



ILO EVALUATION

- **Evaluation Title:** [Creating a Conducive Environment for the Effective recognition and Implementation of Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work](#)
- **ILO TC/SYMBOL:** [EGY/11/03/USA](#)
- **Type of Evaluation :** [Mid-term](#) (final, midterm, external, joint)
- **Country(ies) :** [Egypt](#)
- **Date of the evaluation:** [December 2014](#)
- **Name of consultant(s):** [Nahla Hassan \(please send the CV to EVAL@ilo.org\)](#)
- **ILO Administrative Office:** [CO/Cairo](#)
- **ILO Technical Backstopping Office:**
- **Date project ends:** [August 2015](#)
- **Donor: country and budget US\$** [USA USD 6,435,643](#)
- **Evaluation Manager:** [Yasmine El-Essawy](#)

[This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the ILO Evaluation Unit.](#)

Table of Contents

1. Executive summary.....	2
2. Acronyms.....	10
4. Project Description	11
Project Overview	11
5. Evaluation Objectives	1
Purpose	1
Scope	1
Clients	1
6. Evaluation Methodology	2
Evaluation Questions	2
Methodological Approach	2
Data Collection methods	2
Limitations	3
7. Evaluation Findings.....	4
Relevance and Validity of Design	4
Strategic Fit and Coherence	4
Appropriateness of Project Design and Theory of Change	5
Relevance of Monitoring and Evaluation Systems	8
Project Effectiveness	9
Progress towards Objectives	9
Context and Implementation Challenges.....	20
Effectiveness of implementation strategies.....	21
Managing Partnerships.....	23
Project’s Monitoring Systems.....	24
8. Efficiency of Resource use	26
Financial Resource Management	26
Human Resource Management	27
9. Impact and Sustainability	27
Main Intermediate Results	27
Potential for Sustainability	28
10. Conclusions	29
11. Recommendations	30
12. Lessons learned and Good Practices	32

1. Executive summary

Project Description

Creating a conducive environment for the effective recognition and implementation of fundamental principles and rights at work in Egypt project has a total budget of USD 6,435,643. The project works on two key components the first focusing on the promoting and raising awareness concerning the fundamental principles and rights at work and the second focuses on women employment. In August 2011, the International Labor Organization (ILO) received an initial fund of USD 1,458,148 from the US department of state to implement a project focused on the promotion of fundamental rights and principles at work. In September 2011, an addendum was added to this project with the amount of USD 4,950,495. This addendum widened the scope of the project to include women's rights and participation in the Egyptian labor market.

The project focuses on critical and important aspects related to labour and rights in Egypt. Addressing these rights is important and is more effective in the context of policies and an environment for job-rich and inclusive economic growth. The growth in the recent past in Egypt has not been generating sufficient productive employment opportunities, and women's rights and job opportunities in particular have been severely hampered. Women continue to face additional constraints in the labour market and are not adequately represented in social and labour market policy decision-making processes which affect their employment opportunities. The lack of possibilities to participate in labour markets not only restricts their economic empowerment in families and the society as a whole; it also limits their options to participate in social dialogue and social development of their country.

Evaluation Objectives and Methodology

The project has been working since August 2011 when the Award Agreement was signed as such, and as per ILO regulations, the project was scheduled to undergo an independent mid-term evaluation. The main purposes of this evaluation is to:

- i.* Give an independent assessment of progress to date of the project across all outcomes; assessing performance as per the foreseen targets and indicators of achievement; strategies and implementation modalities chosen; partnership arrangements, constraints and opportunities;
- ii.* Provide strategic and operational recommendations as well as highlight lessons to improve performance and delivery of project results

The evaluation questions are organized using the results-based framework and are intended to provide an assessment of the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and potential sustainability of the project's interventions. The independent mid-term evaluation was qualitative in nature. Quantitative data was collected from existing project documents. The evaluation used five data collection methods: 1) review of documents, 2) review of operating and financial data, 3) face-to-face and telephone interviews with key informants, 4) focus group discussions and in-depth interviews during field visits, and 5) a stakeholder debrief. The main findings of the evaluation are organized to respond to the evaluation questions.

Relevance and Validity of Design

The conducive environment project is well suited to the ILO mandate, strategies and priorities for Egypt and UNDAF as it comprises components focusing on women economic development, promoting fundamental principles and rights at work, economic empowerment through skills training and job placement. In addition, the project design encompasses awareness raising and policy level advocacy. As such the project is aligned with the priorities of the national outcome plans as it aims to promote the establishment of enterprises and cooperatives and increase the number of micro, small and medium enterprises in Egypt. The circumstances during which the project was conceived negatively affected its design. The project received initial funding for its first three objectives and then a second round of funds were available and the subsequent addition of the last three objectives without a comprehensive revision of the project document. As a matter of fact, the project has two project documents. At the moment it seems that two projects are in operation. The project's theory of change doesn't appear, as far as documentary evidence suggests, to have taken in consideration the political and socio-economic turmoil that the country has witnessed between January 2011 and the beginning of the project in October 2011. The causal relationship between the outcomes and outputs can be generally observed for each of the objectives individually. However, there is a clear need to develop vertical linkages amongst the six objectives to increase coherence and logic.

In terms of addressing women's needs in particular, the project has successfully addressed women trade unionists recognizing that they face different challenges than men. In addition, the project sought to create employment opportunities for marginalized women – particularly women with disabilities. The project could be said to have addressed some of the needs of women in general related to awareness raising on ILO fundamental principles and rights at work; awareness raising on the national labour law including duties and rights at work, initiative approaches for women's needs to access the market.

The Conducive environment developed an implementation plan as well as an M&E/results framework system. The two documents provide an overall guidance on project activities and expected results. It is important to note that neither the award agreement for the first three objectives nor the proposal for the project's cost amendment describe any form of indicators against which an assessment of appropriateness could be developed. However, the project developed an M&E system/results framework to monitor progress and achievement towards indicators. The relevance and quality of the project's M&E system is not uniform. For example the first three objectives do not have numerical targets whereas the last three objectives have numerical targets. Most importantly, the project document lacks a logical framework showing vertical and horizontal linkages between the six objectives and how the expected results all contribute to creating a conducive environment for the effective recognition and implementation of fundamental principles and rights at work.

Project Effectiveness

The overall environment in which the project was in no way linear, rather it could be said to have witnessed sharp and consecutive changes making it very difficult for the project to maintain a good implementation rate. The project witnessed 8 cabinet reshuffles, each time this brought with it changes in the leadership of MOMM. This usually necessitated a re-

introduction of the project to MOMM senior management and agreeing on a plan for implementation. This was always a lengthy process which affected the ability of the project to implement its activities with MOMM in a timely fashion.

The conducive environment project has six objectives.

Objective 1: Expand awareness and understanding of fundamental principles and rights at work and their linkages with democracy and sustainable development

This objective had two outputs; National public campaign launched on FPRW; and communication and outreach strategies launched by social partners' organizations.

The project had a large awareness raising and training component. The project trained a very significant number of constituents in the various activities conducted since October 2011. The project organized a total of four awareness raising seminars for 112 journalists and media personal; 196 experts and trainers; and 1,219 workers trained on FPRW and labour relations in general. The workshops were organized to raise awareness about FPRW and related ILO conventions. Journalists and media personal training a number of the participants produced and published good quality articles and media coverage on FPRW, right to collective bargaining, and social dialogue concepts.

It is estimated that 40-50% of this objective has been achieved. The ground work, in terms of training and production of material has been accomplished. The project needs to focus on achieving the second output.

Objective 2: Enhance the capacity of the labour administration to promote and implement public policies, national labour legislation, and sound industrial relations

The project's second objective has two outputs as follows; senior management unit better equipped to improve governance and effectiveness of the labour administration and labour officers acquire modern skills to promote and implement fundamental rights at work and sound industrial relations. The project organized a national seminar in October 2012 on the roles, missions, and structures of MOMM. The seminar was attended by 120 MOMM senior officials and with the participation of the Minister of Manpower and Migration at the time. The project also focused on printing a number of manuals and brochures that the team intends to use in future activities. This evaluation has found that 30 to 40% of this objective has been achieved. Again the ground work for the delivery of the selected outputs has been made. It is important for the project to focus on achieving the outputs.

Objective 3: Enhance the institutional capacity of independent unions and employers' organizations to effectively exercise the rights of freedom of association and collective bargaining

The project selected two outputs for this objective namely new and emerging trade unions are better equipped to represent their constituents and Bi-partite social dialogue and collective bargaining promoted at the national and sectoral levels. This objective can be considered achieved. The project provided numerous trainings to both employers' and workers'

organizations. In addition, the project supported the establishment of a bi-partite committee in Port Said.

Objectives 4, 5, 6 had an overarching goal **to promote women’s fundamental rights and employment opportunities, through policy support and direct interventions at the national, local and individual levels. The below table gives an overview of objectives 4 & 5.**

Objective	Outputs	Status
4. Improving the rights and policy environment for women in Egypt	Output 1: Knowledge base on women’s fundamental labour rights and employment situation in labour markets strengthened and awareness created at the national level;	Partially achieved.
	Output 2: Capacity built within the MOMM on women’s rights and women’s employment and a gender unit created within the MOMM;	Not achieved (pending signing of MoU with MoMM)
	Output 3: Tripartite committee on women’s fundamental rights and labour force participation is set up and a policy framework on women’s rights and employment is developed;	Not achieved (pending signing of MoU with MoMM)
	Output 4: Increased capacity and representation of women in policy-making spaces (labour administration, trade unions and employers organizations and tripartite bodies);	Achieved
	Output 5: Capacity built for NGOs working in the area of equality on labour markets to provide assistance for women in promoting their fundamental rights;	Not achieved (agreement signed with service provider to start implementation)
	Output 6: Promotion of women’s participation in labour markets and their fundamental rights through information networks, awareness campaigns and targeted training programme on women’s rights under national labour legislation,	On-going
5: Providing vulnerable groups of women with skills that will increase their employability and assisting them in finding decent job opportunities	Output 1: Increased skills for women in the area of computer skills and language skills	Not achieved (service contracts signed with service providers. Implementation should start)
	Output 2: Multi-facetted support for women in the informal economy to improve their economic situation, to capitalize on skills gained through informal apprenticeship systems, and to improve	Cannot be determined because different project documents report

	<p>access to formal institutions of finance and other services</p> <p>Two indicators are selected by the project to assess achievement of this output they are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 8,000 women have acquired new skills to better meet current labour market needs - Provide 5000 vulnerable women with skills and job opportunities in the private/public sectors 	different information
	<p><u>Output 3: Better equipped Public Employment Services to be able to handle the specific needs of women</u></p>	Not achieved (pending signing of MoU with MoMM)

Objective 6: Enable women to create and run their own enterprises. According to the project document and the project’s IP and M&E plan this objective has five outputs. Available information from project documents and data collection during the course of this evaluation suggest that some progress has been made towards outputs 1,2 and 3. (Output 1: Improved business support available for women through gender mainstreaming in business and financial services (such as microfinance and banking institutions, business service providers); Output 2: Training and supports for women entrepreneurs in urban and rural areas (targeting young women from vocational institutes in urban areas and women in MSEs in rural areas) and linking women with other business related supports (such as management training, coaching, financial literacy, registration, mentoring, networking and micro insurance). Output 3: Women entrepreneurs supported in creating social enterprises such as cooperatives and associations.

These three outputs still require follow-up from project staff, however, they can be considered partially achieved as most of the training has already been conducted. The trainees, at the time of this evaluation, were considering how to start their own businesses. Some have already started small income generating activities.

Little or no activities have started to implement outputs 4 and 5; { Output 4: Develop a national action plan on Women's Entrepreneurship Development (WED), which builds upon existing studies, identifies policy gaps and develops recommendations for an enabling environment for WED; Output 5: Run a rigorous impact assessment of the women's entrepreneurship training based on a control group approach, helping to create more evidence on the effectiveness of active labour market interventions in Egypt.}

The project has laid the ground work for these outputs either through signing of agreements with entities or consultants.

Objectives 4, 5, and 6 have numerical targets at the output level. They are confusing and not clear. It is not clear how the numbers are collected and whether double counting exists or no. in

the absence of a tracking system or a data base it is also very difficult to estimate the percentage of advancement. Available information in project documents as well as data collection during the course of this evaluation suggest that a lot of ground work has been accomplished towards meeting these objectives. However, there are some outputs that have not been achieved at all (output 4 and 5 for objective 6) and (outputs 2 and 3 for objective 4). Perhaps objective 6 is the one with the most confusing data. The main reason is the lack of clarity regarding the actual targets. Also, numerical targets should be allocated at the objective level to facilitate monitoring.

An analysis of financial data available suggest that the overall percentage of advancement of the project is about between 40 and 50% (burn rate is at 41%. As such, it is difficult to expect the project to be able to meet its stated objectives by the closing date of August 2015.

There are two key factors that have affected the effectiveness of the project. The most critical of them is the design of the project. By focusing on the first three objectives mainly during the first three years of the project, this has reduced the timely implementation of objectives 5 and 6.¹ Furthermore, in terms of design, objective 4 could have benefited from being integrated in the remaining objectives to increase relevance and synergy amongst the various components of the project. However, it is noted that as of November 2012, the gender perspective was added to trainings and awareness raising activities of the project. The second key factor is the weakness of the conceptual framework of the project and hence the weakness of the monitoring system.

More activities have taken place under the first three objectives than the last three objectives. There is a need to focus on achieving outputs and numerical targets.

The project did not have a designated M&E officer until the beginning of December 2014. The functions of the M&E were divided between the project's technical officers. As such each member of the project team was responsible for an objective and the implementation of the activities corresponding to this objective without having someone create the necessary linkages amongst the various activities. In addition team members were preoccupied with implementing the activities and not necessarily monitoring the quality of the outputs.

Efficiency of resource Use

The conducive environment has an overall budget of USD 6,435,643. At the moment the burn rate of the project is low at 41% with less than one year till its expected conclusion. The low burn rate is due to several implementation challenges that the project faced since its inception. It is one of the recommendations of this evaluation that following a review of project objectives and targets, a no-cost extension can be requested from the donor.

Generally speaking the project has allocated resources to achieve expected outcomes and outputs. However, as previously explained the project faced delays in implementation. Despite

¹ According to project team this was mainly due to the fact that there was no team for Obj. 4, 5& 6 till end of 2012. The project's Senior Technical Officer for Women's Employment only joined at the end of November 2012, and the national enterprise coordinator joined in May 2013.

the support and technical coaching offered to the project team through the program unit and specialists in ILO Cairo, the project is generally under-staffed. This is particularly the case regarding the M&E functions of the project.

