



Terms of Reference (Draft) for Independent Mid-Term Project Evaluation

Project Title:	Improved labour migration governance to protect migrant workers and combat irregular migration
Project Code:	ETH/16/02/GBR
Implementer	ILO Country Office for Djibouti, Ethiopia, South Sudan, Sudan and Somalia
Partners	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA), • Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA), • Technical and Vocational Education and Training Agency (TVET), • Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Union (CETU), • Ethiopian Employers Federation (EEF) and • Private Employment agencies
Donor	United Kingdom's Department for International Development
Budget in GBP	GBP 2,780,226.00
Implementation Period	January, 2017 to December, 2020
Type of Evaluation	Mid term
Timing	January 2017 – April 2019

Background of the Project

Although the exact number of Ethiopians who have migrated abroad is unknown due to irregular migration and the absence of centralized registration system, according to the estimates by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA), more than two million Ethiopian diaspora live abroad¹. However, the numbers are estimated to be higher since there is growing evidence that outward migration has increased significantly in recent years. The 2015 Ethiopian Migration Profile prepared by UNICEF depicts an increased international migration stock of Ethiopians living abroad over the years; in 2000, the international Ethiopian migration stock was 662,444² people this figure has reached 1,072,949 in 2015³. In addition, according to the data from Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA) around 460,000 Ethiopians have legally migrated to the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) States mainly Saudi Arabia, Kuwait and Dubai between September 2008 and August 2013⁴. The continued increase in irregular migration mainly trafficking combined with a significant number of reported cases of abuse and mistreatment of Ethiopian migrants in destination country call for urgent attention to the social and economic needs of Ethiopian migrants.

Ethiopia has become one of the major sending countries of Migrant Domestic Workers (MDWs) to the GCC States and their numbers have greatly increased in recent years. MDWs in receiving countries are concentrated in less regulated economic occupations where they work excessive hours without over pay, no weekly or monthly rest days, and restrictions on freedom of movement, exposed to psychological, physical and sexual abuse. Most of them even suffer from virtual imprisonment with their travel and identity documents confiscated. Labour migration is increasingly featuring on the global agenda including that of Ethiopia.

Recognizing the numerous decent work deficits faced by Ethiopian migrants in the Middle East, the ILO is currently implementing a project entitled *Improved labour migration governance to protect migrant workers and combat irregular migration in Ethiopia* funded by United Kingdom's Department for International Development. The project aims at supporting the efforts of the Government. Social partners and Civil Societies in improving labour migration governance to better address migration challenges in the country and combat irregular migration. Through this project the ILO will support the GoE and its partners to address irregular migration and protection risks faced by migrants in countries of origin and destination. For this the project will work on legal and regulatory frameworks for fair recruitment; strengthening and building the capacity of federal, regional, zonal and woreda government offices as well as Ethiopian foreign missions, migrant communities and migrants themselves. The project will also conduct a number of studies on rapid labour market dynamics; labour migration trends and on the capacity of Private Employment Agencies engaged in overseas employment business to assist GoE in developing framework.

This project aims at improving the governance of labour migration and strengthens the protection of migrant workers' rights by making regular labour migration accessible and desirable to potential migrants, so that they do not opt for irregular migration. This will be done through empowering

¹ MoFA Diaspora Policy

² UNICEF (2015). *Ethiopia migration profile*.

³ UNDESA (2016). *International migration report 2015*. New York; United Nations

⁴ MoLSA. *Annual Report*

migrants, regional cooperation, institutional capacity building including foreign missions/embassies and enhancing protection mechanisms in countries of origin as well as destination in line with relevant International standards and the revised overseas employment proclamation 923/2016 and prevention and suspension of trafficking in person and smuggling of migrant's proclamation 909/2015.

The project's intervention logic is entirely based on the human rights-based approach to labour migration of the *ILO Multilateral Framework on Labour Migration*, 2006 focusing on capacity development of both 'rights-holders' to claim their rights and 'duty-bearers' to meet their obligations. The two components of the project are designed accordingly.

The first component is outcome 1: *Migrant workers are better protected through improved access to support services that empower them to make informed decisions and claim their rights*. This will be achieved through improving the capacity of MOLSA, Private Employment Agencies, Regional, Zonal and Wordea level government structures, trade unions, NGOs and increasing the knowledge and awareness of potential migrants. For this project will produce information materials (booklets, brochures, audio and video material) about international labour standards, legal and policy frameworks for the protection of migrant labour, about regular migration regulations and services available. In addition, relevant actor's ability to engage in protection and assistance of migrant workers in the Middle East, and to respond to situations of violations of rights will be strengthened, as well as migrant's knowledge of where to turn if support is needed.

