

Proceedings of the 50th Meeting of the CIS Network 20 – 21 November 2012, ILO Geneva

OVERVIEW

The ILO International Occupational Safety and Health Information Centre (CIS) held its 50th annual meeting on 20 and 21 November 2012 at the ILO Headquarter in Geneva. The main objective consisted of strengthening dialogue and collaboration between organizations actively engaged in generating, disseminating and using knowledge and information in safety and health at work, and more specifically:

- Exchange views on the roles, strategies, objectives and networking arrangements of CIS.
- Identify innovative products and services to develop on the basis of more effective institutional collaboration.
- Discuss possible international cooperation arrangements building on regional proximity, language, capacity development needs, and subject matter priorities.

The programme was built around five distinct sessions held on two days. In addition to introducing the proposed orientation and strategic development of CIS, the first day was an opportunity to hear from initiatives, successes and challenges of existing regional networks. The second day primarily aimed at exploring practical ways to facilitate and strengthen collaboration and cooperation with and among the members of the CIS network of OSH institutions, notably through identifying possible joint network products of common interest in relation to information services, research, education and publications.

DAY 1: OPENING SESSION

Welcome note by the Chief of SAFEWORK

Mr Seiji Machida, Chief of SAFEWORK, welcomed the participants and recalled the role of OSH information in national occupational safety and health systems. In his presentation, he pointed to the ILO estimates on work-related injuries, diseases and death and encouraged all countries to formulate national OSH programmes in collaboration with social partners and other stakeholders. He also informed that to this day 24 countries had ratified Convention 187 and that more ratification processes were underway. Finally, Mr Machida asked participants to be mindful of the role of information centres during the deliberations and to reflect on how to work together globally.

Introduction to the programme of the 50th meeting

2. Mr Claude D. Loiselle, new Coordinator of CIS, emphasised his honour to host the 50th meeting of the CIS network. He shared his convictions that existing OSH knowledge could be better used to fulfil its potential globally and nationally in a number of countries, and that modernizing CIS to promote and support international OSH knowledge and information sharing was needed. He recalled the pioneering role of CIS over the last decades and listed some of the key development issues and possible initiatives to be discussed during the meeting. He thanked the participants for responding positively to the invitation and reassured them that the outcomes of the meeting would be used as realistically as possible in paving the way forward. Mr Loiselle then described the proposed programme, and called for the election of the Chairperson and Secretary for the two-day meeting.

Election of the Chairperson and Secretary of the meeting and adoption of the agenda

3. Ms Suvi Lehtinen from the Finnish Institute of Occupational Health (FIOH) was elected by acclamation as Chairperson. Professor Abdeljalil El Kholti from the Institut National des Conditions de Vie au Travail (INCVT) in Morocco volunteered to act as Secretary of the meeting and was elected. The agenda was adopted with a slight arrangement in the timetable (see Appendix A).

Day 1: Session A – Current OSH knowledge and information at the ILO

CIS current development challenges

- 4. The Coordinator of CIS gave a presentation titled "Mobilizing knowledge forces to protect life at work globally" introducing the main development challenges of the CIS. He explained that CIS somehow holds a dual status within ILO, being both a technical sub-unit and the secretariat of a global network of OSH agencies, institutions and organizations. Special arrangements allowed CIS to gain extra-budgetary incomes from pooling technical material in OSH and disseminating bibliographic references for 50 years. He informed that the reform of the ILO policy portfolio and management initiated by the new Director General could bring important changes ahead in view of the continuing decline in income from subscriptions and royalties and the corresponding erosion of technical, organizational and financial capacities of the CIS over the last decade. Mr Loiselle outlined the main drivers calling for the overdue modernization of the CIS; and referred to high expectations to move from collecting and disseminating OSH information only, to rather fully develop as the knowledge arm of the ILO in OSH, assisting Member States to use knowledge and information in OSH to the fullest extent possible for leveraging effective prevention in workplaces. He then set out 10 key challenges facing the CIS for this vision to materialize.
- 5. On an Institutional level, the tasks ahead to secure a future for the CIS are to conduct further consultations with concerned institutions, stakeholders and social partners; foster partnerships and mobilize resources. Mr Loiselle informed that the Office will be submitting to the ILO Governing Body in October 2013 a programme and budget proposal for the CIS with a renewed mission statement clarifying its strategic roles and objectives, defining inclusive governance modalities and effective working arrangements, as well as resource allocation needs.

Outcome of the November 2011 CIS discussion on the ILO OSH Knowledge and Information Strategy

- 6. Mr Steve Horvath (CCOSH/Canada) expressed his gratitude for the opportunity to summarize the November 2011 special meeting with selected OSH institutions, in which Mr Seiji Machida and Ms Manuela Tomei (Director, ILO/PROTRAV) took part. He explained that there was a great deal of discussion and feedback and that in each session, challenges and questions were put forward. These included:
 - a) Information sharing: Summary Appreciation for the fact that OSH is broadening and includes health promotion. Information sharing is the key component of any National OSH system. CIS network offers an opportunity to share information through this framework.
 - b) Discussion on improving OSH knowledge at enterprise level: Directly impact on changing managers and workers behaviour in workplace.
 - c) Discussion on targeting migrant workers: Significant impact through all jurisdictions. At the end of session Mr Seiji Machida put forward concrete steps, one directly impacting use of resources
 - d) Discussion on CIS website: Make more user-friendly and accessible for different target groups

- e) Use of social media and various potentials: Recognition that if ILO chooses this, it will require additional staffing resources. CCOSH has a proactive social media strategy which requires on-going input from staff, but provides benefits in terms of increased web traffic.
- f) Information products needed to define beneficiary group: Target who exactly is beneficiary of whatever the product is we are looking at. Worker? OSH specialists? Small/large enterprises? Industrialized /developing countries.
- g) Call for evaluation on usefulness of products: CCOSH and NIOSH use Google analytics to track which area of web being used and what kind of coverage in regions, etc.
- h) Review of the ILO OSH Encyclopaedia: New content management system. Call for more flexibility and ability to rapidly update the new encyclopaedia. Discussion from CIS network members for good coordination required and clear strategy on who does what.
- i) Sharing good OSH practices. Real issue to define various themes/sectors/target groups within good practices and create information packages to deliver directly to groups. Content should comply with ILO criteria. Discussion about avoiding duplication of databases, notably EU-OSHA database. How CIS could build on and add to existing databases instead of necessarily creating their own. Call from developing countries for simplified information, picture formats, and multilingual situations.
- j) OSH legislation database presented: There was a suggestion it could be used as advocacy tool, to establish a common framework of legislation across world. Call on CIS networks to present information on new legislation at national level.
- k) Discussion on CIS centres and network: What are expectations of CIS network? What is this organisation looking to us to provide? Clarify in more meaningful terms. There is also the fact that there are a lot of inactive members in CIS network. Discussion about more frequent updating of contact information. Clarify objectives of CIS network. Membership requirements part of this? Suggestion put to ILO to consider.
- Understanding of critical nature of ILO in this process: What ILO brings to this is a unique global perspective – pool together regional issues into overall framework and reference point.
- m) Agencies expressed support for collaboration in process: Need for clear tasks for individual membership. Seiji Machida extended appreciation and put forward concrete steps. One was asking CCOH&S for proposal collecting multilingual material for migrant workers. Mr Horvath explained that CCOSH has established a web portal addressing criteria. This has posed significant challenges. The aim was to use information out there within CIS networks in their own language and create a web portal where that can be shared directly with workplaces. There has been discussion with the Finnish institute regarding a proposal for sharing OSH information with SMEs.
- 7. Mr Fathi Hassan Badawi (Kuwait) commented that his country faces similar multilingual challenges. He stressed the importance of working together in finding a solution for workers who speak Hindi, Urdu, Arabic, etc.
- 8. Mr Horvath replied by referring to the fact that a major driver for change in Canada was a tragedy involving migrant workers from Kazakhstan on a construction site. This led to a Royal Commission investigation which concluded the need to provide relevant safety information to migrants that do not have English or French as a first language. He stressed the importance of leveraging resources to provide directly, hence the web portal design initiative.