Impact and Sustainability

It is still rather difficult to assess the intermediate results of the component focusing on women employment since most of the work on that component has only started close a year ago. Nonetheless, an important result that can be directly attributed to the project is the provision of 1375 new job opportunity to vulnerable women. The project has an exit strategy only for the last three objectives. The project should develop a holistic exit strategy that encompasses both components of the project with clear roles, responsibilities and timeframe for implementation. As it stands the exit strategy is achievable but requires creation of linkages amongst the various levels.

Conclusions

Creating a conducive environment for the effective recognition and implementation of fundamental principles and rights at work in Egypt is an ambitious project that has sought to work on six objectives to produce 20 outputs over the course of four years. Although, under normal economic and political circumstances this would have been a challenging attempt, the situation in Egypt since the start of the project has been constantly changing at times at very fast rhythm. The project is generally well suited to the priorities of the ILO and the development priorities for Egypt.

The project made some good progress towards its targets but still requires additional time to be able to fully meet its objectives. There is an obvious need to revise targets and intended outcomes to be able to meet the targets of the project. Three years after the inception of the project the burn rate is only 41% indicating that more effort needs to be placed in prioritizing what could be achievable.

Recommendations

The following recommendations could help increase the projects overall relevance, effectiveness and intended impact:

- Reformulate the objectives and outputs and merge similar ones. The project could consider omitting all together outputs that it has not started working towards to capitalize its resources in an effective and efficient manner.
- Once a review of objectives and targets has been concluded, consider requesting a no-cost extension.
- Develop a comprehensive M&E system clearly establishing the change the project aims to achieve and revising the human resource structure and monitoring tools accordingly.
- Ensure the timely completion of the protocol for cooperation with MOMM.
- Mainstream gender issues within the structures of social partners, particularly workers' organizations.

- Conduct a study to grasp the potential challenges that can face Cooperatives and establish the necessary strategies to mitigate those challenges.

Lessons Learned and Good Practices

- Continuous engagement with NGOs and CSOs concerned with women economic empowerment will help spread awareness of ILO tools and methodologies and support the empowerment of women.
- Working on issues pertaining to freedom of association and collective bargaining in Egypt is a complicated process. It requires the coordination with various entities most notably the Ministry of Manpower and Migration. Developing a protocol of cooperation between the project and the ministry at the beginning of the project could have saved the project many unnecessary delays.
- Lack of a comprehensive M&E system affects all aspects of the project. M&E systems should be developed immediately following the signing of agreements with donors. The system should clearly state a project goal, develop vertical and horizontal linkages amongst the objectives and outputs, and design M&E processes and tools.

2. Acronyms

ACTRAV	Bureau for Workers' Activities
CAPSCU	Center for Advancement of Post-Graduate Studies and Research
CIDA	Canadian International Development Aid
EDLC	Egyptian Democratic Labor Congress
EFITU	Egyptian Federation of Independent Trade Unions
ETUF	Egyptian Trade Union Federation
FEI	Federation of Egyptian Industries
FORTE	Forum for Training and Education
FPRW	Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work
ILO	International Labor Organization
ITUC	International Trade Unions Confederation
MOMM	Ministry of Manpower and Migration
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
TRIA	Tenth of Ramadan Industrial Association
TOR	Terms of Reference
USDOL	United States Department of Labor
USDOS	US Department of State

4. Project Description

Project Overview

Creating a conducive environment for the effective recognition and implementation of fundamental principles and rights at work in Egypt project has a total budget of USD 6,435,643. The project works on two key components the first focuses on promoting and raising awareness concerning the fundamental principles and rights at work and the second focuses on women employment. The project started in August 2011 when the International Labor Organization (ILO) received an initial fund of USD 1,458,148 from the US department of state to implement a project focused on the promotion of fundamental rights and principles at work. In September 2011, an addendum was added to this project with the amount of USD 4,950,495. This addendum widened the scope of the project to include women's rights and participation in the Egyptian labor market.

The project has six objectives but no overarching goal. However, objectives 4, 5 and 6 have a goal ***to promote women's fundamental rights and employment opportunities, through policy support and direct interventions at the national, local and individual levels***. Table 1 below provides an overview of the project's objectives and expected outputs as intended in the project documents. The project further has numerical targets as follows:

- Train 5000 women on labour laws and FPRW
- Train 100 woman in Management and Leadership skills
- Train 15,000 woman on new skills to enable them to join the labour market
- Create 5000 jobs for women
- 1000 woman start their own enterprises

At the time of its inception, the project's first three objectives were considered the same as another ILO implemented project focusing on social dialogue and funded by the US department of Labour; ***Promoting Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and Social Dialogue in Egypt***. The later was implemented between June 2008 and June 2014 with a budget of USD 2,900,000. Since creating a conducive environment project started after the fundamental principles project, the ILO sought to capitalize on the existing resources and both projects were cost-shared until June 2014. The cost-sharing focused only on the first four objectives of the creating a conducive environment project. In an attempt to increase collaboration and cohesion between both projects, they had the same Chief technical Advisor (CTA). Creating a conducive environment for the effective recognition and implementation of fundamental principles and rights at work in Egypt expected to be concluded by August 2015.

The project works with the key social partners namely the ministry of manpower and migration, employers' organizations and workers' organizations. The project worked mainly with independent trade unions and sector-specific unions. In addition, the project partners with a number of training institutions and NGOs for the implementation of the women employment component.

Table 1: Project Objectives and expected outputs.

Objectives	Outputs
1: Expand Awareness and understanding of fundamental principles and rights at work and their linkages with democracy and sustainable development.	1: National public campaign launched on FPRW; 2: Communication and outreach strategies launched by social partners' organizations
2: Enhance the capacity of the labour administration to promote and implement public policies, national labour legislation and sound industrial relations.	1: Senior Management unit better equipped to improve governance and effectiveness of labour administration 2: labour officers acquire modern skills to implement FPRW and sound industrial relations
3: Enhance the institutional capacity of independent trade unions and employers' organizations to effectively exercise the rights of freedom of association and collective bargaining.	1: new and emerging trade unions are better equipped to represent their constituents 2: bi-partite social dialogue and collective bargaining are promoted at the national and sectoral levels.
<i>Goal: promote women's fundamental rights and employment opportunities, through policy support and direct interventions at the national, local and individual levels</i>	
4: Improving the rights and policy environment for women in Egypt.	1: Knowledge base on women's fundamental labour rights and employment situation in labour markets strengthened and awareness created at the national level 2: Capacity built within the MOMM on women's rights and women's employment and a gender unit created within the MOMM 3: Tripartite committee on women's fundamental rights and labour force participation is set up and a policy framework on women's rights and employment is developed 4: Increased capacity and representation of women in policy-making spaces (labour administration, trade unions and employers organizations and tripartite bodies) 5: Capacity built for NGOs working in the area of equality on labour markets to provide assistance for women in promoting their fundamental rights. 6: Promotion of women's participation in labour markets and their fundamental rights through information networks, awareness campaigns and targeted training programme on women's rights under national labour legislation

<p>5: Providing vulnerable groups of women with skills that will increase their employability and assisting them in finding decent job opportunities.</p>	<p>1: Increased skills for women in the area of computer skills and language skills 2: Multi-faceted support for women in the informal economy to improve their economic situation, to capitalize on skills gained through informal apprenticeship systems, and to improve access to formal institutions of finance and other services 3: Better equipped Public Employment Services to be able to handle the specific needs of women</p>
<p>6: Enable more women to create and run their own enterprise.</p>	<p>Output 1: Improved business supports available for women through gender mainstreaming in business and financial services (such as microfinance and banking institutions, business service providers). Output 2: Training and supports for women entrepreneurs in urban and rural areas (targeting young women from vocational institutes in urban areas and women in MSEs in rural areas) and linking women with other business related supports (such as management training, coaching, financial literacy, registration, mentoring, networking and micro insurance). Output 3: Women entrepreneurs supported in creating social enterprises such as cooperatives and associations Output 4: Develop a national action plan on Women's Entrepreneurship Development (WED), which builds upon existing studies, identifies policy gaps and develops recommendations for an enabling environment for WED. Output 5: Run a rigorous impact assessment of the women's entrepreneurship training based on a control group approach, helping to create more evidence on the effectiveness of active labour market interventions in Egypt.</p>

5. Evaluation Objectives

Purpose

According to the TORs, the stated purposes of this evaluation are:

- iii.* Give an independent assessment of progress to date of the project across the all outcomes; assessing performance as per the foreseen targets and indicators of achievement; strategies and implementation modalities chosen; partnership arrangements, constraints and opportunities;
- iv.* Provide strategic and operational recommendations as well as highlight lessons to improve performance and delivery of project results

In addition the specific objectives of this evaluation as stated in the TORs are:

- Assess the relevance and coherence of project's design.
- Assessing to what extent the stated objectives and outputs are being achieved; and to provide an estimate of the status of completion of results (achieved, in progress, pending) and percentage of progress per category (objective, output, activities) Assess the external and internal challenges and opportunities for the timely implementation of the project.
- Review the efficiency and effectiveness of the project implementation framework and management arrangements.
- Assess the relevance of the project in regards of country needs and how the project is perceived and valued by the target groups
- Provide recommendations on how to build on the achievements of the project and ensure that it is sustained by the relevant stakeholders.
- Review and provide recommendations regarding the sustainability strategy of the project for the remaining period, and if possible suggest avenues for additional activities.
- Document lessons learned and good practices in order to maximize the experience gained.

Scope

The evaluation considers the full geographical breadth of the project, including both national and localised interventions. In preparing its inception report, the evaluator determined a sample of localised interventions to be examined. It considered project implementation from start to the actual timing of the evaluation.

Clients

The primary clients of this evaluation are the ILO management (the ILO DWT/CO Cairo, ILO/FPRW, and Regional Office for Africa), project staff, constituents, key national stakeholders and the donor. Secondary clients include other project stakeholders (key Ministries, NGO, embassies, etc.) and other units within the ILO that may indirectly benefit from the knowledge generated by the evaluation.

6. Evaluation Methodology

Evaluation Questions

The evaluation questions are organized using the results-based framework and are intended to provide an assessment of the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and potential sustainability of the project's interventions

Methodological Approach

This is a qualitative evaluation. Quantitative data was collected from existing project documents. The evaluation used five data collection methods: 1) review of documents, 2) review of operating and financial data, 3) face-to-face and telephone interviews with key informants, 4) focus group discussions and in-depth interviews during field visits, and 5) a stakeholder debrief. The mid-term evaluation was conducted in stages. During the first stage preliminary meetings with project staff were conducted. The purpose of the preliminary meetings was to collect all relevant project documents, agree on a work plan and collectively identify the key stakeholders and partners to be interviewed. Following this, the evaluator developed an inception report and shared it with the evaluation manager. The third stage focused on data collection and the fourth on data analysis and report writing. The field work for this evaluation took place 9-29 December 2014.

Data Collection methods

Data for this evaluation was collected through different means including document review, meetings, focus group discussions, in-depth interviews and a final stakeholders debrief meeting.

Document Review: The evaluator reviewed the following documents before conducting any interviews or field visits.

- The project document
- Cooperative agreement
- Technical progress reports and comments
- Reports on specific project activities
- Training materials
- Trip reports, field visits, meetings, needs assessments and other reports
- Strategic framework, PMP, and performance indicators
- Work plans
- Review of operating and financial data

Interviews with key informants: Interviews were conducted with key program stakeholders (by phone or in-person) including (but not limited to):

- Project implementation team
- Key stakeholders
- Project partners

- Other stakeholders²

Fieldwork: The evaluator met and interviewed the project team in Cairo and with the backstopping Officer in Geneva. The evaluator also met and interviewed a wide range of project stakeholders, partners and beneficiaries. The selection of key stakeholders was completed in close collaboration with the project team. All efforts were made to ensure that the evaluator saw and visited places where successes have occurred as well as challenges.

Menya governorate was initially selected as a location where some field work can take place. However, following discussions with project staff it was noted that at the moment no activities were taking place in Menya and that it would be difficult for the project partners to organize meetings with beneficiaries. Accordingly one project partner from Menya with whom the project is currently planning to implement activities were asked to meet the evaluator in Cairo.

Stakeholder debriefing: The evaluator conducted a debriefing meeting with project staff and key stakeholders to present and discuss initial findings. This meeting served as a validation exercise where feedback on findings was collected to support the report writing process.³

Report writing: following the completion of data analysis, a draft report was prepared and presented for review and comments to the evaluation manager.

Limitations

The evaluator was commissioned in June 2014 to conduct the final evaluation of the USDOL funded project Promoting Fundamental Principles and Rights at work and social dialogue in Egypt. This project shared three objectives with the current project under review. As such the Ministry of Manpower and Migration (MOMM) – a key stakeholder – officially refused to meet with the evaluator⁴. This is a major limitation of this evaluation. The evaluator resorted to previously collected data to assess the value added of the first three objectives of this project. Response to the evaluation report from MOMM indicate that as far as the ministry is concerned there is no difference between the two projects. As such MOMM believed that since they have met the evaluator in June 2014 for the Fundamental Principles project, there was no need to meet the evaluator again for Conducive Environment.

The third limitation was the inability of the evaluator to visit diverse project sites. All data collection took place in Cairo and Tenth of Ramadan Industrial City (Sharqia Governorate). This is due to the fact that no project activities are currently taking place in other governorates. Project activities in other governorates have been concluded.

² A complete list of the field work schedule is available in Annex 1.

³ A list of stakeholders' meeting attendees is available in Annex 2

⁴ The letter of refusal is available in Annex 3.

7. Evaluation Findings

This section presents the evaluation findings. It is divided into four subsections directly responding to the TORs questions. A separate section for lessons learned and good practices is available at the end of the report.

Relevance and Validity of Design

Strategic Fit and Coherence

Creating a conducive environment for the effective recognition and implementation of fundamental rights and principles at work in Egypt (Hereinafter *Conducive Environment Project*) encompasses two main components one focusing on advocacy and policy and the second on actual training and job creation targeting vulnerable women. In other words, the project has an upstream and downstream approach. The conducive environment project is well suited for the ILO mandate, strategies and priorities for Egypt and UNDAF as it comprises components focusing on women economic development, promoting fundamental principles and rights at work, economic empowerment through skills training and job placement. In addition, the project design encompasses awareness raising and policy level advocacy. As such the project is aligned with the priorities of the national development plan, the UNDAF and the ILO DW strategy for North Africa.

