



International
Labour
Office
Geneva

**Employment Sector
Employment Report No. 1**

2008

**Apprenticeship in the informal
economy in Africa**

**Workshop report
Geneva, 3-4 May 2007**

Skills and
Employability
Department

Copyright © International Labour Organization 2008
First published 2008

Publications of the International Labour Office enjoy copyright under Protocol 2 of the Universal Copyright Convention. Nevertheless, short excerpts from them may be reproduced without authorization, on condition that the source is indicated. For rights of reproduction or translation, application should be made to ILO Publications (Rights and Permissions), International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland, or by email: pubdroit@ilo.org. The International Labour Office welcomes such applications.

Libraries, institutions and other users registered with reproduction rights organizations may make copies in accordance with the licences issued to them for this purpose. Visit <http://www.ifro.org> to find the reproduction rights organization in your country.

Apprenticeship in the informal economy in Africa: Workshop report, Geneva, 3-4 May 2007 / International Labour Office, Skills and Employability Department. - Geneva: ILO, 2008

62 p. (Employment Sector Employment Report; No.1)

ISBN 978-92-2-120202-8 (print); 978-92-2-120203-5 (pdf)

International Labour Office; Employment Sector.

apprenticeship / informal economy / Africa

06.09.2

ILO Cataloguing in Publication Data

The designations employed in ILO publications, which are in conformity with United Nations practice, and the presentation of material therein do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the International Labour Office concerning the legal status of any country, area or territory or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers.

The responsibility for opinions expressed in signed articles, studies and other contributions rests solely with their authors, and publication does not constitute an endorsement by the International Labour Office of the opinions expressed in them.

Reference to names of firms and commercial products and processes does not imply their endorsement by the International Labour Office, and any failure to mention a particular firm, commercial product or process is not a sign of disapproval.

ILO publications and electronic products can be obtained through major booksellers or ILO local offices in many countries, or direct from ILO Publications, International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland. Catalogues or lists of new publications are available free of charge from the above address, or by email: pubvente@ilo.org

Visit our website: <http://www.ilo.org/publns>

Printed in Switzerland

Foreword

This report summarizes the presentations and discussions of the workshop “Apprenticeship in the informal economy in Africa”, held on 3-4 May 2007, in Geneva, ILO Headquarters. The objective of the technical meeting was to bring together experts from ILO, academic institutions and development agencies to discuss apprenticeship as a main provider of skills and competences in the informal economy. Apprenticeship is receiving increasing attention in the international policy debate and from policy-makers, in particular in countries where a growing number of young women and men need to be prepared for the world of work.

The ILO’s commitment to upgrade apprenticeship systems in the informal economy is rooted in the Human Resources Development Recommendation, 2004 (No. 195). It calls on members to identify skills development policies that “address the challenge of transforming activities in the informal economy into decent work fully integrated into mainstream economic life” (Art. 3(d))¹. Upgrading informal apprenticeship aims at strengthening incentives for master craftspeople and apprentices to participate in apprenticeship, enhancing quality and relevance of training and effectiveness of the training process, and improving outcomes in terms of employability, productivity, decent work and development.

The ILO is committed to addressing informal training systems through an integrated policy approach aiming to establish linkages between training systems in the informal economy and the formal technical and vocational education and training (TVET) system; improve equal access to apprenticeship for young women and men and expand apprenticeship opportunities for persons in disadvantaged groups; develop assessment and certification schemes for recognition of skills; enhance social protection for apprentices and master craftspeople and improve occupational safety and health measures; facilitate access to microfinance; and strengthen social partnership and social dialogue in the design and implementation of policies.

The workshop identified critical issues and policy challenges with regard to skills development and decent work, and discussed apprenticeship as an entry point for ILO activities in the informal economy and Decent Work Country Programmes. Furthermore, experts shared knowledge and lessons learned in the Africa region on best *practices* to upgrade and improve apprenticeship systems and on effective *policies* to bridge informal and formal training systems and to help informal apprenticeship move towards formalization. Finally, the workshop discussed relevant research questions and methodological issues for fresh research to fill knowledge gaps.

¹ “Training can be one of the instruments that, together with other measures, address the challenge of the informal sector [sic]...Informal sector work is unprotected work that is, for the most part, characterized by low earnings and low productivity. The role of training is not to prepare people for the informal sector and keep them in the informal sector; or to expand the informal sector; but rather it should go in conjunction with other instruments, such as fiscal policies, provision of credit, and extension of social protection and labour laws, to improve the performance of enterprises and the employability of workers in order to transform what are often marginal, survival activities into decent work fully integrated into mainstream economic life. Prior learning and skills gained in the sector should be validated, as they will help the said workers gain access to the formal labour market. The social partners should be fully involved in developing these programmes” (ILO, 2000, para. 7).

I congratulate all participants for making the meeting a success and all presenters for their excellent contributions.

I would like to take this opportunity to thank Irmgard Nübler, who is leading the work programme on apprenticeship and who planned, designed and organized this meeting with the support of colleagues from the Skills and Employability Department. Special thanks to Christine Hofmann who prepared this workshop report, and to both her and Sebastian Buckup who with great enthusiasm helped to organize the workshop. Thanks also to Pia Korpinen, Heather Labanya, Alessandra Molz, Mouniratou Tangara, and Frédérique Weyer who prepared notes of various sessions. I would also like to thank Jane Auvré for helping to organize the meeting and prepare this manuscript.

Hans Haan, one of the keynote speakers at this workshop, passed away shortly after this workshop. His vast knowledge and expertise on training in the informal economy will be missed.

Christine Evans-Klock
Director
Skills and Employability Department
ILO, Geneva

Contents

| | <i>page</i> |
|---|-------------|
| Foreword | iii |
| Abbreviations | vii |
| 1. Introduction..... | 1 |
| 2. Setting the scene..... | 2 |
| 2.1 Keynote presentations..... | 2 |
| <i>Global Employment Agenda and Decent Work</i> | 2 |
| <i>Apprenticeship in the informal economy: Anything new since the 1970s?</i> | 4 |
| <i>New challenges for informal apprenticeship and its potential to adjust</i> | 5 |
| 2.2 Apprenticeship: A multidimensional approach..... | 7 |
| 3. Thematic presentations and discussion | 10 |
| 3.1 Issues and challenges: An ILO perspective | 10 |
| <i>Social protection in apprenticeship</i> | 10 |
| <i>Issues and challenges: A skills perspective</i> | 11 |
| <i>Child labour: The perspective of the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)</i> | 13 |
| <i>Apprenticeships in the informal economy: Potential role of microfinance</i> | 15 |
| <i>The perspective of the entrepreneur</i> | 16 |
| 3.2 Upgrading apprenticeship systems in Africa: Experience and lessons from technical cooperation projects..... | 19 |
| <i>Apprenticeship training: Model and stakes</i> | 19 |
| <i>Apprenticeship systems in Africa: Reference systems, project experiences and lessons learned</i> | 22 |
| <i>Apprenticeship systems in East and West Africa in the ILO Child Labour Project</i> | 24 |
| <i>Approaches to make apprenticeship in Niger more decent and more effective</i> | 28 |
| <i>Examples of interesting projects to upgrade informal apprenticeship</i> | 29 |
| <i>The Vocational Skills and Informal Sector Support Project (VSP) in Ghana</i> | 31 |
| 3.3 The institutional framework of apprenticeship systems in West Africa | 34 |
| <i>Apprenticeship systems in the West African region: An institutional framework</i> | 34 |
| 3.4 Policies and strategies to improve the institutional framework: Role of governments, employers' and workers' organizations..... | 37 |
| <i>Formalization of the informal economy: Different perspectives</i> | 37 |
| <i>Dual apprenticeship in the informal economy: The cases of Benin, Senegal and Togo</i> | 38 |
| <i>Policies and strategies to improve the institutional framework for informal apprenticeship training: The case of Ghana</i> | 41 |
| <i>Apprenticeship training in Mali today</i> | 43 |
| <i>Apprenticeship in the informal economy: The Continuous Apprenticeship Programme in Egypt, 2002-06</i> | 43 |
| 4. Looking ahead: Knowledge gaps and research questions..... | 46 |

| | |
|---|----|
| 5. Conclusion | 50 |
| Bibliography | 53 |
| Appendix I: Workshop programme | 57 |
| Appendix II: List of participants | 61 |

Abbreviations

| | |
|------------|--|
| ADEA | Association for the Development of Education in Africa (ADEA) |
| AFD | French Development Agency (Agence française de développement) |
| BMZ | German Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development |
| CAP | Certificate after school-based vocational training (Certificat d'aptitude professionnelle) |
| COTVET | Council for TVET |
| CQP | Certificate after dual apprenticeship (Certificat de qualification professionnel) |
| DFID | UK Department for International Development |
| FNAM | National Federation of Malian Artisans (Fédération nationale des artisans Maliens) |
| FNAN | National Federation of Niger Artisans (Fédération nationale des artisans du Niger) |
| GTZ | German Technical Cooperation |
| ILO | International Labour Organization |
| IPEC | International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour |
| ISA | Informal Sector Association |
| ISTARN | Informal Sector Training and Resources Network Project in Zimbabwe |
| IUED | Graduate institute of development studies (Institut universitaire d'études du développement) |
| MDG | Millennium Development Goal |
| NACVET | National Co-ordinating Committee on Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Ghana |
| NGO | Non-governmental organization |
| NQF | National Qualification Framework |
| NVTI | National Vocational Training Institute in Ghana |
| PAFP | Vocational Training Support Programme |
| PRSP | Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper |
| SFP | Social Finance Programme of ILO |
| SITE | Strengthening Informal Training and Enterprise in Kenya |
| STEP | Skills Training and Entrepreneurship Programme in Ghana |
| STEP (ILO) | Strategies and Tools against social Exclusion and Poverty |
| TREE | Training for Economic Empowerment |
| TVET | Technical and Vocational Education and Training |
| UNESCO | United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization |
| UNEVOC | International Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training of UNESCO |
| VSP | Vocational Skills and Informal Sector Support Project in Ghana |
| VTI | Vocational Training Institution |

1. Introduction

Many young people in the informal economy find themselves trapped in a vicious circle of low skills, low productivity and low income. The absence of opportunities and resources for training prevents young workers from enhancing their employability to work out of poverty, and it hinders the economy's ability to enhance technologies, productivity and development. The challenge is to provide learning opportunities that improve employability of all young women and men. This represents the shared responsibility of society: parents, community, enterprises, government and social partners.

Apprenticeship has been providing the traditional solution for developing and financing vocational skills of young people in poor societies. Today, apprenticeship in the informal economy represents the main road to skills development in most developing countries. Estimations suggest that 80 per cent of the skills imparted in the informal economy in West Africa are transferred through apprenticeship. In Benin, in 2005, approximately 200,000 young apprentices were trained, which represents ten times as many apprentices than students in vocational and technical education. In many European countries, the traditional guilds-based apprenticeship systems were widely used between the late medieval period and the beginning of industrialization. While it has evolved into effective formal or modern apprenticeship systems in some countries, apprenticeship has almost disappeared in many others.

The International Labour Organization (ILO) acknowledged the relevance of apprenticeship systems early on through its Vocational Training Recommendation, 1939 (No. 57), and Apprenticeship Recommendation, 1939 (No. 60), its Vocational Training (Agriculture) Recommendation, 1956 (No. 101) and Vocational Training Recommendation, 1962 (No. 117). The debate on the informal economy which was launched by the ILO during the 1970s also drew attention to apprenticeship systems in the informal economy. Since then, the ILO is undertaking research in this area, mainly in West African countries, to shed light on the informal training systems. There is clear evidence that apprenticeship in the informal economy is governed by informal institutions such as traditions, social norms and networks. These institutions provide incentives to craftspeople to supply and to youngsters to demand apprenticeship. Furthermore, apprenticeship also provides a mechanism to finance training which allows in particular young people from poor families to access training. Apprenticeship in this region has been described as a self-regulating, self-financing and effective training system, providing relevant occupational skills to a large number of young people and helping poor people gain access to training. However, the studies also identified important weaknesses and challenges in terms of relevance and quality of training, decent work and equal access to apprenticeship.

Training systems in the informal economy went largely unrecognized by governments and training policies. This reflected the general view of many governments towards the informal economy. Development policies and strategies focused on industrialization, modernization and growth which resulted in ignorance, or worse, in hostility towards the informal economy. In the area of training and skills development, policies largely focused on developing formal, government-led and centre-based training systems which provided training in advanced skills to a limited number of workers. These formal training systems remained inaccessible for informal economy workers and the poor due to high costs of training, and a lack of formal education required for admission. More recently, we observe a more supportive view of governments towards the informal economy.

The international policy debate on skills development has, for more than a decade, largely neglected training systems in the informal economy and they are only recently regaining attention. In the light of growing informality, high youth unemployment, and

limited capacities of formal education and training systems to provide vocational education and training, upgrading of informal training and apprenticeship systems is discussed as an important policy option.

The ILO is committed to helping constituents design integrated policies to upgrade work in the informal economy and to reduce decent work deficits by promoting transition to formalization. The current challenge is to develop effective integrated approaches that combine employment creation and social protection with rights at work and representation. Apprenticeship provides an entry point for multiple ILO activities to promote decent work in the informal economy as it touches a wide range of critical and relevant issues: skills development, social security, working conditions, safety and health, child labour, financing and other issues relevant for decent work.

Against this background, the ILO is developing policy messages that are suitable to improve skills development and achieve decent work in apprenticeship training and at the same time protect the incentives of master craftspersons and young people to participate in apprenticeship. Interventions must be carefully designed and need to be sensitive towards existing institutions. Policy-makers need to better understand the institutions governing apprenticeship, analyze their dynamics, and explore policy options and their effectiveness to upgrade apprenticeship. They also need to determine the scope for institutional change and identify practical ways to implement these changes and to link apprenticeship in the informal economy with the formal training system as well as with formal labour markets.

The initial focus of the Skills and Employability Department's apprenticeship research will be Africa for two reasons. First, Africa represents one of the Employment Sectors' priority areas. Second, our state of knowledge is most advanced on apprenticeship in the informal economy in African countries, while only limited research is available from other regions.

2. Setting the scene

2.1 Keynote presentations

Global Employment Agenda and Decent Work

Mr José-Manuel Salazar, ILO

Mr Salazar presented the ILO vision of employment challenges, explaining the context for the work on apprenticeship systems. Four major concerns constitute the employment problem today: (i) despite recent high economic growth, the absolute number of unemployed people is at an all-time high; (ii) there has only been a slight reduction in the numbers of working poor; (iii) the employment gap between women and men persists; and (iv) unemployment and underemployment hit young people hardest. Latest labour market trends (1996-2006) show that more people are working than ever before. However, employment-to-population ratios have declined and total unemployment continues to rise. Overall, the share of working poor has decreased but in absolute terms it remains at an all-time high. Looking at the number of working poor by region, one sees improvements in China, India, and South Asia, whereas in sub-Saharan Africa the amount of working poor has increased.

In sub-Saharan Africa, more than 90 per cent of the workforce is employed in the informal economy. Also across Asian countries, in spite of rapid growth, the working poor represent between 47 and 84 per cent of the workforce. In Latin America, the informal economy accounts for some 75 per cent of workers and 40 per cent of GDP. In total, it is

estimated that out of every ten jobs created in the last 15 years, on average seven were created in the informal economy. Also the gender employment gap persists: in 2006, worldwide only 49 per cent of women aged 15+ were formally employed compared to 74 per cent of men. Young people are most strongly affected: 86.3 million young people, which equals 44 per cent of the world's youth, are unemployed. Youth unemployment rates are normally two to three times higher than average rates.

Policy conclusions from growth, employment and poverty trends

High economic growth is important for poverty reduction and employment creation but it is not sufficient. Given observed trends, there is no reason to think that continued robust growth alone will translate into significant reductions in poverty. Innovative employment and decent work policies are required to strengthen the link between growth and employment creation. In developing countries characterized by dual economies, policy interventions need to focus on the formal and the informal economy and should target women and young people to empower them to join the work force, either as wage labourers or entrepreneurs.

ILO policy framework

The Global Employment Agenda is the employment pillar of the ILO Decent Work Agenda and constitutes the basic policy framework for employment policies. The Global Employment Agenda, which was adopted by the Governing Body in 2003, consists of ten core elements which seek to promote employment, economic development and social justice.

In 2002, the ILO proposed broadening the definition of the “informal sector” to “informal economy” to include all economic activities that are in law or practice – not covered or insufficiently covered – by formal arrangements. This means the informal economy covers workers with diverse employment situations across all economic sectors, in rural and urban areas: workers in wage employment and self-employment, own account workers,² contributing family members and economic units. These employment situations have in common clear decent work deficits and limited access to mainstream resources. The following elements of the ILO decent work strategic objectives are intrinsically linked with the ILO approach towards the informal economy:

- growth strategies and quality employment generation;
- regulatory environment including promotion of labour standards and core rights;
- entrepreneurship, skills, microfinance, market access;
- extension of social security and protection;
- local development (rural and urban);
- organization, representation and social dialogue.

These elements are critical for ILO work on apprenticeship in the informal economy.

² “Informal own-account enterprises are household enterprises (in the sense of paragraph 7) owned and operated by own-account workers, either alone or in partnership with members of the same or other households, which may employ contributing family workers and employees on an occasional basis, but do not employ employees on a continuous basis” (ILO, 1993).

Apprenticeship in the informal economy: Anything new since the 1970s?

**Mr Michel Carton, Institut universitaire d'études
du développement (IUED)**

Introduction

The presentation reflected on the use and meaning of the concepts of informal economy and apprenticeship and its policy implications. Thirty years ago, Mr Carton was involved in research on apprenticeship in the informal economy interviewing 1,500 artisans in Bamako, Kigali and Lomé. An ILO project on the so-called “*Secteur non structuré*” followed. Today, the concept of informality as well as the role of the state needs to be reassessed.