Latest news on traditional CIS information products and services

9. Dr Begoña Casanueva (CIS Senior Technical Officer) referred to the CISDOC database containing more than 70'000 bibliographical references in OSH. She mentioned that, even though useful to some, the update of the database and the production of the CISDOC-TEXT collection of CD-ROMs (derivative product) had been discontinued in January 2012, and since then alternate

- ways of making this wealth of knowledge available are being sought. The CISDOC database archived material will remain available as an ILO online information resource.
- 10. Dr Casanueva informed that the Thesaurus is becoming an online multilingual tool which can be used for translation purposes notably, and for tagging and/or cataloguing OSH material. This tool currently offers a compilation of over 15'000 terms on OSH in English, French and Spanish, where terms are organized hierarchically according to technical specificity. The online version is scheduled to be available during the summer 2013, the current development of this tool will enable the addition of languages in the future.
- 11. Her presentation continued with the International Chemical Safety Cards (ICSC) consisting of a collection of short datasheets containing essential OSH information on chemicals. There are currently about 1'700 cards available that are updated and peer-reviewed in English first, then translated into additional languages by national institutions. A new automated translation module for those cards is being pilot-tested and should be available later in 2013. She underlined the long-term ILO partnership with the World Health Organization (WHO) leading the ICSC project with the support of the European Union.
- 12. On an ending note, she brought attention on the e-OSH 2012 DVD included in the participants' meeting folder. CIS produces yearly since 2011 this DVD and distributes it as part of ILO promotional activities. It is a repository of ILO OSH related documents and publications in English, French and Spanish, including the ILO Encyclopaedia of OH&S, ICSCs, ILO Conventions and Recommendations, and others.
- 13. Mr Roman Litvyakov (CIS Senior Technical Officer) provided indications on the use of ILO OSH web site: With approximately 900'000 hits/year, the web site remains within the 3 most visited of the ILO considered together, noting that the number of mobile users has doubled. He pointed to slight improvement on existing aspects and to a new section created in September 2012 on OSH country profiles gathering information on the ratification of OSH conventions, main OSH legislation, policies and programmes, authorities and bodies, information and advisory services. He invited the participants to provide complementary information about their country. He also shared the orientation adopted within the CIS for developing its web resources in 2013 (www.ilo.org/cis).
- 14. Mr Litvyakov informed the participants on progress made with the Online Edition of ILO Encyclopaedia of OH&S. After much hope and deliberations, the design and programming of the web content management system for the Encyclopaedia was finalized by Professor Stellman and her team in the United Sates, and is now accessible through an ILO Geneva based server (www.ilo.org/oshenc). The Encyclopaedia web site is meant to become the worldwide portal to OSH knowledge and information linking dynamically to additional resources available throughout the world with the support of powerful search routines integrated into the Encyclopaedia content management system. He later referred to the forthcoming presentation by the Coordinator of CIS on the work performed on developing a comprehensive strategy to update and extend the content of the Encyclopaedia.

New Global Database on OSH Legislation

15. Ms Manal Azzi (CIS Technical Officer) introduced the concept and general features of the Global Database on OSH Legislation which is currently being elaborated as a new CIS information product with the support of the Government of South Korea, notably. She explained that this project aims to provide an overview of the structure and content of the OSH legislation in individual countries. It will also be used to benchmark local provisions and compare best practices as a means to help identify trends across regions and countries of similar level of economic and social development. The database will contain extracts of legislative texts classified under a set of descriptors covering most OSH related legal requirements. She pointed

to the challenges of collecting and maintaining the content of the database up-to-date and accurate, and in this regard called upon the CIS meeting participants to actively engage in helping the ILO access country legislation; provide translation where need be; keep the ILO informed of amendments in the OSH legislation field and eventually play a key role in the update and maintenance of this database. The initial template used for collecting initial information was distributed to the participants.

Updating and extending the content of the online edition of the ILO Encyclopaedia of OH&S

- 16. From the very start of his presentation, the new Coordinator of CIS recognized that previous attempts to produce a 5th edition of the ILO Encyclopaedia of OH&S have failed, and indicated that a set of critical decisions need to be made before engaging further development work on this flagship product. Mr Loiselle highlighted the investment made by the ILO in publishing the Encyclopaedia in 1930, 1971, 1983 and 1998 indicating that cost recovery through sales has been practically non-existent for the 4th edition. He stressed that the Encyclopaedia benefits of a high perceived value but its production comes at a high cost in a context of competing priorities and resource stagnation.
- 17. Mr Loiselle mentioned that the ILO is no longer considering a 5th Edition but rather the continuing update and extension of the Online Edition of ILO Encyclopaedia of OH&S introduced earlier, and that in any case developing innovative partnerships seem to be the only way forward, by highlighting the need for participatory scientific governance of the updating process through a Scientific Advisory Committee (SAC) supported by subject-matter technical panels. He drew attention to options being discussed, positioning them on a continuum between a "let's get started" approach and a "set conditions first" approach. He went on to explain the first option which would involve selecting priority topics, identifying and hiring technical expertise on a case-by-case basis using available budgetary resources as opportune; while the latter would involve developing a collaboration framework for mobilizing and coordinating complimentary technical contributions from leading OSH institutions' on the basis of negotiated cooperation arrangements, along with securing funding for undertaking a full update cycle over an extended period of time. In conclusion, Mr Loiselle set out some essential steps forward for the ILO in undertaking this daunting task, and ended his remark by stressing that important decisions need to be made internally in the fluid context of the on-going ILO reform. He appealed to participants for their input in this strategic decision-making process.

Plenary session

- 18. Professor Konstantin Todradze (Russian Federation) commented that he had participated in the third and fourth edition of the encyclopaedia and that these editions had been translated into Russian, published in Russian and resources had been invested to disseminate it in all regions and departments in Russian. He inquired as to whether a Russian expert had been included on the list of authors for the fifth edition. He made reference to significant migration issues, SMEs, microenterprises, etc. He reiterated desire of the Russian Federation to participate more actively and translate new content into Russian.
- 19. The Coordinator of CIS, Mr Loiselle, expressed gratitude and delight at this willingness to contribute. However, he highlighted that this was for an online edition rather than a fifth edition and that there were no plans as yet for a paper edition. He underscored the guiding role of the Scientific Advisory Committee and balanced governance of the updating and extension project so that Encyclopaedia reflects different approaches, cultures, etc.
- 20. Ms Barbara Szczepanowska (CIOP/Poland) commended the CIS team on their tremendous efforts in providing so many sources of information already.

- 21. On a technical note, Mr Litvyakov (ILO-CIS) added that the IT platform on which the online Encyclopaedia is established is flexible and offers the possibility to post content is multiple languages. As such, web tools can be provided should a country be interested in translating content.
- 22. Mr Loiselle took the opportunity to inform the audience that the ILO holds copyright for the 4th Edition of the Encyclopaedia for only 3 of the 7 languages in which it exists, as national institutes hold copyright on translations that they undertook. This means that individual agreements are required to disseminate translated content through the ILO web site. He informed that preliminary steps have been taken to make available online the French and Russian editions.
- 23. Dr Margaret Kitt (NIOSH/USA) commented that at the November 2011 meeting referred to by Mr Horvath, there was discussion as to whether to adopt an opportunistic approach or a strategic approach to updating, and wished to know whether the foreseen Scientific Advisory Committee would help strategize the way forward.
- 24. In response, Mr Loiselle stated that he hoped this would be the case. He underscored the importance of developing strong partnership with OSH institutes across the world as they are the primary contributors to the Encyclopaedia.
- 25. The Chairperson added that, from a CIS centres' point of view, it is very important to see the whole content outline in order to see where the network can contribute to submitting articles in working together with other CIS centres.
- 26. Mr Fathi Hassan Badawi (Kuwait) expressed his belief that language plays a significant role in industry, with workforces coming from China, India, Arab countries, etc. He said that the CIS centres must play a key role in translating this information for the workforce and that CIS centres need to communicate between themselves.
- 27. Mr Machida (ILO-SafeWork) agreed that language is very important, especially in terms of migrant workers. However, he stressed that this translation has to be arranged to meet target groups and that ILO-CIS needs the network's help with that. He referred to funding limitations and that funds are needed to update the Encyclopaedia and develop other products. He encouraged local initiatives for translation and said he would appreciate active discussion with governments in the Arab region and elsewhere. Greater contribution is expected from the network to help balance funds.
- 28. Dr Do Tran Hai (NILP/Vietnam) agreed that language is of utmost importance in the field of protection and for developing training material. He suggested that the ILO could help with some of the occupational training and research, and proposed a shared funding initiative for translating key documentation. He also asked a question regarding copyright ownership.
- 29. Mr Loiselle welcomed the idea while underlining that the ILO being a tripartite organisation, ACTRAV could potentially support the strengthening of capacities of workers' organisations, notably through workers' education programmes. Translation of some parts of the Encyclopaedia could feed into educational programmes specifically targeting this organisation.
- 30. Dr. Farida Iles (INPRP/Algeria) referred back to presentation on the Global database on OSH legislation. She pointed out that there were a great number of foreign investors in Algeria and often they come with their own legislation. They then need help in adapting their legislation to national legislation. She asked if the content of the database could be translated into French or Arabic.
- 31. Mr Machida wished to answer by explaining that the legal database is still in the early stages of development. Completion of this work in English alone is a monumental task. The aim is to translate next year but no funds have been found as yet. Mr Loiselle added that the English