The circumstances during which the project was conceived negatively affected its design. The project works on two main broad themes namely the promotion of fundamental principles and rights at work from a policy point of view and women's employability and market share from a job creation stand point. These two broad categories are not necessarily mutually exclusive, rather complementarity could be developed between upstream and downstream if the conceptual design created linkages and synergies for both to feed into each other. In the case of the conducive environment project, the first three objectives are coherent and logical and feed into each other and the last three are the same but they lack linkages amongst the first three and the last three. Two separate project documents have been developed for the 2 sets of components and at different times. This has made it appear as if two projects were being implemented at the same time using the same pool of resources. According to project staff, the CTA asked the Senior Technical Officer to ensure that gender is mainstreamed in all the training programs and workshops that were developed under Obj. 1, 2 & 3.

An additional layer of complexity of this project is the fact that it started implementing its activities in October 2011; a few months after the eruption of the January 25th revolution in Egypt. The project started implementation while a second US government funded project *Promoting the Fundamental Principles and Rights at work and Social Dialogue in Egypt (2008-2014)* was also being implemented by the ILO. Due to the fact that both projects shared three objectives, the new project inherited the legacy and the challenges faced by the older project particularly in what concerns working with the Ministry of Manpower and Migration (MOMM) and the Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI).

In sum, the project is strategically well suited to the ILO and UNDAF strategies and priorities in Egypt. It encompasses many activities and components that fit well with the overall economic development objectives of Egypt. The project has two sets of objectives each set is coherent and logical, and despite the team effort, more synergies and vertical linkages need to be developed between the objectives to increase coherence and effectiveness of project implementation.

Appropriateness of Project Design and Theory of Change

The conducive environment project has coordinated its activities with several projects implemented by the ILO in Egypt. It capitalized on resources and opportunities from other donors and projects to advance its activities. For starters the project cost shared its first three objectives with the *Promoting the Fundamental Principles and Rights at work and Social Dialogue*. The two projects shared the same CTA and key staff members focusing on workers and employees' organizations. This helped ensure the absence of duplication of effort and resources. Although, at times this created some difficulties for the implementation of some project components, yet the arrangement is methodologically sound and efficient. In addition, the project collaborates with other projects implemented by the ILO in Egypt. The project collaborates in joint activities with Promoting Worker's Rights and Competiveness in Egypt's Export Industries project funded by the US department of Labour. In addition, the project works closely with other projects such as Decent Jobs for Egypt's Young People Project in Egypt (DJEPE); funded by CIDA; Career Guidance for Youth and Job Creation in Egypt; funded by the Italian Cooperation Agency; Decent Jobs for Egypt's Young People, Tackling the Challenge of Young People in Rural Areas; Funded by Australia Aid.

Although cooperation and coordination amongst projects are sound and efficient development practices, yet the design of the project encompassing upstream and downstream components was rather challenging. Despite the lack of harmony between the two sets of objectives of the project, yet all objectives Promoting fundamental principles and rights at work and social dialogue, and the ILO in Egypt in general, faced serious challenges in its relationship with MOMM and FEI. This has affected the conducive environment as well. As far as the social partners could tell, there was no distinction between the two projects as such what affected one necessarily affected the other. The conducive environment has a strong gender focus, however, this focus is only visible in the last three objectives. It is important to note, however, that although the first three objectives of the conducive environment were similar to those of the promoting fundamental principles and rights at work, they were not identical. As such, the conducive environment could have developed different activities and implementation strategies than the fundamental principles and rights project. The two could have coordinated on some activities but not necessarily all of them.

Conducive Environment	Promoting Fundamental Principles and Rights
Obj. 1: Expand Awareness and understanding of fundamental principles and rights at work and their linkages with democracy and	Immediate Objective 1: Workers and employers are more knowledgeable of their rights and obligations and are increasingly

sustainable development.	engaging in constructive dialogue and negotiations.
Obj. 3: Enhance the institutional capacity of independent trade unions and employers' organizations to effectively exercise the rights of freedom of association and collective bargaining.	Immediate Objective 2: Independent, competent and representative employers' and workers' organizations which are able to better represent and defend the interests of their members.
Obj. 2: Enhance the capacity of the labour administration to promote and implement public policies, national labour legislation and sound industrial relations	Immediate Objective3: The Ministry of Manpower has a strengthened capacity to prevent and settle labor disputes.

A comparison between the first three objectives of the two projects shows that although they shared many similarities particularly their target groups, basically the three social partners, different activities and results could have been achieved through these objectives. The first three objectives of the conducive environment are so broadly formulated that a more effective and relevant implementation strategy could have focused on piloting the work with specific organizations in order to capitalise on existing resources. For example immediate objective 3 of the promoting fundamental principles project focused specifically on prevention and settlement of labour disputes. Whereas objective 2 of the conducive environment project focused on other and more broad aspects of labour administration. So although in principle the development of synergies between both projects was necessary, there was no need for identical activities. Although since 2013, gender was mainstreamed in most plans, papers and activities developed by The Social Dialogue Project (e.g. Labour inspection training, Social Dialogue, expert meetings, role of tripartite Parties in settling disputes ...etc.,) however, the design of the conducive environment project could have been improved by further mainstreaming gender as a cornerstone of all project activities.

The synergy between the two projects resulted in additional challenges for the implementation of the first three objectives of the conducive environment project. The final evaluation of the Promoting Fundamental Rights projects lists the challenges faced by the project. These challenges can be said to be the same faced of the conducive environment. In sum these challenges included the unwillingness of FEI to cooperate with the project prior to August 2013, the general lack of trust amongst the social partners, the general political turmoil and uncertainty in Egypt between January 2011 and June 2014, and the limited capacity of emerging independent workers' structures/unions. Gender as a concept is less controversial compared to freedom of association for example. Conducive environment project could have capitalized on this to systematically build and mainstream gender issues amongst the three social partners in order to build a solid consensus.

The project received initial funding for its first three objectives and then a second round of funds were available and the subsequent addition of the last three objectives without a comprehensive revision of the project document. As a matter of fact, the project has two project documents. At the moment it seems that two projects are in operation. The project's

theory of change doesn't appear, as far as documentary evidence suggests, to have taken in consideration the political and socio-economic turmoil that the country has witnessed between January 2011 and the beginning of the project in October 2011. A context analysis and a review of the first three objectives would have eased many of the challenges faced in the implementation. It is important to point out that the situation has been constantly changing during the last three years and developing assumptions and approaches to mitigate risks was a difficult and complicated process. For starters the project witnessed three regime changes and eight cabinet reshuffles. Each of these changes brought with it a new context and new risks. For example each cabinet reshuffle changed the priorities of MOMM and willingness of the ministry to fully cooperate with the project. At the moment all project activities focusing on MOMM are pending the signature of a protocol of cooperation between the ILO and MOMM. This causes delays for the implementation.

The causal relationship between the outcomes and outputs can be generally observed for each of the objectives individually. However, there is a clear need to develop vertical linkages amongst the six objectives to increase coherence and logic. The project was responding to the needs of the constituents and addressed actual needs. The first set of objectives focusing on the fundamental principles and rights and social dialogue were designed as a direct response to the request of the Government of Egypt. In addition, there was a formal letter from MOMM prior to the revolution requesting this technical assistance. Yet they were not without their challenges. These needs have since changed, at least appear to have changed, thus the relevance of project activities targeting MOMM should also be revised. According to the project team, the new protocol – yet to be signed with MOMM – better reflects the needs of the Ministry.

This process has already been put in place and a Protocol for Cooperation will be signed between the ILO and MOMM to ensure that the project is well aligned to the needs of the ministry. The project activities regarding employers' and workers' organizations followed the footsteps of the promoting fundamental principles and rights at work project. The conducive environment focused on developing the capacity and coaching of emerging independent trade unions following the January 25th revolution in Egypt. The project has also capitalized on improved relations between the ILO and FEI to provide awareness raising and capacity building to FEI. Project activities targeting all three social partners could be said to have responded to actual needs. However, it is important to note that the needs of these partners far supersedes the resources and time allocated for the project. The conducive environment in close partnership with promoting fundamental principles has paved the way for further work targeting specific competencies required in these organizations.

In terms of addressing women's needs in particular, the project has successfully addressed women trade unionists recognizing that they face different and additional challenges than men. In addition, the project sought to create employment opportunities for marginalized women – particularly women with disabilities. The project could be said to have addressed some of the needs of women in general.

The project numerical targets are rather ambitious. The project is set to provide training and employment services for over 20,000 woman. The project document is formulated in a general way which could have allowed the project to merge some of these categories to limit the overall number of women targeted. For example, instead of training 15,000 women on job entry skills and creating 5,000 jobs; the project could have trained 15,000 and from amongst those trained identified possible 5,000 jobs. The rational for training only 100 women on management and leadership skills, as indicated in the Project document's 'results to be achieved', is also not clear. There is a need for rethinking these numerical targets in light of the increase in the cost of training and the inflation in Egypt.

Relevance of Monitoring and Evaluation Systems

The two project documents highlighting the intended work of the project include objectives, outputs, activities and intended numerical targets. The two project documents do not include any indicators of achievements.

The Conducive environment developed an implementation plan as well as an M&E/results framework system. The two documents provide an overall guidance on project activities and expected results. It is important to note that neither the award agreement for the first three objectives nor the proposal for the project's cost amendment describe any form of indicators against which an assessment of appropriateness could be developed. However, as stated the project is preparing "drafts" of an M&E system/results framework to monitor progress and achievement towards indicators. The relevance and quality of the project's M&E system is not uniform. For example the first three objectives do not have numerical targets whereas the last three objectives have numerical targets. Most importantly, the project lacks a logical framework showing vertical and horizontal linkages between the six objectives and how the expected results all contribute to creating a conducive environment for the effective recognition and implementation of fundamental principles and rights at work. It is important for the project to develop a project goal that encompasses the six objectives. It is important to state that the project team recognizes the weakness of the M&E plan/system and is working towards improving it.

In doing so, it is important to formulate the indicators in a way that enables the measurement of the change that the project wishes to produce through the different interventions. At the moment it is challenging to understand what the project's targets are, the achievements to date and the plan for the achievements of remaining targets. This feeds into the management structure of the project in general where officers are assigned to "objectives" as opposed to clear roles that can support several objectives. In general there are many gaps in the project's M&E system for a start, there is a need for the project to develop an overarching goal encompassing all six objectives. At the moment it appears to be two different unrelated projects with one goal for 3 objectives only. There should be a better M&E process where data is collected, stored and constantly analysed to ensure progress towards objectives. Progress should focus both on quantity (numerical targets) as well as quality of services provided or achieved. At the moment these gaps make it very difficult to follow-up on project achievements and develop the necessary adjustments in strategy to improve effectiveness. For example, will

be discussed further later on in the report, the project recognizes the high drop-out rate from skills-training and job placement. However, data is not systematically collected to understand why this is the situation, how it can be improved. This example has implications for both effectiveness and efficiency of resource use. There is a need to harmonise understanding amongst project team and mainstream project documents to all reflect the same objectives, outputs and expected results. There is also a need to develop data collection tools and constantly analyse these data to improve project management.

At the moment the design of the M&E plan presents targets and indicators in the same column. This should be amended and targets separated from indicators. For example one of the indicators/targets selected for output 1.1 reads: *At least 3000 MOMM officials and social partners representatives receive training and/or awareness raising on FPRW.* This is a target. A possible indicator could read % of those trained report new knowledge. The source of verification could be a before and after training assessment.

Another example for output 4.4 the selected target/indicator reads: *Train at least 156 women, members of labour unions and business associations on management and leadership skills.* This is a target and not an indicator. A possible indicator could be the % of trained women introducing a new initiative within their organizations. Or %of women attaining a senior position after x number of months after the training. Or any other indicator that aims to measure the impact/change of the training. The trainings and awareness raising activities are the tools used to achieve a specific change. At present the M&E model used by the project does not show the intended change that the project aims to achieve.

The M&E plan at the moment focuses mainly on processes and implementation of activities. The linkages between these activities and an overall goal that the project aims to achieve is not clear and requires a concentrated focus.

Project Effectiveness

Progress towards Objectives

The conducive environment project has six objectives. One of the evaluation questions specifically required that the evaluator provides an estimation of the percentage of advancement for each objective as well as for the project as a whole. In addition, one of the questions focused on whether the project is likely to meet its objectives by the closing date of August 2015. As previously discussed in this report, the project's M&E system does not capture sufficient data to enable an objective and evidence-based response to these questions. However, an analysis of financial data available suggest that the overall percentage of advancement of the project is about between 40 and 50% (burn rate is at 41%. As such, it is difficult to expect the project to be able to meet its stated objectives by the closing date of August 2015.

It is important to note that the first three objectives of the project do not have numerical targets so assessing the percentage of advancement cannot be estimated. A qualitative review

and discussion of the progress is offered below under each objective. Where possible, an estimation of “advancement” has been offered.

Objectives 4, 5, and 6 have numerical targets at the output level. They are confusing and not clear. It is not clear how the numbers are collected and whether double counting exists or no. in the absence of a tracking system or a data base it is also very difficult to estimate the percentage of advancement. Available information in project documents as well as data collection during the course of this evaluation suggest that a lot of ground work has been accomplished towards meeting these objectives. However, there are some outputs that have not been achieved at all (output 4 and 5 for objective 6) and (outputs 2 and 3 for objective 4). Perhaps objective 6 is the one with the most confusing data. The main reason is the lack of clarity regarding the actual targets. Also, numerical targets should be allocated at the objective level to facilitate monitoring.

Objective 1: Expand awareness and understanding of fundamental principles and rights at work and their linkages with democracy and sustainable development

This objective had two outputs; National public campaign launched on FPRW; and communication and outreach strategies launched by social partners’ organizations.