Conceptual considerations

It is questionable whether distinguishing between the informal and the formal economy still makes sense in countries where almost every economic activity is “informal”. The term “informal” implies a normative judgement meaning “not according to due form”. This connotation could be avoided by replacing the term “informal economy” with “national economy”.³ Neither does the differentiation between artisan and entrepreneur reflect the reality: master craftspeople often become entrepreneurs and/or fulfil both tasks at the same time with shifting emphasis. The same holds true for “modern” and “traditional” apprenticeship; this distinction is also potentially misleading as the apprenticeship training itself is neither modern nor traditional, it is training for entrepreneurship and technical skills and introduces the apprentice into relevant social and economic networks. The distinction between “traditional” or “modern” only refers to the occupation. Furthermore, the question arises: what is the meaning of “traditional” today?

The role of the state – A historical overview of perspectives on the informal economy

In the 1970s, the State looked at the informal sector as a parasite, as an obstacle to development. In Kigali, for example, the police chased artisans out of their workshops for being “illegal”. This happened in a context of strong belief in the capability of the state to achieve industrialization and modernization.

In the 1980s and 1990s, liberalism was on the rise and policy attention shifted from market to government failure. Due to structural adjustment programmes and ongoing crises, states were weakened and public sector training was contested by the World Bank. The attitude towards the informal economy became friendlier since it was now seen as a fertile ground for entrepreneurial activities which could provide a way out of poverty and provide training to young people. While in the 1970s, the informal economy was considered as “abnormal”, the perceptions changed to seeing it as “pre-normal” in the 1980s and 1990s, meaning that steady growth would eventually lead to formalization. The State, consequently, intervened little in informal activities applying “soft” policies (*état mou*).

³ For the ILO position see, for example, Governing Body document, “The informal economy” presented at the 298th Session, Mar. 2007. It states that “to promote decent work, there needs to be a comprehensive and integrated strategy cutting across a range of policy areas that eliminates the negative aspects of informality, while preserving the significant job creation and income-generation potential of the informal economy, and that promotes the protection and incorporation of workers and economic units in the informal economy into the mainstream economy” (ILO, 2007a, p. 1).

However, views on informality still varied from seeing informality as an impediment to growth to considering it as a necessary bi-product of economic growth.

Today, countries are faced with the challenges of globalization, including regional integration and a new mix of stakeholders. Governments need to conceptualize the informal economy as the “national economy” and thus shape policies in line with national needs and priorities, promoting entrepreneurship and national development, discarding the duality between formal and informal.

New challenges for informal apprenticeship and its potential to adjust

Mr Hans Christiaan Haan, UNESCO-UNEVOC

The presentation distinguished three types of apprenticeship, discussed their relative advantages and limitations, and reviewed challenges and good practices to upgrade apprenticeship.

Types of apprenticeship training

First, traditional apprenticeship refers to the well-organized transfer of skills within families and social groups based on socio-cultural conventions. It consists of an agreement between the master craftsman and the parents or guardian of the apprentice regulating skills training. The master craftsman takes care of lodging and food for the apprentice and is expected to also provide some ‘moral upbringing’.

Second, informal apprenticeship is similar to traditional apprenticeship training but more ‘open’ in the sense that the majority of apprentices comes from outside the family. Informal apprenticeship training is common in the more “modern” informal activities such as car repair, welding, hairdressing. Recently one can observe examples of master craftspeople that shifted their focus from productive activities to training as their main activity.

Third, modern apprenticeship is usually regulated by an ‘Apprenticeship Act’ which stipulates the length of the training period, the training format, the number of working/training hours, the payment of (part of) minimum wage, and so forth. In most developing countries there is only a small number of modern apprenticeships which are mainly concentrated in medium and large enterprises and state enterprises.

Strengths and weaknesses

Informal apprenticeship training has advantages and disadvantages: it allows for easy access to training, especially for the poor, and the skills taught by the master craftspeople are usually relevant to the real ‘world of work’. In addition, the training allows the apprentice to gradually build up a business network with suppliers and clients. Overall, the approach is seen as more effective than pre-employment training in classrooms. Its main limitations are the lack of a training plan, the passive nature of learning, the limited entry possibilities of new technologies, an incomplete training content and the difference in quality of skills acquired due to the absence of trade testing and certification. Also, the often long training periods and the risk of exploitation of apprentices as ‘cheap labour’ are criticized, as well as the lack of post-training follow-up and support for apprentices to start up their own business.

Good practice examples

There are some emerging good practices to improve apprenticeship training, such as the pre-employment training of apprentices (Informal Sector Training and Resources

Network Project (ISTARN) project in Zimbabwe, see presentation of Ms Grunwald in section 3.2) and the delivery of supplementary training for both master craftspersons and apprentices. Assisting in the preparation of a training plan and strengthening the teaching skills of master craftspeople constitute other possibilities for improving training quality. Less successful have been mere financial initiatives (Vocational Skills and Informal Sector Support Project (VSP) in Ghana, see presentation of Mr Palmer in section 3.2). Vocational training institutions (VTIs) promote higher levels of technology and play a limited role in informal apprenticeship training. Therefore, working with independent trainers or trainers from private training institutions proved more successful (Strengthening Informal Training and Enterprise (SITE) project in Kenya, see presentation of Mr Haan in section 3.2).

Involving informal trade associations into upgrading interventions is also good practice because it helps promote support actions among peers. Furthermore associations may assist in developing the training content, in recruiting master craftspersons and apprentices and encouraging standardization of training qualification, for example by organizing trade tests. Finally, they can assist in monitoring apprenticeship training in terms of quality, content and conditions of work.

Policy challenges in the area of apprenticeship policies

Major challenges remain:

- convince informal operators of the priority need for skills upgrading and product differentiation;
- enhance the quality of transferred skills;
- shorten the duration of training (to 2 to 3 years);
- accelerate technological development and diversification;
- scale up the coverage of upgrading efforts in informal apprenticeship training to reach large numbers of master craftspeople and male and female youth/ apprentices;
- source funding for interventions to upgrade informal apprenticeship.

Conclusion

Overall, skills development is of crucial and growing importance for the promotion of decent work and incomes in the informal economy. Apprenticeship training is by far the dominant source of technical and other skills for the informal economy and can be instrumental in upgrading micro and small enterprises. Skills development must be integrated with broader economic development support such as credit, marketing, institution building and enabling policies. There is substantial need for additional research and pilot initiatives.

2.2 Apprenticeship: A multidimensional approach

KEY QUESTIONS FOR THIS SESSION

What is the meaning of apprenticeship?

What are the dimensions defining apprenticeship?

How can we conceptualize apprenticeship and the institutions governing it?

Ms Irmgard Nübler, ILO

The presentation offered a conceptualization of apprenticeship as a basis for the analysis of policies and programmes to reform and upgrade apprenticeship.

Apprenticeship systems: An asset

First, apprenticeship represents a widely-used approach to develop productive skills and it has evolved in many different societies throughout history and in different regions of the world. Second, many studies confirm that apprenticeship is a cost-effective way of providing skills for the world of work. Third, history however shows that economic and political changes may jeopardize and destroy the system. Policy-makers should be concerned with strengthening and promoting existing apprenticeship systems and support them in adjusting to new economic and political environments.

The dimensions of apprenticeship

Apprenticeship is a system which combines enterprise-based training in productive skills with a financing scheme to meet the financial constraints of young people, their families, local businesses and their communities. Apprenticeship training can be characterized by various dimensions or sets of rules which relate to the learning environment, the learning method, skills content, target group and financing mechanism:

- At the core of apprenticeship systems is an agreement between a trainer or a master craftsman and an apprentice. This agreement which may be written or oral defines the rights, entitlements and obligations of both contractual partners.
- Training is integrated into the production and work process which enhances cost-effectiveness of apprenticeship. Skills development is demand driven, which contributes to productivity and employability of workers. Opportunity costs are low since trainers teach skills mainly during idle hours of the day or week and apprentices use the equipment and tools of the enterprise to practice.
- Apprentices acquire skills in a process of cognitive apprenticeship. This means the apprentice works side-by-side with the trainer to acquire tacit knowledge and vocational skills in a process of imitation and practice. Tacit knowledge is non-codifiable and cannot be taught, but needs to be acquired and “discovered” in a process of observation, practice and experience, working side-by-side with a skilled person.
- Apprentices are trained in the skills of a craft, trade or profession. Therefore they acquire occupational competence and a set of various vocational and core skills which can be transferred between jobs. This contributes to the employability of the worker and higher productivity.
- Recruitment is restricted to young people.
- Apprenticeship provides a financing mechanism where the training firm and apprentice share both the costs and benefits from training. This helps apprentices to overcome financial constraints and master craftsmen to collect returns to training investment.

- The length of the apprenticeship period is fixed in advance. This allows the firm to plan the cost-recovery period and to ensure full returns to its investment in training.

An institutional approach to apprenticeship

Institutions consist of formal and informal rules which guide human behaviour and they provide the mechanism to enforce these rules. The rules embedded in the institutions are reflected in the various dimensions of apprenticeship: training is provided at the workplace; skills are acquired through cognitive apprenticeship; norms and traditions determine recruitment practices – for example that only boys are hired as apprentices in car mechanics, and so forth. The institutional framework performs two distinct functions in apprenticeship systems. First, institutions provide incentives to master craftspersons to supply apprenticeship training in their enterprise and to apprentices to participate in the training. By following the rules provided by institutions, master craftsperson and apprentice develop regular behaviour and they therefore develop trust in the apprenticeship system to function as it is expected. This helps overcome market failure in training and as long as the rules of apprenticeship are respected, firms and workers are motivated to participate in apprenticeship. Second, institutions also determine the quality of training and they influence outcomes in terms of decent work and development objectives such as equitable access to apprenticeship.

The functional objective of institutions creating incentives to participate in training

In the apprenticeship agreement the master craftsperson commits to training the worker in transferable skills which contributes to the worker's employability, and also agrees to finance part of the training and to pay the apprentice some allowances. The apprentice in turn promises to provide labour service to the trainer to share the training costs. In addition, the worker may promise to pay a fee. Training increases the worker's productivity and the worker promises to share the returns with the trainer by accepting a wage below the productivity level. This allows the master craftsperson to recover the training costs.

However, the fulfilment of these various promises occurs at subsequent points in time and this non-simultaneous implementation creates risks and uncertainties. Both the trainer and apprentice may break the promises and they therefore risk losing the investment and benefits from training.

It is the role of the institutional framework to create the conditions under which trainer and apprentice have incentives to participate in apprenticeship: These are:

- expected benefits to training exceed the costs of training and
- trust in each other's cooperative behaviour.

These conditions are ensured by the rules which define apprenticeships. First, apprenticeship applies low-cost training and cost-effective training methods. Apprenticeship creates benefits as it increases productivity of enterprises and provides skills which promote employability of the apprentice. The sharing of costs and benefits allows firms to recover training costs. With regard to the second condition, institutions reduce uncertainty concerning the trainers and apprentice's behaviour. Both the master craftsperson and the apprentice develop trust that the other one will fulfil the promises made in the apprenticeship agreement.

There is evidence that apprenticeship systems deteriorate and break down if the critical institutions are weakened or destroyed and the rules are no longer enforced. Hence, policies and reforms to upgrade apprenticeship need to protect and strengthen these rules and institutions.

The development objectives: Decent work

Studies reveal important institutional gaps and deficits in African informal apprenticeships. Apprenticeship functions, but it often does not function well in the light of decent work outcomes. In particular, institutions are needed to:

- control the quality of skills and set standards in training;
- ensure a systematic diffusion of new skills and technologies into apprenticeship;
- link with the formal training system, for example by combining apprenticeship training with theoretical teaching in training centres;
- improve access for girls to apprenticeship training through a change in traditions and recruitment practice;
- give access to the very poor, for example through microfinance; and
- ensure the recognition of skills in formal labour markets by means of formal assessment and certification.

Policy challenges

Empirical evidence shows that many apprenticeship systems work, although they often do not work well. They work in the sense that trainers and apprentices have incentives to conclude apprenticeship contracts and to participate in apprenticeship. At the same time, apprenticeship does not work well in the sense that the outcome in terms of skills quality, decent work and development objectives is often undesirable. The quality of skills may be low, access may be unequal, productivity and employability may be low. Policies therefore face a dual challenge. They need to protect and strengthen the incentives of apprentices and master craftspersons to conclude apprenticeship contracts and they need to improve the performance of apprenticeship with regards to the development objectives. The challenge for policy-makers is to design policies, strategies and institutions that improve both outcomes. On the one hand, strengthen the incentives to participate in apprenticeship, that is, promote the functional objective, and on the other hand, improve the development outcome.

Design and redesign institutions for improved development outcomes

The design and redesign of formal and informal institutions for improved development outcomes have to take into account the interplay with existing institutions. It is this interplay which in the end determines the impact of institutional reforms on the achievement of development objectives. Policy interventions therefore have to understand the country-specific institutional setting governing apprenticeship in order to analyze the impact of institutional reforms on the functional outcome and on the incentives for master craftspeople and apprentices to participate in apprenticeship. These incentives need to be protected and strengthened when promoting the development outcomes. Only then may apprenticeship systems evolve which both work and work well.

3. Thematic presentations and discussion

3.1 Issues and challenges: An ILO perspective

KEY QUESTIONS FOR THIS SESSION

What are the major Decent Work deficits related to apprenticeship in the informal economy?

What are the skills deficits in the area of apprenticeship training?

What approaches and policies does ILO promote to address these challenges?

What are relevant questions for further research?

PANEL PRESENTATIONS

Social protection in apprenticeship

Mr Emmanuel Reynaud, ILO

The presentation was introduced by a statement on behalf of the Executive Director of the Social Protection Sector, Mr Diop. Informal apprenticeship is the main vehicle for skills provision in West Africa; and the informal economy is the main vehicle for economic growth and development in the region. The bulk of the labour force in rural and urban sub-Saharan Africa works in the informal economy and most of the jobs are of low quality. The lack of social protection is a defining characteristic of informal jobs - it is either totally or at least substantially missing. The ILO's objective is to extend social protection and to facilitate the transition to formality of jobs in the informal economy. This highlights the relevance of social protection in the context of apprenticeship.

Social protection and the informal economy

In the area of social protection, the ILO concentrates on two main dimensions: (i) extending social security; and (ii) promoting decent working and employment conditions, which includes occupational safety and health, wages and incomes, working time and reconciling family and work responsibilities. A cross-cutting issue is the protection of the most vulnerable groups, especially migrant workers, people living with HIV/AIDS and people in the informal economy.

In general, in the area of social security, specific policies, programmes and tools are developed to:

- improve the access to health care through community-based organizations, activities carried out mainly by the ILO's STEP programme (Strategies and Tools against social Exclusion and Poverty);
- extend existing social insurance schemes;
- develop a basic social security package including basic pensions, child benefits and targeted cash transfers.

In the area of decent work and employment conditions, the issue is to improve conditions of work in the informal economy. Ways to do so include:

- promoting preventive measures for health and safety in the informal economy. The ILO uses two main tools to promote this: “Work improvement in small enterprises” (WISE) and “Work improvement in neighbourhood development” (WIND).
- implementing wage regulations and other regulations in the informal economy, such as childcare services, provisions for maternity protection or awareness on working time can help to improve working conditions.

Social protection and apprenticeship in the informal economy

Two major issues have to be considered with regard to apprenticeship. Firstly, social protection of the apprentices, which can be improved through the promotion of occupational safety and health, negotiating decent wages, income and working time or through better access of apprentices to social security benefits. This last point is hard to implement but should not be neglected. Secondly, introducing a social protection dimension into the training itself, especially teaching knowledge on occupational safety and health can lead to improving the well-being of the workers and of enterprises’ productivity.

The ILO is promoting integrated policies for the informal economy through the InFocus Initiative on the informal economy which is co-managed by the Employment Sector and the Social Protection Sector combining employment promotion, social protection, representation and rights at work. Apprenticeship can be seen as an entry point for using different ILO tools. For instance, an occupation-based approach that is currently being developed by the ILO InFocus Initiative can serve as a means to integrate different policy approaches and be especially relevant in the context of apprenticeship.

Issues and challenges: A skills perspective

Ms Christine Hofmann, ILO

Introduction

The Skills and Employability Department has identified the following main issues and challenges regarding apprenticeship in the informal economy: equity of access, training quality and recognition of skills. According to what Ms Nübler presented in the morning session, apprenticeship functions well if on the one hand the system itself is stable and if on the other hand development goals are achieved. The system is stable, as long as apprentice and master craftsperson have the right incentives to participate in apprenticeship. The three issues discussed in this presentation only refer to the second perspective: the development outcome.

Equity of access

The right to equitable access to training is stipulated in ILO instruments such as Recommendation No. 195. It calls on ILO members to “recognize that education and training are a right for all and, in cooperation with the social partners, work towards ensuring access for all to lifelong learning”. Moreover, improving skills among disadvantaged groups enhances overall productivity and thus has positive socioeconomic effects. Apprenticeship is still predominantly male, and female-dominated apprenticeship is concentrated in lower paid trades. The very poor and other vulnerable groups are usually excluded from participating in apprenticeship because they lack the financial resources to pay fees or because they are not part of the social network that enables access. This is especially the case for migrant workers.

Upgrading needs are threefold:

- strengthen social networks, for example by empowering women's groups;
- encourage master craftspeople to take on more female apprentices, in particular in male-dominated occupations or to accept more apprentices from vulnerable groups;
- create new apprenticeships in occupations such as services that are traditionally female-dominated.

Training quality

Addressing training quality involves upgrading of technological competence within the trade. Scope for improvement also lies in the type of learning, which is often reproductive and lacks theory and thus impedes adaptation to changing environments.