The other component, outcome 2 is about *Improved access to protection services of migrants being provided by Ethiopian missions and other relevant institutions*. This places the rights of migrants in general and vulnerable groups in particular at the centre of migration management, encouraging a policy discourse based on international labour standards, conventions and human rights laws. In achieving so, the project aims at building the capacity of the duty bearers: the GoE and governments of major destination countries, to address the rights, needs, and risks faced by migrants in the migration process. The project will also work with social partners, CETU and EEF, and civil society organizations to address unmet needs of potential migrants and migrants. Component 2 includes data collection/assessment approach, to ensure that governments and other actors have reliable information on which to base decisions, and a significant capacity building approach, as mentioned above, directed primarily at the Ethiopian government as well as employers and workers organisations. The government and social partners will be capacitated to develop bilateral agreements and standard employment contract to ensure migrants rights in line with international instruments and provides access to regular labour migration. Moreover, Ethiopian missions and associations in receiving countries will be capacitated to provide direct support to migrants in regards to protection such as shelters, advises etc.

Therefore, through this project the ILO aspires to address and reduce irregular migration by improving labour migration governance and making regular labour migration more accessible and desirable to potential migrants in Ethiopia.

Project major results reported so far are:

- Establishment of the operational management system and MoU signed with the GOE for the project implementation. Revision of log frame; Development of M&E and implementation plan; Baseline on beneficiaries and key informants in Ethiopia and selected destination countries.
- Establishment and configuration of Ethiopian Migrant Data Management system in four regions (Amhara, Oromia, SNNPR, and Tigray) and Addis Ababa City Administration.
- Training of 32 officials from regional, federal level government structures and relevant actors and 147 officials from regional, Zonal and Woreda level BOLSA structures to better manage labour migration.
- Equipped 6 Migration information centers (MICs) with necessary materials, reference documents, human resources and developed their operational guideline.
- Equipped workshops at 8 TVET institutions to provide quality skill training 622 potential migrants attended skills training in these institutions.
- Around 8,403 potential migrants and returnees received information on migration. 3 information brochures in Amharic language and 1 brochure on International Labour Standards (relevant conventions on migration) has been developed.
- Facilitated negotiation of BLA between the Government of Ethiopia and Lebanese Government as well as the United Arab Emirates (UAE).
- Developed entrepreneurship, life skills, and financial education training manual and organized ToT for 25 TVET teachers & BOLSA officials on the manual.

Project alignment with the DWCP, P&B, CPO & SDG

This project will make a substantive contribution to Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) for Ethiopia, ETH 155 - Improved management of labour migration and reduction of irregular migration and ILO Programme & Budget (P&B)⁵ - Outcome 09 - Promoting fair and effective labour migration policies.

This project will also contribute to a number of Sustainable Development Goals (2015-2030), namely Goal 8 - Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all; Goal 16 – Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels; Goal 5 –Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls and Goal 1 – End poverty in all its form everywhere.

⁵ The ILO Programme and Budget (P&B) of the Organization sets out the strategic objectives and expected outcomes for the Organization's work and is approved every two years by the International Labour Conference. The P & B specifies the strategies the ILO will implement to achieve results over the biennium, alongside the capacities and the resources required to deliver those results. The ILO's biennial programme of work is delivered in member States mainly through Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCP) and through Development Cooperation programmes

Project Management Arrangement

The project is managed by a Program Manager (PM) based in the project Office in Addis Ababa and reports to the director of the ILO CO for Djibouti, Ethiopia, South Sudan, Sudan and Somalia. The PM is the principal staff responsible for Programme implementation, supervising staff, allocating Programme budgets, preparing progress reports and maintaining Programme relations with institutional partners. PM is also responsible for elaborating the final programme document, gathering supporting information and developing preliminary work plans.

The PM is supported by a National Project Coordinator, National Communication Officer and Finance/Admin Assistant based in the project Office in Addis Ababa. The project is backstopped by one Technical Officer at the MIGRANT Department in Geneva and a Migration and Mobility Specialist from ILO CO Algiers.

Evaluation Background

ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of technical cooperation activities. This project will go through two independent evaluations. Both evaluations are managed by an ILO certified evaluation manager and implemented by independent evaluators.