version is intended to be the common denominator. In the database there will be direct access to legislation insofar as we are given authorisation. Then those interested in analysing the legislation in Algeria, for example, could gain an overview and subsequently look at details of legislation and carry out a more specific analysis.

DAY 1: SESSION B - WORLDWIDE DEVELOPMENTS IN OSH KNOWLEDGE AND INFORMATION

Innovations and latest developments by members of the CIS network: a) OSH information resources; b) knowledge-sharing practices; c) networking and collaboration

- 32. Ms Boryana Barbukova (BGCIS/Bulgaria) and Ms Aleksandra Atanasovska (MOSHA/The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia) explained in a joint presentation how they met for the first time during the CIS meeting in 2009. Subsequently, the BGCIS was invited to share knowledge on legal regulations in Bulgaria at the "First International Conference on OSH Management Systems" the year after. Cooperation continued with mutual visits of delegations and exchange of information. MOSHA works on dissemination of know-how through their website. A Master degree in OSHA was also launched one year ago. Work is currently underway on the translation of ILO Encyclopaedia of OH&S. The general outcomes of their collaboration are promotion of ILO activities and information products in OSH, the extension of the CIS network and the promotion of OSH in the region.
- 33. Ms Barbara Szczepanowska (CIOP/Poland) presented the main areas of activities of CIOP as being research and development in the field of OSH and ergonomics; standardisation; testing and certification; technical solutions and software; education and training; publications and posters on OSH. She explained that CIOP ran a national programme to adapt working conditions in Poland to EU standards. The new national programme aims to improve safety and working conditions. An OSH promotion unit within the institute takes part in national and international events, organises partnerships, poster competitions, etc. An English version of the Polish CIS Centre's website is being developed. CIS Thesaurus was also translated into Polish and adapted for CIOP-PIB library needs.
- 34. Dr Imad Abdulkhaleq Saber (Iraq) described the role and scope of work of the CIS National Centre with some historical background information. He explained that since 2003 the national centre is part of the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs. He set out the values as: delivery of services to working population; credibility, transparency, teamwork cooperation and continuous promotion, and stated that most employees are university graduates in medicine, veterinary, biology, physics, chemistry, engineering, agriculture, and law. He enumerated the main functions as providing advices, training and education; conducting risk analysis, research; diagnosis of occupational diseases and the study of their magnitude at national level. He explained that personnel are also involved in other duties at national level such as in the HIV/AIDS programme, committee of psychological wellbeing, board for eradication of narcotics and drug abuse, committee on depleted uranium, disability evaluation committee, asbestos hazards and control measures, etc.
- 35. Dr David Smeatham (HSE/UK) presented a new section of the HSE web site designed to outreach to SMEs having practical needs when it comes to OSH information. He showed participants the HSE toolbox for SMEs which gives details of what people need to know and do to manage health and safety effectively. The site provides brief descriptions of typical risk areas and helps reader to understand how they can recognise whether there is a problem and what to do about it, e.g. noise. He also referred to the study conducted on the successful management of OSH in building the 2012 Olympic park, and briefly introduced issues featured on the website, e.g. occupational cancer and research to underpin policy.
- 36. Dr Luise Vassie (IOSH/UK) began her presentation by pointing out that IOSH is the only chartered international body for health and safety professionals. Their aim is to dedicate

information for professionals, including guidance tools and online resources. IOSH also funds research and development of innovative material, and is involved in international projects on knowledge-sharing (e.g. ILO Encyclopaedia, EUSAFE project to develop a professional qualification and training framework, ENSHPO, INSHPO). She referred to their advocacy role, notably for the World Day for Safety and Health at Work, extensive networking and collaboration with 300 small and large events in campaigning and lobbying for better safety and health. Finally, she informed that IOSH continues working with governments and OSH bodies in The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Serbia, Turkey and Romania as part of the EU new accession countries initiative.

- 37. Ms Courtney Drennan from Edith Cowan University in Western Australia provided a student perspective. She expressed the importance of representing the next generation. She felt that the legislation databases and Encyclopaedia were wonderful initiatives. She stressed that these types of information cannot be effective if they cannot be accessed as it had been mentioned earlier that payment may be introduced which may restrict access. She underlined that would affect her, teachers, and trainers in the OSH field, and therefore would be detrimental to effective prevention in the workplace.
- 38. The Chairperson welcomed a special guest, Mr Airat Shafigullin, Minister of Labour Employment and Social Protection from the Republic of Tatarstan of the Russian Federation, wishing to join the ILO-CIS network. After briefly describing the industrial fabric in the Republic of Tatarstan, he explained that one of the key priorities is to improve health and safety at work, productivity and quality along with modernizing production capacity through strategic investment. He explained that since 1991 they have already been working on solving OSH-related problems, disseminating information, holding conferences, training specialists and conducting research. The Minister emphasized that if the *Qualification Development Regional Agency* would become a member of the CIS network, it would allow them to learn from other existing experiences elsewhere through exchange of information with other ILO-CIS Centres, and thus improve their practices and enrich the services provided to the enterprises in order to lower the number of occupational accidents and diseases. He concluded by requesting the management of the CIS network to welcome the Agency as a new member, and to provide them with the necessary information and documents with which to start a very fruitful cooperation.
- 39. Mr Seiji Machida addressed the participants to mention that World Day 2013 would focus on the prevention of occupational diseases. He explained that there is a lack of data on occupational diseases officially recognized in each country. The list of occupational diseases annexed to Recommendation 194 was updated two years ago. He called for support in coming up with diagnostic criteria or national initiatives.
- 40. The Coordinator of CIS summed up the session, referring to the most salient aspects of the individual presentations.

Innovations from technical cooperation projects and activities: EUSAFE – Development of a qualification and training framework for health and safety professionals

41. Mr Claudio Munforti EUSAFE Project Manager (www.eusafe.org) was invited by the Coordinator of CIS to present the main outcomes. The scope of the project was to develop new harmonised profiles for OH&S technicians, professionals and managers, with reference to the European Qualification Framework (EQF) under the ECVET credit system. It aims at fostering mobility of OSH technicians and professionals within the EU, provide governments with a basis for comparison, self-development, training for employers and trade unions. Providing illustrations of the work achieved, he explained the main activities consisted of conducting a research on regulatory requirements in European states, as well as an assessment of the current situation for which IOSH, key partner of the EUSAFE project, brought a major contribution. This exercise proved useful in defining competencies profiles using the EQF standard classification for OSH

- technicians (level 4 & 5) for managers (level 6 & 7), from a grid of 8 levels (from basic to R&D), using EurOSHM and EurOSHT standards (ENSHPO) as benchmarks. Mr Munforti indicated that results were to be disseminated across the 27 EU countries, and beyond through international networking in OSH.
- 42. In response to Mr Renan Alfonso Rojas Gutierrez (CCS/Columbia) for additional information, Mr Munforti explained that it is possible to get familiar with the concept of EQF. He also pointed out to the matrix provided as hand-out that can be adapted to apply to local situations. At the invitation of Mr Loiselle to expand on the connection with the world of work as part of the project implementation strategy, he highlighted the importance of demonstrating ability in practice, beyond the ability to acquire theoretical knowledge. He also explained that matching and bridging academia with professional life was part of the approach, through life-long learning.