Policies to improve the training quality could focus on the technical, vocational and core skills of apprentices and master craftspeople; or could broaden skills by introducing rotation systems between apprentices at several different workshops to provide diverse learning contexts and experiences. Other approaches are to set standards for training or assessment or to improve the technology base through cluster approaches or microfinance.

Recognition of skills

The ILO defines portable skills as skills that can be used productively in different workplaces and that can easily be recognized by employers (ILO, 2007b). In apprenticeship, recognition is usually limited to local or regional networks of employers; and informal apprenticeship certificates are not recognized by the formal technical and vocational education and training (TVET) system or the formal labour market.

There are two possible approaches to achieve recognition of apprentice's skills:

- the bottom up approach to strengthen organization of employers by establishing joint assessment, certification and validation that should then be recognized at national level;
- the top down approach to gradually formalize apprenticeship by establishing links with the formal training system and the formal labour market.

Both approaches intend to make the sources of information more reliable; that means that the reputation of certifying bodies would need to increase.

Apart from the two processes described above, there are two instruments to achieve recognition at national level: certifying skills according to standards provided by formal apprenticeship systems or vocational training institutions, or certifying skills by National Qualification Frameworks which provide nationally-agreed standards.

The SKILLS approach

Training for Economic Empowerment (TREE) is an integrated methodology to cater for disadvantaged groups in rural areas. It is based on the principles of local economic development and community-based training and identifies potential income-generating activities before determining training and post-training needs. The Skills and Employability Department is currently reviewing the synergies between apprenticeship and TREE. Another ongoing project in Cambodia (Alleviating Poverty through Peer Training) applies the Success Case Replication method (SCR), through which disabled people receive informal apprenticeship training from local successful entrepreneurs.

Areas for further research

- the potential of clusters for upgrading of technology and technical skills;
- how to use apprenticeship to change traditional patterns of gender inequality;
- how to enhance recognition of apprentice's skills in the informal economy to build bridges to the formal economy;
- how to strengthen small business associations in order to upgrade apprenticeship, enhance employability and achieve decent work.

Child labour: The perspective of the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)

Mr Patrick Quinn, ILO

Introduction

Mr Quinn welcomed the opportunity to extend the cooperation between ILO initiatives to combat child labour with those to promote skills development. The ILO Decent Work concept consists of four pillars, with IPEC being part of the first (Labour Standards). IPEC's substantial portfolio of technical cooperation programmes includes a significant component on education and training.

The context for IPEC's work

IPEC promotes apprenticeships in the informal economy for two purposes:

- to prevent child labour in apprenticeship, which means employment of children below the minimum age of employment. Cases exist where very young children enter apprenticeship and become subject to abuse and exploitation;
- to promote good quality apprenticeships as part of a strategy to withdraw children at or above the minimum age of employment from hazardous work. Fifty-two million children aged between 15 and 17 are involved in hazardous work. Decent apprenticeships in the informal economy can provide a pathway to decent work and a means to withdraw youth from working in exploitive situations.

ILO Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138), sets the minimum age for employment at 15. A member country whose economy and educational facilities are insufficiently developed may initially specify a minimum age of 14. The Convention does not prohibit all forms of work by children. "Light work", which does not hamper attendance at school, health or development, is allowed from 13 years (12 if minimum age of employment is 14).

ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182), specifies the worst forms of child labour. Certain forms are unconditional worst forms, for example, slavery or practices similar to slavery, such as debt bondage, trafficking of children, and forced recruitment of children for use in armed conflict. The Convention also covers work which by its nature or by the way it is carried out is likely to harm the health, safety or morals of children. Mr Quinn underlined that it is up to the countries to determine what hazardous work is, so the definition can vary from country to country.

Elimination of child labour is closely linked with the Millennium Development Goal (MDG) 2, which sets out that universal primary education should be reached by 2015. A recent report on MDG progress clearly states that child labour is a barrier in reaching this goal. This view is shared by other UN organizations working within the "Education for All" framework. A recently developed global Task Force on Child Labour and Education

for All, set up by ILO, UNESCO, UNICEF, World Bank and United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) is currently intensifying the fight against child labour.

Findings of an apprenticeship evaluation

When IPEC withdraws youth from hazardous work, placing them in decent apprenticeships is one possible solution to assist them. In 2003 IPEC evaluated apprenticeships in seven countries. It was found that these apprenticeships are typically in the informal economy and training is carried out on a highly informal basis. The trainees learn through periods of observation that are followed by periods of direct hands-on experience in the artisan's workshop or shop. Generally this kind of training does not follow any established curriculum or set of objectives. In the case of Turkey, apprentices in informal apprenticeship arrangements had access to a formal training centre for one day a week. However, certification was usually not provided. It was also found that the business usually did not pay any apprenticeship remuneration; in most cases they only provided meals and sometimes modest on-site accommodation.

Strengths of apprenticeship

- **Relevant skills:** The learning process takes place in a business setting, which means that the apprentices acquire complex skills that are relevant to the market needs. In addition to the vocational skills, the trainees observe and learn other entrepreneurial skills, for example negotiating the prices and selling to prospective clients.
- **Building up of own network:** Trainees learn about operating in a business-environment and begin to establish their own business networks, including suppliers and clients which they might take with them once they set up their own enterprise.
- **Vicinity:** Most businesses are located near the community, so the children do not need to travel to town for the training.

Concerns

- **Exploitation as cheap labour:** youth might be treated as cheap labour without really learning any new skills or might be poorly treated by their masters.
- **Low learning effect:** in order to have an adequate learning effect, the number of children to be trained per enterprise or craftsperson should not be too large.
- **Hazardous working environment:** children might be put to work in a hazardous environment.
- **Lack of vocational guidance:** some basic career guidance is required for orienting apprentices and master craftspersons.

Conclusion

Generally, IPEC considers informal apprenticeship schemes to be a good means of skills acquisition if certain standards and quality requirements are followed. First of all, the employment of children below the minimum age should by all means be avoided. In order to extend the access to apprenticeships, local discussions with the government and the social partners on extending and improving informal apprenticeships have to be undertaken.

Furthermore, the following issues need to be taken into account: It is important to carefully select the master craftspeople of skills providers. A written contract which indicates the obligations of the business owners helps improve the apprentices' working conditions and rights. Regular visits by project staff and meetings with the craftspeople and the youth are necessary to ensure good monitoring of the process. Placing only a small number of children in each workshop has also proven to be beneficial. Another aspect to guarantee success is to explore links with formal training or support services, for example

for training in literacy and numeracy. Some kind of validation and certification of achievement is equally important.

Apprenticeships in the informal economy: Potential role of microfinance

Ms Julika Breyer, ILO

Introduction

Social Finance Programme's (SFP) engagement in apprenticeships in the informal economy is part of the programme's work on microfinance for youth employment.

Research

In 2006, SFP conducted a study on the financial arrangements in apprenticeships in Accra, Ghana. It posed the question of whether the mechanisms to finance apprenticeship training are efficient, exploitative or inclusive, and explored to what extent enterprises used apprenticeship fees for the financing of the enterprise. The outcomes will guide subsequent engagement of SFP in the area of apprenticeships.

The main findings suggest that the payment of fees for apprenticeship training is common practice: 97.5 per cent of master craftspeople charge fees that range between US\$22 and 600 (average: US\$153). The study did not confirm any obvious relation between financing of enterprise and apprenticeship. Micro enterprises predominantly use internal sources to finance enterprise activities (3.5 per cent had taken a bank loan). Approximately 83 per cent of apprentices receive financial and in kind support from masters and the allowance received was higher than the fees paid in 66.5 per cent of the cases.

With regard to the accessibility of apprenticeship for disadvantaged youth, the research found that apprentices largely rely on parents or guardians to pay fees and living expenses (in more than 70 per cent of cases). The educational level of apprentices proved to be above average.

Another finding suggests that the main impediment for a smooth transition from apprenticeship to (self-) employment is lack of access to start-up funds.

Areas for potential interventions of microfinance

The research identified three main areas for potential interventions of microfinance:

- Microfinance to support the entry into apprenticeships (via educational loans, saving products, grants).
- Microfinance to support the transition from apprenticeship training to self-employment (via start-up loans to graduated apprentices).
- Microfinance to enhance the quality and quantity of apprenticeship training: interventions on the supply side (via borrowing by the enterprise).

Questions for discussion and further research:

- Positive vs. negative influences of microfinance. Danger of distorting a self-regulating system.
- Feasibility of conditional loans. Under which conditions?
- Design of educational loans for apprentices.

The perspective of the entrepreneur

Mr Klaus Haftendorn, ILO

Entrepreneurship training in apprenticeship has been discussed since the 1970s. Enterprise-based apprenticeship should be used as a tool to alleviate the employment situation in Africa.

Entrepreneurs and apprentices in the informal economy

Informal economy enterprises typically exhibit a set of specific characteristics. Usually these enterprises are small and operate with relatively small capital, using low levels of technology. Their production conditions are often precarious and occupational safety and health standards are not consistently respected. They have a simple product range, limited market access and low-qualified workers. Children are often found as helpers or apprentices in these businesses.

Craftspeople often acquire their technical qualifications as traditional apprentices, or in a TVET centre. In the 1980s, a new type of entrepreneur emerged, having achieved higher educational levels, sometimes university degrees. In Dakar, government attempts to promote formalization of these businesses proved successful, as business performance improved in a formal environment.

Many entrepreneurs in the informal economy start their business out of necessity and they manage their enterprise by themselves. Some master craftspeople train up to seven apprentices, often living off the apprentices' fees, providing training and pocket money in return. Their knowledge is often limited which leads to passing limited knowledge on to the apprentice. Most craftspeople lack the time to update their own knowledge and there is a need for innovative approaches to give incentives and opportunities to master craftspersons for upgrading their knowledge.

The entrepreneur plays a key role as provider of knowledge and skills

The entrepreneur is the key for improving skills training in the informal economy. Some of the major questions to address are:

- How to involve more entrepreneurs actively in apprenticeship training? Experience shows that they will not join unless they have a clear incentive.
- How to increase the skills and technical knowledge of entrepreneurs?
- How to make entrepreneurs accept a standardized curriculum and quality standards?
- What incentives are needed for more investment in apprenticeship training?

Conclusions

The social partners play an important role in creating a platform for the exchange of ideas to discuss the issue. This implies the strengthening of business and crafts associations and involving them in TVET.

As far as skills upgrading is concerned, practical and theoretical training for entrepreneurs, craftspeople and master craftspeople should be provided. Entrepreneurship training could be included in the programme of training centres. In particular, because apprentices are trained in an enterprise, they are more inclined to start up their own business, therefore entrepreneurship training should be included in apprenticeship.

Moreover, a comprehensive legal framework on apprenticeship training should be developed entailing a certification system for traditional apprenticeship equivalent to TVET school certificates in order to improve the recognition of skills.

DISCUSSION: ILO PERSPECTIVES

Mr Walther highlighted that the informal economy had increased from the 1970s until today. He questioned the **concept of informality**. In many African economies, the informal economy is predominant, comprising the vast majority of economic activities. Today there is more awareness in African countries that between 50 and 60 per cent of their GDP is being produced by the informal economy. If there is no skills improvement for this part of the economy, all development efforts will fail. According to Mr Haan, since the 1980s, the conceptualization of the informal economy has gained clarity. Nevertheless, the term “artisan sector” does not equal “informal economy enterprises”, as there are many non-artisan enterprises operating in the informal economy and the self-perception, and thus definition, of artisans varies remarkably among countries.

Globalization is a reality for African societies. The two major challenges are adaptation to change and access to markets. Entrepreneurs are very well aware of market opportunities, but lack the financial means to improve their knowledge base and update their equipment in the workshop. What is needed is a partnership between the state, private firms from the formal economy and enterprises in the informal economy to bridge this gap.

Several participants addressed the **difference between East and West African apprenticeship**. In Kenya, modern skills, for example the repair of mobile phones, can be acquired through apprenticeship. It is widely known that East African apprenticeship is less structured, so does this imply that it is more adjustable to changes than West African apprenticeship?

Mr Carton added two new aspects that are vital for understanding the **changes that have occurred** in African societies in the past 30 years. First, while collective values were still very strong in the 1980s, nowadays, youth has a more individualistic approach to their career path. How does this fit in the context of an intended strengthening of informal associations? The second change refers to instability. Well known patterns have become less reliable than they used to be, be it formal rules imposed by the state or contractual arrangements. If framework conditions change, what implications does this have for apprenticeship?

In terms of **access to apprenticeship** it was pointed out that seemingly small practical problems can pose large constraints in some countries. For example, apprentices are required to bring their own toolbox, which is an expense that youth from very poor families are not able to afford. In response to that, Ms Grunwald reported that the Informal Sector Training and Resources Network (ISTARN) project in Zimbabwe made tools available through a hire-to-buy scheme. At the end of the apprenticeship period, apprentices would own their own tools. This enhanced their attractiveness to potential employers, their employability, or they became self-employed.

Microfinance was discussed as a possible means to upgrade apprenticeship at various levels. While experience seems to be scarce, some experts highlighted the potential of mobile banking to improve the transition from apprenticeship to (self-) employment. Mobile banking in Ghana, based on door-to-door collectors, was supposed to help young people in starting up businesses and thus facilitate the transition into the labour market. World Bank evaluations have shown positive results. Instead of the client going to the bank, the “bank goes to the client”. Banks give out and collect only small amounts of money and have a chance to get to know the apprentices personally. Training loans were also considered as an important means to improve access. However, loans can cause

indebtedness and can constitute an additional poverty trap. This risk needs to be assessed. Saving groups were also discussed as another possible way of improving access for disadvantaged groups. Ms Breyer underlined that microfinance mechanisms had to be adapted to the respective local context. Youth in general are seen as a very risky target group by microfinance institutions, because they usually cannot give good guarantees, do not have a track record or credit history and have limited life and business experience. It was crucial to study microfinance initiatives for youth of different institutions and banks in order to identify what worked and what did not work for this specific target group. One option to reduce the perceived lending risk to youth could be guarantee funds established by the government or other actors or, for example, loan guarantees issued by trade associations or master craftspersons. These theoretical considerations still need to be explored and tested in practice. Other discussants suggested that there should be closer links between business development services and microfinance institutions in order to facilitate start-ups and that more research was needed to close the knowledge gaps. The crucial question is whether the state should invest more in strengthening microfinance for apprenticeship.

The issue of **recognition of skills** was addressed by several discussants. NQFs were put forward as an ambiguous solution. African countries usually have weak institutional capacities so that establishing a comprehensive framework for the recognition of skills could exceed their capacities. The case of South Africa, where an NQF has been implemented, deserves close examination in this regard. Ghana provides two types of assessments for the recognition of apprentices' skills: one organized by informal associations and one offered by the state within an NQF. While the first is reported to attract many graduated apprentices, there are no numbers concerning the latter scheme.

The **economic opportunities of the enterprise** influence the amount and scope of training the enterprise provides. Formalized complementary training, in other words additional training in training institutions that complement practical training at the craftspersons' workshop, could help to close gaps, for example, in technical skills. For vulnerable groups special pre-training could be offered. Klaus Haftendorn referred to the ILO's "Know About Business" (KAB) and "Start Your Business" (SYB) tools that could be used to train apprentices in business awareness (KAB) and entrepreneurship (SYB).

Mr Joussein argued that youth often face **difficulties in applying the skills they acquired during apprenticeship**. In African informal economies, the incidence of wage employment is usually low in crafts trades, formal employment is out of reach for most youth, and self-employment in the apprentice's occupation is constrained due to financial limitations. This is why a majority of youth becomes self-employed in low-skilled jobs not applying the skills acquired during apprenticeship.

By contrast, some discussants were very positive about the **structured apprenticeships** in Mali and Benin (see presentations by Mr Walther in section 3.4, and Ms Haidara in sections 3.2 and 3.4). These programmes have established links with the formal economy which can be further strengthened. The certificates are recognized by the formal labour market and therefore allow apprentices to increasingly access formal resources. The apprenticeship programme undoubtedly adds value to the labour market. Therefore, the overall perception of the future of structured apprenticeship programmes is optimistic. In contrast to interventions focusing on restructuring apprenticeship, the Government in Ghana now wants to take over responsibilities for financing the first year of the apprenticeship training, but the question is: what is happening in the second year? (Mr Palmer)

In Senegal, for example, donors have only supported formal training systems. The established **training funds** mainly cater for the modern sector and therefore neglect large parts of society. The formal training system was originally funded by the ILO and World Bank, nowadays the Senegalese state assumes responsibilities and provides funding.

Associations in the informal economy are weak, while modern sector associations tend to have stronger voices. Youth outside the formal system have no possibilities of benefiting from training funds or any formal resources. This exclusion of the informal economy from formal funds and financing of training results in an inefficient allocation of scarce resources. This is mainly a political issue. (Mr Diouf)

3.2 Upgrading apprenticeship systems in Africa: Experience and lessons from technical cooperation projects

KEY QUESTIONS FOR THIS SESSION

What are the objectives of projects and programmes targeting apprenticeship in the informal economy?

What approaches have been developed to reach these objectives?

What have been the main challenges during implementation?

What lessons can be drawn from these interventions?

What worked well, and why? What did not work so well, and why not?

What knowledge gaps have been identified?

PANEL PRESENTATIONS (I)

Apprenticeship training: Model and stakes

Ms Tania Haidara, Swisscontact

Introduction

Swisscontact is a Swiss development agency experienced in artisan training and in the provision of microcredits. In West Africa, Swisscontact works in Mali (since 1989), Burkina Faso (since 1997), Benin (since 2000), and in Niger.