The evaluation in ILO is for the purpose of accountability, learning and planning and building knowledge. It should be conducted in the context of criteria and approaches for international development assistance as established by: the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard; and the UNEG Code of Conduct for Evaluation in the UN System.

This evaluation will follow the ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation⁶; and the ILO EVAL Policy Guidelines Checklist 3 “Preparing the inception report”; Checklist 4 “Validating methodologies”; and Checklist 5 “Preparing the evaluation report”.

The evaluation will follow the OECD-DAC framework and principles for evaluation. For all practical purposes, this ToR and ILO Evaluation policies and guidelines⁷ define the overall scope of this evaluation. Recommendations, emerging from the evaluation, should be strongly linked to the findings of the evaluation and should provide clear guidance to stakeholders on how they can address them.

⁶ http://www.ilo.ch/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_571339.pdf

Purpose of the Evaluation

The main purposes of the evaluation are:

- a) Assess the implementation of the project so far, identifying factors affecting project implementation (positively and negatively). If necessary, propose revisions to the expected level of achievement of the objectives;
- b) Analyse the implementation strategies of the project with regard to their potential effectiveness in achieving the project outcomes; including unexpected results.
- c) Review the institutional set-up, capacity for project implementation, coordination mechanisms and the use and usefulness of management tools including the project monitoring tools and work plans;
- d) Review the strategies for sustainability;
- e) Identify the contributions of the project to the SDGs, the ILO objectives and its synergy with other projects and programs;
- f) Identify lessons and potential good practices for the key stakeholders.
- g) Provide strategic recommendations for the different key stakeholders to improve implementation of the project activities and attainment of project objectives.

Scope of the Evaluation

The scope of the evaluation covers the project from its start in xxx to March 2019.

Checklist of Questions

Design and relevance:

- Did the project be coherent with the Government objectives, National Development Frameworks and supporting the outcomes outlined in the UNDAF and DWCP as well as the SDGs?
- To what extent the project has integrated gender equality issues in the design, implementation, results and M&E?
- Were the outputs achievable or overly ambitious?
- How does the project complement and fit with other on-going ILO programmes and projects in the country?
- What links have been established so far with other activities of the UN or other cooperating partners operating in the Country in the areas of migration and women's empowerment?

Efficiency of implementation:

- Have the available technical and financial resources allocated and used strategically to provide the necessary support and to achieve the broader project objectives? (VfM)
- Does the management and governance structure put in place worked strategically with all key stakeholders in Ethiopia, ILO and the donor to achieve project goals and objectives?
- How has the staffing process facilitated or hindered the project implementation? Does the project management monitor work facilitated or hindered the project work towards results?
- Is information being shared and readily available to national partners?

Effectiveness:

- What progress has been made towards achieving the overall project objectives/outcomes?
- Have unintended results of the project been identified?
- How has the project coordination worked with government agencies and partners?

Orientation to impact:

- To what extent the potential migrants and migrants are being benefited from the project results on accessing to regular labour migration?

Sustainability:

- Is the project strategy and management steering towards sustainability?
- To what extent can the outcomes be expected to be sustainable beyond the life of project?
- Has the project increased or decreased dependency on outside intervention?
- To what extent has the project strengthened the capacities of government structures, social partners, Ethiopian communities in destination countries and Private employment agencies to ensure improved migration governance and services?

Proposed Methodology

The evaluation is proposed to be carried out through a desk review and field visit to the project sites in Ethiopia and interviewing relevant GoE offices, implementing partners, ultimate beneficiaries (migrants and potential migrants), private sector, the donor, ILO relevant officers and other key stakeholders.. The evaluation team may apply in-depth interview (IDI), focus group discussion (FGD), and small group discussion (SGD), or other methods or techniques as appropriate.

At the end of the field work a stakeholders' workshop will take place to present preliminary results. Then the draft evaluation report will be shared with all relevant stakeholders and a request for comments will be asked within a specified time by the evaluation manager. After receiving the consolidated comments from the evaluation manager the evaluation team will produce the final version of the report and indicate reason for not integrating comments if that would have been the case. Therefore, the evaluation methodology shall include but not be limited to the following:

Desk review

A desk review to analyze project and other documentation including Project Document, ILO annual report (2017-18), minutes of meetings, workshop reports, work plans, inception and technical progress reports and the approved log-frame and initial interviews with the project manager and the donor. The desk review will suggest a number of initial findings that in turn may point to additional or fine-tuned evaluation questions. This will guide the final evaluation instrument which should be finalized under the Inception report that should be approved by the evaluation manager before starting the field phase.

