master's Thesis). Daegue University.
- Youth4Europe. n.d. European Youth Goals 2019-2027. Available at: [European Youth Goals 2019-2027 - Youth for Europe](https://www.youth4europe.eu)
- Zhou, Q.Q. 2019. The path analysis of rural community education service on rural revitalization strategy in China, Open Access Library Journal, 6: e5860. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.4236/oalib.1105860>

## Additional resources

Chung, B.G., Jeon, I.S., Lee, R.H. et al. Global Governance of Education and Training: as reviewed from Jomtien via Incheon to New York. *Asia Pacific Educ. Rev.* 19, 319–336 (2018).

Emmenegger, P.; Graf, L.; Trampusch, C. 2019. The governance of decentralised cooperation in collective training systems: a review and conceptualisation, in: *Journal of vocational education and training*, 01/2019, Volume 71, Issue 1.

Klatt G., Milana M. 2020. Education and Training 2020. In: Milana M., Klatt G., Vatrella S. (eds) *Europe's Lifelong Learning Markets, Governance and Policy*. Palgrave Studies in Adult Education and Lifelong Learning. Palgrave Macmillan, Cham.

OECD. 2018. *Skills Strategy Implementation Guidance for Slovenia: Improving the Governance of Adult Learning*, OECD Skills Studies, OECD Publishing, Paris.

Pouliakas, K. and A. Ranieri. 2019. Governance of Labor Market and Skills Intelligence as Driver of VET Reform, in: *Handbook of Vocational Education and Training Developments in the Changing World of Work*. Springer International Publishing, Cham, 07/14/2019.

Taysum, A. and K. Arar (Eds). 2018. *Turbulence, Empowerment and Marginalisation in International Education Governance Systems*, Emerald Publishing Limited, 2018. ProQuest Ebook Central.

### Argentina

Hanni, M. 2019. *Financing of Education and Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in Latin America and the Caribbean*. Santiago, Chile: European Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean.

UNESCO-UNEVOC. TVET country profile. Argentina [Dynamic TVET Country Profiles \(unesco.org\)](https://unesco.org/dynamic-tvet-country-profiles)

Atchoarena, D. and Lavinia Gasperini. 2003. *Education for rural development: towards new policy responses*. FAO and UNESCO-IIEP. Available at: [Education for rural development: towards new policy responses; 2003](#)

Bolaños, Diego Juárez. 2020. *Programas educativos dirigidos a poblaciones de los territorios rurales. Experiencias en Argentina y México*. Available at: [Programas educativos dirigidos a poblaciones de los territorios rurales. Experiencias en Argentina y México | Tendencias Pedagógicas \(uam.es\)](#)

### Australia

CEDEFOP. 2009. *World Class Competition in Training: Advanced Economies: Some of Europe's Vocational Education and Training Policy Priorities are Shared by Australia, Canada, Japan and the United States: How Are They Responding?* (Briefing Note). Thessaloniki, Greece: CEDEFOP.

Deissinger, T.; Gulden, S.; Herdrich, M. 2017. *Internationales Handbuch der Berufsbildung: Australien*. Vol. 46.

National VET Funding Collections <https://www.ncver.edu.au/research-and-statistics/collections/vet-funding/the-national-vet-funding-collection-explained>

Karmel, T. 2020. "Learning From Successful Skills Development Systems: Lessons From Australia. *Prospects* 44: 235-247.

Malloch, M. and A. Helmy. 2015. "TVET Teachers: A Reflection on Trends in Indonesia and Australia." *TVET@ sia* 5.

Peters, S. 2021. "Market Conditions of International VET Providers: A Comparative Analysis of Australia, UK, USA, and Germany." *Empirical Research in Vocational Education and Training*, 13(1): 1-19.

Struthers, K. and G. Strachan. 2019. "Attracting Women Into Male-Dominated Trades: Views of Young Women in Australia." *International Journal for Research in Vocational Education and Training* 6 (1): 1-19.

### Brazil

Atchoarena, D. and Lavinia Gasperini. 2003. *Education for rural development: towards new policy responses*. FAO and UNESCO-IIEP. Available at: [Education for rural development: towards new policy responses; 2003](#)

Gomes, Candido Alberto and Jacira Câmara. 2004. *Training for rural development in Brazil: SENAR, FAO/UNESCO-IIEP*. Available at: <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000136269/PDF/136269eng.pdf.multi>

### China

Hanemann, U. 2017. *Community Learning Centres (CLC) Programme, China*. UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning (Last update: 20 July 2017). Available at: <https://uil.unesco.org/case-study/effective-practices-database-litbase-0/community-learning-centres-clc-programme-china#:~:text=The%20CLC%20Programme,underdeveloped%20counties%20of%20Gansu%20province.>

OECD. 2016. *Education in China: A snapshot*. Available at: <https://www.oecd.org/china/Education-in-China-a-snapshot.pdf>