In Mali, Swisscontact launched activities in 1989 with a first mandate covering the period between 1989 and 1998, and a second phase since 1998, which is ongoing. Since the beginning, Swisscontact has been supporting the members of associations of artisans which are recognized and affiliated to the National Federation of Malian Artisans (Fédération nationale des artisans Maliens, F NAM). The first phase focused on vocational training in general; since 1998, activities shifted towards apprenticeship. Swisscontact assists associations in organizing supplementary courses for master craftspersons and apprentices and involves local communities who take an active role in apprenticeship.

In Burkina Faso, Swisscontact upgraded vocational training through strengthening the Vocational Training Support Unit. Swisscontact supports the development and establishment of a vocational training model through apprenticeship and sustains a training programme at the Assessment and Vocational Training Centre in Bobo-Dioulasso.

In Benin, a national policy promoting apprenticeship in the artisan sector is in place. Swisscontact promotes the development and establishment of a vocational training model through apprenticeship.

Characteristics of apprenticeship in the informal economy

In the traditional setting in Mali, written apprenticeship contracts do not exist. Young people access apprenticeship through family relations and friendship where an artisan often takes on his nephew or niece or the son or brother of a friend as apprentice. This form of recruiting does not require apprenticeship fees. Only at the end of apprenticeship, large sums of money are spent on a celebration to mark the end of the training period. The apprentice's family usually covers this cost. However, apprentices are not awarded a certificate.

By contrast, in Benin apprentices pay for the traditional apprenticeship. The end of apprenticeship is marked by a ceremony called "liberation" in which the apprentices receive a certificate confirming the acquisition of occupational skills and competences.

The case of Burkina Faso is similar to the Malian case. In all countries, apprenticeship can have a very long duration and therefore can have exploitative elements.

Swisscontact's approach

Swisscontact follows a dual approach: based on the existing traditional training model in all four countries it intends to improve the access to and content of training and apprenticeship. Through Swisscontact's action, bilateral training agreements between apprentice and master craftsperson have evolved into trilateral ones between apprentice, master craftsperson and the public sector. Consequently, an apprenticeship contract was introduced, written or oral, that the state, the apprentice and the master craftsperson recognizes. The apprenticeship takes place on at least two sites, the enterprise and one or more training centres.

Furthermore, Swisscontact promotes empowerment of youth groups in order to increase the demand for apprenticeship. It takes into account the level of technology and provision of tools, training quality, the training of trainers, analysis of occupations and the institutional dynamics.

Vocational Training Support Programme (PAFP)

In 1998, the Mali State established a programme to consolidate vocational training, including a component on apprenticeship financing. Funding is provided by the national training fund financed through payroll taxes from mostly large enterprises. The training programme is coordinated by a tripartite commission composed of representatives of the public sector, apprentices and trade associations. The latter have proved to have a large capacity to lobby and advocate for sustainable funding mechanisms. Apprenticeship training through PAFP includes practical training in the workshop, technical and entrepreneurial training, and literacy courses that take place during or prior to the training.

Initially, 90 per cent of the programme was financed by Swisscontact; today the total project cost is fully covered by the local actors. Since trade associations have gained strength, the FNAM constitutes an important network allowing fruitful exchanges and promoting vocational training. This federation manages the process while Swisscontact no longer influences the project design. In sum, technical and vocational training has undergone important developments at national level and apprenticeship is successively being integrated into the national training system.

Results and success factors

Through Swisscontact's intervention, Mali has trained 25 apprentices in 1989; 1,000 apprentices in 1995; and it decided to train, according to its institutional capacity, 2,500 apprentices per year from 2007 onwards. Apprenticeship today forms part of the national training policy. The numbers are similar in Benin, however, in Burkina Faso, the programme faces problems due to a lack of agreement between the trade associations.

The most important success factors are:

- start with what is feasible;
- cooperation is crucial, actors need time to develop their potential;
- professional associations promote the training concept and are strongly involved in elaborating the training contents and in the operational and financial planning of training programmes;
- master craftspersons (employers) are also beneficiaries of training actions;
- sectoral and geographical development potentials are vital;
- funds for co-financing are available;
- training system is self-regulating at the financial level (without necessarily being self-financing);
- contributions by different actors need to be balanced.

Challenges

A major challenge is that the programme is perceived as elitist. As the training only takes place in urban and semi-urban areas, rural areas are excluded. Moreover, master craftspeople do not receive fees, and they tend to be reluctant to participate in apprenticeship.

Therefore the current challenges for improving the programme include

- extending and adapting the programme to rural areas;
- decentralizing training and achieving the participation of local municipalities;
- introducing certificates for apprenticeship – while in Mali and Benin their reputation is increasing, in Burkina Faso, certification is just starting;
- improving co-financing while avoiding subsidies in order to allow communities to develop ownership.

Questions

What role should training providers play in the development of the training model and the follow up of the implementation of apprenticeship?

In order to upscale and mainstream the programme, how many apprentices can be catered for at most?

Apprenticeship systems in Africa: Reference systems, project experiences and lessons learned

Ms Edda Grunwald, GTZ

Determining factors for project experiences and lessons learned

All development agencies have their own “reference systems” which determine the shape a project takes – for example, Germany’s vocational training system is strongly influenced by the concept of a dual system. Therefore, elements of the dual system serve as a prominent reference system for the German Technical Cooperation (GTZ). The developmental conceptual framework for project design and management for the GTZ – as an implementing agency – is defined by the respective ministry, the Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ).

In 1986, BMZ/GTZ emphasized the promotion of the modern, industrial sector. The Ministry’s development idea at that time was that industrialization leads to technological innovation and standardization of mechanical skills – from crafts to industrial production. BMZ/GTZ propagated the “dual system” in partner countries to set up a model TVET-system substituting the existing one and following a trickle-down approach, which means that once the system was in place, it was expected to expand automatically. However, this approach neglected poverty reduction and the promotion of disadvantaged groups.

In 1992, BMZ/GTZ’s emphasis changed towards industrialization and discovery of ‘services’ and modernization of the informal sector. Trickle-down was supplemented by a push-up approach. BMZ/GTZ development ideas focused on how TVET contributes to enhanced access for income and work. It propagated taking into account existing structures of the TVET system (modernization) as well as non-formal training offers; and a preference for the “dual system”. It focused on human capital for the economy/society and an empowerment of individuals. A “consulting approach” for TVET was introduced with vertical links (intervention at micro, meso and macro level) as well as horizontal links with other projects.

BMZ/GTZ’s emphasis in 2005 turned towards human development and poverty alleviation as a multi-dimensional concept. So the economic dimension was complemented by the social dimension of social inclusion and integration. TVET and the labour market were viewed as a joint approach and addressed formal as well as informal employment. The ruling principles are pro-poor growth (considering not only the quantity but also the quality of growth) and impact orientation. In the light of integrated approaches, the number of pure TVET projects is reduced: TVET usually constitutes a component in a broader programme. Approaches address not only lifelong learning, but school-to-work issues and labour market information systems, too. However, quite often little attention is paid to the interface between TVET and basic education.

Country-specific economic development strategy

The following table summarizes different development approaches that countries in West Africa are pursuing. They differ according to their defined basis for development, be it natural resources, population or regional protection. All approaches lead to a different focus on economic and human resource development. However, apprenticeship in the informal economy is not in focus. If considered at all, apprenticeship is seen as a tool or mechanism for development.

| Basis for development | Focus | Countries |
|--|--|--|
| Natural resources as a backbone | Enhancement of local value added in transforming natural resources: - enterprise development - technology transfer => need for adequately trained human resources | - Ghana - Guinea |
| Population (scarcity of natural resources) | Generation / accumulation of human capital – for regional / global labour market (reference: Mauritius, Tunisia) | - Benin - Sahel region - Senegal |
| Regional protection of West African Union | Extended enterprise development combined with vocational training to prepare for global competition | |

TVET projects and programmes and traditional apprenticeship

BMZ/GTZ's TVET projects took place in diverse contexts with different development orientations.

In Swaziland, the project intended to develop a modern apprenticeship system in a country where apprenticeship in the informal economy did not exist. The project's success was limited – due to its design, the available resources and duration.

In Egypt, in the light of an existing traditional apprenticeship system (in the informal economy), a BMZ/GTZ programme established an education scheme including a modern apprenticeship aiming to strengthen the formal economy. The project outcome has to be assessed against the required time and inputs (financial and personnel resources).

In Benin, Guinea, Senegal and Togo, the projects' intention was to modernize the existing informal apprenticeship by strengthening the interfaces between the informal and the formal economy (in Senegal the project is still ongoing).

All these projects share the perception of informal apprenticeship as a system of deficiencies.

Only in Zimbabwe was informal apprenticeship not perceived as a system with deficits, but as a potential. The dichotomy of informal versus formal proved irrelevant, as the project aimed to unlock economic and social potentials. Therefore, the project no longer used the term "upgrading" but the concept and wording of "value adding" to apprenticeship in the informal economy.

Overall lessons learned about traditional apprenticeships systems

- Apprenticeships in the informal economy are social constructs and are subject to social changes. These changes can be observed in time; in different localities; in different trade sectors; within a specific trade sector and in the type of skills acquired through apprenticeship.
- There are also apprenticeships in the modern informal economy.
- Apprenticeships are as good as the master craftspeople – although apprentices are sometimes better educated. However, master craftspeople are the cornerstone of apprenticeship to encourage excellence, and enhance productivity and quality of products or services. Improving skills of master craftspeople is more likely to yield good results

than only addressing apprentices. To improve performance of master craftspeople, a successful approach is to promote networks and exchange of experience. Informal associations therefore are key to success. What to do if informal associations do not exist?

- Apprenticeships are not always demand-oriented; sometimes they are poor in identifying market needs. Due to the apprenticeship's reproductive character, master craftspeople have difficulties in identifying market niches and saturation trends. As only few master craftspeople received training in a formal setting, there is little ground for modelling the apprenticeship on the basis of what happens in the formal economy.
- Apprenticeships only function if the workplace meets minimum standards such as sufficient work for the apprentices, appropriate level of skills of master craftspeople including their readiness to teach and share know-how; and tools for the apprentices to use.

Overall issues to be considered by development agencies

Pursuing impact orientation means determining training success according to the number of graduates who become (self-) employed, and not the mere number of people receiving training, regardless of training quality.

Apprenticeships in the informal economy are constructed around social relationships and traditional practices of knowledge transmission. This means it is crucial to understand the 'traditional knowledge' as well as the traditional knowledge systems.

Hence, 'new' methodologies, for example, the 'appreciative inquiry' method, need to be applied. Research should be action-oriented, that is, interventions and research should go hand in hand.

These interventions need to be integrated into broader policy frameworks and take into account the impact of enabling environments, access to microfinancing, and linkages between the formal and the informal economy. They should be based on principles of flexibility in terms of training content and delivery, demand-orientation of training and sustainability. The latter means to avoid subsidies, to favour low cost and focused, but not poor quality, and to avoid dependencies by abiding by the 10:90 principle (input of 90 per cent from the community, in addition to 10 per cent of external contributions).

Apprenticeship systems in East and West Africa in the ILO Child Labour Project

Ms Leoncia Salakana, ILO

Introduction

ILO IPEC conducts a project on the elimination of child labour in four African countries, namely Ghana, Kenya, Tanzania and Uganda. Four country studies at the beginning of the project indicated that the exclusion from basic education and TVET ranks high amongst the factors for children to be subject to child labour. Therefore, tackling problems of access to basic education and TVET would facilitate the elimination of child labour.

Project description

Following the country study findings, a three-year (2004-07) sub-regional skills training project was designed and is being implemented in Ghana, Kenya and Tanzania. The project, funded by the Canadian Government, aims to combat the worst forms of child labour in the urban informal economy of the participating countries through providing

informal, cost-effective methods of skills training, with special emphasis on traditional apprenticeship training. The project develops comprehensive, integrated skills training strategies for youth between 14 to 17 years and builds capacity of informal economy associations of employers, craftspeople and artisans. Each country has a project management committee chaired by the Ministry of Labour, with ILO-IPEC as the secretariat and organizations of workers, employers and relevant civil society organizations as members of the committee.

Education, TVET and child labour

In sub-Saharan Africa, many children cannot access secondary education. In Tanzania, for example, the transition rate from primary to secondary school is between 12 and 18 per cent. Most of the children that drop out of primary school and those who cannot access secondary education rely on TVET to acquire skills that lead to employment. Formal systems of TVET in sub-Saharan Africa cater only for 10 per cent of youth, so that the majority of youth acquire their skills in informal training arrangements. While an ILO/UNIDO/UNDP report (2002) confirms that the informal economy creates 58 per cent of the Gross National Income and employs 70 per cent of the workforce, government development programmes usually exclude the informal economy.

Apprenticeship training: Experience in Tanzania

Through the support of the IPEC project in Tanzania, the Tanzanian Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) (MKUKUTA) incorporated a strong skills element. The IPEC Skills Training Pilot Project in Tanzania targets 150 children. A local non-governmental organization (NGO), KIWOHEDE (Kiota Women's Health and Development Organization), participates in the project through identifying and rescuing children from different environments like mines or domestic sex work. Thereafter the Tanzanian Small Industries Development Organisation (SIDO) provides vocational skills through coordinating and supervising apprenticeship schemes of selected craftspeople and artisans.

At present, trainees are engaged in six types of vocational trades, namely: bamboo handicraft (35); auto mechanics (39); batik printing and tie and dye (25); food processing (16); hair dressing (12); and decoration (18). All skills training aims to prepare youth for (self)-employment. The project also trains TVET providers and apprentices in labour rights, contracts writing, occupational safety and health, entrepreneurship, gender and life skills and HIV/AIDS awareness training. Other assistance provided includes startup capital and opportunities to access national and international markets through exhibitions. Special attention is given to girls who are willing to enter male-dominated trades.

Apprenticeship training: Experience in Kenya

The Kenyan PRSP recognizes the informal economy (usually referred to as Jua Kali, literally meaning "hot sun") as crucial; however, this is not necessarily translated into financial commitments to improve opportunities for training and employment.

Two vocational skills training programmes were designed and implemented by the Kisumu Centre Jua Kali Artisans Association (KCJCAA), an association of producers of goods in the urban informal economy in Kisumu. Twenty girls rescued from, or at risk of, exploitative child labour were attached to Jua Kali crafts-women from the association. The Undugu Society of Kenya, an NGO collaborating with the project, identified a hundred mainly female children who were engaged in commercial sexual exploitation. Accordingly, they were attached to Jua Kali artisans on apprenticeship schemes in trades such as mobile phone repair, dress making, driving and computer repair.

Apprenticeship training: Experience in Ghana

The Ghanaian project builds on the existing national strategy against the worst forms of child labour embedded in the Children's Act of Ghana, the Social Protection Strategy as well as the Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy (GPRS). The Ministry of Manpower, Youth and Employment assumes national responsibility for apprenticeship reforms and identifies key legislations on informal apprenticeship. The National Board of Small Scale Industries (NBSSI) is responsible for devising the Training Manual; and the Council of Indigenous Business Association (CIBA), trains trainers on gender mainstreaming among local artisans.

In Ghana, four apprenticeship training programmes were designed. The implementing agencies, the Centre for Communities, Action and Development (CENCOSAD), FITNET, Mission of Hope for Society Foundation (MIHOSO) and Partners in Development, each trained 25 youth.

Additionally, an assessment on gender issues was conducted to determine the attitudes of consumers, employers, their families, the master craftspeople and the society in general towards an inclusion of girls in the traditionally male-dominated apprenticeships in the informal economy.

Challenges

- **Sustainability:** The training of master craftspeople and apprentices receives institutional support, so it might be difficult to replicate the scheme without external intervention. Also, the project period was too short to ensure long-term acquisition of knowledge and skills in all trades to facilitate (self-) employment. Some trades could not be covered due to apprenticeship durations that exceeded the project duration, for example blacksmith.
- **Training quality:** Training modalities are informal, with limited skills and knowledge.
- **Formalization:** If formalization is imposed by policy measures, some master craftspeople might be reluctant to formalize working relationships through contracts. Awareness raising and information on the benefits of formalization is needed. Efforts to establish operational linkages between formal TVET institutions and traditional apprentices (self-) employment support services were not successful.
- **Value of associations:** Knowledge and practice on the value of informal trade associations needs to be spread, especially in East Africa.
- **Gender:** The choice of trades strongly reflects gender stereotyping. Girls still shy off from traditionally male-dominated trades.

Lessons learned

- There is no 'one-size fits all' approach to skills training in the informal economy.
- **Incorporation of apprenticeship into development plans:** Policy commitments to upgrade apprenticeship need to be linked to concrete national action plans. Moreover, implementing agencies should collaborate with local governments so that apprenticeship activities are incorporated in the respective authorities' local development plans.
- **Collaboration with key stakeholders:** the recruitment of children and craftspeople in collaboration with the community and relevant organizations/associations is crucial

DISCUSSION: EXPERIENCE AND LESSONS FROM PROJECTS (I)

Discussants stressed the fact that governments in West Africa are engaging in **social dialogue on training**. However, while the training funds are managed by tripartite committees, the pilot projects usually lack participation of trade unions. The role of the state in the Benin or the Mali case is to collect payroll taxes. Around 30 to 40 per cent of these taxes are transferred to the funds which then spend around 50 per cent for training in the formal economy and 50 per cent for training for the informal economy.

A question clarified that Swisscontact had not established **international networks of master craftspeople** between the different countries to provide for exchange of experience. The networks are all working at national level. However, a regional cooperation of trade associations takes place.