Experiences and recent achievements from existing regional networks

English-speaking African countries

43. Ms Mary Muchengeti (ARLAC/Zimbabwe) described ARLAC (African Regional Labour Administration Centre) as an organisation jointly constituted by the ILO and UNDP in 1974, and became an independent organisation in 1982. ARLAC draws its membership from 20 member countries and pursues the following objectives: training, consultancy and advisory services, studies and research, information services (e.g. OSH risks) and producing training materials. She highlighted that their biggest achievement of late has been the offer of post graduate programmes in Labour and Employment studies in collaboration with the University of Lagos, Nigeria. They also collaborate closely with the ILO and advise membership on the application of ILO instruments. ARLAC appreciates that OSH awareness is critical and are actively involved in promoting a safety culture (media, radio, TV useful). She expressed the need for wider partnerships to influence hard-to-reach workplaces. She explained that the prevailing rate of workplace accidents, partially obtained with great difficulties through member countries, shows that education is key to prevention, starting from school level. ARLAC has developed practical and easy-to-use training materials, on a tripartite basis, and carries out many training activities but they cannot be as detailed as desired due to lack of resources, and challenging funding mechanism.

Latin America

44. Mr Renan Alfonso Rojas Gutierrez (CCS/Colombia) and representative of ALASEHT (Asociación Latino Americana de Seguridad e Higiene en el Trabajo) explained it was created in Buenos Aires in 1977 as a private non-profit organisation. It has 9 active institution members from Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Columbia, Ecuador, Mexico, Panama, Peru and Uruguay, Costa Rica (3x), Paraguay and Venezuela, and receives support from Spain through MAPFRE (private insurance multinational). ALASEHT aims to provide knowledge, exchange and actions and seeks to facilitate and promote development of safety through risk prevention of accidents and occupational health protection of the environment to maintain and improve the quality of life in Latin American countries, as well as productivity, competitiveness and sustainable development. Mr Rojas Gutierrez indicated that in 2015 ALASEHT will be recognised as a private non-profit professional enterprise and will have an active presence in economic integration processes and multilateral trade agreements (MERCOSUR). He referred to the following initiatives: Establishment of a library management system to pool all CIS information services and each associate in other countries; sharing experience amongst specialised agencies on risk of accidents; exchange of legal regulations and standards; facilitating capacity building; promoting and disseminating technical and scientific research studies on the subject; exchange of highly qualified professionals to promote technical assistance. Mr Rojas Gutierrez concluded by

underscoring results of an inquiry in which a low level of commitment on part of CIS national centres was detected. He called for greater visibility of institutions on the webpage. He also expressed the need for greater communication within Latin America, not to mention elsewhere and commended the initiative for a regional approach to CIS networking.

Asian countries

45. Mr José María S. Batino (OSHC-DOLE/Philippines) and Mr Nualon Akarapong (OSHB-DLPW/Thailand) jointly presented the ASEAN OSHNET created with the support of the ILO and UNDP with the aim of establishing an ASEAN training centre or network for the improvement of working conditions and the environment. They indicated that there was beneficial cooperation and solidarity amongst national OSH institutions of ASEAN countries including: promotion, training and research, flow of information and harmonisation of OSH standards, and outlined the current division of work among countries, e.g. Thailand is responsible for information, the Philippines for training, and so forth. They referred to their Plan of Action 2011-2015 aiming at raising the profile of the ASEAN OSHNET (regional conference with tripartite structure); benchmarking of OSH performances in the region; strengthening regional and international cooperation beyond current partner countries and international organisations. Mr Akarapong developed further on the provision of OSH information, particularly through web-based tools, for dissemination and information sharing, using as an example the ASEAN guidelines on chemical classification (in 3 languages in Thailand), e-service tools and safety posters. Concluding, he listed the challenges of knowing how to present information and how to disseminate to other parts of the region.

European countries

- 46. Mr Tim Tregenza (EU-OSHA) introduced some of the work of EU-OSHA. Their role is to cover health and safety at work for EU and pre-accession states and other networks. He then focussed on reasons for engaging in networking, such as creating social capital, exchanging ideas and achieving joint results for maximum benefit, notably by avoiding duplication and facilitating cooperation. He stressed that networking OSH is done at Member States level, EU and at the broader international level. Mr Tregenza referred to an ESENER study conducted in 35 countries which revealed the motivation for taking action in OSH was the legal obligation, while the main reason for not acting was the lack of awareness, noting that the smaller the enterprise, the less need for OSH they perceived.
- 47. He then referred to the EU-OSHA campaign run every two years; the current theme being "leadership and worker participation" and the campaign starting in 2014 will be on "practical solutions for psychosocial risks". He shared information about OiRA (online interactive risk assessment tool) which is a platform whereby stakeholders can create targeted risk assessment tools for their key areas which can then be shared elsewhere in Europe. He also introduced participants to "NAPO" an ideal tool for training migrant workers as it uses short animated clips illustrating specific health and safety issues. Mr Tregenza then outlined the challenge of anticipating future risks and stressed that by collecting resources, a picture of future risks can be gathered (e.g. ageing workforce in Europe).
- 48. He concluded by highlighting the success factors for OSH networking: 1) build on existing structures and resources; 2) active support of network members, not just information relay; 3) seek synergies; 4) mainstream OSH into other policy areas, for example with education; and 5) be a "superconnector"!

Questions & Answers

49. The Chairperson welcomed a number of comments and questions. This provided the opportunity for Mr Rojas Gutierez to explain the benefit of aligning ALASEHT with free trade

- agreements and areas of economic integration (MERCOSUR), mainly for two reasons: 1) to ensure that issues of safety, health and environment are taken into account in agreements between Latin American countries given that the same level of political awareness and interest does not exist in all countries; 2) Free trade agreements with US, Canada, EU contain two important chapters that need to be taken into account: a Chapter on Labour issues that includes health and safety at work and the environment protection chapter.
- 50. Responding to a query about the demands addressed to ARLAC in OSH, Ms Muchengeti explained that OSH is a recurring request but due to the fact that ARLAC covers all aspects of labour administration, they have to combine different aspects of OSH into other topics, and as a consequence they offer only two workshops on OSH specifically. She indicated this is why they have introduced the Master programme in Nigeria, and developing collaboration with other universities, e.g. Egypt, Zimbabwe and Kenya. She emphasised the role of ILO in providing technical expertise in delivering those workshops.
- 51. To Mr Munforti commenting that he expected to hear that one of the barriers for taking action in OSH was the wrong perception of safety has a cost, Mr Tregenza explained that, while the legal obligation was the main driver for change, the results of the ESENER study also pointed to economic factors which varied across sectors e.g. construction; manufacturing. He mentioned the results were available on the website, and that their next survey will encompass enterprises down to five workers in size, and will cover agriculture.
- 52. With regard to mainstreaming OSH into supply-chain management, Mr Tregenza replied to the participant that this is one of the main challenges EU-OSHA is looking at as part of their current campaign on leadership and worker participation. He underlined that if a business wants to be taken seriously, it has to set an example within the supply-chain, highlight by the same token that reputation can be a real driver for improving health and safety.
- 53. Mr Tregenza also explained to Mr Makhonge (DOSHS/Kenya) raising a concern on the practicality of mainstreaming OSH in education when teachers themselves lack the necessary knowledge, that this is achieved as part of a long-term project, and that indeed the first challenge is educating teachers and the second getting themes onto curriculum. In primary and secondary school, this is integrated into other topics. He admitted it is more of a challenge at university level as universities like to hold on tight to what they teach. He referred to a "whole school approach", taking Sweden as a model which even addresses the harm done by bullying and is included in risk assessment for the school as a whole.
- 54. The Chairperson expressed an interest in Mr Batino's mention of several countries sharing responsibilities within the ASEAN OSHNET by taking a lead in certain areas and asked how this was achieved in practice. He replied that this was through an agreement among member States, based on the expertise of each country.
- 55. A discussion ensued as to any other regional networks people would be aware of. The Chairperson highlighted the importance of being "superconnectors" and mentioned the Northern Dimension Partnership in Public Health and Social Wellbeing, the Baltic Sea Network on Occupational Health and Safety, and the South East European Network on Workers' Health. Others went on to mention: the Réseau Magrébin de Santé au Travail (REMSAT); INSHPO (construction); Réseau de Recherche en Santé et Sécurité du Travail du Québec (RRSSTQ); Inter-Africaine de Prévention des Risques Professionnels (IAPRP); International Association of Labour Inspectors (IALI); Asia-Pacific Occupational Safety and Health Organization (APOSHO); Partnership for European Research in Occupational Safety and Health (PEROSH); among others.
- 56. The Chairperson thanked everybody for their hard work, invited everybody to the drinks reception and closed the meeting at 5.26 p.m.