Interviews with Key Stakeholders in Addis Ababa

A first meeting will be held with the ILO CO Director and with the Project Team. After that the evaluation team will meet key stakeholders to undertake more in depth reviews of the respective national strategies and the delivery of outputs and outcomes. The team may investigate further on the operations and functioning of the Project, its implementation processes, interventions and achievements to date. A detail itinerary will be prepared for these interviews in discussion with the Evaluation Manager according to the list provided by the project.

Field In-depth interviews in Ethiopia:

The Evaluation team is expected to meet project beneficiaries' men and women to undertake more in depth reviews on the project work and results.

Interviews with ILO Staff

The evaluation team will undertake group and/or individual discussions with project staff in Addis Ababa. The evaluation team will also interview ILO staff responsible for financial, administrative and technical backstopping of the project. The project manager will share an indicative list of persons to be interviewed after further discussion with the Evaluation Manager.

Deliverables

- ***Inception report (with detailed work plan and data collection instruments) following ILO EVAL Checklist 3, the report should include:***
 - Description of the evaluation methodology explaining the instruments to be used for data collection (qualitative and quantitative); analysis, triangulation including the data collection plan in line with the TOR
 - Guiding questions for IDI, FGD, SGDs;
 - Detailed fieldwork plan for the three regions to be developed in consultation with the Evaluation Manager and project team;
 - The evaluation report outline.
 - Agenda for the stakeholders' workshop
- ***Stakeholder Workshop:*** Workshop with key stakeholder representatives, project officials, ILO CO officials, and donor to be organized on the final date of the field mission. In the workshop the evaluation team will briefly describe:
 - The methodology followed during the evaluation and findings in line with 5 OECD/DAC criteria.
 - Initial tentative recommendations based on the findings

The evaluation team will share the agenda for the stakeholder workshop in advance with the evaluation manager.

○ ***The draft and final versions of the evaluation report in English (maximum 30 pages plus annexes) will be developed under the following structure:***

- Cover page with key project and evaluation data
- Executive Summary (as per ILO EVAL template)
- List of Acronyms
- Table of Contents
- Background on the project and its logic
- Purpose, scope and clients of evaluation
- Methodology and limitations
- Main Findings
 - Relevance and quality of design
 - Efficiency of implementation
 - Effectiveness
 - Orientation to impact
 - Sustainability
- Conclusions
- Recommendations
- Lessons learned (as per ILO EVAL template)
- Good practices (as per ILO EVAL template)
- Annexes:
 - TOR
 - Inception report
 - List of people interviewed
 - Schedule of the field work
 - List of Documents reviewed
 - Brief transcripts of the interviews, FGDs

Management arrangements, work plan & time frame

The evaluation team leader will report to the evaluation manager appointed by ILO EVAL with whom he/she should discuss any technical and methodological matters of the project as well as the evaluation. The evaluation manager will supervise and monitor activities of the evaluation team under oversight of the ROAF Senior evaluator officer. The final approval of the report will be by EVAL. The evaluation will be carried out with full logistical and administrative support of the ILO Country Office in Addis Ababa.

All draft and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be submitted to the evaluation manager in electronic version compatible with Word for Windows. The first draft of the report will be circulated to all partners for a two weeks review. Comments from stakeholders will be presented to the evaluator by the evaluation manager for its integration into the final reports as appropriate or to document why a comment has not been included.

All reports, including drafts, will be written in English and following ILO templates for (each section). Ownership of data from the evaluation rests jointly with the ILO and the consultants.

The copyright of the evaluation report will rest exclusively with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentations can only be made with the written agreement of the ILO. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.

Composition of evaluation team

The evaluation team will consist of one international consultant and one independent national consultant. The international consultant will be the team leader and will have responsibility for the evaluation report. He/she will be a highly qualified senior evaluation specialist with extensive experience on conducting independent evaluations and ideally also well versed on the project thematic area. The national consultant will have particular experience in the project work area. The evaluation team will agree on the distribution of work and schedule for the evaluation and stakeholders to consult.

Evaluation Timetable and Schedule

The MTE will be conducted between April - June 2019.