The project had a large awareness raising and training component. The project trained a very significant number of constituents in the various activities conducted since October 2011. The project activities involved:

1. Two-level training on FPRW and labor dispute prevention and settlement, two-level training on effective communication, and a three-day seminar on labour administration for a total of 1,629 MOMM officials.
2. Basic awareness raising activities on FPRW and labor dispute, and two-level training on effective communication on freedom of association and collective bargaining for a total of 1,373 employers’ representatives.
3. Two-level training on FPRW and labor dispute prevention and settlement, and two-level training on effective communication on freedom of association and collective bargaining for a total 1,219 trade unionists.
4. Bi and tri partite trainings on social dialogue and dispute prevention and settlement for 507 MOMM, employers, and workers’ representatives.
5. FPRW and social dialogue concepts and mechanisms training for 196 NGOs representatives.
6. FPRW and the role of media in promoting fundamental principles and rights for 112 journalists and media personnel.

The project organized a total of four awareness raising seminars for 112 journalists and media personal; 196 experts and trainers; and 1,219 workers trained on FPRW and labour relations in general. The workshops were organized to raise awareness about FPRW and related ILO conventions. Journalists and media personal training a number of the participants produced and published good quality articles and media coverage on FPRW, right to collective bargaining, and social dialogue concepts.

The training for the 196 experts and trainers organized not only to produce material about the national legislation and benchmarking it with the relevant ILO conventions, but also for the project to select good trainers that would be contracted by the project later on as trainers and resource persons.

Two-level training workshops organized for MOMM and each social partners' media taskforces to support them in developing their media strategies focusing on freedom of association and collective bargaining. The trainings were conducted using ILO's DECLARATION toolkit "Put Your Message to Work". The toolkit was translated into Arabic and printed by the project.

In addition to the above activities for media personnel and journalists, the project enriched the discourse around FPRW and social dialogue through dissemination of a wide range of key publications⁵ as follows:

- Translated and printed the ILO Declaration's Media Toolkits 'Put your message to work' on freedom of association and collective bargaining for Government, employers and workers.
- ILO book on ILS;
- ILO Labour inspection book;
- ILO booklet on the Declaration on the FPRW;
- ILO booklet on the Declaration of Social Justice for a Fair Globalization;
- ILO booklet on the concept of social dialogue;
- Booklet "ILO at Glance";
- ILO book titled "Fundamentals of labour administration";

In the beginning of 2012, a number of TV channels and Radio stations broadcasted programs about social dialogue and FPRW. Although during the implementation period there had been a lot of media interest in freedom of association, FPRW and social dialogue, the volatile political context occupied journalists and media personnel which made it difficult to keep their attention on labour related issues.

Based on the above, one could say that 40-50% of this objective has been achieved. The ground work, in terms of training and production of material has been accomplished. The project needs to focus on achieving the selected outputs.

Objective 2: Enhance the capacity of the labour administration to promote and implement public policies, national labour legislation, and sound industrial relations

The project's second objective has two outputs as follows; senior management unit better equipped to improve governance and effectiveness of the labour administration and labour officers acquire modern skills to promote and implement fundamental rights at work and sound industrial relations. According to project documents, below is a list of activities that the project completed under this objective. In May 2012, the project organized a national seminar on social

⁵Cost-shared with EGY/107/03M/USA.

dialogue. A set of recommendation was approved by the participants, among them establishing social dialogue council and mechanisms.

The project organized a national seminar in October 2012 on the roles, missions, and structures of MOMM. The seminar was attended by 120 MOMM senior officials and with the participation of the Minister of Manpower and Migration at the time. The seminar aimed at concluding a set of recommendations that could serve as a foundation for future actions through reviewing the findings of the ILO previous studies about labour administration in Egypt; ILO relevant conventions; the current structure and role of the ministry, and two good practices from Morocco and Ireland. Following that seminar, the project and MOMM agreed on a work plan consisting of a three-phased-capacity-building training program for MOMM officials. The program aimed to establish four technical taskforce groups and enabling them to lead the reform process in four fields: labour administration; labour dispute prevention and settlements; labour legislation; and social dialogue and collective bargaining. The project only completed the first phase as planned, which composed of 38 training workshop for 1,292 participants. But, in the beginning of 2014, MOMM declared that it does not wish to pursue the plan as it was initially envisaged and requested the project to organize a training on labour dispute prevention and settlement. Accordingly, the project organized four workshops for 156 participants selected out of the 1,292 that attended the first phase.

Other activities completed under this objective include the printing of 3000 copies of an ILO book titled "Fundamentals of labour administration" which the project intends to use in its activities. The project also prepared a brief of the ILO working document No. 27 "Ministries of Labor: comparative overview, database, organograms, ILO action" prepared by by Mr.Ludek Raychy, 2013, Geneva, (104) pages. The project further supported MOMM in the process of labor code reforms through the provision of technical advice and supporting seminars targeting MOMM, the social partner, experts, trainers, NGOs, and media personnel and journalists. The project supported some of the social dialogue sessions organized by MOMM on trade unions draft law. This resulted in drafting a law that is not issued yet. It is worth to mention here that representatives from EFITU and EDLC who participated in these sessions had already been trained by the project;

This above discussion indicate that 30 to 40% of this objective has been achieved.

Objective 3: Enhance the institutional capacity of independent unions and employers' organizations to effectively exercise the rights of freedom of association and collective bargaining

The project selected two outputs for this objective namely new and emerging trade unions are better equipped to represent their constituents and Bi-partite social dialogue and collective bargaining promoted at the national and sectoral levels.

To cope with the context and the challenges mentioned in the Background section of this report, the project adopted a two-pronged strategy to achieve this objective. The first step was to build the capacity of each social partner to increase its knowledge and enhance its skills in

applying FPRW in order to be engaged in constructive social dialogue; and the second, was to support the social partners in establishing their organizations in accordance with ILO relevant conventions.

1. Two seminars were organized in 2013 on 'the role of employers' organizations in social dialogue to achieve a fair and sustainable development'. These two seminars were very beneficial in terms of exchange of information and present good practices. Experiences of five countries were presented and examined. A delegation of three members represented ministries of labor, employers' organizations, and workers' organizations were invited from: Tunisia, Morocco, Denmark, Ireland, and Turkey to present their respective country's experience in enhancing freedom of association and institutionalizing social dialogue;
2. A tripartite seminar was organized in the last quarter of 2013 on the role of trade unions in development during transition periods. The seminar concluded a set of recommendations and interventions to support Egyptian trade unions;
3. The project cost-shared with ILO-Beirut Office the translation of National Tripartite Social Dialogue: an ILO guide for improved governance;
4. The project completed the quality control of the translation of ILO manual "National tripartite social dialogue";
5. Developed a three-part guide on Effective Workers' Organizations in close collaboration with ACTRAV. As mentioned earlier in this report, this three-part guide developed to enable workers' organizations to develop their by-laws and structures to eventually enhance their institutional capacities to become independent, competent and representative;
6. Printed three guides developed by ACT/EMP to support FEI and other employers' representatives in developing their structure and services
 - Building Employers' Organization Revenue,
 - Governance in Employers' Organizations,
 - Strategic Approach to Management of Employers' Organizations.

The project targeted workers federations (EFITU & EDLC), sectors (textile, tourism, civil aviation, farmer, fishermen), and geographical (Upper Egypt, north, and upper Egypt) levels, in addition to that, a number of training were tailored for women trade unionists.

On the side of employers' organizations, the project targeted businessmen, businesswomen, investors associations and chambers of commerce (late 2012 until beginning of 2013), and FEI (October 2013 until June 2014). As a result of increasing the participants' knowledge, there were three millstones:

- In cooperation with ACTRAV and ITUC, the project supported the establishment of two trade unions federations: The Egyptian Federation of Independent Trade Unions (EFITU), and the Egyptian Democratic Labor Congress (EDLC),
- Following the massive training provided by the project for businesswomen, businessmen, and investors' association, the employers' coordination committee was established in Alexandria to serve as a forum for its members where they can discuss employers' concerns and seek measures to address them.

- Some social partners who had trained by the project approached the project to request its technical support in establishing bi-partite social dialogue committees. In response, the project managed to support the social partners in Port Said Free Zone in establishing the first Bipartite social dialogue committee in Port Said Free Zone;

This objective can be considered achieved. The project provided numerous trainings to both employers' and workers' organizations. In addition, the project supported the establishment of a bi-partite committee in Port Said.

As previously discussed, objectives 4, 5, 6 had an overarching goal **to promote women's fundamental rights and employment opportunities, through policy support and direct interventions at the national, local and individual levels.**

Objective 4: Improving the rights and policy environment for women in Egypt.

This project selected six outputs for this objective. Below is a brief overview of the project's achievements to date under each of the six outcomes.

Output 1: Knowledge base on women's fundamental labour rights and employment situation in labour markets strengthened and awareness created at the national level;

This outcome has a numerical indicator as follows: At least 5000 women and men are trained on labour laws, including fundamental principles and rights of women at work.

According to project documents, ILO GEMS has been translated into Arabic and is being adapted to the Egyptian context via capacity building. A gender consultant has been hired, and is adapting the GEMS into Arabic and conducting the TOT program. One validation workshop and one training have been conducted. The 4 remaining trainings are planned in January and February 2015.

In addition, issues related to women's fundamental principles and rights at work was included in the around 40 workshops conducted by the promoting fundamental principles project team targeting over 1000 tripartite members.

An expert committee on women's economic empowerment was established. Seven papers on different issues related to women's economic empowerment have been developed.

Papers on Women's Economic Empowerment in Egypt

- 1) The Effectiveness of NGOs in addressing the targeted groups of poor women*
- 2) Role of Employers' Organizations in encouraging women to start their small business*
- 3) Women in the informal sector and their access to microfinance*
- 4) Fundamental Human Rights Conventions and women's rights at work*
- 5) Towards a safe environment at work free from harassment*
- 6) Women rights in the Egyptian Labour Law, trends and practices*
- 7) Supporting women in the Labour Unions*

The ILO Gender related Conventions (C100 Pay equity – C111 non-discrimination; C156 family responsibilities – C177 work from home, C183 maternity) were contextualized and presented in the tripartite workshops.

Output 2: Capacity built within the MOMM on women's rights and women's employment and a gender unit created within the MOMM;

Project team discovered during implementation that a gender unit exists within the ministry. As such, the team decided to build the capacity of the unit. In this regard the project has formed a team of experts for women's economic empowerment and developed materials addressing the topic as well as on ILO gender conventions. Further work with MOMM is pending the signature of a PROTOCOL OF COOPERATION between the project and the ministry. It is worth noting that the ministry only requested this PROTOCOL OF COOPERATION at the beginning of 2014. Prior to this date little or no work was conducted by the project regarding this outcome.

Output 3: Tripartite committee on women's fundamental rights and labour force participation is set up and a policy framework on women's rights and employment is developed;

According to the project's monitoring and evaluation plan/sheet no tripartite committee for women exist. It is likely that one of the key issues with this output is the fact that MOMM is still to sign a PROTOCOL OF COOPERATION with the project and the absence of a gender/women unit in FEI. The situation of women's task force within worker's organizations is not clear. Nonetheless, the project in cooperation with the promoting fundamental principles project conducted over 50 workshops. Each workshop included sessions on women's FPRW. The project further reports that two workshops organized by the promoting fundamental rights targeted women's associations. Total number of those attending the 50 workshops was 2300 of which 850 were women. Total participants in the 2 workshops targeting women's association was 34 women.

According to the project's strategic implementation plan the project has already developed and shared the training materials for 'Mainstreaming gender in programs and Policies' with the Women's Affairs Unit at MOMM. Furthermore, a protocol was developed on the agreed upon activities to be implemented jointly between MOMM and the project. Once the protocol is signed the project will 1) implement the trainings to raise the awareness of relevant staff in gender and development issues; 2) assist in the development of a policy framework to mainstream gender in employment policies, and 3) assist in developing a vocational training centre which will enable vulnerable women to learn new skills and find better job opportunities,

Output 4: Increased capacity and representation of women in policy-making spaces (labour administration, trade unions and employers organizations and tripartite bodies);

This output has a numerical indicator At least 156 women, members of labour unions and business associations obtained management and leadership skills.

165 women have been trained on management and leadership skills (MLS) in decision making posts in the unions, business associations and NGOs. The implementing partner was CAPSCU⁶. According to the project document this has exceeded the targeted number of '100 women trained on MLS'. A new Implementation Agreement was signed with CAPSCU. The new contract aims to provide 'job entry skills' TOT to 120 women out of the 160. They will in turn support 10 women each to develop their capacity on skills needed to enter the market, Several meetings were conducted with the Federation for Egyptian Industries (FEI) and the frame of cooperation was decided. Accordingly, a strategy was developed in cooperation with the National Specialist for Employers' Organizations and the Senior Specialist Employers Activities, 'FEI/ILO Strategy to improve women participation in the business community', and a Consultant to establish a 'Women in Business Support Unit at FEI has been hired.

In addition, the project developed a protocol, including the work plan for MOMM's Women Affair Unit, and support in drafting the NAP. However no progress has been achieved since MOMM has not signed the protocol, A gender consultant hired to assist ILO and FEI in building the capacity of FEI staff for the establishment of a 'Women in business unit', Conducted the first introduction WSs for the 21 Focal points from FEI and Industrial Chambers.

Output 5: Capacity built for NGOs working in the area of equality on labour markets to provide assistance for women in promoting their fundamental rights;

The Professional Development Foundation (PDF) has been selected to provide training to 8-10 NGOs to support women's economic empowerment.⁷ No further achievements on this output are reported.

Output 6: Promotion of women's participation in labour markets and their fundamental rights through information networks, awareness campaigns and targeted training programme on women's rights under national labour legislation,

Sessions on duties and rights at work, in addition to women's rights in the labour law are presented to all the beneficiaries with whom the project signs an "Implementation Agreement" or a 'Service Contract'. So far, around 2,075 women were trained (1700 with FORTE and 375 with TRIA).

Objective 5: Providing vulnerable groups of women with skills that will increase their employability and assisting them in finding decent job opportunities

According to the project document, three outputs were formulated for this objective as follows:

Output 1: Increased skills for women in the area of computer skills and language skills

⁶The Center for Advancement of Postgraduate Studies and Research in Engineering Sciences at Cairo University (CAPSCU) is one of the research and consultation pillars targeting service of the community. <http://capscu-egypt.com/>

⁷ PDF has signed the contract on 20 January and has sent a list of potential NGOs to be trained.