Day 2: Session C - Mobilising strengths for prevention

57. After a welcome word by the Chairperson opening the second day, Mr Loiselle introduced the programme as primarily exploring practical ways to facilitate and strengthen collaboration and cooperation with and between the members of the CIS network.

Exploring the possibilities for joint network activities in parallel sub-group discussions

- 58. The Coordinator of CIS initiated the first discussion of the day consisting of identifying possible joint network products of common interest in relation to information services, research, education and publications. He referred to changing needs in OSH knowledge and information, and illustrated his observation saying that forty years ago it was relevant for the ILO-CIS to develop and disseminate technical fact sheets on safety of hand tools, safe use of ladders and how to set up ergonomic work stations for example. He argued that anyone searching the web for any of these today will find everything they need and even more. However, there are other areas of international OSH knowledge and information sharing for which the ILO-CIS could play a more significant role.
- 59. Mr Loiselle highlighted that network members are already very active in research in OSH, working with universities and academic programmes, setting up training institutes, offering OSH information and advisory services. He shared his view that it was time to look forward and assess what could be achieved in terms of innovative joint network activities that will be meeting tomorrow's needs for OSH knowledge and information globally. He went on to describe the morning session consisting of four separate group discussions that participants had already registered for. The session then broke up, each with one ILO representative and a rapporteur to discuss the following topics:
 - A. Knowledge & information sharing tools (subject-matter web platforms, e-Newsletter, etc.)
 - B. OSH knowledge and information products (databases, Encyclopaedia, others)
 - C. Joint research projects (identification of priority areas and topics of mutual interest)
 - D. Education and training programmes in OSH (University curricula, OSH in TVET, distance & elearning, international internships, study missions, etc.)

Feedback from working groups

60. Upon return from group discussions, the Chairperson informed that Mr Loiselle agreed to facilitate this session. He then thanked the participants and invited the designated rapporteurs to join the tribune and provide feedback.

Group A: Knowledge & information sharing tools

61. Mr Smeatham (HSE/UK) acting as rapporteur for Group A with 16 participants informed that two particular issues were discussed, e.g. sharing between CIS centres and sharing information with specific stakeholders, notably employers and worker as well as others. With regard to the first issue, the group felt there's a need for three particular inventories: 1st an inventory of newsletters targeting different audiences would be useful as the Finnish African and Asian-Pacific Newsletters for example; 2nd a list of every centre websites and in particular an inventory of what is on them; and 3rd an inventory of experts to assist countries find expertise to deal with particular needs they would have. As for the second area for particular tools, the group would welcome tools to help centres reach out to workers. It could be some common information that could be developed together and then translated into different languages on particular topic areas. Attention could be given to using social media for reaching to young workers for the matter. Another set of tools are needed to reach SMEs. Writing guidance in very simple forms, introduce topics to help people understand what the risks are, and how those risks can be controlled, not in academic language but in simple language, would prove useful.

62. Mr Smeatham reported that Group A wished the CIS network would develop knowledge and information sharing tools allowing for good mobile access, notably for users not having access or using internet on computers. Where platforms exist for sharing information through mobile devices, the CIS should be looking at what works and sharing this information. He also mentioned that a message board would be useful to keep CIS Centres informed of the issues that different colleagues are facing, either for seeking peer support or sharing good examples. Finally, the CIS was also invited to look into the opportunity for increased uses of wikis to edit or import resources onto a shared information hub. He reminded that a lot of material already exists and it's a case of facilitating its sharing so that all can learn from that expertise.

Group B: OSH knowledge and information products

- 63. Ms Elly Goos (Netherlands) acted as rapporteur and informed the group consisted of 10 people, partly from EU countries and partly from Asia, highlighting this determined the outcomes of the discussion which primarily focused on products and language. As a result she indicated that the CIS should focus on English as it is most widely understood. She mentioned the CISDOC database was discussed thoroughly and informed its main users were researchers and students. Ms Goos referred to problems contributing to this database because of time restraints mainly but also because CISDOC is not the first priority in various organisations. Group B was of the opinion that it might be a good idea to focus on another product, e.g. that CIS centres could send lists of new acquisitions to the ILO-CIS with bibliographic data and if possible a summary, noting that a good idea would be to drop the "CISDOC" branding as it's no longer updated, underlining the fact that keeping it prominent on the website may undermine the image of CIS, while it could be kept as an archived database. She also shared the observation to the effect that the CIS website could be made more user-friendly.
- 64. Another major point of discussion reported by Ms Goos was the use of translation which is of particular importance for Asian countries where there's a large need for translating CIS information into local languages. Suggestion for CIS to work more with some regional centres that have the capacity and resources to engage into translation work, citing in example the Korean centre that translated resource material not only into Korean but also into other languages of the region. In this connection, there remains a clear need for countries to share local information through the CIS country profile pages as a means to enhance international visibility of the work of each centre while having the possibility to add links to information products in national languages as appropriate. Lastly, Group B discussed the feasibility for CIS centres to contribute to the global database on OSH legislation as not all centres have a legal department to provide the detailed information needed, especially in view of keeping content up-to-date.

Group C: Joint research projects

- 65. Mr Claudio Munforti acted as rapporteur for Group C in which 12 people participated. He informed they started by brainstorming on items with a focus on sector-specific topics and others of potential interest, and then explored some ideas more in-depth to make a list of proposals. He highlighted the relevance of first assessing what is already available in order to optimise the use of research capacities. He then enumerated areas of general interest identified for possible joint research projects as follows:
 - a) Dialogue in OSH and in particular how education and training of workers' representatives enable effective engagement in tackling OSH challenges;
 - b) Identification of safety requirements in the informal economy along with awareness raising practices to promote good working conditions in informal micro and small enterprises;

- c) Qualification and education practices notably to assess whether the outcomes of the EUSAFE project could extend and be applied beyond countries of the European Union;
- d) Scope of adaptation to different OSH legislative frameworks by multinational corporations doing business in various countries;
- e) Functioning of OSH knowledge institutions around the world to provide an overview to support networking and deployment of safety and health programmes;
- f) Global investigations on occupational diseases with a special focus on carcinogenic substances;
- g) Accident reporting and recording practices worldwide in support to broader standardisation;
- h) Health and safety in Mining was an area of some concern to participants from African countries having common interest and need for support;
- i) Monitoring of investment in OSH research against key indicators to document global trends in OSH R&D.
- 66. Mr Munforti reminded all to pay attention to organize properly such joint research projects from the earliest stage in order to facilitate the transferability and usability of their outcomes. He added a few items not directly pertaining to Group C but rather to the area of information sharing for which he suggested to add sharing best practices in OSH and accident case history in a database.