Sl. No.	List of Tasks	Responsibility	Time line (Tentative Dates)
1.	Selection of the consultant and contract signing	ILO	24 April, 2019
2.	Discussion with the Consultants (Skype) on the Project and the TOR	ILO	25 April, 2019
3.	Desk review of project background documents (PRODOC, Work plans and Progress Reports, etc.	Consultant	25 to 27 April, 2019
4.	Submission of draft Inception report including design of evaluation instrument	Consultant	27 April, 2019
5.	Feedback on inception report	ILO	30 April, 2019
6.	Finalization of the inception report (including work plan and Field visit itinerary)	Consultant	2 May, 2019
7.	Field mission (data collection and debriefing and stakeholder workshop)	Consultant	5 to 13 May 2019
8.	Submission of the Evaluation report (Draft)	Consultant	13 to 18 May, 2019
9.	Review of the Draft evaluation report	ILO	19 to 22 May 2019
10.	Circulate draft report among key stakeholders including donor and receive feedback	ILO	23 May to 11 June, 2019
11.	Consolidate feedback and share with the consultant.	ILO	12 June, 2019
12.	Submission of the final evaluation report	Consultant	13 June, 2019

Proposed work days for the evaluation team

Phase	Responsible Person	Tasks	No of days	
			IC	NC
I	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Briefing with the evaluation manager, the project team and the donor ○ Desk Review of programme related documents ○ Inception report 	5	2
II	Evaluation team with organisational support from ILO	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ In-country consultations with programme staff ○ Field visits ○ Interviews with projects staff, partners beneficiaries ○ Stakeholders workshop for sharing findings ○ Debriefing with the CO- Addis Ababa 	10	10
III	Evaluation team	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Draft report based on consultations from field visits and desk review and the stakeholders' workshop 	5	2
IV	Evaluation Manager	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Quality check and initial review by Evaluation Manager ○ Circulate draft report to stakeholders ○ Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to team leader 	0	0
V	Evaluation team leader	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Finalize the report including explanations on why comments were not included 	1	0
TOTAL			21	14

IC: International Consultation and Team leader

NC: National consultant

Key qualifications & experience of the Evaluation Team & Responsibilities

For the international evaluator and team leader:

Responsibilities	Profile
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Desk review of programme documents • Briefing with ILO/Evaluation Manager • Explain the task to the national consultant • Development of the evaluation instrument • Telephone interviews with ILO and DFID • Undertake Interviews with stakeholders and key informants 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not have been involved in the project (design, review, implementation, etc.). • Relevant background in social and/or economic development or other related field. • More than 7 years of experience in the design, management and evaluation of development projects independently or as a team leader, in particular with policy level work, institutional building and local development projects. • Experience in evaluations in the UN system or other international context as team leader

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Undertake field visits in projects areas • Facilitate stakeholders workshop • Draft evaluation report • Finalise evaluation report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevant experience in the region in migration and/or reintegration and sound understanding of gender equality will be an asset • Demonstrated ability to deliver quality results within strict deadlines. • Fluency in English is essential • Experience in facilitating workshops for evaluation findings.
---	---

For the National consultant:

Responsibilities	<u>Profile</u>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Desk review of programme documents • Contribute to the development of the evaluation instrument • Organize interviews of stakeholders and field visits in the country • Provide or facilitate translation and interpretation as required • Co- facilitate Interviews with stakeholders and key informants • Co-facilitate stakeholder workshop (under the team leader leadership) • Contribute to the evaluation report through systematizing data collected and providing analytical inputs • Others as required by the team leader 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not have been involved in the project (design, review, implementation, etc.). • Relevant background in country social and/or economic development or other relevant field. • Around 5 years of experience in the design, management and evaluation of development projects, in particular with policy level work, institutional building and local development projects. • Relevant country experience, preferably prior working experience in migration, reintegration and employment. • Sound understanding on gender equality issues. • Experience in facilitating workshops for evaluation findings. • Fluency in English • Knowledge of local languages in the field visit areas would be preferred • Experience in the UN system or similar international development experience desirable.

Budget

Estimated resource requirements:

- Team leader: 21 days of honorarium, travel to Addis Ababa and project target areas including flights (all economy class) and DSA days (only during mission to Addis Ababa) according to ILO policy
- National consultant: 14 days of honorarium, travel to the project target areas including flights if necessary and DSA (only during in-country field) days according to ILO policy
- Local transportation in the project areas during field mission
- Stakeholders workshop