The selected indicator for this output is: *Implementation Agreements signed with at least two service providers to provide at least 2000 vulnerable women with skills that will help them to access the market*

The project reports that three service contracts have been signed with Amideast, EFE, and Scoreplus, and CAPSCU. The 3 contracts include TOT for 60 graduates who will target 600 – 800 beneficiaries. The IA with CAPSCU includes TOT for 120 women who will target 1000 - 1200 beneficiaries. According to the project's IP and M&E plan, the IAs are ongoing with FORTE and TRIA. So far over 2000 women have been trained and 1350 secured jobs in factories.

The project has also provided 8 CAPSCU trainers and trainees with the Job Club methodology training. Job Clubs are two-week intensive job search support activities bringing together people at a labour market disadvantage who are guided and coached by two facilitators to reach out to the hidden job market, become more aware of their skills, write good CVs and motivation letters, and market themselves well, including through interviews, to eventually find a job. CAPSCU trainers will not conduct a Job Club but train women on becoming Job Club facilitators.

Output 2: Multi-facetted support for women in the informal economy to improve their economic situation, to capitalize on skills gained through informal apprenticeship systems, and to improve access to formal institutions of finance and other services

Two indicators are selected by the project to assess achievement of this output they are:

- 8,000 women have acquired new skills to better meet current labour market needs
- Provide 5000 vulnerable women with skills and job opportunities in the private/public sectors

It is difficult to assess what have been the achievements under this output as two project documents report different data. The M&E plan which includes the project indicators lists the agreement with CAPSCU (cited above) as a result for this output. Whereas a project document titled: *Summary of achievement objectives 4, 5, 6 January 2015* doesn't list this output. Instead the document lists a different output: *Support women in the informal economy to improve their economic situation*.

Available data in the second document supports the output's second indicator. The report explains that 2 IAs targeting 2,000 beneficiaries were signed with FORTE and TRIA. 1400 have been trained by FORTE, and 1,000 employed in textile industry. The agreement with TRIA is still ongoing (and facing some challenges). However, 375 have been trained by TRIA, and 350 employed in food factories.

Moreover, NGOs have been trained on the ILO's Training for Rural Economic Empowerment (TREE) approach to target vulnerable women in rural communities in Egypt. After the training, proposals have been received by participating NGOs and two are selected for support in implementation.

Output 3: Better equipped Public Employment Services to be able to handle the specific needs of women

In cooperation with the Career Guidance Project, a draft capacity building program has been developed. No progress could be achieved as the PROTOCOL OF COOPERATION with MOMM is yet to be signed.

Objective 6: Enable women to create and run their own enterprises

According to the project document and the project's IP and M&E plan this objective has five outputs. Available information from project documents and data collection during the course of this evaluation suggest that some progress has been made towards outputs 1,2 and 3. Whereas little or no activities have started to implement outputs 4 and 5. The project has laid the ground work for these outputs either through signing of agreements with entities or consultants. For outputs 2 and 3 several training activities have already taken place. However, the outcomes of these trainings is not clear. Each output is addressed separately below.

Output 1: Improved business support available for women through gender mainstreaming in business and financial services (such as microfinance and banking institutions, business service providers).

Selected Indicator: Implemented an agreement with the Social Fund for Development (SFD) to train 100 existing women entrepreneurs. The SFD provided them with SFD services (in Cairo and Alexandria)

An Implementation Agreement has been developed in coordination with the SMEs Specialist. It has been approved by ILO, and is still being revised from the Financial and legal Departments at SFD.

Output 2: Training and supports for women entrepreneurs in urban and rural areas (targeting young women from vocational institutes in urban areas and women in MSEs in rural areas) and linking women with other business related supports (such as management training, coaching, financial literacy, registration, mentoring, networking and micro insurance).

Selected Indicators: Provided technical support for 200 women with disabilities to start their micro projects in (Cairo, Sohag, Siwa and Marsa Matrouh). Trained 200 underprivileged women in Embaba on hand crafts (Sewing, Embroidery, printing, khayamyia): 135 worked in the hand crafts cooperatives; and the rest (65) started income generating activities (home-based hand crafts)

Two 'contract for services' have been implemented with two development NGOs, each targeted 100 women with special needs. The aim was to develop their skills and provide them with an income generating opportunity. GET AHEAD TOT program was provided to 25 association members whom in turn provided the training to over 100 women with special needs, the training manual is in Arabic. WE GROW is translated into Arabic and a TOT program was developed for 20 women.

This selected indicators for this output do not correspond to the expected output. The outputs specifically indicates that the project will target women in vocational institutes in urban areas, and women engaged in MSEs in rural areas. In reality, the project worked with women with disabilities (not engaged in vocational institutes) both in urban and rural areas.

This output can be considered 50-60% achieved as the project provided training to women in Embaba and supported the formation of a cooperative for handicrafts in Embaba. Follow-up work is required with women with disabilities (in urban and rural areas) to support them in starting their own enterprises.

Output 3: Women entrepreneurs supported in creating social enterprises such as cooperatives and associations.

Selected Indicator: 310 women engaged in three cooperatives: two (75 women) in Upper Egypt (animal husbandry and agricultural), one (100 women) in Behira, in addition to the above 135 women above (see output 6.2); 2. 150 women established a value-chain.

This indicator for this output is not accurate. It speaks of 310 women engaged in three cooperatives. However, the numbers above add-up to 400 women $(75 * 2) + (100) + (150)$.

The project reports that The 'New Vision Association for Development', working on rural development was selected to up-scale and develop two cooperatives for 75 rural women in a small remote village in the Governorate of Luxor. New Vision association is also working on establishing a third cooperative for animal husbandry in Menia governorate. These cooperatives are not fully operational yet. New vision continues to train and coach the women.

A contract was signed with a skill development specialist to train 200 beneficiaries on sewing and handicraft skills to start an enterprise. MYCOOP was adapted for handicraft skills cooperatives and a TOT program was conducted for around 20 women.

Output 4: Develop a national action plan on Women's Entrepreneurship Development (WED), which builds upon existing studies, identifies policy gaps and develops recommendations for an enabling environment for WED.

Indicator: Trained at least 150 women entrepreneurs that became capable of applying ILO knowledge and skills

According to project document, TORs developed on 'Assessment of the status of women's entrepreneurial activities in Egypt' and shared with the skill specialist. No further activities were conducted towards the fulfilment of this output. The project has not really started working on this output.

Output 5: Run a rigorous impact assessment of the women's entrepreneurship training based on a control group approach, helping to create more evidence on the effectiveness of active labour market interventions in Egypt.

Indicator: Contract an external auditor to assess the impact of the project on the economic and social welfare of the girls.

According to project documents, the GetAhead consultant is providing follow-up field visit to supervise over the women who successfully participated in the TOT training, and have hence become a trainer. It is not clear to the evaluator how the above activity corresponds to the expected output. Available information suggest that no activities have started yet in this output.

Context and Implementation Challenges

The conducive environment project started operating at a time of increased turmoil and on-going change in the context. The overall environment in which the project was in no way linear, rather it could be said to have witnessed sharp and consecutive changes making it very difficult for the project to maintain a good implementation rate. The project witnessed 8 cabinet reshuffles, each time this brought with it changes in the leadership of MOMM. This usually necessitated a re-introduction of the project to MOMM senior management and agreeing on a plan for implementation. This was always a lengthy process which affected the ability of the project to implement its activities with MOMM in a timely fashion. Starting 2014, MOMM changed its strategy and requested the drafting of a PROTOCOL OF COOPERATION to continue cooperation with the project. This PROTOCOL OF COOPERATION has not been signed by MOMM to this moment. Hence there is a halt in many of the planned activities with MOMM.

The project started its work while the labor movement in Egypt was witnessing major change and transformation. On the one hand many independent trade unions were being established and at the same time many workers strikes were taking place all over the country. This made it difficult for the project to work both on building the capacities of these unions while introducing social dialogue and collective bargaining as tools for effective dispute settlement. The nascent workers' organizations were not without their challenges. Many were plagued with internal power struggles, weak structures and over politicization of issues. This has also been a challenging process for the project. The main impediment to working with the workers' organizations has also been the absence of a legal framework regulating the establishment and management of trade unions in Egypt. This made it difficult for other important constituents such as MOMM and employers' organizations to recognize the emerging trade unions.

In accordance with the existing Trade Unions Act, the Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF) is recognized as the only legal national trade union structure in Egypt, and all local unions must be recognized and affiliated with it. Consequently, the Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI) refused to hold negotiations with any independent trade union. Many parties claimed that all strikes and sit-ins were initiated by independent TU. Tension between FEI and ETUF from one side and independent TU from the other side escalated. Several employers have shut down their businesses, and many workers were dismissed. By the end of 2012, and because independent TU number has increased and based on the fact that these unions exist and function though there is no legal basis, FEI and other employers' representatives and institutions were compelled to meet and negotiate with them. In this volatile and intense context, the project had to work and achieve its results against the first three objectives: support independent TU who has no legal base and its representativeness is questioned, but cease working with the ETUF who has the legal base; strengthen MOMM's capacity that was

entirely occupied by who would be the next minister and what would be the accompanied changes; reform labour legislation through social dialogue, of course, where the social partners did not recognize each other's and MOMM could not take any risk of passing legislation during transition periods when there was no parliament; support employers' organizations (mainly FEI) who had refused to work with the project until October 2013; and finally increase workers and employers knowledge of their rights and obligation.

In addition to these contextual challenges, the project faced operational challenges. For starters there were no Arabic information regarding freedom of association and there were no trainers capable of providing training related to FPRW. It was difficult for the project to build the required knowledge base and skills for the delivery of trainings and awareness raising activities. The team used several of the materials related to Gender that have been translated by the ILO Beirut Office.

Concerning the women employment component, the project also faced several challenges. The economic institutions, which are still functioning, were becoming increasingly inefficient; e.g. the Women National Council's Business Development Center. They ceased to promote equitable economic growth as mentioned in their mandate. Business associations, especially the business women associations, lack the capacity to become catalyst to economic development for grassroots women. Due to the recent unrest in Egypt, and the further deterioration of the economy and closure of businesses, stakeholders find it more difficult to guarantee/ create a job opportunity in the private sector. It was very difficult to identify qualified partners. The project team reports meeting with over 30 potential partners all whom showed keenness and willingness to sign a contract and assist in achieving the objectives. However, when asked to submit a written proposal they either handed a not so well planned document, or do not return altogether. Many of the potential Service Providers that were approached clearly stated that they were ready to provide the training, but cannot commit themselves to providing job opportunities.

For Example, it took the Project Team around 4-5 months to develop an Implementation Agreement with the Ministry of Health (MOH). Despite the fact that the ILO director met with the Minister of Health who welcomed the cooperation, and despite receiving approval from ILO Regional Office to sign the agreement, MOH declined from signing one day before the official ceremony. MOH assumed that more technical and financial revision must be conducted, however the project team was informed, informally, that the provision of "decent work" is a difficult commitment.

Effectiveness of implementation strategies

In light of the immense challenges that the project has faced, the achievements to date can be said to be commendable. A review of the project progress presented above shows that more activities have taken place under the first three objectives than the last three objectives. However, there is a need to focus on achieving outputs and numerical targets. The project can be said to have produced outputs as per the work plan but has suffered from several delays as discussed in the above section.

The project faced many challenges that were well beyond its control or possible anticipation. Project team has strived to find alternative strategies to respond to the changes in the environment and address the operational challenges that it encountered in a timely fashion. The project also seized opportunities when they arose. For example the change in the management of FEI and readiness of the federation to work with the ILO was timely embraced by the project and hence outputs focusing on FEI were timely produced.

One of the key strategies adopted by the project was awareness raising and training of a wide range of beneficiaries. Most of those trained have expressed during the course of this evaluation (mainly workers' and employers' organizations) their satisfaction with the trainings they received. Even those who had some comments regarding the content of the training or the trainer could also list some positive learning experience that has changed their perceptions. Trained women have also reported a positive feedback regarding the quality of the trainings they received.

Two key factors have affected the effectiveness of the project. The most critical of them is the design of the project. By focusing on the first three objectives mainly during the first three years of the project, this has reduced the timely implementation of objectives 5 and 6. Furthermore, objective 4 could have benefited from being integrated in the first three objectives to increase relevance and synergy amongst the various components of the project. The second key factor is the weakness of the conceptual framework of the project and hence the weakness of the monitoring system (will be further discussed below).

A second key strategy adopted by the project was the integration between the conducive environment and the fundamental principles project. Whereas the first three objectives were similar they were not identical. An alternative strategy could have been the cooperation on some of the activities and not on all activities. This is particularly the case for the training activities for MOMM. The fundamental principles project focused on the entire MOMM structure. Whereas the conducive environment project could have focused on the gender unit and other relevant departments. At the moment, the project is successfully creating these synergies with other projects implemented by the ILO. The project cooperates with a number of projects focusing on women's employment, women's entrepreneurship and others to capitalize on existing resources and increase effectiveness. The project has made strategic use of coordination and collaboration with other ILO projects. The project held many awareness raising sessions on FPRW between November 2012 and May 2013 in complete coordination and cost sharing with the fundamental principles project funded by the US Department of Labour. The project also coordinated with Promoting Worker's Rights and Competiveness in Egypt's Export Industries project funded by USDOL in organizing a labour dispute and inspection mission to MOMM (30 November – 17 December 2014)

The project also signed an implementation agreement in partnership with The Way Forward after the Revolution – Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia project; funded by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Finland; with New Vision NGO for the Establishment of three

Cooperatives in Upper Egypt (August 2014 - August 2015). The project also collaborated with Decent Jobs for Egypt's Young People Project in Egypt (DJEPE); funded by CIDA; Career Guidance for Youth and Job Creation in Egypt; funded by the Italian Cooperation Agency; Decent Jobs for Egypt's Young People, Tackling the Challenge of Young People in Rural Areas; Funded by Australia Aid; to implement a training on Job Search clubs and TREE program.

The conducive environment project has successfully established effective communication with other projects implemented by the ILO in Cairo, Egypt. The project enjoys the full support and technical expertise of the senior entrepreneurship development specialist, the skills specialist, the senior employers' specialist and the senior workers' activities specialist. The increased support offered by the specialists during the 2014 has enabled the project to effectively increase its outputs. The project also enjoys the support of the program unit in ILO Cairo. The project has also been effective in maintaining sound communication with the technical backstopping unit in ILO HQ. Regular communication and review of the project has been offered by the technical backstopping and guidance on ways to move the project forward has been agreed upon.

Managing Partnerships

Due to the wide design of the project, the conducive environment is working with a large number of partners. On the one hand the project works with MOMM, employers' and workers' organizations as well as a number of implementing and service delivery partners. The project contracted FORTE, TRIA, CAPSUCU, AhlMasr and ENGOSC to provide training and job placement services to vulnerable women.