Group D: Education and training programmes in OSH

- 67. Ms Muchengeti acting as rapporteur for Group D proceeded with providing a generic report on discussions by first enumerating the various challenges identified, knowing all geographic regions were represented in the group and all have different challenges. The lack of qualified personnel to provide appropriate OSH training, which she referred to as being linked to a limited number of accrediting institutions, appears as a key challenge. The group noted that OSH is becoming a business, and therefore OSH training is not being done with the sincerity it deserves, and referred to a need to mainstream OSH education into all levels. Many have difficulties reaching target groups including workers in agriculture, SMEs, the informal sector, and also children. Language barriers also present a challenge notably when it concerns migrant workers and minority groups. She then pointed to the general lack of resources among member countries represented in the discussion.
- 68. The rapporteur then presented ideas for moving forward such as: identifying training institutions and network of experts to conduct training of trainers' programmes; reaching out to specific target groups; using e-learning as an option where expertise is not available. Enhanced regional cooperation with more advanced countries would help according to Group D, and the CIS could facilitate linking up member countries with similar challenges and support the development and delivery of training programmes. Lastly, she expressed the wish that CIS eventually engages in accrediting training institutes.

Questions and comments in plenary

- 69. Mr Loiselle launched the discussion by asking Ms Muchengeti to elaborate on "OSH as a business". She explained that in some countries legislation approves that training institutes can offer OSH training without necessarily getting input from ministries of labour and OSH authorities. As a result, these institutions are doing it as a business, not with the depth that it deserves to be given. A participant to the group discussion added that the ILO could set clear rules for training centres or guidance in terms of experience, personnel etc.
- 70. Professor El Kholti (INCVT/Morocco) mentioned that a recent demand for training in Morocco was answered by consultants using material in health and safety available on the internet, and

then improvised themselves as OSH trainers without having the necessary qualification. For him, the limited State resources dedicated to OSH are conducive to this situation. He mentioned about work underway to give accreditation to training providers which is to be supported by an investment programme for businesses to hire qualified consultants. He stressed the need for a legal text.

- 71. In response to Mr Munforti's asking if an international "code of conduct" could be adopted to govern OSH training, Mr Loiselle briefly outlined the main types of ILO instruments being conventions, recommendations, and codes of practices. He referred to ILO Conventions citing for example Conventions 155 and 187, explaining that ILO Conventions are comparable to international treaties. They are negotiated and adopted by the International Labour Conference (ILC), and usually become binding instruments when ratified at country level. ILO Recommendations resemble Conventions in many ways but usually complement them and provide more precisions, but are not subject to ratification by Member States, thus are not binding instruments. He then continued to Codes of practice, 46 of which relate to safety and health. Codes of practice essentially aim to provide comprehensive guidance in priority topics. To this day there is no ILO instrument defining the requirements to perform as trainer, manager or consultant in OSH. He said that there are very interesting national initiatives in this direction and perhaps an international instrument could be adopted in the future if it were to become a priority for Member States.
- 72. Mr Munforti stated that the EUSAFE project could make documentation available to ILO, and mentioned that ENSHPO has a set of standards for managers and technicians with a code of conduct. He indicated that locally they have not only qualifications addressing education profile but real certification of professionals through accreditation process, linked to European accreditation network. He offered sending more detailed information to participants should other countries wish to develop similar tools.
- 73. Mr Loiselle turned to the participants to continue discussion on the presentations of the rapporteurs and asked what would be the conditions for engaging in joint network-based production of any knowledge related products, research or knowledge sharing activities that would be developed and owned by the network members as a collective effort rather than being undertaken by the ILO only.
- 74. Mr Horvath (CCOH&S/Canada) positioned the answer to this question at the level of what membership of this network really means, and talked about what it takes from each organization involved to be an engaged member in the network. In addition to the various inventories listed earlier, he pointed to the need for some "inventory" of what network members are ready to make available to other members in terms of resources, perhaps in the form of a database. He stressed that the role of the ILO in this regard would be to host that database but the role of network members would be to keep its content up-to-date as part of their continuous engagement. He stressed that sharing of technical information is an important aspect of contributing to the network but not only, information on on-going work would prove useful, citing for example information on what governments are working on that others could be interested in and provide input on, citing policy areas such as mental health for instance. The value of the network is found in sharing that "second layer of information" and this can only be effective if the members engage in the network.
- 75. Professor El Kholti expressed his full agreement with Mr Horvath, and underscored the importance of personal commitment above and beyond institutional commitment to engage in the network.
- 76. Mr Junzhi Wang (ACFTU/China) expressed their full support for CIS to play a leading role in joint research projects but stressed the importance to identify areas of core interest that meet the needs of most countries. In his opinion, it is important to ensure sustainable funding for

- research projects, acknowledging that if a project meets the needs of most countries then maybe industrialized countries could fund such project. He suggested that CIS is well positioned to mobilize the necessary expertise and lead joint research projects.
- 77. Dr Ilès (INPRP/Algeria) agreed to the point of Mr Badawi from Kuwait proposing the CIS to hold more frequent meetings throughout the year, notably through webinars. She mentioned not being satisfied with the annual meetings of CIS despite having participated throughout the years, she would like a little more from the CIS, for example a list of experts that could be called on, if necessary, would be useful. There was a lot of discussion in her group about accreditation of institutions and that she learned a lot from other participants. She stressed the importance of networking this knowledge.
- 78. Dr Rojas Gutierrez from Colombia identified the commitment of each Centre to strengthen the network as a critical condition, and this starts with assigning human resources for this purpose. Referring to his experience in Latin America, he found that most CIS Centres operated as part of library services of the Ministries of Labour, which simply do not have the resources or the possibility to engage in international collaboration at their level. He referred to some ILO guidelines dating from 2003 which refers to the relationship between the ILO and National CIS Centres, and stressed the importance of updating this document to enshrine new characteristics for the network taking into account the need for broader cooperation. He then suggested setting down standards for the role of different centres vis-à-vis the ILO. For him, Centres must comply with the role that's conceived for them. Bearing in mind the limited budgetary resources of the ILO-CIS, he urged the other national centres to take on a greater role in tackling issues put forward during this meeting.
- 79. After Mr Loiselle had highlighted the significance of defining renewed collaboration modalities for a "second generation of partnership with the ILO", Dr Rojas Gutierrez added that the ILO national centre in Colombia provides a great deal of institutional support to others in the region, thus facilitating the allocation of additional resources in other institutions such as the Inter-American Development Bank which has a programme to respond to emergencies. He stressed that it is easier to obtain resources for development with the support of the ILO.
- 80. The Coordinator of CIS turned to his colleague Mr Litvyakov to ask whether it would be possible to have a simple page with 2 columns on the website; one column for expressing needs, and the other for centres expressing offer of support, mentioning that if the CIS Centre in Zimbabwe needs a trainer in chemical safety in March 2013 for example, that they can make an appeal and eventually hope for someone to see it and offer the necessary support. While acknowledging that everything is possible with information technology, Mr Litvyakov informed that only limited functions can be implemented on the ILO web content management system, and mentioned this possibility could be looked into more closely notably if some centres could provide alternate platforms to host this kind of information sharing tools.
- 81. Mr Loiselle summarized the exchanges in plenary by enumerating the key conditions for undertaking network-based activities collectively. He noted *engagement* as a first key condition for success, both individual engagement but also the engagement of the organisation member of the network. He underlined the importance for activities to be undertaken to be *relevant* to the needs of the network members. He noted that financial resources did not seem to be a condition identified by the participants during the discussions and expressed his view that indeed *funding* opportunities should be found for knowledge and information products and activities of relevance. He then pointed to the necessary availability of *expertise* within the network to carry the work forward, and mentioned by the same token that CIS is exploring the possibility of establishing an international roster of expertise in OSH that would draw on existing registries and similar resources. He stressed the call for new collaboration arrangements with

- the ILO to be clarified in *new terms and conditions of membership to the CIS network* to be written in light of the outcomes of this meeting.
- 82. To conclude, Mr Loiselle expressed gratitude to the participants on behalf of the ILO for devoting their life and career to serving the imperatives of safety and health at work with all their sincerity. He shared his hope and engagement for improving the functioning of the CIS network.