Discussants also highlighted the **importance of informal associations**. Recalling the statement of Mr Carton from the morning session that all institutional structures seem to be subject to constant change in Africa, Ms Nübler asked how this applied to informal associations. Ms Haidara clarified that informal associations were strengthened through the interventions of the ILO project in Mali and other countries in the 1980s and 1990s ("*Secteur non structuré*"). To date, formal and informal associations in Mali have struck agreements on common approaches to training and therefore work together by providing complementary training for apprenticeship through the training fund. Moreover, the FNAM is strongly involved in the design of apprenticeship. It is the umbrella organization for many regional and local informal trade associations. Mr Haan added that it is crucial to distinguish between "official" associations that were induced by governments and independent informal associations that have evolved autonomously. In Burkina Faso many artisan organizations in the formal economy are induced by the government; in the informal economy there are only few informal economy artisan associations. Mr Walther specified that in Benin, the associations were not induced or influenced by the government and the level of organization is very high. In Senegal, there are diverse organizations representing the interests of different professions or sectors of activities. However, they are not, like in Benin, connected at national level.

The question of **institutional change** and its influence on apprenticeship was also discussed. Two examples from Tunisia and Morocco were put forward, where apprenticeship in the informal economy rapidly diminished due to government legislation that was hostile to informal training systems, demonstrating how informal and formal institutions can interplay. Consequently, master craftspeople have shied away from projects involving government for fear their business will be negatively affected. In Tanzania there has also been resistance from master craftspersons in the informal economy to formalize their businesses. Governments' approach to and support given to informal apprenticeship is strongly influenced by its perception of the informal economy. Compared to Ministries of Education; Ministries of Labour seem to be more inclined to upgrade the informal economy and to acknowledge its potential.

Discussants also underscored that **rural areas** need adapted apprenticeship programmes. Swisscontact is currently undertaking efforts to extend the apprenticeship programme to rural areas.

Progress in Burkina Faso is slower than in the neighbouring countries. National recognition is not yet in place, as cooperation between the trade associations proves to be difficult. Furthermore, the training fund in Burkina Faso is much smaller than its counterpart in Benin or Mali.

PANEL PRESENTATIONS (II)

Approaches to make apprenticeship in Niger more decent and more effective

Mr Christian Joussein, ILO

Introduction

The ILO is implementing two complementary approaches to upgrade apprenticeship in Niger. Apprenticeship reform has been an issue in Niger since 2004. Both projects have been financed by the European Union (EU).

The new apprenticeship approach should allow informal enterprises to evolve towards the formal economy and to build up a new generation of master craftspeople capable of providing better training to their apprentices.

The first pilot project

Young people were recruited to undertake an apprenticeship for six months or less; enterprises were selected according to their reputation. The apprentices received complementary training at the craftspeople's workshop of 8 to 16 hours per week in five large cities. The chosen trades were metal working, car mechanics, carpentering and dressmaking.

The complementary training included trade-specific vocabulary, functional and trade-related calculation, general and trade-related technology, reading and writing plans, hygiene and security. The trainers were craftspeople whose technical and pedagogical skills were also upgraded. In order to exchange information about the training progress, all trainers involved met on a regular basis.

Project results

More than 83 per cent of the apprentices confirmed that they improved their skills and competencies, as did 70 to 74 per cent of the trainers.

The apprentices were assigned new tasks and were encouraged to share their knowledge with other workers. This helped them gain self-esteem. Moreover, they were allowed to use tools and machines in order to execute small tasks on their own, and they received additional requests of clients to work outside the enterprise. The biggest achievement for apprentices was a network amongst themselves.

The second pilot project

Apprenticeship received growing attention in the second pilot project. While the first project aimed at "establishing vocational training which meets the demand of beneficiaries and responds to labour market needs", the second project supports "vocational training and apprenticeship", as the project documents state. Since March 2006, apprenticeship is recognized as one pillar of the national sectoral TVET policy.

A national tripartite forum confirmed the principle of dual apprenticeship and social dialogue on training by consensus. An inter-ministerial and tripartite National Apprenticeship Committee was created to guide implementation, monitor the progress and ensure follow-up and evaluation.

Provisional rules for the second apprenticeship pilot project have been devised and enterprises have been carefully selected. Trades for the second pilot phase have been agreed based on PRSP experiences and a labour market analysis to identify potential income-generating activities.

The National Federation of Niger Artisans (FNAN) will be involved in all stages of apprenticeship. FNAN was strengthened throughout the last years and is now organized at national, regional, departmental and partly at local levels. Each trade association underwent a needs assessment and hired a trainer to provide complementary training for apprentices.

Challenges and the next steps

A new training fund will provide financial assistance. Subsidies will be paid to participating enterprises and continuous training will be free of charge for master craftspeople.

Standards for training quality and the assessment of acquired skills are set by the government in cooperation with FNAN. These standards concern national training curricula, duration of complementary trainings (one week per month), a special type of training contract, a final certificate recognized by the artisan's association and the Labour Ministry, social protection for apprentices and master craftspeople, and limitation of the number of apprentices per enterprise.

The first pilot project has shown that it is crucial to involve the association of artisans in all phases of the implementation of the project. The state should only intervene to certify. Another challenge will be to overcome the gender bias, the largely Muslim society in Niger limits the access of girls to certain occupations. Despite all efforts to become financially self-sustaining, the apprenticeship still needs to be funded by the EU.

Examples of interesting projects to upgrade informal apprenticeship

Mr Hans Christiaan Haan, UNESCO-UNEVOC

Ghana: Rural Enterprise Project⁴

The Rural Enterprise Project in Ghana aims to promote entrepreneurship in rural areas among poor people through business development activities, access to credit and skills development for apprentices and skills upgrading for master trainers. Funding of US\$20 million was provided from the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) over eight years.

Project activities included: (i) basic skills training (for income-generating activities); (ii) management training for existing micro and small enterprises followed by business counseling; (iii) skills upgrading for master trainers; (iv) complementary theoretical training for apprentices; (v) technology development and transfer; and (vi) occupational safety and health seminars.

Between 1995 and 2000, 6,800 micro and small enterprises received training in management skills, 5,300 received business counseling and 3,000 unemployed youth were trained in income-generating activities. The project provided training to 745 master craftspeople, and over 1,000 apprentices; and 65 technology demonstrations were conducted.

⁴ For further information, see Haan (2006).

The project is considered a success for its use of appropriate technologies. Seventy per cent of participants indicated that they could apply the skills that were imparted. However, several shortcomings were identified. Some aspiring apprentices were too poor to access apprenticeship training. Grant assistance could enable apprentices to buy toolkits and make down payments for training. In addition, graduated apprentices needed access to credit and they demanded certification of their skills for the following reasons: certificates would allow them to apply for positions in the formal economy, and they could show them to their customers. Alternatively, a certificate would also allow them to participate in the lottery for US visas.

Kenya: Strengthening Informal Training and Enterprise (SITE)⁵

This joint project of a Kenyan NGO and a British NGO aimed to: (i) upgrade technical and managerial skills of master craftspeople; (ii) upgrade their ability to train apprentices; and (iii) strengthen the capacity of selected vocational training institutions.

An initial “market trends survey” identified priority sub-sectors and skills gaps. Twenty trainers from vocational training institutions and consultants were trained as resource people. In total, 419 master craftspeople and 1,680 apprentices were trained. The training led to an upgrading of technology in micro and small enterprises.

Independent trainers and trainers from private training providers were selected for the programme. This was necessary, as trainers of vocational training institutions showed little interest to get involved in the project for reasons of reputation. The latter trainers showed more interest in new high-tech solutions than in improving skills of informal economy workers.

Master craftspeople received skills upgrading on the basis of a training needs assessment. Informal associations proved very useful in spreading the message about the complementary training to apprentices and master craftspeople, and therefore helped identify people to participate.

Improve informal apprenticeship training: lessons learned

Provide training which quickly results in improved business performance to strengthen incentives for master craftspeople to participate in apprenticeship. This was the case in the SITE project in Kenya.

The programme or policy should not provide financial incentives to master craftspeople for taking on apprentices, as this distorts the incentives for taking on apprentices. Workshops poorly equipped might be attracted into accepting large numbers of apprentices.

To improve training quality in apprenticeship, projects can assist in elaborating training plans, enhance teaching skills of master craftspeople, offer supplementary training to apprentices and master craftspeople, or monitor the training progress through visits by a third party.

Often VTIs are more interested to provide training for the formal economy than for the informal economy. Efforts to effectively involve VTIs into informal apprenticeship often entail a major institutional reorientation and this needs to be carefully addressed.

⁵ *ibid.*

Involving informal trade associations can reap the following benefits: promote apprenticeship among peers; assist in recruiting master craftspeople and apprentices; and promote the monitoring of apprenticeship.

Mr Haan mentioned three other forms of training apart from apprenticeship that can be encountered in the informal economy: (i) training organized by informal sector associations themselves; (ii) community-based training, for example delivered by local trainers at very low cost; and (iii) complementary ‘embedded’ training for informal economy workers conducted by private enterprises, for example training in sewing machine repair by Singer.

The Vocational Skills and Informal Sector Support Project (VSP) in Ghana⁶

Mr Robert Palmer, University of Edinburgh

The World Bank Vocational Skills and Informal Sector Support Project (VSP) (1995-2001) focused on skills upgrading for master craftspeople and informal apprentices.⁷

Summary of the main aspects of the VSP

The project objective was to raise productivity in five occupational areas of the informal economy (dressmaking and tailoring, electrical installation, refrigeration and air-conditioning, carpentry and joinery, blockwork and concreting) by improving the skills of master craftspeople to enhance quality of goods and services produced, by making apprentices more effective producers and less wasteful, and by introducing new and attractive products.

Training places were to be allocated from the National Coordinating Committee on Technical and Vocational Education and Training (NACVET) to trade associations by means of “intake vouchers”. These vouchers were passed on to master craftspeople who either used them for their own skills upgrading or passed them on to apprentices (who had to have been subject of apprenticeship training for at least 18 months) or other employees. Informal apprentices could select their own – nearby – centre offering the desired training course. Upon completion of training, toolkits were to be provided to trainees.

Cost recovery was a key basis for the project. Trainees were expected to pay a share of the training costs and the toolkits. Training institutions were compensated according to performance, that is, number of trainees who successfully complete the programme.

The project focused on the following components:

- apprentice training: centrepiece of the project consisting of short practical courses (12 weeks with demonstrations by the instructors followed by practical exercises by the informal apprentices, provided through public and private training institutions;
- skills upgrading courses for master craftspeople who were found to be interested in both technical skills (four weeks) as well as in entrepreneurial, accounting and costing skills (two weeks); and

⁶ This case study draws on the following sources: Amankrah, 2001a, 2001b; Haan, 2007; Haan and Serrière, 2002; Johanson and Adams, 2004; Korboe, 2001a, 2001b; Palmer, 2007; World Bank, 1995, 2001.

⁷ The World Bank provided credit of US\$9.6 million. The total project cost was US\$12.4 million.

- involving local informal sector associations (ISAs) in designing the training courses, selecting the participants and choosing the tools for the graduates.

VSP provided incentives for apprentices to be trained: a small training allowance; the opportunity to purchase tools at subsidized rates; and a “World Bank” certificate on completion.

Results and impact

The VSP trained 14,565 apprentices, against a target of 15,000, in five trades in 39 selected public and private institutions. Although an exact gender breakdown of the number of apprentices trained is not available, since four out of five of the VSP trade areas were male dominated, it is clear that the VSP benefited male apprentices more than female apprentices. Apprentices that were trained under the VSP indicated that they experienced improvements in: reading of formal technical designs; turning out better finished products and providing safer services; improved prospects as they are sought after by some employers; and enhanced self-esteem. Skills to make higher quality products improved the apprentices’ status as they were envied by the non-enrolled peers for superior skills and better respected by their master craftspeople.

Under the VSP, 9,304 master craftspeople (20 per cent female) received technical training (the target being 5,000) and 7,666 master craftspeople (30 per cent female) benefited from entrepreneurship training (the target being 5,000). The master craftspeople improved their technical efficiency and productivity, for example, in undertaking of minor repairs of own tools; safer and more reliable production methods; improved creativity; and improved ability to set profitable prices for products.

Main implementation challenges

A number of problems associated with the VSP led the World Bank to rate the project as ‘unsatisfactory’ at the implementation completion reporting stage in terms of achieving its objectives. Some problems included:

- Due to weak institutional linkages and limited cooperation between key government and NGOs in the area of vocational training and employment start-up, VSP graduates lacked access to an integrated package of services (credit, extension services, post-training support, and social protection).
- Many ISAs were reluctant and lacked incentives to distribute “intake vouchers” to members, and to recruit training participants. Some failed to verify the eligibility of applicants and the executives of others attempted to gain personally by selling the available training places. The fact that the programme had to offer tools at a discount to master craftspeople taking part in the scheme shows that master craftspeople had to be enticed to participate.
- The voucher scheme failed as voucher holders lacked a meaningful choice between training institutions; it involved relatively high administrative costs, and trade associations were not compensated for marketing and processing the vouchers.
- Trade association members had chosen toolkits that were inferior, which also indicates the low level of commitment.
- Due to relatively small numbers of participants, the impact on the wider informal economy was insignificant. The government did not have the finance to scale up or continue the project once the donor funding ended.

Main lessons learned

- After some initial hesitation, the VSP-organized technical training aroused widespread interest among VTI instructors, master craftspeople and apprentices, who perceived the courses as a ‘quick route’ to skills development.
- Job-oriented competency is achieved more quickly in shorter courses of durations between six to 12 weeks that focus on practical skills rather than lengthy theoretical classroom instruction.
- Private training institutions demonstrated greater flexibility to adapt the content and duration of training to the market, picked up innovative training approaches more quickly and needed less support to carry out training on their own.
- Training fees are acceptable for participants when training is felt to be relevant, but there is a need to pay allowances to poorer trainees.
- Providing financial incentives for instructors and training institutions and other participants is important.
- Information on demand for skills is crucial for adjusting training offerings. There is a need for advance planning and marketing for each training cycle to meet the skills demand of enterprises.
- Vouchers allow students to choose their training providers, which fosters competition among the providers, resulting in either lower costs or higher quality. Experience in the VSP shows that a region has to have a concentration of training institutions in order for a voucher system to provide real trainee choices and stimulate competition among providers.
- Tracer studies are critical for feedback.
- In order for graduates to get integrated post-training support, the relationship between key government institutions and NGOs concerned with vocational training and employment start-up needs to be improved.

DISCUSSION: EXPERIENCE AND LESSONS FROM PROJECTS (II)

The discussion focused on the **difference between East and West African training systems** in the informal economy. The argument was put forward that informal apprenticeship in East African countries tends to rely more on an individual agreement between a trainer, craftsman or teacher and a worker, trainee or apprentice, and that it lacks the institutional arrangements prevailing in West African countries. Trainer and apprentice negotiate the skills to be transferred and the fees and the labour the apprentice has to provide. Once the workers have acquired the skills, they will leave the provider of training. The master craftsman and apprentice have to be convinced that the training offered is worthwhile for both of them. Policies and projects to improve training and skills development therefore focus on building up supply and demand for training, and on developing training products that are paid for. This more market-based approach may imply a higher flexibility of the system which allows for new skills to be introduced rather quickly into apprenticeship, for example mobile phone repairing. However, it was recognized, that much more research is required on informal apprenticeship in East Africa. (Mr Haan, Ms Nübler)

The francophone West African countries are becoming aware of the low degree that technical and vocational training contributes to enhancing employability of youth. This is why all countries are presently considering a **restructuring of informal apprenticeships** including the integration of structured traditional apprenticeship into the institutional training system. Consequently, this would lead to certification recognized at national level. (Mr Haan, Ms Salakana, Mr Walther, Ms Nübler, Ms Haidara)

Many countries have national **training funds**, and their challenge ahead is to convince the fund managers to spend money for training in the informal economy. However, several anglophone African countries do not have national training funds. Therefore, the question was raised as to how complementary training should be funded. A solution would be to build up a training market with demand and supply of training that is offered at a certain cost. The common rule is that pre-apprenticeship training is usually funded by the state; the rest is self-funded.

3.3 The institutional framework of apprenticeship systems in West Africa

KEY QUESTIONS FOR THIS SESSION

How do informal institutions shape the performance of apprenticeship systems in the informal economy with regard to training outcome and development goals?

What role do social networks play for informal institutions to work?

What forces induce institutional change?

What is the meaning of “formalization”?

INTRODUCTION

Ms Irmgard Nübler, ILO

In analyzing the institutional framework governing apprenticeship in the informal economy, the distinction between functional and development objectives was highlighted once more. The functional perspective focuses on the interests of the different actors and on their incentives to participate in training. The development perspective is largely normative and analyzes to what extent institutions promote desirable outcomes.

Apprenticeship systems in the West African region are embedded in an informal institutional framework, that is, rules of behaviour based on socially-shared values and norms. These rules are created, communicated and enforced outside legally-binding channels. In other words, whereas formal institutions are enforced by governments, trade unions and employers’ organizations, informal institutions are enforced by social networks, informal associations, communities, and so forth.

PRESENTATION

Apprenticeship systems in the West African region: An institutional framework

Mr Sebastian Buckup, ILO

Introduction

Given the long duration and complexity of apprenticeship agreements, the question arises as to how the informal institutional framework provides incentives for apprentice and master trainer to trust in each other’s cooperation and to conclude an apprenticeship agreement?