The project adopted working procedures with the implementing partners. However, the diversification of partners and the large targets that the project aims to achieve has, at times, affected the effectiveness and consistency of implementation. During the course of this evaluation, some of the women that found employment through the project complained that they did not receive the financial award promised to them. This was discussed with the project team who explained that there were some difficulties in providing the implementing partners with their payment as they did not provide the necessary documents on time. At the moment the project is facing challenges with TRIA due to the later inability to provide the necessary documentation for the work done. There seems to be some difficulty in managing this relationship in particular.

As previously discussed, the project has always strived to maintain good and on-going communication with MOMM and other social partners. At the beginning of the project, FEI refused to work with the ILO and its projects in Egypt. However, following a change in FEI management in 2013, the project has enjoyed a sound communication and working relationship with the FEI. The project has worked well with other employers' organizations in Egypt. The conducive environment has also maintained a sound working relationship with TUs in general.

One of the challenges in managing partnerships are the different expectations of partners. The project has always amended its strategies to accommodate MOMM's priorities. However, some

of the activities require follow-up to ensure effectiveness of outcomes. For example, the project held little or no activities with workers' organizations since the conclusion of the fundamental principles project in June 2014. Likewise, many of the activities with women trade unionists, employers' associations and sectoral workers' unions (fishermen – farmers) require constant technical support and follow-up to increase effectiveness and impact.

Project's Monitoring Systems

The project did not have a designated M&E officer until the beginning of December 2014. The functions of the M&E were divided between the project's technical officers. As such each member of the project team was responsible for an objective and the implementation of the activities corresponding to this objective without having someone create the necessary linkages amongst the various activities. In addition team members were preoccupied with implementing the activities and not necessarily monitoring the quality of the outputs.

The project has a large number of beneficiaries (between 15,000 and 25,000) but it doesn't have a beneficiary tracking system where information is recorded and follow-up is conducted regularly. This is a major challenge for the project. Without a tracking system, it is very difficult for the project to report on the situation of the women receiving training or placed in jobs. During the course of this evaluation, the evaluator encountered some irregularities that the M&E system does not possess the necessary tools to capture and address. The evaluator met with some women employed in factories, through the project, who have been working before and with social insurance so it is not clear whether these women are counted towards the 5,000 new jobs created or no. The evaluator also met with some women who do not wish to receive social insurance lest they lose existing social benefits. Lastly, but most importantly, some of the beneficiaries interviewed were below 18 years of age and they were not hired as "trainees" or "apprentices" as required by Egyptian Law. Article 99 of the Egyptian Labor law prohibits the employment of children before they complete compulsory education or reach age 14 years. Article 100 of the same law gives the minister of Manpower the authority to regulate child employment, as such ministerial decree no 18 of 2002 sets the regulations for apprenticeship programs. Apprentices should be between 12 and 18 years of age, should be hired to "learn/train" a profession and it should be done according to a contract between employer and employee/legal guardian. Egyptian Law generally prohibits the employment of children or apprenticeship programs in any hazardous occupation.

The project has provided 100 women with management and leadership skills and trained 200 women on the Get Ahead training for micro and small enterprises. However, there is no existing M&E tools to track these women and assess the outcomes of the trainings. For example, the project provided training services to women with special needs. However, the criteria for selecting these women is not clear. Moreover, no follow-up was offered to these women to support them in starting their own enterprise. The evaluator is not questioning the validity of working with women with special needs. Rather, it is important to recognize that in order to integrate them in society they require additional support and perhaps different strategies. For example it was noted that training women with special needs require more time. They also explained that they need support in marketing and product development.

The existing M&E procedures do not capture these issues. And if they do – girls dropping out of employment schemes after marriage – no management decisions are taken to address them. The project clearly is challenged by its design. On the other, there is no clear systems in place that ensures that important data are systematically collected and analyzed to improve management and implementation strategies. The project has an implementation plan and an M&E sheet/plan.

A project as large as this one requires a full M&E system which should include a project goal, a logical framework, input-outcome-output indicators as well as performance indicators, and M&E tools including a beneficiary tracking system. This will allow the project to focus both on the quality as well as the quantity of the services provided. According to the project team, at the time of writing this report, an M&E system is being developed in coordination with the project's M&E officer and the ILO M&E Specialist.

Perception of Stakeholders regarding project interventions

One of the evaluation questions focused on understanding the perception of stakeholders regarding the quality and quantity of outputs produced by the project. During the course of this evaluation a wide range of stakeholders were interviewed. As will be discussed below, most stakeholders were satisfied with the project outputs.

Stakeholders expressed satisfaction with the outputs produced by the project. Interviewed trained women explained that the training helped them understand their rights and responsibilities in the work place and were greatly satisfied by the fact that they have contracts with their employers guaranteeing social and health insurance.. Employers, explained that the project served as an important source to secure labourers who are trained and committed to their jobs.

Organizations that provided the Get Ahead training in Marsa Matrouh, Cairo and Sohag explained that the training manual itself and the tool – Get Ahead – is well suited to the target group. However, it was also noted that it wasn't sufficient. It was noted that in Marsa Matrouh, for example, further support is needed by the women to be able to start their enterprise. This include linking them to some form of revolving fund, providing support for feasibility studies and training on management of enterprise to allow them to grow.

Trained women – with disability and not with disability – explained that attending the trainings has helped them on many levels. On the one hand, attending the training was a way for them to communicate and exchange ideas with other women that they otherwise wouldn't have met. They spoke highly of the trainers and believed that the trainers help them become better persons and listen to their problems and help them. On another level, the training provided them with a sense of worth and empowerment. Many spoke about their desire to work and produce things to improve their living standards.

Other key stakeholders include workers' and employers' organisations as well as MOMM. As previously mentioned elsewhere in this report, there is an overlap between the activities of the conducive environment and those of the fundamental principles as such, the perceptions of these three stakeholders encompasses activities of the two projects. FEI and MOMM trainees

believed that more focus should have been given to providing practical and on-the-job training and not only theoretical sessions. And both groups also explained that training the three “social partners” together would have fostered a better understanding amongst them.

Workers’ organisations and female trade unionists were positively affected by the trainings and awareness raising sessions received. Interviewed individuals during the course of this evaluation explained that they trainings were well organised and helped them understand what their role is and how they can become more effective in solving workers’ issues.

8. Efficiency of Resource use

Financial Resource Management

The conducive environment has an overall budget of USD 6,435,643. The project started operating in August 2011 and is expected to continue until August 2015. At the moment the burn rate of the project is low at 41% with less of one year to continue. Generally speaking the project has allocated resources to achieve expected outcomes and resources. However, as previously explained the project faced delays in implementation.

The project’s first three objectives have a total budget of USD 1,485,148. Of this total amount about USD 700,000 or about 50% remain unspent due to delays in implementation discussed in section 7 of this report. The last three objectives have a total budget of USD 4,950,499. Only about USD 2,790,000 have already been spent; again close to 50% due to implementation delays previously discussed. It is clear that the project needs to increase its implementation activities during the remaining months of the project. The project’s activities have been cost effective. The amounts allocated for the intended activities appear to be sufficient. However, the project will be challenged by the time constraints as it is supposed to end by August 2015. It is important to recognize that a budget revision should take place⁸ to request a no cost extension. However, this review will also require taking in consideration the target numbers that the project is trying to achieve. There is a need to clarify the target numbers and conduct an analysis of a realistic achievable number based on available budget. It is also important to recognize that some activities will require time particularly the establishment of cooperatives. It is important for the project team to prioritize the outputs that could be achieved and capitalize on previous achievements. For example the project can build on the success in forming a bi-partite committee in Port Said by mainstreaming gender and establishing a bi-partite women committee. That would help the project efficiently achieve this output. The same can be accomplished in 10th of Ramadan where a bi-partite committee was previously established.

A second approach would include merging the targets as initially envisaged in the project implementation plan. According to the project’s implementation plan the targets for objective 4 are 15,000 women have developed skills; 5,000 of which obtain jobs, and 1,000 start an income

⁸ According to project team, a budget revision is planned.

generating activity. The 5,000 who will obtain jobs could also be trained on FPRW to maximise impact and efficiency. This way the project doesn't have to work on sparse target groups but focus on a concentrated number of beneficiaries and build a successful model that can then be replicated through other projects. It is also important to recognize that since 2011, Egypt has witnessed increased inflation rate. Newly introduced government economic policies such as the removal of some subsidies (most notably energy) need to be factored in as prices of many services have increased over the course of the last three years.

Human Resource Management

The flaws and gaps in project design and lack of clarity regarding its overall goals have affected its human resource management. The project had a CTA but only until the end of 2013. With two years remaining in the project life, a CTA should have been identified and appointed. Project team members have joined the project at different times between 2011 and 2013. This affected the implementation rate of many activities as some officers were only recruited in 2013 (for example the implementation of Objective 5 only started as of November 2012 and Objective 6 focusing on enterprise creation only started in 2013).

Despite the technical support offered to the project team through the program unit and specialists in ILO Cairo, the project is generally under-staffed. This is particularly the case regarding the M&E functions of the project. Monitoring and evaluation are core functions of successful development projects. The conducive environment could be considered a pioneer project that is providing awareness about new topics in development and attempting to integrate economic empowerment of women through a variety of methodologies. This requires additional effort to monitor, document and synergize activities. It is important to constantly collect data regarding lessons learned and amend implementation strategies accordingly. At the moment this is done on an ad hoc basis and not as a core function of the project.

Moreover, since June 2014, the project does not have a full-time worker's activities officer. The project does not have someone specifically targeting workers as a result no activities focusing on trade unions and workers' relations have taken place recently. This is true except a recent attempt to work with the union of domestic workers. There is a need to increase efficiency of monitoring system by having competent staff oversee this function.

9. Impact and Sustainability

Main Intermediate Results

The project progress is at varying points as previously discussed in this report. It is still rather difficult to assess the intermediate results of the component focusing on women employment since most of the work on that component has only started close to a year ago. Nonetheless, an important result that can be directly attributed to the project is the provision of 1375 new job opportunities to vulnerable women. It is important, however, to re-check the number to ensure that these work opportunities were in fact "new". It is also important to recognize that some of these opportunities were offered to girls less than 18 years of age and work on regulating their situation. Nonetheless, the women interviewed have explained that their perceptions about their work, the importance of social insurance and rights and responsibilities have greatly been

affected by the training they received. The awareness raising of the women has increased their self-worth and understanding of their rights vis-à-vis their employers.

Another important result is the introduction of new methodologies of economic empowerment to a varied range of partners. The trainings on Job clubs, TREE, My COOP, We GROW, GEMS and Get head have been introduced to several NGOs already engaged in income generating activities. This will help increase the knowledge regarding ILO methodologies and promote the adoption of these methodologies to better serve vulnerable women. The project has also worked on engaging civil society organizations such as universities, NGOs, training centers in providing an innovative approach to women’s employment.

The observed results from the first three objectives are jointly shared between the Conducive Environment Project and the Fundamental Principles Project. These include building the capacity of newly established trade unions and workers’ federations. The exchange of experiences and provision of international experiences have helped TUs develop their internal systems and structures. It is recognized that these structures continue to require additional support; however, the both projects paved the way for other interventions to continue working on freedom of association in Egypt. A second result could perhaps be observed within the employers’ organizations. The project has successfully improved the image and knowledge regarding the role of the ILO. This is particularly the case regarding the work of the conducive environment with the FEI. It is evident from interviewed conducted during the course of this evaluation that the FEI leadership is keen on adopting new systems and improving capacities to implement FPRW. This is apparent in the steps taken to establish both a women in business unit and a labor affairs unit within FEI.

The project has supported the increase in awareness regarding FPRW and the importance of social dialogue in Egypt. Despite implementation challenges and issues pertaining to quality of interventions discussed in this report, it is evident that the various stakeholders of the project have benefited from participation in project activities to the extent that almost all of them have expressed their desire for the project’s activities to continue.

Potential for Sustainability

The project does not have a holistic exit strategy for all its components. Rather a multi-level exit strategy was developed for the woman component only as follows:

Micro Level	Meso Level	Macro Level
Cooperatives for vulnerable women, both agricultural and handicraft skills	setting up self-reliant community based organizations	A Roadmap for Action that will highlight the best approaches for including women in labour market.
Pool of trainers on ILO's enterprise development manuals: GETAHEAD,	Institutional building of NGOs working on women's economic empowerment to	To work closely with the Ministry of Manpower on

<p>WEGROW, MYCOOP, GEMS...</p> <p>Pool of trainers on 'Job entry skills',</p>	<p>become real catalyst reaching out to grassroots women and assisting them to start their own income generating activities,</p> <p>An operational 'Women in Business Support Unit' at FEI,</p> <p>An operational joint Labour Unions' Women's Committee</p>	<p>mainstreaming gender into employment/ labour market policies & action plan</p> <p>Establish a sub-committee social dialogue for women's issues in the labour market</p>
---	--	--

The project should develop a holistic exit strategy that encompasses both components of the project with clear roles, responsibilities and timeframe for implementation. As it stands the exit strategy is achievable but requires creation of linkages amongst the various levels. For example, linkages between the newly established cooperatives and existing structures should be developed. These need to be institutionalized to ensure sustainability of support to the model and increasing the economic benefits for women.

Another important sustainability measure is the creation of a knowledge base which could include the creation of an online database to disseminate the training material. And an in-house database of qualified trainers that future projects can rely on in different projects. There is also a need to create a sustained relation amongst the various CSOs engaged in this project. This could be done through the creation of an online platform to exchange experiences and promote cooperation and coordination amongst them. Lastly, but equally important, the project should calculate the necessary financial and human resources needed to implement the exit strategy in an effective and efficient manner.

10. Conclusions

Creating a conducive environment for the effective recognition and implementation of fundamental principles and rights at work in Egypt is an ambitious project that has sought to work on six objectives to produce 20 outputs over the course of four years. Although, under normal economic and political circumstances this would have been a challenging attempt, the situation in Egypt since the start of the project has been constantly changing at times at very fast rhythm. The project is generally well suited to the priorities of the ILO and the development priorities for Egypt.