Day 2: Session D - International cooperation in Safety and Health

83. The Chairperson launched the afternoon session by first inviting a special guest Dr Walter Eichendorf (DGUV/Germany and President of the International Organizing Committee) to introduce the 2014 ILO-ISSA World Congress on Safety and Health at Work, to be held in Frankfurt under the motto: "Sharing a vision for sustainable prevention". Dr Eichendorf explained that the Congress will be structured by content, with keynote speeches, 6 technical sessions and 30 symposia. He proceeded to give an overview of the programme content, and emphasised that there would be time on Saturday or Sunday for a CIS meeting before the event begins. Also featured on the programme will be tours of workplaces in Frankfurt, a German national evening, Forum for Prevention, and the International Media Festival for Prevention. The languages available will be English, French, Spanish and German. There will be differing price schemes depending on the country and funding possibilities.

ILO recent international cooperation project: Improving safety and health at work through a Decent Work Agenda

84. Ms Amélie Schmitt (ILO SAFEWORK) introduced a technical cooperation (TC) project recently implemented in Ukraine, Moldova, Zambia, Malawi and Honduras by showing a short video and explained the beneficiary countries were chosen on the basis of their commitment to OSH, as reflected in their Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP). She informed the project was made possible with the financial support of the *European Commission Investing in People Programme*. She explained the project strategy was based on the provisions of the *Promotional Framework for Occupational Safety and Health Convention*, 2006 (No. 187) and listed the main outputs: national OSH profiles in the 5 countries; national OSH programmes adopted; OSH coordination bodies strengthened; new networks of trainers in risk assessment and management; enhanced capacities of OSH inspectors; improvements in some national systems for reporting and notification of accidents and diseases; and awareness raising campaigns. Ms Schmitt enumerated a number of outputs of global interest also produced in the framework of the project.

CIS network members' development needs on OSH knowledge and information

85. The Coordinator of CIS, Mr Loiselle, engaged this session by providing a brief overview of the overall functioning of technical cooperation projects and stressed that they need to be demand-driven and respond to well-identified needs. He referred to past experiences that were very successful, and to the possibility for the ILO to develop a large scale TC programme to strengthen national capacities to develop, mobilize and make use of OSH knowledge and information to the fullest extent possible. He then proceeded to the distribution of numerous post-it stickers and asked the participants to write down needs they would have in their respective countries, and to come and stick the post-its up at the front. Once this exercise was completed, Mr Loiselle emphasised that he was taking the exercise very seriously as there are so few opportunities to collect first-hand expressions of needs like that. He proceeded to take a few at random, read them aloud and commented on possible responses to those needs which triggered interventions on the possibility of using existing material from other leading OSH institutions.

- 86. Mr Loiselle explained that many of the needs listed could possibly be responded to without an intervention by the ILO, citing OSH in SMEs as an example. He pointed out that Canada, the UK and other countries have invested and worked for years on this topic through conducting research, producing material and developing websites notably. When resources already exist, it becomes difficult to justify an ILO intervention. He suggested that it was sometimes just a matter of finding the relevant information and requesting the permission to use it, highlighting the importance of using the resources available, provided that the source is mentioned in respect of intellectual property and national investment involved.
- 87. Mr Smeatham from the Health and Safety Executive (UK) took the opportunity to confirm that there would be no problem with using HSE information as long as the source was recognised, and Dr Luise Vassie pointed out that IOSH website materials can all be downloaded and used, stating that they can even be translated into other languages. She encouraged everybody to use these resources, whilst of course mentioning the source.
- 88. Mr Loiselle indicated the ILO support usually address more complex issues such as establishing a national capacity to conduct labour inspection, or when it comes to establishing a tripartite body at national level for example, as these often require technical input from an international experience perspective. He underscored that TC projects are extremely expensive to develop and implement, but that they can be funded using national resources or through the multilateral donors system. He mentioned that costs have to be calculated and project ideas justified, and sometimes backed by political support. It is therefore important to check if resources are already available, mobilise people having the expertise, identify gaps and ask for ILO assistance as appropriate.
- 89. The Chairperson thanked the participants for their contribution and remarked on how many yellow post-its there were, and how much work lies ahead.

DAY 2: Session E – The way forward: New CIS Network functioning modalities

Guiding principles on the governance of the CIS network: Strategic orientation, functioning modalities and work programme

- 90. The Coordinator of CIS introduced the last session of the 50th meeting by calling on participants to have a frank discussion on a possible way forward. He explained that in-depth changes were needed to the functioning of the network which he illustrated with a presentation providing factual information on effective country coverage and participation. For him, the main purpose of the CIS network is to provide a basis for collaboration among agencies, institutions and organisations active in OSH, but that collaboration itself requires individual motivation and the effective commitment from member organisations, along with sustained financial support to ensure their participation in network activities in order to enable its institutionalisation.
- 91. During his presentation, Mr Loiselle mentioned the CIS network constitution and structure should be flexible enough to ensure broad representation and participation of organisations with varying capabilities, needs and expectations to participate, share and gain knowledge regardless of their level of development. He expressed the view that a global OSH network should also encompass and encourage the development of purpose-oriented 'sub' networks.
- 92. He stressed that new network governance arrangements in which the ILO only plays the role of "network facilitator" are needed, and that this facilitation should be dynamic, collaborative and participative. He indicated that arrangements should comprise a well-constituted and functioning network steering committee guided by the sole interest of promoting and supporting international collaboration in OSH. Self-governance of the network should be aimed for as a development goal.

- 93. He continued his intervention by listing key improvements to the current functioning modalities, and highlighted the importance of ensuring proper programming of CIS network activities before challenging the participants as to whether an annual meeting was necessary, given the cost involved in the current context of austerity measures. He put forward several options such as: meeting globally every 3 years only to coincide with the World Congress; organize the meeting regionally in the years between in partnership with regional networks or clusters; and to hold OSH knowledge and information subject matter or language-based specific events. He also shared his belief that the ILO-CIS should target as a matter of priority regions or countries showing an important knowledge deficit on the fundamentals of OSH.
- 94. Mr Loiselle suggested that the network structure and 'centre' status be revisited, moving from a status of 'centres' to 'members' of the ILO CIS network or 'partners' of the ILO in OSH. He underscored the importance of making the offer of OSH knowledge meet the needs through a broadened and segmented CIS network base, extending network membership to other categories of OSH knowledge stakeholders such as public institutions, academia and civil society organisations, and adapting knowledge products accordingly. He advocated this extension was needed whilst pointing out that not all countries have the same level of development, and called for a global effort to enhance OSH knowledge capacities through international technical cooperation in countries like Haiti and South Sudan, for example.
- 95. Finally, he referred to the importance of observing how Member States are developing, sharing and making use of OSH knowledge and information, and how existing networks are evolving and adapting. He shared his view on the importance to report regularly on the state of OSH knowledge and networks around the world, and to assess the impact and benefit of OSH knowledge-based interventions and their contribution to the effectiveness of prevention.