Xue, E.; Li, J.; Li, X. 2021. Sustainable development of education in rural areas for rural revitalization in China: A comprehensive policy circle analysis, *Sustainability* 2021, 13, 13101. <https://www.mdpi.com/2071-1050/13/23/13101/pdf>  
 UNESCO-UNEVOC. 2018b. TVET Country Profile. People's Republic of China. Available at: [Dynamic TVET Country Profiles \(unesco.org\)](https://unesco.org)

### France

Cedefop. 2019. France overview, available at: <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/tools/vet-in-europe/systems/france-2019>

Centre Innffo. 2020. Territoires d'Outre-mer : modalités d'intervention des Opco. Available at: <https://www.centre-inffo.fr/site-droit-formation/actualites-droit/mayotte-modalites-dintervention-dun-opco-interprofessionnel>

Cnesco. n.d. État des lieux en France sur l'enseignement professionnel. Available at : <http://www.cnesco.fr/fr/dossier-enseignement-professionnel/bilan-en-france/>

France Compétences. n.d. Qui sommes-nous? Available at: <https://www.francecompetences.fr/france-competences/#gouvernance>

Légifrance. 2020. Décret n° 2020-1680 du 23 décembre 2020 relatif à la formation professionnelle outre-mer. Available at: <https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/jorf/id/JORFTEXT000042739065>

Ministère du Travail, de l'Emploi et de l'Insertion. 2019. La formation professionnelle : principes généraux. Available at: <https://travail-emploi.gouv.fr/formation-professionnelle/article/la-formation-professionnelle-principes-generaux>

—. N.d. Accompagner les jeunes - Plan 1 jeune, 1 solution. Available at: <https://travail-emploi.gouv.fr/le-ministere-en-action/relance-activite/plan-1jeune-1solution/>

Ministère de l'Économie, des Finances et de la Relance. n.d. Sésame vers l'Emploi pour le Sport et l'Animation dans les Métiers de l'Encadrement. Available at: <https://www.economie.gouv.fr/plan-de-relance/profils/particuliers/sesame-emploi-sport-animation>

Missions Locales. 2018. Missions Locales. Available at: <https://www.mission-locale.fr/missions-locales/>

### Indonesia

Dewa Komang Tantra. 2012. Pusat Kegiatan Belajar Masyarakat (PKBM) dan Akreditasi. Available at: <https://jurnalakrab.kemdikbud.go.id/index.php/jurnalakrab/article/view/259>

Kadir, S.; Bachrul, N.; Bachrul, B. 2016. Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Indonesia: Challenges and Opportunities for the Future. Available at: [https://lkyspp.nus.edu.sg/docs/default-source/case-studies/lkysppms\\_case\\_study\\_technical\\_and\\_vocational\\_education\\_and\\_training\\_in\\_indonesia.pdf?sfvrsn=e5c5960b\\_2](https://lkyspp.nus.edu.sg/docs/default-source/case-studies/lkysppms_case_study_technical_and_vocational_education_and_training_in_indonesia.pdf?sfvrsn=e5c5960b_2)

Kamdi, W. 2015, Community-Based Learning in Vocational Education and Training: Making Schools Closer to The Real World, in: Proceedings of the 3rd UPI International Conference on Technical and Vocational Education and Training, Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research, Feb 2015. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.2991/ictvet-14.2015.48>

Prakarsa. 2020. Laporan Evaluasi Balai Latihan Kerja (BLK-K) Angkatan 2017-2018. Jakarta: Prakarsa. Available at:

OECD. 2020. Fostering local approaches to skills in Indonesia. Available at: <https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/sites/df6c4fbb-en/index.html?itemId=/content/component/df6c4fbb-en>

SEA-VET. n.d. Indonesia Profile. Available at: [SEA Indonesia TVET profile](https://sea-vet.org/sea-vet-profile/indonesia)

Shantini Y, Hidayat D, Oktiawanti L. 2019. Community learning center in Indonesia: managing program in nonformal education. *International Journal of Research and Review*. 2019; 6(11):522-532. Available at [https://www.ijrrjournal.com/IJRR\\_Vol.6\\_Issue.11\\_Nov2019/IJRR0066.pdf](https://www.ijrrjournal.com/IJRR_Vol.6_Issue.11_Nov2019/IJRR0066.pdf)

UNESCO-UNEVOC. 2021a. TVET Country Profile. Indonesia. Available at: [UNESCO 2021 Indonesia TVET Country Profile](https://unesco.org)

UNESCO Bangkok. 2008. Community learning centres: country report from Asia. Available at: <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000160492>

### Japan

MEXT. 2010. The Concept of Global Human Resource Development Focusing on the East Asian Region. Importance of promoting interuniversity exchanges with quality assurance. Available at: <https://www.mext.go.jp/en/policy/education/highered/title02/detail02/sdetail02/1373900.htm>

Tsukamoto. 2016. VET in Japan, <https://internationaleducation.gov.au/International-network/japan/countryoverview/Documents/2016%20VET%20brief.pdf>