Governing the apprenticeship system

The rules, tradition and norms governing apprenticeship are enforced in social networks and this makes cheating or exploitation less attractive than cooperating. For these to take effect three conditions need to hold: First, cheating needs to be visible, that is, there needs to be a certain degree of transparency. Second, the threat of sanctions needs to be credible. Third, the sanction needs to have an impact in terms of outweighing the “gains from cheating”. Social networks, that is, ties of kinship, friendship and community, are pivotal in creating these conditions through several “channels”:

- **Affection:** apprenticeships take up to four years in Benin, Ghana and Togo and up to seven years and more in Niger and Senegal. Particularly in rural areas one may observe what is sometimes called “child fosterage”: the apprentice is brought into the master trainer’s family before the apprenticeship begins and lives with them during the apprenticeship. This way the training relationship becomes closely linked with a personal relationship which creates trust and avoids opportunistic behaviour.
- **Socialization:** moral rules and religious beliefs often play an important role for the enforcement of apprenticeships in traditional trades. The mabube weavers in Senegal provide an illustrative example: considering weaving as a potentially dangerous activity which is associated with spirits, they believe that passing on too early the secret lore which protects the weaver from the spirits causes harm to the apprentice – a mechanism to prevent apprentices from defecting. Beliefs of this kind are transmitted through and saved in social networks.
- **Reciprocity and reputation:** when master trainer and apprentice have strong social ties between each other, there is a good potential for reciprocity in case of cheating. In other words, social networks create interdependencies. Furthermore, they provide effective communication channels among group members and can hence shape the reputation of an actor.
- **Communal sanctions:** networks facilitate cooperation between group members. One example is the enforcement of informal trade certificates in Togo: entrepreneurs without certificates, that is, those who finished training without the master trainer’s consent, are likely to encounter harassment and threats of having their enterprise demolished.

Overall, social networks help disseminate credible information and provide an effective monitoring mechanism; they create interdependencies which make sanctioning threats credible; they shape individual and collective learning processes; and they solve collective action problems, increasing the impact of communal sanctions.

However, governance through social networks also has important disadvantages: When access to training depends on social networks rather than merit, both trainer and apprentice may lack incentives to make an effort to participate; and disadvantaged groups may remain excluded.

Other enforcement mechanisms exist to maintain the training agreement:

- **Trade secrets:** master craftspeople may hide a crucial skill from the apprentice to force them to stay. However, this decreases the enterprise’s productivity and potentially also the motivation of the trainee.
- **Payment structure of apprenticeship fees:** in many West African apprenticeship fees are common, for example, Ghana with more than 95 per cent. The timing of the payment can be used to shape the incentives of master trainer and apprentice. In Ghana some 20 to 40 per cent of the fees are paid at the end to make sure the master trainer sticks to the apprenticeship agreement.

Linkages between the informal apprenticeship system, social networks and labour market outcomes need to be clearly understood. Future research may also focus on alternative enforcement mechanisms and their consequences on quantity, quality and access to training in the informal economy.

Challenges to the apprenticeship system

The informal apprenticeship system in its existing form is increasingly challenged by important changes in the socio-economic environment:

- Technological change: apprenticeship needs to respond to new and increasingly complex knowledge, particularly in modern trades characterized by rapid technological change.
- Emerging new professions: adaptability, for example, to new professions in the information and communication technology (ICT) field challenges traditional cognitive job-based teaching methods.
- Urbanization and population growth: the stability of the apprenticeship system could be jeopardized as social networks break down in urban and semi-urban areas without being replaced by strong voluntary associations.
- Health threats: pandemics like HIV/AIDS might affect investment in training.
- Political pressure or neglect: if systems are constantly neglected by policy-makers, the lack of support could affect the system's viability in the long-run.

DISCUSSION: THE INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

Discussants argued that the focus on **social networks** may disregard the relevance of economically driven networks, such as purchasing associations. Linkages between these different types of networks need to be carefully examined in African societies. Whereas some years ago, the development discourse overemphasized the economic dimension of personal relations, the social dimension should not be overemphasized today. Ms Nübler underlined that institutional economics combines both perspectives. Informal associations, for example, are players with mainly economic, but also social purposes. Mr Buckup explained that social networks can help enforce economic goals.

Discussants confirmed that social and economic networks are presently under stress. Efforts to formalize informal apprenticeship and to achieve decent work need to help **changing informal institutions, and thereby changing social behaviour**. In order to influence social behaviour, the GTZ has had some experience by using the “profitable social management” method. (Ms Grunwald) Discussants highlighted that social realities can only be changed if all partners and stakeholders are involved. Collective agreements therefore play a vital role for the setting of rules.

Mr Walther added that the major impediment to enhanced productivity is the enterprises' **lack of access to financial resources, advanced technology and skills**. An Agence française de développement (AFD) study revealed that 80 per cent of master craftspeople considered improving access to markets as the highest priority.

Health issues are a major concern, for example in Swaziland. Thirty per cent of teachers died of AIDS. In the light of high HIV prevalence rates, Ms Grunwald raised the question on the consequences for the provision and organization of long-term training by master craftspeople and trainers for supplementary training.

3.4 Policies and strategies to improve the institutional framework: Role of governments, employers' and workers' organizations

KEY QUESTIONS FOR THIS SESSION

What policy areas are addressed by governments in West-African countries aiming at promoting apprenticeship training in the informal economy?

How do present formalization efforts relate to and interact with the existing informal institutions: do formal institutions substitute, complement, accommodate or compete with informal institutions?

What is the impact of policies in terms of training, development and decent work objectives?

What have been the major impediments to change and reform?

What is the role of employers' and workers' associations in promoting apprenticeship in the informal economy?

What lessons can we learn from country experience and what is good practice?

INTRODUCTORY PRESENTATION

Formalization of the informal economy: Different perspectives

Ms Azita Berar-Awad, ILO

Introduction

Ms Berar-Awad underlined the relevance of apprenticeship in the informal economy, and discussed ILO perspectives on formalization.

The informal economy is gaining new momentum in policy discussions and academic research. Although different organizations might have different views on concept and measurement, it is commonly agreed that the informal economy is not disappearing but growing. It emerges in new forms and places, also in industrialized countries. Hence, the informal economy is no longer a phenomenon linked to traditional forms of production and the question of the quality of informal employment becomes crucial.

While it is recognized that the informal economy is the only source of livelihood, jobs, income, and solidarity networks for millions of people, the image of low productivity, vulnerability, poverty, lack of protection, and the impossibility of making long-term projections for the people working in informal jobs, remains. Even though not everyone in the informal economy is poor, ways should be found to lead people out of informality.

There is no single or "one size fits all" solution to informality and the identification of feasible solutions requires a productive search examining different experiences and "good practices".

What is formalization?

There is no "ILO approach" to formalization. The 2002 International Labour Conference agreed not to talk about "formalization per se", but about incorporating the informal economy into the mainstream economy. The concept of "formalization" itself is not well defined and there are ongoing discussions as to what formalization really means.

There are two very extreme ideas on formalization: the first attempts to project on the informal economy the same labour relation models that have developed in industrialized countries. The focus is on implementation of formal rules and on inefficiencies. This view implies an approach to formalization which is focusing on enforcement and inspection. The second considers the informal economy as a totally different culture as compared to the formal economy. The industrial model has been introduced by colonialism which only reaches the small formal segment of the economy. This view talks about informality in an almost romantic way as the “traditional way” of doing things. It is important to find a solution between these two extreme ideas as both have their own limitations.

The ILO talks about “progressive” formalization. Employers focus on the process of registration of micro and small enterprises. The aim is to provide the right incentives to enterprises to register. The workers focus on organization, representation and voice. For governments, the concept of formalization includes access to formal systems of resource allocation, for example micro finance, enlarging the tax base, and access to a minimum coverage by the social protection and social security system. The ILO’s view on progressive formalization includes all these aspects.

Skills and the informal economy

Skills acquisition and development in the informal economy often face resistance by various actors, as the approaches have not been flexible enough. A “dual training system” may be one approach to incorporate the informal economy into the mainstream economy.

PANEL PRESENTATIONS

Dual apprenticeship in the informal economy: The cases of Benin, Senegal and Togo

**Mr Richard Walther, Agence française de
développement (AFD)**

The place and role of the informal economy

Mr Walther proposed to identify the informal economy according to the definition adopted in 1993 by the “International Conference of Statisticians”. The definition stipulates that there are no written records in informal enterprises for expenditure and reinvestment, and that these enterprises are not separated from the households to which they belong.

The informal economy plays a major role in creating employment and national wealth in West Africa. Although traditional apprenticeship is the largest training provider in Africa, there are no statistics on the number of people trained. The informal economy is the major training provider in Benin, Togo and Senegal (in Senegal, the formal TVET system caters for 7,000 trainees while for example the private car repair enterprises on their own train around 348,000 apprentices).

The craftsmen are the real evaluators of the apprentices and should be integrated into a system of follow-up designed by trainers and craftspeople to evaluate training outcomes. Certification should be part of the process, since experience has shown that companies prefer hiring an apprentice with certificate over hiring a certified TVET student. Such a system obviously needs financial resources which have to be reserved by the public authorities. This commitment of the authorities is crucial.

Craftsmen and micro-entrepreneurs are aware of the need to adapt their products and services to the level of technology and quality required by the market, but they lack financial and human resources and access to information. In the case of Benin, trade

associations are working on how to upgrade the skills of apprentices and master craftspersons at the same time. AFD is considering possibilities to address these challenges in different sectors, in order to identify the best innovations and apply a coherent system.

The case of Benin

In the case of Benin, a broad, unified approach to reform was applied. At the beginning of the 1990s, the economic and social partners agreed on including the informal economy in the national reform process. In 1998, a national training policy was defined aiming to introduce an improved traditional apprenticeship system into an overall vocational and job training system. Part of this process was the creation of the Ministry of TVET and the training fund, in order to support the reform.

Clear roles for the key stakeholders improved the organizational dynamics in this process. The National Federation of Benin Artisans (FENAB) played a core role, while the Government was taking on regulatory action. The social partners recognized their responsibilities for dealing with the informal economy. The donor agencies were key in structuring the process.

On this basis, the traditional apprenticeship system could be converted into a dual one. It included the identification of specific qualification levels for apprentices and craftspersons, the creation of a series of regulatory instruments (guidelines for introduction, organization, evaluation, contract and financing) and a coordinated management. The training scheme is open for apprentices aged over 14 who have completed at least four years of primary school. The training usually lasts for three years and once a week the apprentice receives three 200-hour phases of training at a training centre.

Skills of apprentices are assessed. The assessment method seeks to establish a balance between theory and practical tests, and between a continuous assessment and examinations.

First outcomes of this process: 294 apprentices were assessed in 2006, of whom 292 were certified, another 3,000 assessments per year are planned for the coming years. Companies prefer to hire someone with a certificate from dual apprenticeship (Certificat de qualification professionnel (CQP)) over someone with a training centre certificate (Certificat d'aptitude professionnelle (CAP)). Funding is provided by various sources including Swisscontact, the French cooperation, training centres and the apprentices themselves.

With regard to financing, there is a clear lack of national resources to support the new scheme. Besides, the craftspeople and their families have difficulties in paying their 5 per cent share, and the assessment sessions are rather costly (54,707 FCFA per trainee in 2006; approximately US\$130 at current rate of exchange). Furthermore, support for labour market insertion of young graduates is still weak.

The case of Togo

In Togo, the new apprenticeship scheme was designed much in the same way as in Benin, based on a dual training with CQP certificates. The apprentices enter at an average age of 16 and the duration is between two and five years. The apprentice attends a one-week course per month in the training centre. The educational requirements for entering the schemes are different for traditional and for the more modern, urban occupations.

Assessments of the system in Togo have found:

- a strong demand of craftspeople to be trained along with the trainers, to also access new technologies and equipment;

- a lack of human resources in the Ministry to follow up, assess and extend the system due to scarce information and deficient assessment means;
- a lack of financial means in training centres to maintain and update equipment;
- that “dual apprenticeships” are recognized by the modern companies;
- a lack of formal jobs which means that financial resources are needed to help the apprentices create their own jobs or activities.

The case of Senegal

In Senegal, the reform of the apprenticeship system is an ongoing process. The TVET Ministry intends to identify best practice among all apprenticeship experiences in order to set up a “model dual apprenticeship approach” within the formal training system. The social partners and professional organizations are involved in piloting this scheme. AFD is supporting three studies in order to analyze the current situation of apprenticeship in the informal economy in three different sectors: clothing/textiles, car repair and construction/public works.

The studies make proposals on possible structures of reorganized apprenticeships.

Conclusion

The reform of traditional apprenticeship is at the top of the agenda in various West African countries. Governments realized that formal training does not necessarily lead to formal employment. Reform of training systems is needed to make them more effective. The current reforms intend to stimulate job creation for youth and link formal and informal training through a comprehensive and integrated training system. The experience in Mali (see presentation by Ms Haidara in sections 3.2 and 3.4) has shown that bringing a new, dual approach into the formal training system changes the whole value system and training becomes much more practical and less theoretical.

Furthermore, public-private partnerships and a coordinated management involving all stakeholders are vital for the success of the reforms. The dual apprenticeship may become one model for successful post primary training in West Africa. A reorganized apprenticeship system is the only way of ensuring that a maximum of young Africans can acquire the skills needed to stimulate the informal economy and encourage the shift from a survival-based approach to a development-based approach. There is a need to address the subsistence economy and to improve their productivity. The higher the training level of the young people in this sector, the higher their earnings and the greater the probability of moving into better, more formal employment.

Questions for the future

- What is the cost of dual apprenticeship system in comparison to the present TVET system and who will pay for what?
- How can the skills of trainers, master craftspersons and apprentices be improved at the same time while also creating a link between initial and continuing training?
- How can policy-makers upgrade such a system and how can the system be adapted to the requirements of new jobs? Maybe technical universities could help.
- How can the new system be managed by a balanced partnership of public authorities, social partners and the various stakeholders?

Policies and strategies to improve the institutional framework for informal apprenticeship training: The case of Ghana

Mr Robert Palmer, University of Edinburgh

The informal apprenticeship training in Ghana is responsible for some 80 to 90 per cent of all basic skills training in the country. Approximately 5 to 10 per cent of training is delivered by NGOs, for-profit and non-profit providers.

The institutional framework

The National Vocational Training Institute (NVTI), set up in 1970 is responsible for the nationwide coordination of all aspects of vocational training including apprenticeship. However, the main programmes of the NVTI's Department of Apprenticeship have been targeted at training "formal" apprentices.

A National Coordinating Committee on Technical and Vocational Education and Training (NACVET) has been set up to coordinate skills training across nine different ministries. Yet, so far it has failed to design a national policy for skills development. It suffers from capacity problems and ongoing tensions between the two parent ministries, which are the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Manpower, Youth & Employment. NACVET is currently being replaced by a Council for TVET (2006/7).

The 1998 Children's Act outlines the legislative framework for informal apprenticeship. It defines a minimum age of 15 years, sets out the master craftspeople's responsibilities, and specifies the content of apprenticeship agreements. One of the most important elements of the institutional framework for informal apprenticeship is informal sector associations (ISAs). They are actively involved in the supervision of skills training.

However, ISAs are not necessarily strong, effective and representative. They act as intermediaries between member enterprises and the government, but their purpose is usually political (such as the collection of taxes) rather than the provision of active support to its members. A World Bank evaluation concluded that most of the associations they examined only existed in name and were not mobilizing local artisans.

Young people trained through informal apprenticeship have two certification options:

- certificates awarded by informal sector associations;
- NVTI proficiency certificates on the basis of a non-written competency-based skill test. Many informal apprentices do not register for the NVTI examination.

There is no data on how many informal apprentices participate in the test and how many pass and receive certifications.

Policies and strategies to improve the institutional framework

Specific policies have helped to improve the institutional framework of informal apprenticeship, such as Ghana's Poverty Reduction Strategies (the GPRS I and II), the 2004 Education Reform White Paper and the 2004 TVET Policy Framework.

The policy framework for TVET led to the establishment of a Council for TVET (COTVET) which coordinates and oversees the broad spectrum of formal, informal and non-formal education and training across ministries. COTVET includes an Informal Sector Affairs Division which will develop policies and programmes for strengthening informal apprenticeship. It aims at reforming and strengthening the system by introducing

competency-based training and assessment systems. It also develops mechanisms to link informal skills development with the formal TVET system.

The TVET policy framework encourages the formation of trade associations for delivering training-related assistance to members. It aims at integrating informal apprenticeship into a NQF and at incorporating TVET into the poverty alleviation strategies. Finally, it intends to provide guidelines for NGO activities in the area of informal economy training.

The Government of Ghana takes full responsibility for the first year of approved informal apprenticeships. Payments are made directly to the master craftsman to cover the first year of training. Currently, a figure of US\$500 per apprentice is being discussed – an amount many times higher than the cost of the entire three years of informal apprenticeship. This figure is far too high and will most probably be reduced.

Skills Training and Entrepreneurship Programme (STEP)

One major initiative in Ghana to support skills development in a context of poverty reduction is the STEP Programme, implemented between 2003 and 2005. STEP was a government-supported programme to reduce poverty by providing employable skills and other assistance (for example, microfinance) to the unemployed. The aim of the activities was to enable beneficiaries to join the formal economy.

The main components of STEP were skills training delivered through vocational training providers, skills enhancement for master craftsmen and skills training in apprenticeship placements, and microfinance.

In order to improve teaching capabilities of master craftspeople, they received pedagogical skills with the Ghana Regional Appropriate Technology Industrial Service. Up to ten trainees were then attached to a master craftsman to undertake a workshop-based apprenticeship for up to 12 months. Additional training took place either in the enterprises' own facilities when adequate equipment and machinery was in place, or in other informal enterprises.

The approved STEP budget aimed at funding 1,000 master craftspeople to undergo skills enhancement and to take on 5,000 new apprentices. They were paid 500,000 Ghanaian Cedis (approx. US\$55) per apprentice to cover the tuition costs. In the end, only 1,140 STEP apprentices were placed with 120 master craftsmen, who only had received limited pedagogical training.

Many of the master craftsmen who accepted apprentices could not provide a decent training environment and were ill-resourced in tools and equipment. The master craftsmen also complained about receiving insufficient funding. Also, the training was considered too short and there were huge delays in STEP graduates accessing microfinance.

Some of the lessons learned from the STEP programme are:

- there is a need for a more effective assessment whether the training environment is suitable for the trainee;
- master craftsmen need to receive sufficient funds to cover the training costs; responsibilities of providing food for the apprentices need to be clearly defined;
- the training duration has to be adequate;
- post-training support has to be more efficient.