Perspectives on the way forward

- 96. The Chairperson opened the plenary discussion. Mr Rojas Gutierrez from Colombia immediately congratulated Mr Loiselle for this extraordinary presentation. He said he had been attending CIS meetings for about 15 years but that this was the first time he had seen a clear strategic management presentation, analysing strengths and weaknesses and looking at the best way to develop a strategic plan for this network. He admitted that there remains a lot to be done but that laying the cards on the table like this means that we can be clearer and will be able to move work forward and respond to the needs of each country.
- 97. Ms Elly Goos (Netherlands) referred back to one of Mr Loiselle's slides which stated that the CIS is collaborating, but she did not understand on what. Furthermore, she said that the original name of the network is CIS where "IS" refers to OSH Information. However, it was not clear for her from the presentation where OSH information is going to. She asked what OSH knowledge really means and how it differs from OSH information.
- 98. Mr Loiselle explained that for 50 years the CIS has been focusing exclusively on collecting and disseminating information, e.g. Toxicity of substances, products, hazards, others, but now the ILO pursues a knowledge agenda. Knowledge is what allows you to do with information available, it allows for connecting information through analysing needs; supporting efforts by people and for people; conducting research; developing educational material to allow people to tackle the complexity of safety and health; and providing advisory and information services.
- 99. Mr Badawi (Kuwait) thanked ILO for the opportunity to share information and interact as well as for asking CIS what they need from the ILO in setting out what the ILO expects from them.
- 100. Dr Luise Vassie congratulated the Coordinator of CIS and his team on the 2-day programme, culminating in such a strategic vision. She said there comes a point in most organisations when you have to be brave and realise that perhaps the status quo is not the way forward. This takes courage, and the team deserves congratulations. She stressed that whilst change presents

- challenges, it also brings many opportunities and that she looked forward to being part of that and making a difference to people's lives.
- 101. Ms Barbara Szczepanowska (CIOP/Poland) expressed her concern at the fact that this vision differs from what has been done by the network over the course of 50 years. She emphasised the hard work and dedication of predecessors. She requested to have the presentation on paper in order to be able to digest it more easily and expressed the need to have time to think. She referred to the fact that many member institutions have plans in place for some years to come and that this vision would therefore pose them a problem. Ms Szczepanowska emphasised that the participants in the room were from many different backgrounds including some practitioners doing practical work. She also said that CIS was and is an information centre. She implied that there was a gap between practical people on the ground and theoretical ideas floated in meetings. She said there used to be some practical training during meetings, on how to serve users better. She wondered about the relationship between theory and practice, and said that Mr Loiselle presented some important ideas but that it must be discussed and it was a pity they had not heard the presentation at the beginning of the annual meeting. She called for caution in changing the network and respect for work that has been done before.
- 102. Steve Horvath (CCOH&S/Canada) agreed that it was a shock to the organisation as a whole. However, he said that looking at the network from an organisational effectiveness perspective was long overdue, asking why there are organisations that are no longer involved. He argued that structure is the problem; it is indicative of where a network is going. He suggested that if CIS were to disappear it might not have that great an impact, precisely because a lot of informal networks have developed. If a void were to be created, it would be filled. Conversely, developing countries would feel the loss a lot more acutely. He said it was time to revisit the role of the ILO because the network has changed. The ILO can no longer sit at the centre of the hub, try to bring in all the information, translate and send it back out. He suggested that the centres could take some of the yellow post-its and tackle them themselves; maybe the ILO could take 20%. However, he said he was not sure the ILO could solve the issues within a year. He called for a practical approach, said that the trend has been emerging over the years and everybody has ignored it. ILO cannot be all things to all people, it needs to organise resources available. He stressed that he acknowledges the input and successes of predecessors but that the environment has changed faster than the network.
- 103. Professor El Kholti said that Morocco had been a member since 1994 and when he looks back over the years, he finds there is not that much to look to. He explained that he came to this meeting as it was the 50th meeting and thought he was going to leave again empty-handed. Yet this has not been the case, he is not leaving with empty hands. He stressed that the proposal was to "revisit" not to delete everything that has been achieved but it was time to look to the future, building on 50 years of work. It would be abhorrent to forget but we must look to the future with a fresh perspective, taking into account current needs, tools and context.
- 104. Mr Loiselle then underscored that he was not forcing the issue. He carried out the analysis and was proposing a possible way forward. He stressed that it was now important to actually deal with the issue as it is becoming increasingly burdensome and increasingly unlikely that the ILO can continue defending it. Renewing the functioning of the network does not mean erasing information services. On the contrary, it is giving it a second wind. A number of information services in the world were set up with the assistance of network members over time because the ILO organised meetings, held trainings and they were dealing with it so it worked. It no longer works from Geneva. Those that have the means to come here already have well functioning information services. We must now bring the capacity to establish OSH knowledge and information management capacity where it is most needed, and go beyond information only and engage in developing academic curricula, assisting the structuring process of OSH

- research work, and helping people develop their own solutions to mobilize OSH knowledge capacity at country level.
- 105. Mr Loiselle then set out what is expected: To work in a networked fashion, collaborate, participate, share knowledge, set up twinning arrangements, and pool together knowledge forces for prevention. He informed that all the meeting's presentations, including the list of delegates, were available on the memory stick provided. He invited participants to stay in touch via e-mail and mentioned that virtual meetings and discussion forums could be organized. He reminded all that the CIS network must become a collective force to solve the dramatic problem of safety and health in the world of work.
- 106. Ms Lehtinen, the Chairperson, rounded up this session, indicating that the ILO CIS unit would surely respect people's need to adjust and think over and digest but she felt it was extremely important not to waste anything worthwhile. Countries and international organisations have a need to change, whilst building on what has already been established and developed.

CONCLUSIONS OF THE MEETING

Observations by the Chairperson and Secretary of the 50th Meeting of the CIS network

- 107. The Chairperson outlined the scope and purpose of the meeting using slides on observations and conclusions: *To exchange experiences, learn about ILO activities, discuss the role of CIS the unit and of the CIS network in future.* She referred back to the November 2011 meeting and congratulated the CIS unit for having developed the slides that Mr Loiselle just presented according to the lines of discussion last year. She mentioned the need for a long-term work plan so that every centre contributing knows what activities are included and what the specific elements of the work plan are. There was a clear need to restructure the CIS network.
- 108. She underscored that UN organisations are for 193 countries and so information flow is the key. In a network, criteria need to be set out for different categories of centres. The CIS unit is working on this. She added that last year it was suggested to look at structures of other international networks e.g. WHO CC Network. She thought that some aspects of a new structure for CIS Collaborating Centres were already emerging from Mr Loiselle's slides. Self- and external evaluation of activities are also important.
- 109. She presented eight items reflecting the discussions during the two days on what they understand as being needed for the CIS to move forward:
 - a) Analysis of the needs of the countries as to information services;
 - b) Revisiting the mission and drawing up of CIS strategy with action plan 2012 -2020 to ensure availability of resources;
 - c) Agreeing on contributions by CIS centres and division of work to engage and commit;
 - d) Decisions on activities and outputs to meet the new needs of constituents;
 - e) Making a fact-based SWOT analysis of various options for online ILO encyclopaedia, on how to organize the whole process of updating content;
 - f) Identifying new substantive topics that should be included in ILO-CIS portfolio (SMEs, green jobs, migrant workers, etc.);
 - g) Examining collaboration possibilities with other information networks and regional networks to avoid overlapping;
 - h) Developing, facilitating and strengthening networking, training and capacity building within the CIS-ILO and National CIS Centres family (twinning, sub-regional working groups, etc.);
 - i) Studying the opportunities provided by the advancements in new technologies, new information media and new uses (including but not limited to social media).

- 110. The Chair then expressed her thanks and said it had been a pleasure to chair the meeting.
- 111. Professor El Kholti expressed his thanks to everybody and apologised for having sometimes been very strict regarding time.

Concluding remarks by the ILO

- 112. Mr Loiselle expressed warm thanks to Ms Lehtinen and Professor El Kholti for accepting such a difficult mandate of chairing this historic meeting. He also thanked participants for the quality of their participation, highlighting that the world needs their contribution and the ILO's appreciation of their inputs. He also warmly thanked the members of the CIS team who have been working extremely hard over the past months. He emphasised team work and that the team was at the service of the CIS centres. He extended his gratefulness to the interpreters and the note taker.
- 113. Mr Machida thanked everybody for their active participation and praised the high attendance. He also thanked Ms Lehtinen and Professor El Kholti. He highlighted the need for change, changes in resources and environment. He underscored the importance of continuing to work together as a whole. He said there were ongoing products, such as, encyclopaedia, ICSC, etc. which will not be dropped. Another aspect is how to network, how to find support and facilitate mutual assistance. Further communication can be possible through a summary note, comments, web debate. He called for more frequent interaction and the inclusion of absent members in future plans. He said this was the beginning of a new era for CIS and called for continuous contribution.
- 114. A symbolic token of appreciation was given to the Chairperson and the Secretary.
- 115. The Chairperson then declared the 50th meeting of CIS closed at 5:13 pm.