World Bank. 2015. Promoting Skills Development and Job Creation in East Asia Project. Available at: <https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/401251508750125067/pdf/120585-WP-P150980-PUBLIC-Japan-NQF-summary.pdf>

### **Mexico**

CONALEP. 2017. La Experiencia del CONALEP en la Formación Dual, Available at: [La experiencia del CONALEP en la Formacion Dual VF .pdf \(www.gob.mx\)](#)

Gobierno de México. n.d. Conalep: Colegio Nacional de Educación Profesional Técnica. Available at: [http://sems.gob.mx/es\\_mx/sems/vinculacion-social](http://sems.gob.mx/es_mx/sems/vinculacion-social)

Loukos, Panos and Leslie Arathoon. 2021. Panorama del ecosistema agrotecnológico para los pequeños agricultores de América Latina y el Caribe, NOTA TÉCNICA 2084, Banco Interamericano de Desarrollo (BID) Lab. Available at: [Panorama del ecosistema agrotecnológico para los pequeños agricultores de América Latina y el Caribe | Publications \(iadb.org\)](#)

Ruiz López, Arturo and Elena Quiroz Lima. 2014. Educación comunitaria: una propuesta alternativa para los pueblos indígenas de Oaxaca – México, in: Polis. Revista Latinoamericana 38/2014. Available at: [Educación comunitaria: una propuesta alternativa para los pueblos indígenas de Oaxaca – México \(openedition.org\)](#)

### **Republic of Korea**

OECD. 2020c. Strengthening the governance of skills systems, <https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/sites/cd2b486a-en/index.html?itemId=/content/component/cd2b486a-en>

### **Russia**

ILO. 2011. Employment and Labour Market Strategies in Russia in the Context of Innovations Economy. Proceedings of the Conference organized jointly by the Ministry of Health and Social Development and the ILO. Available at: [https://www.ilo.org/moscow/information-resources/publications/WCMS\\_306607/lang--en/index.htm](https://www.ilo.org/moscow/information-resources/publications/WCMS_306607/lang--en/index.htm)

Mirzabalaeva, Farida Islamudinovna; Zabelina, Olga Viktorovna; Shichkin, Igor Alexeevich; Alieva Patimat Ruslanovna. 2017. Primary Areas of Labor Force Development in Russian Rural Territories, in: Academy of Strategic Management Journal, Vol: 16 Issue 1. Available at: [Primary Areas of Labor Force Development in Russian Rural Territories \(abacademies.org\)](#)

OECD. 2003. Partnerships and employment in the Russian Federation: Lessons from the Krasnokamsk Initiative. Seminar organised by the Russian Ministry of Labour and Social Development and the OECD (LEED Programme). Available at: <https://www.oecd.org/employment/leed/2496892.pdf>

World Bank. 2021. Barriers and Opportunities to Employment for Persons with Disabilities in the Russian Federation. Available at: <https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/36627>

### **Saudi Arabia**

Aldossari, A.S. 2020. Vision 2030 and reducing the stigma of vocational and technical training among Saudi Arabian students. Empirical Res Voc Ed Train 12, 3 (2020). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40461-020-00089-6>

Arabi, K. 2018. The impact of human capital on Saudi economic growth: emphasis on female human capital. Arch Busin Res 6:189–203. <https://doi.org/10.14738/abr.612.5588>

Khan F, Aradi W, Schwalje W, Buckner E, Fernandez-Carag M. 2017. Women's participation in technical and vocational education and training in the Gulf States. Inter J Train Res 15:229–244. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14480220.2017.1374666>

Saudi Hollandi Capital, 2012. Labor and the Nitaqat program: Effect on the Saudi Arabian economy, Available at: <https://www.alawwalinvest.com/content/laborandthenitaqatprogram.pdf>

### **South Africa**

Department of Higher Education and Training (of South Africa). 2020. Revised Strategic Plan 2020-25. Available at: <https://www.dhet.gov.za/SiteAssets/Planing%2cPolicy%20and%20Strategy/DHET%20Revised%202020-2025%20Strat%20Plan%20.pdf>

Government Gazette. 2020. List of CETC, Community learning Centres and Satellite Learning Centres <https://www.dhet.gov.za/SiteAssets/Community%20College/Full%20list%20of%20CET%20Colleges.pdf>

Kühn, M. 2019. The South African Technical and Vocational Education and Training System from a German Perspective. Available at:

<https://www.researchgate.net/publication/341646223> The South African Technical and Vocational Education and Training System from a German Perspective

Landa, N., Zhou, S.; Marongwe, N. 2021. Education in emergencies: Lessons from COVID-19 in South Africa. *Int Rev Educ* 67, 167–183 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11159-021-09903-z>

### **Turkey**

Education Reform Initiative (ERG). 2018. Education Monitoring Report 2016-17. Available at: [EIR2016-17.ENG 29.06.18.web .pdf \(egitimreformugirisimi.org\)](#)

ETF. 2009. In demand: Career guidance in EU Neighbourhood countries. Available at: [Career guidance in EU neighbo... \(iccdpp.org\)](#)