The project was a timely and relevant project that sought to first compliment the work of an existing project; Promoting the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and Social Dialogue in Egypt. The addition of three objectives focusing on women economic empowerment/employment without a complete review of the project objectives and strategies has affected the internal coherence of the project design and ultimately its effectiveness. A review of the project design following the additions of the women employment component could have created the necessary linkages amongst the six objectives; and perhaps reduced them to five objectives with three focusing on policy level and two on direct women

employment models. This review should have been also accompanied by a review of the human resource structure and a development of a comprehensive monitoring and evaluation system and not just a plan. This could have increased the internal coherence and logic of the project's interventions.

The relevance and effectiveness of the project could have also been increased by adopting a strategy of piloting models and then rolling these models out. The project has a large numerical target of providing various services to 15,000 – 20, 000 women. This has placed immense pressure on the project to deliver without focusing on testing successful models that can then be scaled up.

The project made some good progress towards its targets but still requires additional time to be able to fully meet its objectives. There is an obvious need to revise targets and intended outcomes to be able to meet the targets of the project. Three years after the inception of the project the burn rate is only 41% indicating that more effort needs to be placed in prioritizing what could be achievable. There is also a need for a review of the human resource structure available. It is inconceivable that the project can meet its requirements with the number of staff available. The project is generally understaffed with no project manager/CTA since the end of 2013 and no workers' organizations officer since June 2014. Although the project enjoys the full support, technical expertise and coaching from the Specialists available in ILO CO/Cairo, yet there is a need for forward planning and follow-up on activities.

Determining intermediate results of the project in light of its limited implementation progress is difficult. Yet, the project has provided training to a large number of individuals on FPRW. Major progress can be observed in the relationship between the project and FEI. In addition, the project has provided skills training and job placement to 1375 woman. An additional 300 women have been trained on various ILO methodologies and tools to promote income generation and entrepreneurship.

11. Recommendations

Based on the findings of these recommendations, and in accordance with the stated purpose and objectives of this evaluation, the following recommendations aim to provide a guide to project team on ways to increase relevance and effectiveness of interventions.

This evaluation although it is a mid-term is taking place after $\frac{3}{4}$ of the life of the project has already elapsed (project ends in August 2015). This may make it difficult for the project to introduce the necessary changes to increase effectiveness and impact. Accordingly, it is recommended that mid-term evaluations be planned for before the end of the second year of the project to allow project management to make the necessary adjustments to ensure effectiveness and impact.

Relevance, Validity of Design and Efficiency

	Recommendation	To Whom	By when
1	Re-calculation of project targets. At the moment the project has a target reaching over 20,000 women. It is	Project management	By August 2015

	recommended that this number be reduced by at least 75%. A thorough analysis of available financial resources should provide a more realistic target. In addition, the project should focus on activities that can have double impact. For example while preparing women for job placement provide a simplified FPRW training. This training should include information regarding freedom of association. This would help the project meet its objectives	and backstopping	
2	Consider merging Objective 4 with other objectives and eliminating the outputs where no progress is reported to date such as outputs 4.6 and 5.3.	Project management and backstopping	By august 2015
3	Following a review of project objectives and expected outputs, consider a no-cost extension to enable the project to meet its objectives	Donor	Before August 2015

Effectiveness& Impact

	Recommendation	To Whom	By when
4	Conclude as soon as possible the protocol of cooperation with MOMM to enable the project to implement planned activities in a timely fashion.	Government and ILO Cairo	As soon as possible
5	Reformulate the project strategy to ensure that women employment models being tested are documented to form a model that can be advocated for at the policy level.	Project Management ILO Cairo Specialists	On-going
6	A review of project targets should also place an importance on the quality of interventions. It is important for the project to provide a holistic package of services to vulnerable women which could help them improve their economic circumstances.	Project management	On-going
7	Ensure that monitoring systems are in place to facilitate project interventions this could be achieved by separating the targets and the indicators and recognizing that indicators should measure the change that the project wishes to accomplish. At the moment the indicators developed in the implementation plan read better than those available in the M&E sheet. It is recommended that the project team continues to reformulate the indicators in a way to facilitate measuring progress towards achievements.	Project team, ILO Cairo, Backstopping	Before the no cost – extension request.

8	Continue to build bridges amongst the social partners to foster a culture of dialogue and discourse. Build on previously established bi-partite committees in Port Said and 10th of Ramadan to mainstream gender and women economic empowerment into the discourse.	Project management and ILO Cairo	On-going
9	Ensure a full-understanding of the challenges that could face cooperatives and design the necessary plans to mitigate these risks and challenges.	Project management	

Sustainability

	Recommendation	To whom	Time
10	Develop a holistic exit strategy encompassing all project interventions – or what can be sustained.	Project Management	By year 3 of the project
11	Create the necessary linkages that would ensure that services provided to vulnerable women will continue well after the life of the project	Project Management	By the beginning of year 4 of the project

12. Lessons learned and Good Practices

Despite the design and implementation challenges that the project faced since its inception, yet it provides a number of good practices that could be continued in the coming phase and/or replicated by other projects working on the same issues. These good practices are:

- Continued cooperation and coordination with other ILO projects to increase effectiveness, efficiency and impact. The project has partnered with several ILO implemented projects on numerous activities. However, for this to continue, the project must be selective in ensuring that the activities serves its core objectives and are relevant to the expected outputs.
- Continuous engagement with NGOs and CSOs concerned with women economic empowerment will help spread awareness of ILO tools and methodologies and support the empowerment of women.

During the coming phase of the project, particularly if extended beyond October 2015, it will be important for the project to ensure a stronger focus on achieving expected outputs and concentrating efforts on achievable targets. In particular the project could:

ILO Lesson Learned Template

Project Title: Creating a Conducive Environment for the effective Recognition and Implementation of Fundamental Principles and Rights at work in Egypt

Project TC/SYMBOL: EGY/11/03M/USA

Name of Evaluator: Nahla Hassan
2015

Date: January 18,

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LL Element	Text
Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)	Working on issues pertaining to freedom of association and collective bargaining in Egypt is a complicated process. It requires the coordination with various entities most notably the Ministry of Manpower and Migration. Developing a protocol of cooperation between the project and the ministry at the beginning of the project could have saved the project many unnecessary delays.
Context and any related preconditions	Since 2011, Egypt has gone several regime change and eight cabinet reshuffles. Each of these changes brought with it a new minister with a new set of priorities and objectives. In the absence of a protocol for cooperation/implementation, the project was constantly striving to adjust its planned activities.
Targeted users / Beneficiaries	Project Management
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	No one could have foreseen all the changes in cabinet and regimes in Egypt.

Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	Change is not always negative. Changes in FEI management enabled the project to build a relationship and work with FEI.
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	Implementation

ILO Lesson Learned Template

Project Title: Creating a Conducive Environment for the effective Recognition and Implementation of Fundamental Principles and Rights at work in Egypt
Project TC/SYMBOL: EGY/11/03M/USA

Name of Evaluator: Nahla Hassan

Date: January 18, 2015

The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.

LL Element	Text
Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)	Lack of a comprehensive M&E system affects all aspects of the project. M&E systems should be developed immediately following the signing of agreements with donors. The system should clearly state a project goal, develop vertical and horizontal linkages amongst the objectives and outputs, and design M&E processes and tools.

Context and any related preconditions	
Targeted users / Beneficiaries	Project Management
Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	Absence of a clear M&E system with targets negatively affects project management. It also creates difficulties in follow-up and in implementation and monitoring
Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	

ILO Emerging Good Practice Template

Project Title: Creating a Conducive Environment for the effective Recognition and Implementation of Fundamental Principles and Rights at work in Egypt
Project TC/SYMBOL: EGY/11/03M/USA

Name of Evaluator: Nahla Hassan

Date:

The following emerging good practice has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text can be found in the full evaluation report.

GP Element

Text

Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	Continuous engagement with NGOs and CSOs concerned with women economic empowerment will help spread awareness of ILO tools and methodologies and support the empowerment of women.
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	
Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	CSOs can continue to use ILO tools as well as attempt to integrate concepts related to FPRW in other projects and other activities
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	
Potential for replication and by whom	All trained CSOs and NGOs can use the ILO tools and manuals.
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	
Other documents or relevant comments	



Terms of Reference

Mid-term independent evaluation for EGY/11/03/USA

Title of project to be evaluated	Creating a conducive environment for the effective recognition and implementation of fundamental principles and rights at work in Egypt
TC Code	EGY/11/03/USA
Administrative Unit responsible	ILO Country Office in Cairo
Technical Unit(s) responsible for backstopping the project	ILO FPRW, Geneva
Type of evaluation	Mid-term independent evaluation

13. BACKGROUND

The independent evaluation will consider project EGY/11/03/USA “Creating a conducive environment for the effective recognition and implementation of fundamental principles and rights at work in Egypt”. The project is financed by the US Department Of State.

The project started in August 2011 and is due to run until October 2015. The US Department Of State funded an initial contribution of 1’485’148; an addendum to this agreement was signed on 28 September 2011, for an additional funding of USD 4’950’495. The total budget of the project is therefore USD 6’435’643. The initial project component, signed in August 2011, focused on the promotion of fundamental principles and rights at work. The addendum signed in September 2011, widened the scope of the project to include a component on the labour rights and participation in the labour market of Egyptian women.

As per ILO evaluation policy, an independent mid-term evaluation for EGY/11/03/USA is to be conducted.

The key objectives and results expected from both projects, against which this evaluation will be based, are provided in Annex 1. Project documents, progress reports and other key documentation will be provided to the evaluator.

14. EVALUATION PURPOSE, CLIENT AND SCOPE

The independent evaluation serves two main purposes:

The evaluation is conducted as per ILO evaluation policy, with the following two purposes:

- v. Give an independent assessment of progress to date of the project across the all outcomes; assessing performance as per the foreseen targets and indicators of achievement; strategies and implementation modalities chosen; partnership arrangements, constraints and opportunities;
- vi. Provide strategic and operational recommendations as well as highlight lessons to improve performance and delivery of project results

And the following specific objectives:

- Assess the relevance and coherence of project's design.
 - Assessing to what extent the stated objectives and outputs are being achieved; and to provide an estimate of the status of completion of results (achieved, in progress, pending) and percentage of progress per category (objective, output, activities) Assess the external and internal challenges and opportunities for the timely implementation of the project.
 - Review the efficiency and effectiveness of the project implementation framework and management arrangements.
 - Assess the relevance of the project in regards of country needs and how the project is perceived and valued by the target groups
 - Provide recommendations on how to build on the achievements of the project and ensure that it is sustained by the relevant stakeholders.
 - Review and provide recommendations regarding the sustainability strategy of the project for the remaining period, and if possible suggest avenues for additional activities.
 - Document lessons learned and good practices in order to maximize the experience gained.
-

CLIENTS

The primary clients of this evaluation are the ILO management (the ILO DWT/CO Cairo, ILO/FPRW, Regional Office for Africa), project staff, constituents, key national stakeholders and the donor.

Secondary clients include other project stakeholders (key Ministries, NGO, embassies, etc) and other units within the ILO that may indirectly benefit from the knowledge generated by the evaluation.

SCOPE

The evaluation will consider the full geographical breadth of the project, including both national and localised interventions. In preparing its inception report, the evaluator may determine whether a sample of localised interventions may be appropriate for the evaluation of the project's local involvement. It will consider project implementation from start to the actual timing of the evaluation.

15. EVALUATION CRITERIA AND QUESTIONS

The project will be considered from the perspective of the following criteria:

- Relevance: The extent to which the development intervention has met beneficiary requirements, country needs, global priorities and partners' and donors' policies.
- Development effectiveness: The extent to which the development intervention's objectives and intended results are being achieved.
- Resource Efficiency: The extent with which resources are economically converted into results, including mention of alternative more cost-effective strategies when applicable.
- Preliminary Impact: Positive and negative, intended and unintended long-term effects, recommendations on tools and methods used to maximize impact

- Sustainability: The continuation of benefits and probability of continued long-term benefits after the project has been completed.
- Partnerships: The extent to which the project is contributing to the capacity development of national partners, and how much is it building synergies with similar initiatives
- Lessons learned and good practice: Good practices being identified by the project, key lessons being learned from project implementation, and potential recommendations for similar projects/projects
- Policy change: The extent to which the methodologies and activities designed in the project ensure policy change within the time frame of the project.

The evaluation will address the following questions:

Relevance and validity of design

- Is the project relevant to the achievements of the outcomes in the national development plan, the UNDAF and the ILO DW strategy for North Africa?
- Have the projects addressed relevant needs? Given the current political, socio-economic and financial situation, are the project objectives and design still relevant?
- How well does the project complement and link to activities of other donors/development agencies at local level?
- How does the project align with and support the ILO strategies and priorities in Egypt and the region?
- Is the 'theory of change/intervention logic behind the project coherent and realistic? Do outputs causally linked to outcomes, which in turn contribute to the broader development objective of the project?
- Have the various 'change' assumptions and risks been properly identified and addressed in project design and implementation?
- How appropriate and useful are the indicators described in the project document in assessing the project's achievements? Are the targeted indicators realistic and can they be tracked?

Project effectiveness

- Is the project making sufficient progress towards its planned objectives? Which percentage of advancement can be estimated for each objective, and for the overall advancement of the project? Is the project likely to achieve its planned objectives by its closing date?
- Were outputs produced and delivered as per the work plan? Has the quantity and quality of project's outputs been satisfactory? How do the stakeholders perceive them?
- What, if any, alternative strategies would have been more effective in achieving the timely implementation of projects' activities and outputs?
- Has the project adopted effective and consistent working procedures with implementing partners and relevant ILO units? And has the project and relevant ILO's relevant units (FPRW, ILO Cairo Programme) made strategic use of coordination and

collaboration with other ILO projects and with other donors in the country/region to increase its effectiveness and impact?

- How effective is the communication between the project management and project beneficiaries and partners (Ministry of Manpower, social partners' organizations, implementing partners, donor, etc.)? How effective is the communication between the project management and other ILO units (technical backstopping unit in HQ, the field office (Specialists, Programme Officers) and the regional office)? And What were the specific efforts made by the project management to involve workers' and employers' participation, and determine how effective the project was at promoting the normative function of the ILO?
- How effectively does the project management monitor project performance and results? What M&E system has been put in place, and how effective is it? Is relevant data systematically being collected and analyzed to feed into management decisions? Is data disaggregated by sex?
- How effective has been the technical support offered by CO/Cairo and HQs in ensuring technically sound interventions, international quality standards, alignment with international conventions or policy guidelines?