Concerns regarding government policies

There is a need to avoid undermining the strengths and the sustainability of the informal apprenticeship and there is a need for policy to take into account the lessons learned with prior programmes when designing new plans to formalize informal apprenticeship. Specific concerns focus on the amount of financing for the first year, the integration into the NQF, politics interfering too much with actual policies and the creation of an enabling business environment.

Apprenticeship training in Mali today

Ms Tania Haidara, Swisscontact

Two years ago, Mali launched a national TVET policy document that also contains a passage on the informal economy, specifically the artisan sector. It addresses four major issues: the financing; the official recognition of training in the informal economy through certificates; the inclusion of apprenticeship in national programmes, and the recognition of different actors which play clearly-defined roles within the system.

According to the policy document, 90 per cent of apprenticeship funding is provided by the national training fund, while 10 per cent needs to be funded by the apprentices themselves. The official recognition of training involves the development and validation of apprenticeship rules. Certificates will be delivered by the ministry that is in charge of the training. Certificates will have an official character and be given out after an exam according to national standards. Master craftsmen's skills and experiences will also be certified. Informal apprenticeship training is included in the Investment Programme of the Education Sector. A concern remains whether the modern sector, which is financing large parts of the apprenticeship scheme for the informal economy, will continue its financial support through its contributions to the training fund.

Pilot projects and national commitments played an important role in the development of the national TVET document. The process involved national actors, professional organizations and public service providers with specific responsibilities for the apprenticeship system. For the coming period, a sectoral and geographical extension is intended.

Apprenticeship in the informal economy: The Continuous Apprenticeship Programme in Egypt, 2002-06

Mr Abdel-Aziz Boutaleb, ILO

Background

The ILO apprenticeship programme in Egypt is still an ongoing experience.

Unemployment is one of the main challenges for Egypt today and particularly youth unemployment is very high. Human resource development and skills development are considered to be crucial in tackling these problems.

Within the VET system there are several different providers and models of delivery. Technical and vocational education is generally comprised of three systems: the vocational education system, the secondary technical education system and the higher technical institutes system.

A large informal economy, new information and communication technology, and external competition pose important challenges; as does the mismatch between demand for and supply of skilled workers, often due to occupational shifts.

Framework of the programme

Different Ministries are currently building up a comprehensive framework for a consistent apprenticeship system. It comprises five levels, each defined in terms of competences: semi-skilled worker, skilled worker, under-technician, technician and high technician. Each level has a different proportion of on-the-job and off-the-job training.

Organization and management of the apprenticeship system includes work on educational contents, training standards, technical contents and activity requirements, as well as the role of partners involved (established through an apprenticeship contract), the protection of youth, inspection services, funding and financing.

Programme strategy

The programme strategy consists of three pillars:

- combining a bottom-up and a top-down approach: a National Steering Committee develops the main guidelines for the system and promotes the exchange of experiences; a Local Steering Committee implements and manages the project; a Decentralized Management Unit takes care of the pedagogical, administrative and financial management;
- ensuring community participation: all partners will be involved in needs assessment, project design and implementation;
- promoting the fund-raising capabilities of stakeholders through funding mechanisms at the local level (sustainability).

The Programme Strategy contains an implementation methodology that includes several forums and events such as preparatory meetings, national tripartite seminars, events in each governorate, informative sessions for employees and craftspersons, and events for NGOs.

The beneficiaries of the programme would be:

- youth between 14 to 19 years;
- school drop-outs;
- working children;
- informal apprentices.

The programme is a dual system where training is organized in three different places: on-the-job, in vocational training centres (theory and practice), and near the job, for example for courses on occupational safety and health, literacy training and computer courses.

Pilot programme implementation

The first phase started in 2002. The pilot is carried out in three governorates and in different sectors, such as carpentry, mechanics, electricians, clothing, and so forth. Up to now, 390 apprentices completed their training. Most of them continued as employees and 45 of them opted for self employment.

The programme receives funding from different donors and is integrated in a US Department of Labour (USDOL) funded programme on “Combating child labour through

education”. The African Development Bank (ADB) is mainstreaming the apprenticeship programme into the 2008–11 Education Strategy for Egypt.

DISCUSSION: POLICIES AND STRATEGIES

Ms Azita Berar-Awad opened the discussion by summarizing the following areas that could be further addressed:

- Why are we searching for a new model, and what are the limits of informal and formal training systems?
- What are successful experiences concerning the financing of training? Besides budget allocation through public funds and private training arrangements, what are the PPP (public-private-partnership) models that have worked?
- The recognition of marketable skills allows for a fluid transition from informal to formal labour markets. What type of skills should be produced?
- Skills acquisition does not guarantee access to jobs. Apart from microfinance, what other mechanisms exist?
- What roles do the social partners play in training arrangements?

In many cases the state is not involved in co-financing training in the informal economy. Mr Walther stressed that it is always important to define “who pays what”. Generally, as in the case of Mali, the employers in the formal economy want their training levy to be used for continuous training of workers and not for apprentices in the artisan sectors. Apprenticeship was a model for initial VET and should therefore be financed to a certain extent by the state. Some funds (for example in Mali) have established a quota for apprenticeship which means that a certain percentage of the funds’ budget has to be spent on apprenticeship. Ms Grunwald pointed out that in Germany there is a discussion on whether apprenticeship is a public or a private good. Further questions are: how can the different cost–benefit ratios of education and training systems, including apprenticeship, be reflected in public spending on TVET? What is the role of the government in the context of financing further training?

Another point was raised regarding the transition from basic education to apprenticeship. Several countries face the problem of an age gap between primary schooling, finished at the age of 12, and the legal minimum age for work or training such as apprenticeship, which is 14 or 15. As the enrolment rate for secondary education is very low in Africa, alternative models need to be found to bridge this gap. If there is no feasible offer for 12 to 14 year-olds, they lose their ability to abide by a certain schedule, their readiness to follow regular daily routines and to integrate into training.

Mr Palmer clarified that certificates offered by informal trade associations in Ghana are recognized at national level, but only among the members of these associations. However, they remain of further value for graduated apprentices when they become self-employed, as they will be recognized as master craftspeople by all members of the associations and hence will be able to attract apprentices of their own more easily. Certificates offered by the NVTI in Ghana can also be useful to access semi-formal employment. For example in construction, workers hired on a daily basis receive better pay if they can prove their qualification by showing the NVTI certificate. Mr Palmer also commented that the US\$500 planned to sponsor the first year of apprenticeship training in Ghana could well corrupt the sustainable financing mechanisms and would likely attract new enterprises to join the system that are not fit to train apprentices.

A discussant highlighted that in Cameroon the highly skilled take very long to find an appropriate job, while the low skilled find jobs very quickly. This means that employability

is enhanced by upgrading apprenticeship, if skills acquired meet the needs of the local labour market.

4. Looking ahead: Knowledge gaps and research questions

KEY QUESTIONS FOR THIS SESSION

What are the ongoing and planned research programmes in the area of informal training systems, and to what extent is informal apprenticeship a focus?

What additional research questions need to be addressed?

How could we best develop synergy effects through cooperation?

INTRODUCTION

Ms Irmgard Nübler, ILO

Based on the presentations and discussions, Ms Nübler pointed out issues that have been identified and highlighted for further research: attention should be given to the lessons that can be learned from research carried out 20 to 30 years ago (studies by M. Carton; F. Fluitman). Issues like gender, post-primary education and training, new technologies and financing of training should be addressed as well as recognition of skills as a means to establish links with the formal economy and the formal training system. The discussion should also cover the role of important players such as informal associations and should assess how to deliver policy messages.

PANEL PRESENTATIONS

Mr Richard Walther, Agence française de développement (AFD)

The research agenda addressed by AFD and the Association for the Development of Education in Africa (ADEA) is post-primary vocational training in Africa. They follow three approaches:

- Research to upgrade apprenticeship: Mr Walther undertook case studies on vocational training in the informal economy in Angola, Benin, Cameroon, Ethiopia, Morocco, Senegal and South Africa. Specific studies on renewing apprenticeship systems are being undertaken in Benin, Mali, Senegal and Togo.
- Research exploring training schemes where students alternate between school and enterprises.
- Research on young leadership networks in Africa: They have proven to be a good way for youth to enter the labour market and to access training arrangements.

ADEA biennale

The ADEA biennale, which will take place next year in Mozambique, will be devoted to post-primary education and training. For this conference, an ADEA working group is developing ten case studies on post-primary education and training systems in West Africa and Eastern Africa (Ethiopia). Both apprenticeship and school-based systems are considered among these studies. Mr Walther invited the ILO to participate in the biennale.

Research needs

In order to be able to understand development needs in Africa, it is necessary to understand the present context of training systems, innovations within the system, ongoing projects, and the socio-economic situation at country level. On the basis of the socio-economic situation, development priorities need to be identified. Next, developing priorities need to be linked to skills priorities (forward-looking skills).

In order to understand existing dynamics, research has to take into account perspectives of social actors (entrepreneurs, practitioners and social partners). These stakeholders' prime interest is to improve their situation. Any intervention should help them take ownership and understand their situation, make them aware of what they can do, and help them master their financial means. Interventions need to address administrative and organizational challenges, and, in some cases, play a mediating role.

Decent work will not be achieved by braking the dynamics of the informal economy, but by supporting them. Interventions should explore possible ways of introducing decent work into the informal economy by examining social contexts, actors and dynamics of transformation.

An important research question is how to help countries follow a path of modernization according to their needs.

Mr Robert Palmer, University of Edinburgh

Introduction

Mr Palmer is involved in an ongoing research project funded by the UK Department for International Development (DFID) on "Skills for growth and poverty reduction in Ghana" (joint project by University of Edinburgh and research partners in Ghana), which focuses on the benefits for the poor from skills training and the extent to which skills acquired are utilized by graduates in the labour market. The study will explore the links between skills, work, poverty reduction and growth.

Social composition

Regarding the social composition of apprentices, the data available is scarce. Only large externally-funded projects produced good-quality evaluation reports. The study will assess, by gender, educational level, and poverty level, who has access to apprenticeship, and under what conditions. It will also analyze "good" or "bad" apprenticeship trades with regard to social composition. The institutional framework, that is, the socio-cultural, economic and political context, is an important force in determining the social composition of apprentices.

Labour market outcome

Limited data is available on the link between the skills of apprenticeship graduates and labour market outcomes. Many arguments are therefore based on assumptions and rather weak evidence. The difference between acquired skills and skills actually used in wage employment or self-employment needs to be examined. Labour market outcomes are affected by two types of enabling or disabling environments. One is the delivery context, that is, the training quality of apprenticeship; the other is the transformative context, for example labour market, socio-cultural, political and policy environments, which facilitates that apprenticeship leads to development outcomes. Both dimensions will be covered in the research.

The research will not only look at policies on paper, but also at practiced policies, the political will behind them, and the government's capacity to implement policies that facilitate the informal economy to develop. When examining labour market outcomes, it is necessary to examine the context into which apprentices are graduating.

The DFID research project addresses the following questions:

- How and under what conditions do educational systems, including apprenticeship in the informal economy, help to overcome the poverty trap?
- To what extent are the poorest able to access different types of apprenticeship in the informal economy?
- What is the social composition of apprentices and how does the institutional framework shape this composition?
- To what extent are skills acquired through apprenticeship used in the labour market?

Mr Emmanuel Reynaud, ILO

Introduction

In the face of existing research it becomes apparent that there is a gap between the potential of informal apprenticeship and its modest results. This finding alone triggers the need for more research in order to better understand the logics of apprenticeship systems and its current evolution and dynamics. Research needs to take the strong external influences into account to which apprenticeship systems are subject. The framework established by the Skills and Employability Department, distinguishing between functional and development outcomes, can be a very useful tool. The role of actors needs to be understood as well as the wide differences among countries. This calls for taking into account national and local conditions.

Research gaps

Further research on apprenticeship in the informal economy should explore the relation between formal TVET and apprenticeship systems in the informal economy.

The capacity of apprenticeship to respond to the needs of the national economy has to be examined. Therefore the dynamics of apprenticeship and its current evolution, as well as differences between countries need to be understood. Possible links between apprenticeship and social protection, apprenticeship and access to finance, entrepreneurship training, child labour and particular challenges in rural areas should also be addressed. This requires more integrated and long-term approaches which could help policies to develop more integrated approaches to decent work in informal apprenticeships.

Academics and international organizations have different research needs. The ILO should become more active in action-oriented research. This implies taking stock of existing local knowledge. Based on cumulated knowledge and findings, the ILO will draw lessons and translate them into policy messages for constituents.

The ILO should focus on areas in which it has comparative advantages, to contribute to strengthening the local research capacities in order to enhance ownership of findings among local academics, to design new mechanisms for information exchange within the research community; and to develop partnerships with research centres such as the Graduate Institute of Development Studies. A long-term view is important.

Finally, research can draw important lessons from analyzing the process of modernization in apprenticeship systems such as in Germany. These apprenticeship systems were exposed to significant economic and social changes and many apprenticeship

systems in Africa today face similar challenges. By understanding the process of institutional change and evolution through historical analysis, we may be able to derive important recommendations for upgrading informal apprenticeship in African countries. The process of modernization and its implications for upgrading need to be carefully understood.

DISCUSSION ON KNOWLEDGE GAPS AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The benefits of apprenticeship need to be assessed in terms of poverty and growth, and to contrast them with its costs. The momentum for training within the international development debate was lost when the World Bank published its report in 1991 (World Bank, 1991). This policy paper claimed that investment in vocational training was too expensive. Only recently the German BMZ commissioned new research on the **cost-benefit of skills development**. (Ms Grunwald)

The momentum that is presently given to secondary education should be used by exploring the **links between informal and formal training arrangements**. Research and interventions should focus on the areas of organizational strength in training systems. (Mr Quinn)

Ms Weyer pointed out that **further knowledge** on apprenticeship is needed. Tracer studies would allow a better understanding of the apprentices' labour market insertion, and also include information on social composition, the access to apprenticeship (role of social networks), and the training process. Working with researchers in Africa should be a priority, and the Graduate Institute of Development Studies, which is already implicated in research in the field of skills development, is available to cooperate and conduct research on apprenticeship.

While Mr Haftendorn argued for improving skills of master trainings (entrepreneurs), Ms Phan suggested that lessons should be drawn from projects combating child labour, particularly those linking skills training and youth employment opportunities for child workers aged between 14 and 17. Both stressed a need for **integrated approaches**.

5. Conclusion

The workshop highlighted the importance and potential of apprenticeship training in the informal economy, to provide skills and competences to a growing number of young women and men entering the labour market. Informal apprenticeship builds on the local knowledge base and is a self-regulating and self-financing system embedded in the local social context.

The challenge for policies and interventions is to recognize and build on local institutions and to upgrade capacity of the informal training system to:

- provide relevant and quality training in order to enhance employability of apprentices and to meet labour market needs,
- develop an institutional framework which supports the achievements of development objectives, respects labour standards, productive employment and decent work, and
- strengthen incentives of stakeholders to participate in apprenticeship and provide training to the growing number of youth.

Within this context, coordination of informal apprenticeship with the formal schooling system and the formal training system is considered crucial in order to establish coherent learning paths, smooth transition from school to apprenticeship training, and improve access of apprentices and master craftspeople to formal training, for example, in theoretical knowledge, advanced technologies, or management skills. Credible assessment and certification of knowledge and competences acquired in informal apprenticeship is considered essential for recognition of apprenticeship training in formal education and training systems and in formal labour markets.

This transition and upgrading process involves institutional change and the creation of new institutions. Policy interventions need to be carefully designed in order to build sustainable institutions, processes and solutions. The local community and social partners need to take ownership; informal crafts associations and small business associations are key players and are considered a major success factor. Furthermore, the role of the State, of microcredit, training funds and enterprise clusters have been highlighted in co-financing training, improving diffusion of technologies and new skills, and promoting equal access to apprenticeship training on a sustainable basis.

Skills development policies, both in the formal and informal economy, need to be integrated into the national development strategy. National development plans need to recognize apprenticeship training in the informal economy and its institutional framework as a major provider of skills. The development of skills needs to be linked to relevant economic policies, for example, national technology, industrial and trade policies in order to achieve national development objectives.

Informal apprenticeship attracted substantial attention in the international policy debate 20 to 30 years ago, however, lost its momentum more than a decade ago. The debate did not result in effective national policies in most countries to upgrade informal apprenticeship. Interventions were often at the project level, and for a limited period of time. The workshop highlighted the need for further research at national, regional and industry level in order to better understand informal institutions regulating apprenticeship in the informal economy, to exchange knowledge and to inform the newly-emerging debate on lessons learned from different approaches and experiences to upgrade and formalize informal apprenticeship. Cooperation of ILO with other development agencies and international organizations and with universities and research institutes as well as the

creation of networks is considered crucial in this process. Furthermore, the workshop noted the importance of providing new knowledge and insights to governments and social partners, and of raising awareness for effective policies in upgrading informal apprenticeship for development.