Efficiency of resource use

- Have financial resources of the project been allocated strategically according to the work plan in order to achieve outcomes? Has the project monitored under regular basis financial delivery, and adjusted its future allocations, when necessary? See implementation plan or other activity/output-based budgeting documents.
- Is the composition of the project team considered sufficient, over or under-sized? Has the composition of the project been adjusted to ensure efficiency of resources and expertise?
- Has the implementation of activities been cost-effective? Will the results achieved justify the costs? Could the same results have been attained with fewer resources?

Impact and sustainability

- What are the main intermediate results that can be imputed to the work of EGY/11/03/USA? Provide a synthetic, reader-friendly write-up of key results achieved that may be of use for wide dissemination;
- Can observed changes (in attitudes, capacities, systems, institutions etc.) be causally linked to the project's interventions?
- Has the project successfully built or strengthened an enabling environment (legislation, policies, social capital...) for sustainability? Has the project successfully built or strengthened institutional and organisational capacities in the relevant fields of work?
- How effective and realistic is the exit strategy of the project?

Lessons learned

- What good practices can be learned from the project that can be applied in the next phase and to similar future projects?
- What should have been different, and should be avoided in the next phase of the project

16. Evaluation Methodology

Based on the above criteria and questions, the evaluator will elaborate an information collection and analysis methodology within its inception report.

The evaluation fieldwork will be qualitative and participatory in nature. The evaluation will be carried out through a desk review and field visit to the project sited in Egypt for consultations with ILO management and staff, constituents, as well as other relevant implementing partners, beneficiaries and other key stakeholders. Consultations with relevant units and officials in Geneva, Addis Ababa and Cairo will be done and the method for doing so will be decided by the evaluator and the evaluation manager. The independent evaluator will review inputs by all ILO and non ILO stakeholders involved in the project, from project staff, constituents and a range of partners from the private and civil sectors.

The draft evaluation report will be shared with all relevant stakeholders and a request for comments will be asked within a specified time (not more than 2 weeks). The evaluator will seek to apply a variety of evaluation techniques – desk review, meetings with stakeholders, focus group discussions, field visits, informed judgment, and scoring, ranking or rating techniques. Subject to the decision by the evaluator and the evaluation manager a guided Open Space workshop with key partners may be organized in Cairo.

The following principles will be applied during the evaluation process:

1. Methods of data collection and stakeholder perspectives will be triangulated to the greatest extent possible.
2. Gender and cultural sensitivity will be integrated in the evaluation approach.

Desk review

A desk review will analyze project and other documentation including the approved log-frame, monitoring reports, annual and semi-annual reports provided by the project management and Field and HQ backstopping officers.

Quantitative data will be drawn from project documents including the Technical Progress Reports (TPRs) and other reports to the extent that it is available.

The desk review will suggest a number of initial findings that in turn may point to additional or fine-tuned evaluation questions. This will guide the final evaluation instrument which should be finalized in consultation with the evaluation manager. The evaluator will review the documents before conducting any interview.

Interviews with ILO staff

The evaluation team will undertake group and/or individual discussions with project staff in Cairo. The evaluation team will also interview key staff of other ILO projects, and ILO staff responsible for financial, administrative and technical backstopping of the project in ILO DWT Cairo and ILO HQ. An indicative list of persons to be interviewed will be furnished by the project management (CTA) after further discussion with the Evaluation Manager.

Interviews with key stakeholders

A first meeting will be held with the ILO Director of DWT Cairo and with the Project Team. After that the evaluator will meet relevant stakeholders including members of the project steering committee (if available) and technical working group (if available), project beneficiaries to undertake more in depth reviews of the respective national strategies and the delivery of outputs and outcomes of the respective components in the country. Around the end of the data collection from the field, the evaluation team will make a debriefing to the ILO DWT Cairo Director, the project team and the evaluation manager.

Key steps that will be followed during the evaluation:

Step 1: Meet and discuss with the Evaluation manager, ILO Cairo Office and the project team to get a proper briefing about the project and the process of the evaluation.

Step 2: Desk review of all relevant documents and preparation of inception report.

Step 3: Submission of inception report to the evaluation manager for comments and approval. The Evaluation manager will share the inception report with the relevant stakeholders.

Step 4: On-site interviews with stakeholders, meetings and focus group discussions with CO Cairo, project staff, FPRW, project beneficiaries, social partners and other key stakeholders.

Step 5: A debriefing and preliminary recommendations seminar will be led by the evaluator in Cairo, with participation from the project team and Cairo Management, ILO/FPRW and the key stakeholders, to present and discuss the preliminary findings of the evaluation

Step 6: Submission of evaluation first draft to the evaluation manager. The evaluation manager will share the draft report with relevant stakeholders and revert to the evaluator with a consolidated comment within 2 weeks.

Step 7: The evaluator will finalize the report incorporating any comments deemed appropriate and providing a brief note explaining why any comments might not have been incorporated. He/she will submit the final report to the evaluation manager

Step 8: The Evaluation Manager will forward the final draft report to the Regional Evaluation Focal person for review. Then, the regional Evaluation Focal Person will forward the report to EVAL for approval.

Step 9: The evaluation manager officially forwards the evaluation report to stakeholders and PARDEV.

Step 10: PARDEV will submit the report officially to the donor.

Key stakeholders and sources of information:

Donor

USDOS Desk Officer in Washington (by phone)

ILO

ILO/FPRW staff and other relevant HQ staff

ILO Project Staff based in Cairo

Director and relevant officials of the ILO Country Office for Egypt

Government

Ministry of Manpower and Migrations, Ministry of Social Solidarity, Social Fund for Development and other line Ministries where applicable

Trade Unions and employers organisations

A list of stakeholders is attached.

Ethical Considerations and Confidentiality

The evaluation mission will observe utmost confidentiality related to sensitive information and feedback elicited during the individual and group interviews. To mitigate bias during the data collection process and ensure a maximum freedom of expression of the implementing partners, stakeholders, communities, and implementing partner staff will generally not be present during interviews. However, implementing partner staff may accompany the evaluator to make introductions whenever necessary, to facilitate the evaluation process, make respondents feel comfortable, and to allow the evaluator to observe the interaction between the implementing partner staff and the interviewees.

17. Main deliverables

The expected deliverables are:

- a) An inception report, including workplan and methodology;
- b. A concise Evaluation Report as per the proposed structure in the ILO evaluation guidelines:
 - Cover page with key project and evaluation data
 - Executive Summary
 - Acronyms
 - Description of the project
 - Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation
 - Methodology
 - Clearly identified findings for each criterion (responding to the evaluation questions)
 - Conclusions
 - Recommendations
 - Lessons learned and good practices (Using the ILO template – to be provided by the evaluation managers)
 - Annexes
 - List of persons met/consulted, description of focus group meetings.

18. Management arrangements

Evaluation Manager

The evaluation team will report to the evaluation manager (Ms. Yasmine Elessawy, elessawy@ilo.org) and should discuss any technical and methodological matters with the evaluation manager should issues arise. The project team will provide the required direct administrative and logistical support for the completion of the evaluation in consultation with the evaluation manager (including transportation, facilitation of contacts, organization of stakeholders workshops).

Work plan & Time Frame

The total duration of the evaluation process is estimated to --- working days for the independent international consultant over a 6 week period from 20 November to 17 February 2014. The international independent consultant will spent at least --- working days in Egypt for data collection and debriefing.

Evaluation Phases

The evaluation is foreseen to be undertaken in the following main phases and time period aiming for submission of the final evaluation report to the donor no later than 24 April 2015.

Phase	Tasks	Responsible Person	Timing
I	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Preparation of TOR, consultation with stakeholders 	Evaluation manager	1-20 November
II	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identification of independent international evaluator Entering contracts and preparation of budgets and logistics 	Evaluation manager	21 – 24 November
III	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Telephone briefing with evaluation manager Desk review of project related documents Evaluation instrument designed based on desk review 	Consultant	
IV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consultations with Project staff/management in Egypt Consultations with HQ Units, Cairo, ROAF Consultations with stakeholders Debriefing and presentation of preliminary findings to ILO DWT Cairo, the project team and HQ 	Consultant with logistical support by the Project	
V	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Draft evaluation report based on desk review and consultations from field visits 	Consultant	
VI	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Circulate draft evaluation report to key stakeholders Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to evaluation team leader 	Evaluation manager	
VII	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Finalize the report including explanations on if comments were not included 	Team leader with support of national consultant	
VIII	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review of the final draft report by the Regional Eval. Focal point Approval of report by EVAL 	Regional Eval. Focal Person EVAL	
IX	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Official submission to the PARDEV 	Evaluation manager	

19. Timeframe and payment

The evaluation will be undertaken from 30th of November- to 29th of December 2014.
The evaluator shall be remunerated for the following working days:

Desk review and inception report	3 days
Field work: Data collection	12 days
Stakeholder meeting	2 days (including preparation)
Draft evaluation report	6 days
Final evaluation report	2 days
TOTAL	25 days

Fees: 25 days * 385 \$ = 9625 \$

Payment schedule

The assignment will be paid upon completion of work and submission of the final report to the satisfaction of the ILO.

20. Legal and ethical matters

The evaluation will comply with UN Norms and Standards, including UNEG ethical guidelines. By agreeing to undertake this work, the consultant guarantees he/she does not have any stakes or prior involvement with the project implementation, nor any links to project management or any other conflict of interest that would compromise the independence of the evaluation.

21. Key qualifications and experience of the Evaluation

The international consultant should have the following qualifications:

- Master degree in Business Management, Economics or related graduate qualifications
- A minimum of 10 years of professional experience specifically in evaluating international development initiatives in the area of skills, employment, micro enterprises, entrepreneurship, rural development and management of development programmes, preferably in Africa.
- Demonstrated expertise and capability in assessing technical and vocational skills training in rural and informal economies, business support services in support of micro-enterprise development including entrepreneurship and small business management training, access to finance, business linkages and markets.
- Proven experience with logical framework approaches and other strategic planning approaches, M&E methods and approaches (including quantitative, qualitative and participatory), information analysis and report writing.
- Knowledge and experience of the UN System.
- Understanding of the development context of the project country (Zimbabwe) would be a clear advantage.
- Excellent communication and interview skills.
- Excellent report writing skills.
- Demonstrated ability to deliver quality results within strict deadlines.

The National consultant should have the following qualifications:

- Master degree in Business Management, Economics or related graduate qualifications
- A minimum of seven years of professional experience, specifically in the area of monitoring and evaluation of international development initiatives and development organizations.
- A minimum of 5 years of professional experience specifically in evaluating development projects/programmes in the area of skills, employment, micro enterprises, entrepreneurship, rural development and management of development programmes, preferably in Africa.
- Demonstrated expertise and capability in assessing technical and vocational skills training in rural and informal economies, business support services in support of micro-enterprise development including entrepreneurship and small business management training, access to finance, business linkages and markets.
- A track record of conducting various types of evaluations, including process, outcome and impact evaluations in Zimbabwe and preferably in the area of skills, employment, entrepreneurship, rural development.
- Knowledge and experience of the UN System
- Excellent communication and interview skills.
- Excellent report writing skills.
- Demonstrated ability to deliver quality results within strict deadlines.

22. ANNEXES

The following annexes are part of these TORs:

ANNEX 1. Implementation Plan for the project.

ANNEX 2. List of stakeholders

ANNEX 3. INCEPTION REPORT OUTLINE

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165972/lang--en/index.htm

ANNEX 4. ILO Policy Guidelines for results-based evaluation.

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_168289/lang--en/index.htm

Annex 2: Field Work Schedule and List of Meetings

Field Visits Schedule

List of Meetings/interviews

Name of Partner	Date	Time
1. Dr.Shareef Ghoniem,ENGOSC	9/12/2014	8:00 am-10:00 am (confirmed)
2. CAPSCU trainers (Leadership and Management skills)	11/12/2014	8:00 am- 9:30 am (confirmed)
3. Ms.Perihan Abou Zaid, Studio Embaba (Handcraft)	11/12/2014	11:00am- 2:00 pm (confirmed)
4. Katherine Torres (backstopping Officer)	13/12/2014	
5. Eric Oechslin	14/12/2014	8:30 am - 9:10 am (confirmed)
6. Kholoud Alkhalidi		9:20 am - 10:00 am
7. Luca Fedi		10:10 am - 10:50 am
8. Mr.Mostafa Kamal, Ahl Misr Association for disabled	14/12/2014	2:00 pm - 4:00 pm
9. Ms.Sahar Ibrahim New Vision for Development, Minia	15/12/2014 16/12/2014	Exact time will be determined
10. FORTE ,textile factory visits (3) Mr. Yasser - Novotex	17/12/2014 18/12/2014	10:00 am- 3:00 pm (confirmed)
11. Dr.Sayed Kasseb, CAPSCU	20/12/2014	10:00 am - 12:00 pm (to be rescheduled if possible)
12. Ms. Hala Salah El Din, Khaled Abdel Hameed TRIA 10 th Ramadan. Visit factories to meet with beneficiaries	21/12/2014	10:00 am - 3:00 pm (confirmed)
13. Mona Mohamed Reda & Saber El-Maleh El-Horeya Food Industries	21/12/2014	
14. Faten Abdel Fatah Trainer FEI	15/12/2014	
15. Sahar Mounir Gender Consultant FEI	15/12/2014	
16. Nagy Al-Fayoumi FEI Chairman	22/12/2014	
17. Mohamed Farag	16/12/2014	

Independent General Union of Egyptian Farmers		
18. Zarea El-Bidani 19. Hamdy Gharabawy General Union of fishermen	16/12/2014	
20. Amr El-Amroussy Project consultant		

List of focus Group Discussions/general meetings

	Location	Profile of beneficiaries	Number of attendees
1	Pyramisa Hotel	CAPSCU Trainers	6
2	Imbaba	Handicraft trainees	20
3	Ahl Masr NGO	Get Ahead Trainees – women with special needs	5
4		Training and Job placement in textile factories	8
5		Training and Job placement in textile factories	5
6	Novoex Textile factory	Training and Job placement in textile factories	6
7	Al-Horeya Food Industries	Training and Job placement in textile factories	10
8	Al-Delta Food Industries	Training and Job placement in textile factories	10
9	CAPSCU	CAPSCU Trainees	8
10	FEI	Trainees of FEI (social dialogue – communication)	20

Annex 2: List of Stakeholders' meeting attendees

Annex 3 Attendees of Stakeholders' meeting