Bibliography

- Amankrah, J. 2001a. *Ghana's experience in apprenticeship training and other skills development initiatives in the informal sector*, Vocational skills and informal sector support project, Ghana Ministry of Manpower Development and Employment (MoMDE) (Accra, MoMDE).
- . 2001b. *What works in skills development in informal sector training: The case of Ghana*. Vocational skills and informal sector support project, Ghana Ministry of Manpower Development and Employment (MoMDE) (Accra, MoMDE).
- Barbagelata, H.H. 2003. *Formación y legislación del trabajo* [Training and labour legislation], CINTERFOR/ILO, (Montevideo, CINTERFOR).
- Bardhan, P. 2001. "Understanding underdevelopment: Challenges for institutional economics from the poor country perspective", in G. Kochendörfer-Lucius; B. Pleskovic (eds): *Institutional foundations of a market economy* (Berlin, German Foundation for International Development (DSE)).
- Boterf, G.L. 1985. "Les apprentis dans le projet d'appui aux petits producteurs urbains de Bamako: Eléments d'une recherche participative et propositions pour l'action", in C. Maldonado; G.L. Boterf (eds): *L'apprentissage et les apprentis dans les petits métiers urbains: Le cas de l'Afrique francophone* (Geneva, International Labour Organization).
- Buechler, H. 1989. "Apprenticeship and transmission of knowledge in La Paz, Bolivia", in M.W. Coy (ed.): *Apprenticeship, from theory to method and back again* (Albany, NY, State University of New York Press), pp. 31-50.
- Brown, J.S.; Collins, A.; Duguid, P. 1989. "Situated cognition and the culture of learning", in *Educational Researcher*, Vol. 18, pp. 32-42.
- Carton, M. 1980. *La formation dans le secteur non structuré* (Geneva, International Labour Organization).
- Castro, C. de Moura; Kempner, K.; Bas, D. 2000. "Apprenticeship: The perilous journey from Germany to Togo", in C. de Moura Castro; K. Schaack; R. Tippelt (eds): *Vocational training at the turn of the century* (Frankfurt am Main, Peter Lang).
- CEDEFOP (European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training). 2006. *Typology of knowledge, skills and competences: Clarification of the concept and prototype*, CEDEFOP Reference Series No. 64 (Luxembourg, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities).
- Collins, A.; Brown, J.S.; Newman, S.E. 1987. *Cognitive apprenticeship: Teaching the craft of reading, writing and mathematics*, Technical Report No. 403, BBN Laboratories (Cambridge, MA, Centre for the Study of Reading, University of Illinois), Jan. 1987.
- Dilley, R.M. 1989. "Secrets and skills: Apprenticeship among Tukolor weavers", in M.W. Coy (ed.): *Apprenticeship, from theory to method and back again* (Albany, NY, State University of New York Press).
- Drazen, A. 2000. *Political economy in macroeconomics* (Princeton, NJ, Princeton University Press), p. 23.

- Fluitman, F. 1992. *Traditional apprenticeship in West Africa: Recent evidence and policy options*, Vocational Training Branch Discussion Paper No. 34 (Geneva, International Labour Organization).
- Oudin, X. 1991. *Skill acquisition and work in micro-enterprises: Evidence from Lomé, Togo*, Vocational Training Branch Discussion Paper No. 31 (Geneva, International Labour Organization).
- Goody, E.N. 1989. “Learning, apprenticeship and the division of labor”, in M.W. Coy (ed.): *Apprenticeship, from theory to method and back again* (Albany, NY, State University of New York Press).
- Granovetter, M. 1985. “Economic action and social structure: The problem of embeddedness”, in *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 91, No. 3, pp. 481-510.
- Haan, H.C. 2006. *Training for work in the informal micro-enterprise sector: Fresh evidence from sub-Saharan Africa*, Technical and Vocational Education and Training: Issues, Concerns and Prospects Vol. 3, UNESCO-UNEVOC Book Series (Dordrecht, Springer Netherlands).
- ; Serrière, N. 2002. *Training for work in the informal sector: Fresh evidence from West and Central Africa*, Turin International Training Centre (ITC) of the ILO Occasional Paper (Turin, ITC/ILO), Aug. 2002.
- Helmke, G.; Levitsky, S. 2003. *Informal institutions and comparative politics: A research agenda*, Kellogg Institute for International Studies Working Paper No. 307 (Notre Dame, Indiana, Kellogg Institute of International Studies). Available at: <http://kellogg.nd.edu/publications/workingpapers/WPS/307.pdf> [8 May 2008].
- International Labour Office (ILO). 2007a. *The informal economy*, Governing Body, 298th Session, Geneva, Mar. 2007, GB.298/ESP/4.
- 2007b. *Portability of skills*, Committee on Employment and Social Policy, Governing Body, 298th Session, Mar. 2007, GB.298/ESP/3.
- 2006. *Employability by improving knowledge and skills*, Governing Body, 295th Session, Geneva, Mar. 2006, GB.295/ESP/2(rev.).
- 2000. *Conclusions concerning human resources training and development*, adopted by the International Labour Conference at its 88th Session, Geneva, June 2000.
- 1993. *Resolution concerning statistics of employment in the informal sector*, adopted by the 15th International Conference of Labour Statisticians (ICLS), Geneva, Jan. 1993.
- ; United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO); United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). 2002. *Roadmap study of the informal sector in Mainland Tanzania*, Apr. 2002 (Dar es Salaam, ILO/UNIDO/UNDP). Also available at: <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/empent/docs/F1061704847/roadmap%20tanzania%20april2002.pdf> [12 May 2008].
- Johanson, R.K.; Adams, A.V. 2004. *Skills development in sub-Saharan Africa* (Washington, DC, World Bank).
- Kazi, S. 1989. “Employment and skill acquisition in the informal sector of Rawalpindi and Laore, Pakistan”, in F. Fluitman (ed.): *Training for work in the informal sector* (Geneva, International Labour Organization), pp. 149-152.

- King, K. 1989. "Training for the urban informal sector in developing countries: Policy issues for practitioners", in F. Fluitman (ed.): *Training for work in the informal sector* (Geneva, International Labour Organization), pp. 17-38.
- Korboe, D. 2001a. *Government of Ghana: Vocational skills and informal sector support project (VSP)*, project evaluation report (draft, 30 June 2001).
- . 2001b. *Ghana: Vocational skills and informal sector support project (VSP): Beneficiary Impact Assessment*, consultancy report for NACVET/World Bank – VSP (Apr. 2001).
- Maldonado, C. 1985. "L'apprentissage et la mise en valeur des qualifications dans les petits métiers en Afrique francophone", in C. Maldonado; G.L. Boterf (eds): *L'apprentissage et les apprentis dans les petits métiers urbains: Le cas de l'Afrique francophone* (Geneva, International Labour Organization).
- Mantzavinos, C. 2001. *Individuals, institutions and markets* (Cambridge, UK, Cambridge University Press), p. 24.
- Meagher, K. 2006. "Social capital or analytical liability? Social networks and African informal economies", in *Global Networks*, Vol. 5, No. 3, pp. 217–238.
- Nölker, H.; Schönfeld, E. 1985. *Glossar: Internationale Berufspädagogik*, German Technical Cooperation (GTZ), Expert Verlag.
- North, D.C. 1990. *Institutions, institutional change and economic performance* (Cambridge, UK, Cambridge University Press).
- Nübler, I. 2006. "Institutions and the finance of general skills training: Evidence from Africa", in D. Kucera and J. Berg (eds): *Labour market institutions in developing countries* (Geneva, International Labour Organization).
- . 2003. "Betriebliche Investitionen in Ausbildung und Berufsbildungspolitik in Entwicklungsländern: Eine Institutionenökonomische Perspektive", in H. Ahrens (ed.): *Neuere Ansätze der theoretischen und empirischen Entwicklungsforschung* (Berlin, Duncker & Humblot).
- . 1997. "Evolutionary theory in education and training: A comparative analysis of France and Germany", in *Vierteljahreshefte zur Wirtschaftsforschung*, Vol. 2, No. 66.
- Ostrom, E. 2005. *Understanding institutional diversity* (Princeton, NJ, Princeton University Press).
- Palmer, R. 2007. "Excitement about growth, disappointment about skills?" in *Norrag News*, No. 38, Jan. 2007 (Network for Policy Research Review and Advice on Education and Training (NORRAG)). Available at: <http://www.norrag.org/pdf/NN38.pdf> [8 May 2008].
- Polanyi, M. 1958. *Personal knowledge: Towards a post-critical philosophy* (Chicago, University of Chicago Press).
- Velenchik, A.D. 1995. "Apprenticeship contracts, small enterprises, and credit markets in Ghana", in *The World Bank Economic Review*, Vol. 9, No. 3, pp. 451-475.
- Walther, R. 2007. *Vocational training in the informal sector. Or how to stimulate the economies of developing countries? Conclusions of a field survey in seven African countries* (with input from E. Filipiak), AFD Research Department (Paris, Agence française de développement (AFD)).

- World Bank. 2001. *Implementation completion report on a loan/credit/grant to Ghana for an education and training project*, draft internal document (Washington, DC).
- . 1995. *Republic of Ghana vocational skills and informal sector support project*, Staff Appraisal Report No.13691-GH (Washington, DC).
- . 1991. *Vocational and technical education and training: A World Bank Policy Paper* (Washington, DC). Available at:
<http://info.worldbank.org/etools/docs/library/74184/winter2002/proceedings/pdfpapers/mod5wbp.pdf> [12 May 2008].

Appendix I: Workshop programme

| THURSDAY, 3 MAY 2007 | |
|--|---|
| Setting the Scene | |
| 9:00 – 9:15 | Opening session Speaker: Christine Evans-Klock <i>(Director, Skills and Employability, ILO)</i> |
| 9:15 - 10:15 | Keynote presentations Speakers: José-Manuel Salazar: Global Employment Agenda and Decent Work <i>(Executive Director, Employment, ILO)</i> Michel Carton: Apprenticeship in the informal economy: Anything new since the 1970s? <i>(Director, Institut universitaire d'études du développement (IUED))</i> Hans Christiaan Haan: New challenges for informal apprenticeship and its potential to adjust <i>(Consultant, UNESCO-UNEVOC)</i> |
| 10:15 – 11:00 | Workshop Introduction and Discussion: <i>Apprenticeship – A multi-dimensional approach</i> Speaker: Irmgard Nübler <i>(Skills and Employability, ILO)</i> Facilitator: Christine Evans-Klock <i>(Skills and Employability, ILO)</i> Rapporteur: Pia Korpinen Questions: - What is the meaning of apprenticeship? - What are the dimensions defining apprenticeship? - How can we conceptualize apprenticeship and the institutions governing it? |
| 11:00 – 11:15 | Coffee break |
| Issues and challenges: An ILO perspective | |
| 11:15 – 13:00 | Panel presentations and discussion Speakers: Emmanuel Reynaud <i>(Social Protection, ILO)</i> Christine Hofmann <i>(Skills and Employability, ILO)</i> Patrick Quinn <i>(International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), ILO)</i> Julika Breyer <i>(Social Finance Programme, ILO)</i> Klaus Haftendorn <i>(Job Creation and Enterprise Development, ILO)</i> Facilitator: Josiane Capt <i>(Skills and Employability, ILO)</i> Rapporteur: Alessandra Molz Questions: - What are the major Decent Work deficits related to apprenticeship in the informal economy? - What are the skills deficits in the area of apprenticeship training? - Which approaches and policies does ILO promote to address these challenges? - What are relevant questions for further research? |

| | |
|---|---|
| | |
| 13:00 – 14:30 | Lunch |
| Upgrading apprenticeship systems in Africa: Experience and lessons from technical cooperation projects | |
| 14:30 – 17:30 | Presentations and discussion |
| 16:00 – 16:15 (coffee break) | <p>Speakers:</p> <p>Tania Haidara <i>(Swisscontact, Mali)</i></p> <p>Edda Grunwald <i>(German Technical Cooperation (GTZ))</i></p> <p>Leoncia Salakana <i>(International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), Tanzania)</i></p> <p>Christian Joussein <i>(Skills and Employability, ILO)</i></p> <p>Hans Christian Haan <i>(UNESCO-UNEVOC)</i></p> <p>Robert Palmer <i>(University of Edinburgh)</i></p> <p>Facilitator:</p> <p>Nicolas Serrière <i>(International Training Centre, ILO)</i></p> <p>Rapporteurs:</p> <p>Heather Labanya, Mouniratou Tangara</p> <p>Questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - What are the objectives of projects and programmes targeting apprenticeship in the informal economy? - Which approaches have been developed to reach these objectives? - What have been the main challenges during implementation? - What lessons can be drawn from these interventions? - What worked well, and why? What did not work so well, and why not? - Which knowledge gaps have been identified? |
| 18:00 | Reception, ILO Restaurant (R2 North) |

FRIDAY, 4 MAY 2007

The institutional framework of apprenticeship systems in West Africa

08:30 – 09:15

Presentations and discussion

Speakers:

Irmgard Nübler
(*Skills and Employability, ILO*)

Sebastian Buckup
(*Skills and Employability, ILO*)

Facilitator:

Emmanuel Reynaud
(*Social Protection, ILO*)

Rapporteur:

Christine Hofmann

Questions:

- How do informal institutions shape the performance of apprenticeship systems in the informal economy with regards to training outcome and development goals?
- What role do social networks play for informal institutions to work?
- What forces induce institutional change?
- What is the meaning of "formalization"?

**Policies and strategies to improve the institutional framework:
Role of governments, employers' and workers' organizations**

9:15 – 9:30

Introductory presentation

Speaker:

**Azita Berar-Awad: Formalization of the informal economy:
Different perspectives**
(*Employment Policy, ILO*)

9:30 – 11:15

Panel presentations and discussion

Speakers:

Richard Walther
(*Agence française de développement (AFD)*)

Robert Palmer
(*University of Edinburgh*)

Tania Haidara
(*Swisscontact, Mali*)

Abdel-Aziz Boutaleb
(*Skills and Employability, ILO*)

Facilitator:

Azita Berar-Awad
(*Employment Policy, ILO*)

Rapporteur:

Alessandra Molz

Questions:

- What policy areas are addressed by governments in West-African countries aiming at promoting apprenticeship training in the informal economy?
- How do present formalization efforts relate to and interact with the existing informal institutions: do formal institutions substitute, complement, accommodate or compete with informal institutions?
- What is the impact of policies in terms of training, development and decent work objectives?
- What have been major impediments to change and reform?
- What is the role of employers' and workers' associations in promoting apprenticeship in the informal economy?
- What lessons can we learn from country experience and what is good practice?

| | |
|---|---|
| 11:15 – 11:30 | Coffee break |
| Looking ahead: Knowledge gaps and research questions | |
| 11:30 – 13:00 | <p>Guided discussion</p> <p>Speakers: Richard Walther <i>(Agence française de développement (AFD))</i> Robert Palmer <i>(University of Edinburgh)</i> Emmanuel Reynaud <i>(Social Protection, ILO)</i></p> <p>Facilitator: Irmgard Nübler <i>(Skills and Employability, ILO)</i></p> <p>Rapporteur: Frédérique Weyer</p> <p>Questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - What are the ongoing and planned research programmes in the area of informal training systems, and to what extent is informal apprenticeship a focus? - What additional research questions need to be addressed? - How could we best develop synergy effects through cooperation? |
| 13:00 – 13:15 | Closing session |

Appendix II: List of participants

| Surname | First name | Organization | Title |
|-------------|-----------------|---|--------------------|
| Berar Awad | Azita | ILO, Employment Policy Department | Director |
| Boutaleb | Abdel-Aziz | ILO, Skills and Employability Department | Senior expert |
| Breyer | Julika | ILO, Social Finance Department | Junior expert |
| Buckup | Sebastian | ILO, Skills and Employability Department | Junior expert |
| Capt | Josiane | ILO, Skills and Employability Department | Senior expert |
| Carton | Michel | Institut universitaire d'études du développement (IUED) | Director |
| Diouf | Papa Ndiaye | Institut universitaire d'études du développement (IUED) | Researcher |
| Evans-Klock | Christine | ILO, Skills and Employability Department | Director |
| Gasskov | Vladimir | ILO, Skills and Employability Department | Senior expert |
| Grunwald | Edda | German Technical Cooperation (GTZ) | Senior expert |
| Haan | Hans Christiaan | UNESCO-UNEVOC | Consultant |
| Haftendorn | Klaus | ILO, Job Creation and Enterprise Development Department | Senior expert |
| Haidara | Tania | Swisscontact | Senior expert |
| Hofmann | Christine | ILO, Skills and Employability Department | Junior expert |
| Huber | Ruth | SDC, Swiss Development Cooperation | Senior expert |
| Joussein | Christian | ILO, Skills and Employability Department | Senior expert |
| Korpinen | Pia | ILO, Skills and Employability Department | Junior expert |
| Labanya | Heather | ILO, Skills and Employability Department | Junior expert |
| Molz | Alessandra | ILO, International Training Centre Turin | Junior expert |
| Nübler | Irmgard | ILO, Skills and Employability Department | Senior expert |
| Oumarou | Moussa | ILO, Social Dialogue Department | Senior expert |
| Palmer | Robert | University of Edinburgh | Researcher |
| Phan | Thuy | ILO, International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour | Senior expert |
| Quinn | Patrick | ILO, International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour | Senior expert |
| Rei | Diego | ILO, Youth Employment Programme | Junior expert |
| Reynaud | Emmanuel | ILO, Social Protection Sector | Director |
| Salakana | Leoncia | ILO, International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour | Senior expert |
| Salazar | José-Manuel | ILO, Employment Sector | Executive Director |
| Serriere | Nicolas | ILO, International Training Centre Turin | Senior expert |
| Tangara | Mouniratou | ILO, Skills and Employability Department | Junior expert |
| Walther | Richard | Agence française de développement (AFD) | Consultant |
| Weyer | Frédérique | Institut universitaire d'études du développement (IUED) | Researcher |
| Windell | James | ILO, Skills and Employability Department | Senior expert |

Employment Reports

2008

- 1 Apprenticeship in the informal economy in Africa - Workshop report
Geneva, 3-4 May 2007

**More publications of the Employment Sector can be found on:
<http://www.ilo.org/employment>**

Employment Sector

**For more information visit our site:
<http://www.ilo.org/employment>**

International Labour Office
Employment Sector
4, route des Morillons
CH-1211 Geneva 22

Email: edempdoc@ilo.org